

### Pioneers of the Field

Focusing on the crucial contributions of women researchers, Andrew Bank demonstrates that the modern school of social anthropology in South Africa was uniquely female-dominated. The book traces the personal and intellectual histories of six remarkable women through the use of a rich cocktail of new archival sources, including family photographs, private and professional correspondence, field-notes and field diaries, published and other public writings, and even love letters. The book also sheds new light on the close connections between their personal lives, their academic work and their anti-segregationist and anti-apartheid politics. It will be welcomed by anthropologists, historians and students in African Studies interested in the development of social anthropology in twentieth-century Africa, as well as by students and researchers in the field of Women and Gender Studies.

Andrew Bank is a professor in the History Department at the University of the Western Cape, South Africa. He was commissioning editor of the journal *Kronos: Southern African Histories* from 2001 to 2015 and is a member of the editorial board of the *South African Historical Journal*. He is also the co-editor of *Inside African Anthropology: Monica Wilson and Her Interpreters* (Cambridge University Press, 2013). His previous monographs are on slavery in Cape Town (1991) and the Bleek-Lloyd Collection of Bushman folklore (2006).



#### THE INTERNATIONAL AFRICAN LIBRARY

General editors

LESLIE J. BANK, Human Sciences Research Council, South Africa HARRI ENGLUND, University of Cambridge DEBORAH JAMES, London School of Economics and Political Science ADELINE MASQUELIER, Tulane University BENJAMIN SOARES, African Studies Centre, Leiden

The International African Library is a major monograph series from the International African Institute. Theoretically informed ethnographies, and studies of social relations 'on the ground' which are sensitive to local cultural forms, have long been central to the Institute's publications programme. The IAL maintains this strength and extends it into new areas of contemporary concern, both practical and intellectual. It includes works focused on the linkages between local, national and global levels of society; writings on political economy and power; studies at the interface of the socio-cultural and the environmental; analyses of the roles of religion, cosmology and ritual in social organization; and historical studies, especially those of a social, cultural or interdisciplinary character.

For a list of titles published in the series, please see the end of the book.



# Pioneers of the Field

South Africa's Women Anthropologists

Andrew Bank

University of the Western Cape

International African Institute, London





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107150492

© Andrew Bank 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Bank, Andrew, author.

Pioneers of the field: South Africa's women anthropologists / Andrew Bank. International African library.

New York: Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Series: The international African library | Includes bibliographical references.

LCCN 2016026286 | ISBN 9781107150492

LCSH: Women ethnologists – South Africa – Biography.  $\mid$  Ethnologists – South Africa – Biography.  $\mid$  Ethnology – Study and teaching (Higher) – South Africa – History – 20th century.

LCC GN20 B34 2016 | DDC 305.80092/268 [B]-dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2016026286

ISBN 978-1-107-15049-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To my wife Anja



## Contents

	List of figures pa	ge viii
	Acknowledgements	xii
	Introduction: rethinking the canon	1
1	Feminizing the foundational narrative: the collaborative anthropology of Winifred Tucker Hoernlé (1885–1960)	15
2	An adopted daughter: Christianity and anthropology in the life and work of Monica Hunter Wilson (1908–1982)	64
3	Anthropology and Jewish identity: the urban fieldwork and ethnographies of Ellen Hellmann (1908–1982)	104
4	'A genius for friendship': Audrey Richards at Wits, 1938–1940	151
5	Historical ethnography and ethnographic fiction: the South African writings of Hilda Beemer Kuper	
	(1911–1992)	189
6	Feminizing the discipline: the long career of Eileen Jensen Krige (1904–1995)	239
	Conclusion: a humanist legacy	272
	Bibliography Index	284 309

vii



# Figures

1.1:	Winifred Tucker in her matric year at Wesleyan Girls'	
	High School, Grahamstown, 1902.	page 20
1.2:	Winifred Tucker and the South African College's first	
	SRC, 1905.	21
1.3:	'Breakdown of our waggon near Sendeling's Drift',	
	Richtersveld, Northern Cape, 1912.	27
1.4:	This portrait of a Nama woman photographed on Winifred	
	Tucker's first field expedition of 1912 is reproduced from the	ie
	only glass negative to have survived a devastating fire in Wit	:S
	University Library that would destroy all of her field-notes an	d
	other materials.	28
1.5:	Winifred and Alwin as a young baby, Boston, 1915.	31
1.6:	Winifred (front row, second left) was photographed with he	r
	family on her return to Johannesburg in 1920.	33
1.7:	Winifred Hoernlé around the time that her intellectual	
	'daughters' first encountered her, August 1927.	48
1.8:	Winifred Hoernlé as photographed by Leon Levson	
	in 1944.	62
2.1:	Monica Hunter as a teenager, Edinburgh, 1922.	68
2.2:	Monica at work in the Stanley Library, Girton College,	
	Cambridge, 1930. This was the year in which she completed	d
	her undergraduate degree, having earlier switched from	
	history to social anthropology, and won an Anthony Wilkin	
	Scholarship which funded her fieldwork in Pondoland and th	ie
	Eastern Cape from 1931.	74
2.3:	'Nosente, the Mother of Compassion', Auckland Village,	
	1931. Nosente was a Christian convert whose testimony	
	about the rapid social changes in the Eastern Cape between	
	the time of her birth in the late 1860s and that of Monica's	
	fieldwork in the 1930s was the subject of an autobiography	
	that Monica recorded, edited and published in Margery	
	Perham's Ten Africans (1936).	77

viii



	List of figures	ix
2.4:	The trading store run by Mary Soga and her husband at Ntibane, Western Pondoland (south-east of Mthatha) where Monica spent seven highly productive months doing fieldwork. She claimed to have developed her understanding of Pondo culture through sitting on mealie sacks in the store and listening to the gossip of clients, like the young Pondo	
2.5:	women in the foreground.  The first of the page-spread features published in the <i>Illustrated London News</i> of 22 August 1936 in 'appreciation' of	79
2.6	Reaction to Conquest. The photographs were selected from the twenty-eight plates that featured in the book.	83
2.6:	Members of the African Studies Department and senior students, Fort Hare Native College, 1946. Monica is in the centre of the middle row. Her friend and colleague Z.K. Matthews is seated on her left. Her talented graduate student Livingstone Mqotsi is seated at the end of the middle row,	
	far left.	98
2.7:	Monica Wilson on a hike during her retirement, with the	
3.1:	Hogsback Mountain in the background.  'The Family, 1922': Bernard and Chlothilde	102
3.2:	Kaumheimer with their daughters, Ellen (left, aged 14) and Inez (right, aged 10) at a public swimming pool in Johannesburg.  'No. 4 Alleyway'. This was one of nineteen photographs that featured in the appendix to the belatedly published <i>Rooiyard</i>	111
3.3:	(1948). The large barrels were used for beer-brewing.  'No. 17 John Chafimbira'. Ellen's research assistant and	118
	bodyguard in Rooiyard, 1933.	119
3.4:	Ellen and Ruth, aged two, 1938.	127
3.5:	Photographs from the appendix to Ellen Hellmann's doctoral	
	thesis (1939).	132
	Ellen Hellmann, 1945.	135
3.7:	Ellen Hellmann addressing a public meeting during the	
	1950s, possibly at Entokozeni, a clinic in Alexandra with	
	which she was actively involved.	141
4.1:	'Shilusako citimene, Audrey!' ('Don't worry about	
	citimene [tree-cutting], Audrey!') Audrey researching	
	methods of agriculture in the field, Bembaland,	1.60
4.2	c October 1933.	162
4.2:	'The Hockey Team!' Audrey and Lorna after a hockey match	
	at Shiwa Ngandu. Audrey is standing with her stick in her left	162
	hand. Lorna is kneeling in front of the trophy, c 1933.	163



X	List o	f figures

4.3:	'In Swaziland. Rock climb (staged) with Biesheuvels (lecturer in psychology here [at Wits University]).' An outstretched Audrey with Dr Simon Biesheuvel (1908–1991) and two	
4.4:	students on their vacation fieldtrip to Swaziland, July 1938. 'With Biesheuvels and the prettiest student.' Further adventures on the Swaziland fieldtrip, July 1938. Audrey is on	172
	the right.	173
4.5:	'Descending ravine to a native village. (Ainslie trying to show that there is <i>no</i> need to be alarmed).' Audrey, a colleague and their students on yet another adventurous vacation	
	fieldtrip, 1939.	174
5.1:	'Princess Topi and Hilda Beemer outside her house at Lobamba.' This photograph was probably taken by Malinowski during his fortnight in the field with Hilda in	
	late July and early August 1934.	200
5.2:	'Photo of Hilda Kuper in the field.' This photograph was probably taken by Leo Kuper when he visited her field-site on	
	the eve of her departure for her three-month tour of	
	Swaziland, beginning in September 1934. From left to right: Sobhuza II, Hilda Beemer and her guide-cum-research	
	assistant, standing alongside her car with its TJ (Transvaal,	
	Johannesburg) registration number.	201
5.3:	'Recruits for the gold mines of the Rand lined up with their	
	papers and bundles, ready to get on the bus for the first stage	
	of their long journey out of Swaziland.' Photographer Hilda	
	Beemer, c 1935.	209
5.4:	A photojournalistic sequence capturing an incident in the	
	Johannesburg city centre in the mid-1940s. It involved a young milkman falling off a bicycle followed by animated	
	pavement discussion about the incident between a young	
	white teenager and a group of stylishly dressed township	
	youth. It is her eye for the unusual incident, for the personal	
	and the particular that made her such a gifted story-writer.	210
5.5:	'Dolly's wedding.' Hilda Kuper's photograph of her	
	daughters, Mary (right) and Jenny (left), at a Hindu wedding	
	celebration in Durban, 1954.	220
5.6:	The Kuper family on a visit to Chatsworth House in	
	Derbyshire in 1958. Hilda was on a Simons Fellowship at	
	Manchester University organized by Max Gluckman. Jenny is on the left alongside Leo, Mary on the right alongside Hilda	
	and their cousin John Beemer is in the middle.	224
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	



List of figures	xi
5.7: Hilda's research assistant and later UCLA graduate student, Thoko Ginindza, doing tape-recorded interviews in the field for Hilda's biography of Sobhuza II, c 1973. The project almost derailed when the tape and a mass of other field	
materials went missing in Johannesburg in 1974 before they	
could be posted to Los Angeles.	233
5.8: Hilda Kuper and Sobhuza II at the Reed Dance in Lobamba	
in September 1981.	237
6.1: Eileen and her university friends, Johannesburg Training	
College Hostel, c 1922. From left to right: Louise Jongbloed,	
Maisie Eaton, Cato Smuts and Eileen Jensen.	243
6.2: Envelope labelled 'July 1926 [sic]: Holiday with Lennie Impey	
at W.N.L.A., Zoekmakaar [sic].' Left to right: Valda Inglis,	
Lennox Impey, Eileen Jensen, Cato Smuts.	246
6.3: Eileen and Jack at the time of their engagement, 1926.	247
6.4: Deputy South African Prime Minister Jan Smuts visiting	
Eileen and Jack at their field base, 1937. He later wrote the	
Foreword to their book. From left to right: Cato Clark (née	
Smuts), Jack Krige, Eileen Krige, Bancroft Clark, Jan Smuts,	
two local men and three children (unidentified).	255
6.5: Eileen and baby Thor, Durban, 1946.	259
6.6: Eileen at Modjadji in the early 1980s. She is greeting the late	
Mantwa Modjadji who was one of the wives of Modjadji III.	269



## Acknowledgements

All books are thoroughly collaborative products, a collective biography probably more than most. Sustaining long-term research projects involves patience, curiosity and determination, but also a great deal of emotional and psychological support. For this I owe a major debt to my wife Anja Macher. She not only created the conditions that have allowed for steady creative engagement over a long period, but joined me on archival trips to Los Angeles, Johannesburg and a fieldtrip to Swaziland, and patiently listened to pages and pages of text readings, simply and dispassionately identifying them either as 'lively' or 'boring'.

Intellectual friends have played a particularly supportive role. My brother, the South African anthropologist Leslie J. Bank, spent years working collaboratively on an edited collection on Monica Hunter Wilson, one of the six women who will feature in this study. He has helped me retain a sense of enthusiasm and perspective on the long road. Diana Wylie read a draft manuscript at a stage where I was veering off course and commented with warmth, insight, openness and enthusiasm. Karen Tranberg Hansen helped me formulate my publication proposal and read the entire manuscript with a trained critical eye. Elizabeth F. Colson got in touch with me after reading the collective edition on Monica Wilson and not only provided the most incisive of commentaries on all my chapters, but convinced me that bringing to life these women intellectuals was a worthwhile and relevant endeavour. Adam Kuper, Michael W. Young and Nancy Lutkehaus added generous endorsements, while Kuper and John Sharp provided generous reviews of the book in manuscript form. They inspired me to produce a more stirring and fitting conclusion.

I own a special debt to my research assistant Sue Ogterop whose long experience of accessing data at the African Studies Library of the University of Cape Town enormously enriched all six biographies. I am also grateful to her for meticulous copy-editing. I sent each of the chapters to specific readers and have acknowledged them individually in each case, but thank them collectively here. My long-time visual and design guru, Jenny Sandler, has assisted me with the choice of visuals and has patiently managed their arrangement and archiving.

xii



#### Acknowledgements

xiii

In her remarkable self-reflective sounding on the biographical constructions of Sylvia Plath, Janet Malcolm identified living descendants as the biographer's sworn enemy. 'They are [she declares] like the hostile tribes an explorer encounters and must ruthlessly subdue to claim his territory.' Fortunately, my own experience of relations with relatives has been far more benign; in fact, positively charmed. Eileen's granddaughter and daughter-in-law, Emily-Ann and Dulcie Krige, have selflessly copy-edited and meticulously corrected not only the chapter on their beloved forebear, but the entire manuscript in final draft forms picking out scores of errors in each chapter. This is quite apart from their sharing of deeply private papers on Eileen, including love letters between her and Jack, and Emily-Ann's expert guidance through her grandmother's extensive archive based on her own 144 page index! Jenny and Mary Kuper have shared memories, family photographs and patiently read and reread sundry draft chapters on Hilda. Their disarming honesty about Hilda as a surprisingly doting wife and dedicated mother has profoundly reshaped my appreciation of her life and work. I have likewise been deeply moved by Dame Ruth Runciman's openness in sharing often painful details about her mother Ellen Hellmann's difficult life, and have been touched by her gratitude for my efforts to tell an alternative and more appreciative story about Ellen. Diana W. Higgs allowed me to use photographs from the Winifred Hoernle Papers. Francis and Tim Wilson gave permission for reproduction of visuals from the Wilson Collection.

My main intellectual debt is to my selfless friend, the historian and editor Russell Martin who has vastly improved each of the narratives that make up this book. He has taken my bloated, baggy draft chapters, one at a time, and knocked them into readable shape. He has made accessible stories of my typically long-winded excursions into the personal lives of my cast, trimming away side characters, unnecessary detail and cumbersome qualification. After all, it is not everyone who will casually enquire over a hand of bridge whether you, too, happen to be in the habit of reading and rereading, from cover to cover, the 1965 Onions edition and more occasionally the 1996 Burchfield edition of Fowler's classic *Modern English Usage*.

Finally, I am grateful to the midwives from CUP and the International African Institute who have nursed this book to life. Stephanie Kitchen remains a model of warmth, efficiency and enthusiasm. Sarah E. Green was patient and generous regarding my ever-expanding wish list for last-minute visuals, while Velmurugan Inbasigamoni injected a welcome energy in seeing the book through to copy-editing, layout and printing. Margie Ramsay is responsible for the multi-layered and enticing Index.