

US - Countervailing and Anti-Dumping Measures

UNITED STATES - COUNTERVAILING AND ANTI-DUMPING MEASURES ON CERTAIN PRODUCTS FROM CHINA

Report of the Appellate Body WT/DS449/AB/R*

Adopted by the Dispute Settlement Body on 22 July 2014

China, Appellant/Appellee
United States, Other Appellant/Appellee
Australia, Third Participant
Canada, Third Participant
European Union, Third Participant
India, Third Participant
Japan, Third Participant
Russia, Third Participant
Turkey, Third Participant
Viet Nam, Third Participant

Appellate Body Division:

Bhatia, Presiding Member Chang, Member Zhang, Member

TABLE OF CONTENTS

				Page
1.	INTF	RODUC	TION	3040
2.			TS OF THE PARTICIPANTS AND THIRD NTS	3046
			s of Error by China – Appellant	
		2.1.1	Interpretation and application of Article X:2 of the GATT 1994	3047
		2.1.2	Article 11 of the DSU	3051
		2.1.3	China's request for completion of the analysis	3052

^{*} The correction notified in WT/DS449/AB//R/Corr.1 has been made in this report.



Report		ppellate I	-	d II 's 10's A - 11	20.60
	2.2	_		the United States – Appellee	3060
		2.2.1		station and application of Article X:2 of the	3060
		2.2.2	Article	11 of the DSU	3065
		2.2.3	China's	request for completion of the analysis	3067
	2.3	Claim	s of Erro	r by the United States - Other Appellant	3071
		2.3.1	Article	6.2 of the DSU	3071
	2.4	Argur	nents of	China – Appellee	3075
		2.4.1	Article	6.2 of the DSU	3075
	2.5	Argur	nents of	the Third Participants	3079
		2.5.1	Austral	ia	3079
		2.5.2	Europea	an Union	3080
		2.5.3	Japan		3081
3.	ISSU	ES RAI	ISED IN	THIS APPEAL	3082
4.	ANA	LYSIS	OF THE	APPELLATE BODY	3084
	4.1	Articl	e 6.2 of t	he DSU	3084
		4.1.1	Functio	n of Article 6.2 of the DSU	3085
		4.1.2	The me	asure(s) at issue as identified in the panel	
			-		3088
		4.1.3		ited States' claim that China's panel request sistent with Article 6.2 of the DSU	3090
			4.1.3.1	The text and narrative of the panel request	3090
			4.1.3.2	Abandoned claims	3104
			4.1.3.3	Conclusions	3106
	4.2	Articl	e X:2 of	the GATT 1994	3107
		4.2.1	The Par	nel's findings	3107
		4.2.2	Interpre	etation and application of Article X:2	3110
			4.2.2.1	Function of Article X:2	3110
			4.2.2.2	China's appeal of the Panel's interpretation of Article X:2	3112
			4.2.2.3	Determination of the meaning of municipal law for purposes of Article X:2	3121
			4.2.2.4	Identification of the baseline of comparison under Article X:2	
			4.2.2.5	The Panel's application of the baseline of	
				comparison to the measure at issue	3128
		4.2.3	Conclus	sions	3128
	4.3	Articl	e 11 of th	ne DSU	3129



		US - Countervailing and A	nti-Dumping Measures
	4.4	Completion of the Analysis Under Article X:2 of	f the
		GATT 1994	3130
5.	FINI	DINGS AND CONCLUSIONS	3161
AN	NEX 1.		3163
ANI	NEX 2.		3166
ANN	NEX 3		3168



Report of the Appellate Body

CASES CITED IN THIS REPORT

Short Title	Full Case Title and Citation
Australia – Apples	Appellate Body Report, <i>Australia – Measures Affecting the Importation of Apples from New Zealand</i> , WT/DS367/AB/R, adopted 17 December 2010, DSR 2010:V, p. 2175
Australia – Salmon	Appellate Body Report, <i>Australia – Measures Affecting Importation of Salmon</i> , WT/DS18/AB/R, adopted 6 November 1998, DSR 1998:VIII, p. 3327
Brazil – Desiccated Coconut	Appellate Body Report, <i>Brazil – Measures Affecting Desiccated Coconut</i> , WT/DS22/AB/R, adopted 20 March 1997, DSR 1997:I, p. 167
Brazil – Retreaded Tyres	Appellate Body Report, <i>Brazil – Measures Affecting Imports of Retreaded Tyres</i> , WT/DS332/AB/R, adopted 17 December 2007, DSR 2007:IV, p. 1527
Canada – Aircraft (Article 21.5 – Brazil)	Appellate Body Report, Canada – Measures Affecting the Export of Civilian Aircraft – Recourse by Brazil to Article 21.5 of the DSU, WT/DS70/AB/RW, adopted 4 August 2000, DSR 2000:IX, p. 4299
Canada – Autos	Appellate Body Report, <i>Canada – Certain Measures Affecting the Automotive Industry</i> , WT/DS139/AB/R, WT/DS142/AB/R, adopted 19 June 2000, DSR 2000:VI, p. 2985
Canada – Periodicals	Appellate Body Report, <i>Canada – Certain Measures Concerning Periodicals</i> , WT/DS31/AB/R, adopted 30 July 1997, DSR 1997:I, p. 449
Canada – Renewable Energy /Canada – Feed-in Tariff Program	Appellate Body Reports, Canada – Certain Measures Affecting the Renewable Energy Generation Sector / Canada – Measures Relating to the Feed-in Tariff Program, WT/DS412/AB/R / WT/DS426/AB/R, adopted 24 May 2013
Canada – Wheat Exports and Grain Imports	Appellate Body Report, Canada – Measures Relating to Exports of Wheat and Treatment of Imported Grain, WT/DS276/AB/R, adopted 27 September 2004, DSR 2004:VI, p. 2739
Chile – Price Band System	Appellate Body Report, Chile – Price Band System and Safeguard Measures Relating to Certain Agricultural Products, WT/DS207/AB/R, adopted 23 October 2002, DSR 2002:VIII, p. 3045 (Corr.1, DSR 2006:XII, p. 5473)
Chile – Price Band System (Article 21.5 – Argentina)	Appellate Body Report, Chile – Price Band System and Safeguard Measures Relating to Certain Agricultural Products – Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by Argentina, WT/DS207/AB/RW, adopted 22 May 2007, DSR 2007:II, p. 513
China – Auto Parts	Appellate Body Reports, China – Measures Affecting Imports of Automobile Parts, WT/DS339/AB/R / WT/DS340/AB/R, adopted 12 January 2009, DSR 2009:I, p. 3
China – Rare Earths	Panel Reports, <i>China – Measures Related to the Exportation of Rare Earths, Tungsten, and Molybdenum</i> , WT/DS431/R / WT/DS432/R / WT/DS433/R / and Add.1, circulated to WTO Members 26 March 2014 [appeal in progress]



US - Countervailing and Anti-Dumping Measures

Short Title	Full Case Title and Citation
China – Raw Materials	Appellate Body Reports, <i>China – Measures Related to the Exportation of Various Raw Materials</i> , WT/DS394/AB/R / WT/DS395/AB/R / WT/DS398/AB/R, adopted 22 February 2012, DSR 2012:VII, p. 3295
EC – Approval and Marketing of Biotech Products	Panel Reports, European Communities – Measures Affecting the Approval and Marketing of Biotech Products, WT/DS291/R / WT/DS292/R / WT/DS293/R / Add.1 to Add.9 and Corr.1, adopted 21 November 2006, DSR 2006:III, p. 847
EC – Asbestos	Appellate Body Report, European Communities – Measures Affecting Asbestos and Asbestos-Containing Products, WT/DS135/AB/R, adopted 5 April 2001, DSR 2001:VII, p. 3243
EC – Bananas III	Appellate Body Report, European Communities – Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas, WT/DS27/AB/R, adopted 25 September 1997, DSR 1997:II, p. 591
EC – Bed Linen (Article 21.5 – India)	Appellate Body Report, European Communities – Anti-Dumping Duties on Imports of Cotton-Type Bed Linen from India – Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by India, WT/DS141/AB/RW, adopted 24 April 2003, DSR 2003:III, p. 965
EC – Export Subsidies on Sugar	Appellate Body Report, European Communities – Export Subsidies on Sugar, WT/DS265/AB/R, WT/DS266/AB/R, WT/DS283/AB/R, adopted 19 May 2005, DSR 2005:XIII, p. 6365
EC – Fasteners (China)	Appellate Body Report, European Communities – Definitive Anti- Dumping Measures on Certain Iron or Steel Fasteners from China, WT/DS397/AB/R, adopted 28 July 2011, DSR 2011:VII, p. 3995
EC – Hormones	Appellate Body Report, <i>EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones)</i> , WT/DS26/AB/R, WT/DS48/AB/R, adopted 13 February 1998, DSR 1998:I, p. 135
EC – IT Products	Panel Reports, European Communities and its member States – Tariff Treatment of Certain Information Technology Products, WT/DS375/R / WT/DS376/R / WT/DS377/R, adopted 21 September 2010, DSR 2010:III, p. 933
EC – Poultry	Appellate Body Report, European Communities – Measures Affecting the Importation of Certain Poultry Products, WT/DS69/AB/R, adopted 23 July 1998, DSR 1998:V, p. 2031
EC – Sardines	Appellate Body Report, <i>European Communities – Trade Description of Sardines</i> , WT/DS231/AB/R, adopted 23 October 2002, DSR 2002:VIII, p. 3359
EC – Seal Products	Appellate Body Reports, European Communities – Measures Prohibiting the Importation and Marketing of Seal Products, WT/DS400/AB/R / WT/DS401/AB/R, adopted 18 June 2014
EC – Selected Customs Matters	Appellate Body Report, <i>European Communities – Selected Customs Matters</i> , WT/DS315/AB/R, adopted 11 December 2006, DSR 2006:IX, p. 3791
EC – Selected Customs Matters	Panel Report, European Communities – Selected Customs Matters, WT/DS315/R, adopted 11 December 2006, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS315/AB/R, DSR 2006:IX, p. 3915
EC – Tariff Preferences	Appellate Body Report, European Communities – Conditions for the Granting of Tariff Preferences to Developing Countries, WT/DS246/AB/R, adopted 20 April 2004, DSR 2004:III, p. 925



Report of the Appellate Body

Short Title	Full Case Title and Citation
EC – Trademarks and Geographical Indications (Australia)	Panel Report, European Communities – Protection of Trademarks and Geographical Indications for Agricultural Products and Foodstuffs, Complaint by Australia, WT/DS290/R, adopted 20 April 2005, DSR 2005:X, p. 4603
EC – Tube or Pipe Fittings	Appellate Body Report, European Communities – Anti-Dumping Duties on Malleable Cast Iron Tube or Pipe Fittings from Brazil, WT/DS219/AB/R, adopted 18 August 2003, DSR 2003:VI, p. 2613
EC and certain member States – Large Civil Aircraft	Appellate Body Report, European Communities and Certain Member States – Measures Affecting Trade in Large Civil Aircraft, WT/DS316/AB/R, adopted 1 June 2011, DSR 2011:I, p. 7
Guatemala – Cement I	Appellate Body Report, <i>Guatemala – Anti-Dumping Investigation Regarding Portland Cement from Mexico</i> , WT/DS60/AB/R, adopted 25 November 1998, DSR 1998:IX, p. 3767
India – Additional Import Duties	Appellate Body Report, <i>India – Additional and Extra-Additional Duties on Imports from the United States</i> , WT/DS360/AB/R, adopted 17 November 2008, DSR 2008:XX, p. 8223
India – Patents (US)	Appellate Body Report, <i>India – Patent Protection for Pharmaceutical and Agricultural Chemical Products</i> , WT/DS50/AB/R, adopted 16 January 1998, DSR 1998:I, p. 9
Japan – Agricultural Products II	Appellate Body Report, <i>Japan – Measures Affecting Agricultural Products</i> , WT/DS76/AB/R, adopted 19 March 1999, DSR 1999:I, p. 277
Japan – Alcoholic Beverages II	Appellate Body Report, <i>Japan – Taxes on Alcoholic Beverages</i> , WT/DS8/AB/R, WT/DS10/AB/R, WT/DS11/AB/R, adopted 1 November 1996, DSR 1996:I, p. 97
Japan – Apples	Appellate Body Report, <i>Japan – Measures Affecting the Importation of Apples</i> , WT/DS245/AB/R, adopted 10 December 2003, DSR 2003:IX, p. 4391
Japan – DRAMs (Korea)	Appellate Body Report, <i>Japan – Countervailing Duties on Dynamic Random Access Memories from Korea</i> , WT/DS336/AB/R and Corr.1, adopted 17 December 2007, DSR 2007:VII, p. 2703
Korea – Alcoholic Beverages	Appellate Body Report, <i>Korea – Taxes on Alcoholic Beverages</i> , WT/DS75/AB/R, WT/DS84/AB/R, adopted 17 February 1999, DSR 1999:I, p. 3
Korea – Dairy	Appellate Body Report, <i>Korea – Definitive Safeguard Measure on Imports of Certain Dairy Products</i> , WT/DS98/AB/R, adopted 12 January 2000, DSR 2000:I, p. 3
Thailand – H-Beams	Appellate Body Report, Thailand – Anti-Dumping Duties on Angles, Shapes and Sections of Iron or Non-Alloy Steel and H-Beams from Poland, WT/DS122/AB/R, adopted 5 April 2001, DSR 2001:VII, p. 2701
US – 1916 Act (EC)	Panel Report, <i>United States – Anti-Dumping Act of 1916, Complaint by the European Communities</i> , WT/DS136/R and Corr.1, adopted 26 September 2000, upheld by Appellate Body Report WT/DS136/AB/R, WT/DS162/AB/R, DSR 2000:X, p. 4593
US – Anti-Dumping and Countervailing Duties (China)	Appellate Body Report, United States – Definitive Anti-Dumping and Countervailing Duties on Certain Products from China, WT/DS379/AB/R, adopted 25 March 2011, DSR 2011:V, p. 2869



US - Countervailing and Anti-Dumping Measures

Short Title	Full Case Title and Citation
US – Anti-Dumping and Countervailing Duties (China)	Panel Report, <i>United States – Definitive Anti-Dumping and Countervailing Duties on Certain Products from China</i> , WT/DS379/R, adopted 25 March 2011, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS379/AB/R, DSR 2011:VI, p. 3143
US – Carbon Steel	Appellate Body Report, United States – Countervailing Duties on Certain Corrosion-Resistant Carbon Steel Flat Products from Germany, WT/DS213/AB/R and Corr.1, adopted 19 December 2002, DSR 2002:IX, p. 3779
US – Continued Suspension	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Continued Suspension of Obligations in the EC – Hormones Dispute</i> , WT/DS320/AB/R, adopted 14 November 2008, DSR 2008:X, p. 3507
US – Continued Zeroing	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Continued Existence and Application of Zeroing Methodology</i> , WT/DS350/AB/R, adopted 19 February 2009, DSR 2009:III, p. 1291
US – COOL	Appellate Body Reports, <i>United States – Certain Country of Origin Labelling (COOL) Requirements</i> , WT/DS384/AB/R / WT/DS386/AB/R, adopted 23 July 2012, DSR 2012:V, p. 2449
US – Corrosion -Resistant Steel Sunset Review	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Sunset Review of Anti-Dumping Duties on Corrosion-Resistant Carbon Steel Flat Products from Japan</i> , WT/DS244/AB/R, adopted 9 January 2004, DSR 2004:I, p. 3
US – Countervailing and Anti-Dumping Measures (China)	Panel Report, <i>United States – Countervailing and Anti-Dumping Measures on Certain Products from China</i> , WT/DS449/R and Add.1, circulated to WTO Members 27 March 2014 [appeal in progress]
US – Countervailing Duty Investigation on DRAMS	Appellate Body Report, United States – Countervailing Duty Investigation on Dynamic Random Access Memory Semiconductors (DRAMS) from Korea, WT/DS296/AB/R, adopted 20 July 2005, DSR 2005:XVI, p. 8131
US – FSC	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Tax Treatment for "Foreign Sales Corporations"</i> , WT/DS108/AB/R, adopted 20 March 2000, DSR 2000:III, p. 1619
US – Gambling	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Measures Affecting the Cross-Border Supply of Gambling and Betting Services</i> , WT/DS285/AB/R, adopted 20 April 2005, DSR 2005:XII, p. 5663 (Corr.1, DSR 2006:XII, p. 5475)
US – Gasoline	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Standards for Reformulated and Conventional Gasoline</i> , WT/DS2/AB/R, adopted 20 May 1996, DSR 1996:I, p. 3
US – Hot-Rolled Steel	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Anti-Dumping Measures on Certain Hot-Rolled Steel Products from Japan</i> , WT/DS184/AB/R, adopted 23 August 2001, DSR 2001:X, p. 4697
US – Lamb	Appellate Body Report, United States – Safeguard Measures on Imports of Fresh, Chilled or Frozen Lamb Meat from New Zealand and Australia, WT/DS177/AB/R, WT/DS178/AB/R, adopted 16 May 2001, DSR 2001:IX, p. 4051
US – Large Civil Aircraft (2 nd complaint)	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Measures Affecting Trade in Large Civil Aircraft (Second Complaint)</i> , WT/DS353/AB/R, adopted 23 March 2012, DSR 2012:I, p. 7



Report of the Appellate Body

Short Title	Full Case Title and Citation
US – Offset Act (Byrd Amendment)	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Continued Dumping and Subsidy Offset Act of 2000</i> , WT/DS217/AB/R, WT/DS234/AB/R, adopted 27 January 2003, DSR 2003:I, p. 375
US – Oil Country Tubular Goods Sunset Reviews	Appellate Body Report, United States – Sunset Reviews of Anti-Dumping Measures on Oil Country Tubular Goods from Argentina, WT/DS268/AB/R, adopted 17 December 2004, DSR 2004:VII, p. 3257
US – Section 211 Appropriations Act	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Section 211 Omnibus Appropriations Act of 1998</i> , WT/DS176/AB/R, adopted 1 February 2002, DSR 2002:II, p. 589
US – Shrimp	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products</i> , WT/DS58/AB/R, adopted 6 November 1998, DSR 1998:VII, p. 2755
US – Softwood Lumber IV	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Final Countervailing Duty Determination with Respect to Certain Softwood Lumber from Canada</i> , WT/DS257/AB/R, adopted 17 February 2004, DSR 2004:II, p. 571
US – Softwood Lumber IV (Article 21.5 – Canada)	Appellate Body Report, United States – Final Countervailing Duty Determination with Respect to Certain Softwood Lumber from Canada – Recourse by Canada to Article 21.5 of the DSU, WT/DS257/AB/RW, adopted 20 December 2005, DSR 2005:XXIII, p. 11357
US – Softwood Lumber VI (Article 21.5 – Canada)	Appellate Body Report, United States – Investigation of the International Trade Commission in Softwood Lumber from Canada – Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by Canada, WT/DS277/AB/RW, adopted 9 May 2006, and Corr.1, DSR 2006:XI, p. 4865
US – Steel Safeguards	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Definitive Safeguard Measures on Imports of Certain Steel Products</i> , WT/DS248/AB/R, WT/DS249/AB/R, WT/DS251/AB/R, WT/DS252/AB/R, WT/DS253/AB/R, WT/DS253/AB/R, WT/DS254/AB/R, WT/DS259/AB/R, adopted 10 December 2003, DSR 2003:VII, p. 3117
US – Underwear	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Restrictions on Imports of Cotton and Man-made Fibre Underwear</i> , WT/DS24/AB/R, adopted 25 February 1997, DSR 1997:I, p. 11
US – Upland Cotton	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Subsidies on Upland Cotton</i> , WT/DS267/AB/R, adopted 21 March 2005, DSR 2005:I, p. 3
US – Upland Cotton (Article 21.5 – Brazil)	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Subsidies on Upland Cotton – Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by Brazil</i> , WT/DS267/AB/RW, adopted 20 June 2008, DSR 2008:III, p. 809
US – Wheat Gluten	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Definitive Safeguard Measures on Imports of Wheat Gluten from the European Communities</i> , WT/DS166/AB/R, adopted 19 January 2001, DSR 2001:II, p. 717



US - Countervailing and Anti-Dumping Measures

Short Title	Full Case Title and Citation
US – Wool Shirts and Blouses	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Measure Affecting Imports of Woven Wool Shirts and Blouses from India</i> , WT/DS33/AB/R, adopted 23 May 1997, and Corr.1, DSR 1997:I, p. 323
US – Zeroing (EC)	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Laws, Regulations and Methodology for Calculating Dumping Margins ("Zeroing")</i> , WT/DS294/AB/R, adopted 9 May 2006, and Corr.1, DSR 2006:II, p. 417
US – Zeroing (Japan) (Article 21.5 – Japan)	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Measures Relating to Zeroing and Sunset Reviews – Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by Japan</i> , WT/DS322/AB/RW, adopted 31 August 2009, DSR 2009:VIII, p. 3441



Report of the Appellate Body

PANEL EXHIBITS CITED IN THIS REPORT

Exhibit No.	Description
CHI-1	United States Public Law No. 112-99, An act to apply the countervailing duty provisions of the Tariff Act of 1930 to nonmarket economy countries, and for other purposes, 126 Stat. 265 (13 March 2012)
CHI-2	United States Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit, Georgetown Steel Corporation v. United States, 801 F.2d 1308 (Fed. Cir. 1986)
CHI-3	United States Court of International Trade, GPX International Tire Corporation v. United States, 645 F. Supp. 2d 1231 (CIT 18 September 2009)
CHI-6	United States Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit, GPX International Tire Corporation v. United States, 666 F.3d 732 (Fed. Cir. 2011)
CHI-7	United States Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit, GPX International Tire Corporation v. United States, 678 F.3d 1308 (Fed. Cir. 2012)
CHI-14	USDOC, Countervailing Duties: Final Rule, <i>United States Federal Register</i> , Vol. 63, No. 227 (25 November 1998), pp. 65348-65360
CHI-15	Memorandum dated 18 September 2002 from Richard W. Moreland, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Group I Import Administration, to Faryar Shirzad, Assistant Secretary for Import Administration, "Issues and Decision Memorandum for the Final Determination in the Countervailing Duty Investigation of Sulfanilic Acid from Hungary"
CHI-83	Legal Opinion of Richard H. Fallon, Jr, Professor of Law, Harvard University
CHI-124	Supplemental Legal Opinion of Richard H. Fallon, Jr, Professor of Law, Harvard University
USA-2	United States Code, Title 19, Chapter 4, Section 1671
USA-7	USDOC, Carbon Steel Wire Rod From Czechoslovakia: Final Negative Countervailing Duty Determination, <i>United States Federal Register</i> , Vol. 49, No. 89 (7 May 1984), pp. 19370-19374
USA-10	USDOC, Carbon Steel Wire Rod From Poland: Final Negative Countervailing Duty Determination, <i>United States Federal Register</i> , Vol. 49, No. 89 (7 May 1984), pp. 19374-19378
USA-21	General Issues Appendix, appended to the Final Affirmative Countervailing Duty Determination: Certain Steel Products From Austria, <i>United States Federal Register</i> , Vol. 58, No. 130 (9 July 1993), pp. 37225-37261
USA-23	USDOC, Notice of Initiation of Countervailing Duty Investigations: Coated Free Sheet Paper From the People's Republic of China, Indonesia, and the Republic of Korea, United States Federal Register, Vol. 71, No. 227 (27 November 2006), pp. 68549-68549