

THE GLOBALIZATION OF ADOPTION

This book expands our understanding of a growing yet largely unstudied phenomenon: the movement of children across borders through intercountry adoption. What explains the spread of intercountry adoption through the international system over time? McBride investigates the interconnected networks of states, individuals, and adoption agencies that have collaborated to develop the practice of intercountry adoption we see today. This book tells the story of how adoption agencies mediate between individuals and states in the process in two ways: first, by teaching states about intercountry adoption as a policy and, second, by helping states implement intercountry adoption as a practice. Ultimately, McBride argues that this process of states learning about intercountry adoption from adoption agencies has facilitated the global development of the practice in the past seventy years.

BECCA MCBRIDE is Assistant Professor of Political Science and International Relations at Calvin College in Grand Rapids, Michigan, where she teaches courses on international relations and comparative politics. She holds a PhD in International Relations from Vanderbilt University and an MA in Russian and East European Affairs from Georgetown University. She is currently working on an MEd in Curriculum and Instruction. Her research focuses on processes of diffusion, human rights and children in the international system, intercountry adoption, and more effective pedagogy for teaching across cultures. Before entering academia, she worked for the CIA as a Russian political and leadership analyst.





THE GLOBALIZATION OF ADOPTION

Individuals, States, and Agencies across Borders

BECCA MCBRIDE

Calvin College





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107149632

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
McBride, Rebecca Ann, author.
The globalization of adoption : individuals, states, and agencies across borders / Becca McBride.

New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

LCCN 2016017584 | ISBN 9781107149632 (hardback)

LCSH: Intercountry adoption – History. | Intercountry adoption – Political aspects. | BISAC: LAW / Family Law / General.

LCC HV875.5 .M325 2016 | DDC 362.734-dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2016017584

ISBN 978-1-107-14963-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

This does not constitute an official release of CIA information. All statements of fact, opinion, or analysis expressed are those of the author and do not reflect the official positions or views of the Central Intelligence Agency (CIA) or any other U.S. Government agency. Nothing in the contents should be construed as asserting or implying U.S. Government authentication of information or CIA endorsement of the author's views. This material has been reviewed solely for classification.



Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-14963-2 - The Globalization of Adoption: Individuals, States, and Agencies Across Borders Becca Mcbride Frontmatter More information

CONTENTS

	List of figures page viii List of tables ix List of graphs x Acknowledgments xi	
1	The globalization of intercountry adoption 1	
	I A puzzling trend 1	
	II The argument in brief: diffusion through state learning 3A Existing explanations 5	
	III Why should there be a political study on intercounadoption? 9	try
	IV Roadmap 11	
	V Conclusion 12	
2	The policies and practices of intercountry adoption	14
	 I Overlapping legal systems 15 A The legal and political systems of adopting states 16 B The Legal and political systems of states with vulnerable children 20 C The international legal framework for coordinating adoptions 26 	
	II Conclusion 28	
3	A theory of the diffusion of intercountry adoption	29
	I Main themes 31	
	II Why allow intercountry adoption? – Potential answ from cooperation literature 33	ers/



vi

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-14963-2 - The Globalization of Adoption: Individuals, States, and Agencies Across Borders Becca Mcbride Frontmatter More information

CONTENTS
III Theoretical framework part 1: diffusion through learning 39 A Adoption agencies as agents of state learning 41 B The learning process for states with vulnerable children 43 C The learning process for adopting states 45
 IV Theoretical framework part 2: domestic characteristics and state choices 49 A Domestic characteristics and receptivity to intercountry adoption 49 B Domestic characteristics and intercountry adoption partnerships 55
V Conclusion 56
4 Data to investigate global trends in intercountry adoption 58
I Data on patterns in states' decision to allow foreign adoption of children 59 A Does the state "allow" intercountry adoption? 59 B When did the state move from a "no" to a "yes"? 65
 II Data on how adopting states choose partners for intercountry adoption 68 A States' commitment to the Hague Convention 68 B Partner choice for intercountry adoption 69
III Conclusion 75
5 Why do states allow foreign adoption? 76
I Methods and the model 77 A Modeling challenges 80
 II Are states' choices to allow intercountry adoption interdependent? 81 A Is intercountry adoption a domestic political process? 85 B How do domestic characteristics shape the state's decision? 87
III Conclusion 91
6 How do states choose partners for intercountry adoption? 93



CONTENTS vii

I Is the Hague Convention an effective source of information? 94

II The model 97

III Findings 99

IV Discussion 102

V Conclusion 104

7 The future of intercountry adoption 107

I A happy ending? 108

II A recap of the argument 112

III Implications 115

IV Conclusion 117

Appendix 1 State-by-state sources for dependent

variable 121

Appendix 2 SAOM model information and

justification 187

Bibliography 189

Index 197



FIGURES

- 3.1 Sending states that allowed intercountry adoption in 1985 (top) and 2005 (bottom). White=Yes. page 30
- 5.1 Predicted probability of allowing intercountry adoption (other variables at mean). 83
- 5.2 Predicted probabilities of allowing intercountry adoption. 84

viii



TABLES

page 60

4.2	Logistics of intercountry adoption 62	
4.3	Does a state allow intercountry adoption? 64	
4.4	Dates when states allowed intercountry adoption	67
5.1	Learning model 82	
5.2	Domestic political model 86	
5.3	Multivariate models 88	
6.1	Top ten states allowing foreign adoption of children:	
	2005–2009 96	
6.2	SOAM results 101	

4.1 Legality of intercountry adoption



GRAPHS

- 4.1 2005 International Child-Flow Network (Circles=Sending states, Squares=Receiving states. Gray=Hague committed, Black=Not committed) page 72
- 4.2 2006 International Child-Flow Network (Circles=Sending states, Squares=Receiving states. Gray=Hague committed, Black=Not committed)73
- 4.3 2007 International Child-Flow Network (Circles=Sending states, Squares=Receiving states. Gray=Hague committed, Black=Not committed) 73
- 4.4 2008 International Child-Flow Network (Circles=Sending states, Squares=Receiving states. Gray=Hague committed, Black=Not committed) 74
- 4.5 2009 International Child-Flow Network (Circles=Sending states, Squares=Receiving states. Gray=Hague committed, Black=Not committed) 74



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work represents six years of my life, and it would not have been possible without the army of people who surrounded me and supported me through the process. I owe an eternal debt to the body of scholars who helped me take seeds of ideas and develop them into something I could cultivate until they bore fruit. I would never have started the project without the support of my graduate committee at Vanderbilt, who started investing in my progress long before it was required, and never failed to provide support and guidance when needed. Dr. James Lee Ray always pushed me to succeed, but also gave me room to develop my own ideas and design. I am grateful for the hours he spent reading and rereading my thoughts, and patiently nudging me in more fruitful directions.

Dr. Giacomo Chiozza has truly embodied the most valued qualities of an advisor and mentor. He taught me what it means to be a scholar by instruction, interaction, and example. Giacomo held me to high standards that at times seemed impossible to achieve, but he always graciously gave me the tools to succeed. Moreover, Giacomo's investment in his students through Vanderbilt's International Relations Colloquium was one of the most influential components of my graduate experience.

Dr. Carol Atkinson is one of the key reasons I have achieved any career goals. She was the first to ask me about my ideas, the first to listen to them, and the first to tell me they had promise. She showed enthusiasm when my energy was failing, and she believed in me more than I believed in myself. Dr. Dawn Iacobucci's modeling help was invaluable, and her expertise in diffusion research helped me situate my ideas within a valuable literature. Finally, I would have never finished the project and navigated the publication process without Dr. Marc Hetherington's support, who supported me as a friend far beyond when he was expected to support me in any official capacity.

Outside Vanderbilt, I have been the beneficiary of surprising and gracious support from a network of scholars who gave me the benefit of doubt when I was young and inexperienced in my career. Marijke



xii

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Breuning encouraged my intercountry adoption research when others doubted its validity, and her friendship has helped me overcome significant challenges as my career has developed. There are countless reviewers who read manuscripts, journal article submissions, and other components of this work. Because they were anonymous I cannot thank them by name, but their comments have been invaluable as I have developed this project. Thanks to the network of scholars who invited me to participate in panels and present my research, your support for the work of a graduate student will never be forgotten. I hope I encourage my own students the way your efforts encouraged me. I would also like to thank the "Smith" family who let me share their story in the pages of my book. I am so thankful I was able to celebrate with you from afar as we saw the completion of your adoption journey.

There are hundreds of people who came together to provide a support network that enabled me to complete graduate school and survive the first two years at Calvin as a mother of two small children. My parents and siblings have stood in for me when I have had to miss school events, and babysitters have spent hours caring for my children. My department chair, Kevin den Dulk, welcomed me to a new community, helped my husband refinish wood floors, and even walked my children to school so I could attend important meetings. Moreover, he has helped me navigate that awkward transition from graduate student to independent scholar.

I have been encouraged to grow into the supportive community I have found at Calvin College. Before there was any evidence that I was a worthy investment, multiple groups at the college were giving me surprising support. In some cases, I have known my advocates – people like Cheryl Brandsen, Matt Walhout, Jennifer Holberg, James K.A. Smith, Kevin den Dulk, Susan Felch, Neil Carlson, Dean Ward, and David Smith. In other cases, there have been people advocating for me behind the scenes anonymously. Your vote of confidence has been incredibly encouraging. This work has been generously supported by a Calvin Research Fellowship, two McGregor Research Fellowships, a Henry Institute Grant, and two Calvin Contingency Grants. I have been blessed to land in a generous community that values scholarship as much as it values teaching.

Perhaps my greatest inspiration at Calvin is the body of students I have the privilege of teaching every day. More than just a part of my professional life, they have also become part of my family. I will forever remember the students who first trusted me enough to take my classes and then registered for my classes a second semester. It would be



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

xiii

impossible to name all the students who have written letters to advocate on my behalf, let me share in their stories, brought me donuts and chocolate and coffee, helped move my family in the midst of a looming deadline, prayed for me, encouraged me, and made me smile. My time spent with students is truly the highlight of my professional life. Of all these students, Nydia Langill has given me something to root for, and she has let me join her journey of victory even while she has joined in mine. Finally, I would never have finished this project without research assistance from Brooke Bonnema, Ian Graham, Laju Eresanara, and most of all Sung Hun Choi. Sung Hun walked alongside me in the final and hardest miles of this project, and his skilled analysis and encouragement helped me survive.

Keegan and McKenna have literally lived their childhood with me writing this book. They were five and two when I started, and they will be eleven and eight upon its publication. My hope is that they will have learned from my experience the same lessons my parents taught me: that dreams are worth pursuing and hard work is the key to success. My kids see the world around them as magical, and they know how to celebrate better than anyone else I know. I aspire to be more like them, and I hope they are proud of me too.

Adam, my awesome husband of fifteen years, is quite possibly superhuman. He is the one who encouraged me to pursue a PhD, even when the thought overwhelmed me. He has worked a full-time job and been a full-time dad, all while being my Excel coach. He has listened to every idea, every presentation, and given me honest feedback even when he knew it would make me mad. This book is as much his victory as it is mine. I cannot wait to see where the years take us. Wherever we end up, it will be amazing because we end up there together.

And finally, this book is an amazing testament to the parents who raised me to work hard and pursue dreams. The childhood hours spent observing coffee shop debates between my father and other men in my small Tennessee town instilled in me a love of politics. The years spent watching my father work the farm by day and play fiddle by night showed me that hard work comes in many forms and is always the key to success. My mother's years of sacrifice as she raised three children demonstrated that the most successful people are those who are more focused on others than they are on themselves. I only hope I leave a legacy as faithful as theirs. Thank you for modeling for me the true nature of achievement.