

HUMANITY AT SEA

This interdisciplinary study engages law, history, and political theory in a first attempt to crystallize the lessons the global “refugee crisis” can teach us about the nature of international law. It connects the dots between the actions of Jewish migrants to Palestine after World War II, Vietnamese “boat people,” Haitian refugees seeking to reach Florida, Middle Eastern migrants and refugees bound for Australia, and Syrian refugees currently crossing the Mediterranean, and then legal responses by states and international organizations to these movements. Through its account of maritime migration, the book proposes a theory of human rights modeled around an encounter between individuals in which one of the parties is at great risk. It weaves together primary sources, insights from the work of twentieth-century thinkers such as Hannah Arendt and Emmanuel Levinas, and other legal materials to form a rich account of an issue of increasing global concern.

ITAMAR MANN is a member of the Faculty of Law at the University of Haifa, Israel. Before moving to Haifa, he was a research fellow at Georgetown University Law Center, and completed his dissertation at Yale Law School. He has published in the areas of human rights, refugee and migration law, political theory, and international criminal law. In 2009–2010, he held a Bernstein Fellowship during which he reported for Human Rights Watch from Greece and Turkey.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL
AND COMPARATIVE LAW

Established in 1946, this series produces high-quality, reflective, and innovative scholarship in the field of public international law. It publishes works on international law that are of a theoretical, historical, cross-disciplinary, or doctrinal nature. The series also welcomes books providing insights into private international law, comparative law, and transnational studies which inform international legal thought and practice more generally.

The series seeks to publish views from diverse legal traditions and perspectives, and of any geographical origin. In this respect it invites studies offering regional perspectives on core problématiques of international law, and in the same vein, it appreciates contrasts and debates between diverging approaches. Accordingly, books offering new or less orthodox perspectives are very much welcome. Works of a generalist character are greatly valued and the series is also open to studies on specific areas, institutions, or problems. Translations of the most outstanding works published in other languages are also considered.

After 70 years, *Cambridge Studies in International and Comparative Law* remains the standard-setter for international legal scholarship and will continue to define the discipline as it evolves in the years to come.

General Editors

Larissa van den Herik

Professor of Public International Law, Law School Leiden University

Jean D'Aspremont

Professor of Public International Law, Manchester International Law Centre, University of Manchester

A list of books in the series can be found at the end of this volume.

HUMANITY AT SEA

Maritime Migration and the Foundations of International Law

ITAMAR MANN

University of Haifa Faculty of Law, Israel



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-14876-5 — Humanity at Sea
Itamar Mann
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107148765

© Itamar Mann 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Mann, Itamar, author.

Humanity at sea : maritime migration and the foundations of international law / Itamar Mann, Georgetown University School of Law.

New York NY : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Series: Cambridge studies in international and comparative law | Includes bibliographical references and index.

LCCN 2016026283 (print) | LCCN 2016026603 (ebook) | ISBN 9781107148765

LCSH: Refugees – Legal status, laws, etc. | Boat people – Legal status, laws, etc. | International law and human rights.

LCC KZ6530 .M326 2016 (print) | LCC KZ6530 (ebook) | DDC 341.4/86–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016026283>

ISBN 978-1-107-14876-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-14876-5 — Humanity at Sea
Itamar Mann
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

In loving memory of my grandfather, Kurt Kanowitz

[...] it is easier for the world to express concern and outrage for the unknown refugee who drowns, or otherwise perishes, for he makes no demand on any nation. It is far more difficult to be reconciled to resolving the problems of those who live.

– Kurt Waldheim, *United Nations Secretary General* (1979)

CONTENTS

List of Figures page viii
Acknowledgments ix

Introduction: Humanity Washed Ashore 1

1 Flagless Vessel 21

2 What Is a Human Rights Claim? 56

3 What Is a Human Rights Commitment? 102

4 Between Moral Blackmail and Moral Risk 134

5 The Place Where We Stand 163

6 Imagination and the Human Rights Encounter 187

Conclusion: The Dual Foundation of International
Law 211

Postscript 227

Index 237

FIGURES

- 1 Four-year-old freedom fighter (photographer unknown). *page 98*
- 2 The finding of Moses, by Herbert J. Gute, Gouache on paper on board, 1933–1935 (copy done during excavations at Dura Synagogue, Syria). 232

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

At Tel Aviv University I studied under Adi Ophir, whose moral and political thought left an enduring mark on my own ideas. A number of fantastic law professors, most importantly Aeyal Gross, Leora Bilsky, and Shai Lavi, introduced me to the history and theory of international law. Anat Ben-Dor, Tally Kritzman-Amir, and Ora Bloom at the law school's Refugee Rights Clinic helped spark my interest in refugee law.

Soon afterwards, with two friends, we started an organization that provided pro bono representation to refugees. We named the organization after "We Refugees," an essay by Hannah Arendt that also features in this book. Omer Shatz and Iftach Cohen, who led that project, remain an inspiration. Ahmad Musa and a number of other members of the Sudanese community in Tel Aviv shared with me their experiences of what it means to be a refugee.

Paul Kahn, my advisor at Yale Law School, has been the single most important influence on my work. The many hours we spent talking in his office taught me how to think about law philosophically and historically. This book is a reflection of some of Paul's own profound insights and methodological commitments, and is also an attempt to argue with some of his positions. Owen Fiss has also been a mentor over the course of my studies. I am humbled by the opportunity to be in ongoing conversation with both of them.

I am grateful to several others at Yale who have shaped my thinking. Seyla Benhabib has been helpful far beyond what I could expect or hope for, particularly in terms of revisions to the work. Patrick Weil provided invaluable advice and guidance, alongside emotional support and friendship. James Whitman read the dissertation and provided insightful comments. David Singh Grewal assisted me immensely in my research at the early stages. Jim Silk offered helpful comments on several occasions, and allowed me to present my work at the Schell Center's Human Rights Workshop and at a workshop he conducted with Michael

Reisman. Anthony Kronman helped more than he knows with a few razor-sharp insights and suggestions.

Samuel Moyn, who I also initially met at Yale, read multiple early drafts and has provided copious intellectual support of various kinds. Perhaps most importantly, he responded to my presentation at the Modern Jewish Worlds Workshop at Harvard University, organized by Adam Stern and my dear friend Ofer Dynes. Sam's often biting and always incisive critique was a kind gift that encouraged me to sharpen my arguments. Guy Goodwin-Gill and Hagar Kotef gave me a number of invaluable comments briefly before publication.

I'm thankful for the Robert L. Bernstein International Human Rights Fellowship, which allowed me in 2010–2011 to work with Human Rights Watch and the Open Society Justice Initiative on a project concerning refugee rights in Europe. During this period I worked closely with Bill Frelick, Rupert Skilbeck, Yiota Massouridou, and Simone Troller. Yiota's commitment to the rights of asylum seekers in Greece was particularly powerful to behold. I will always feel indebted to the many resilient refugees and migrants who agreed to speak with us.

Thanks to Tendayi Achiume and Jeffrey Kahn for co-organizing "The Globalization of High Seas Interdiction" with me. Harold Koh, a protagonist of Chapter 3, deserves particular thanks for his support of this conference. I'm thankful to Thomas Gammeltoft-Hansen not only for joining us but also for remaining a supporter of my work.

I'd like to thank the Institute for Global Law and Policy (IGLP) for fantastic opportunities to present my work. Heidi Matthews convened a workshop in which Ioannis Kalpouzos responded to my work. They both became two of my most cherished academic and intellectual fellow travelers. Andrew Lang also provided fantastic feedback. A workshop Rose Sydney Parfitt convened gave me an opportunity to hear responses by Manuel Iturralde and Ernesto Miele.

Gearóid Ó Cuinn, who I also met at the 2014 IGLP Workshop, is a central presence in my closest group of colleagues. Through his work as Director of the Global Legal Action Network (GLAN), he is currently helping me put together an advocacy agenda that stems to some extent from my work on this book.

Naor Ben-Yehoyda supported me tremendously over many years. Apart from reading and discussing drafts, Naor helped putting together the John Harvard Colloquium at Cambridge University's Centre for Research in the Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities (CRASSH). I'm grateful for Simon Goldhill's lead of our conversations there, and for

Mezna Qato's thoughtful and critical response to a short paper that came out of my ideas in Chapter 2.

I've benefitted from conversations with Jaya Ramji-Nogales and Peter Spiro, who recently founded an interest group on International Migration Law at the American Society of International Law. Among the people affiliated with that group, I have an especially big debt to Moria Paz. No one has shown a quicker, deeper, and more sympathetic reaction to what I have to say in this book.

I'd like to thank the Max Planck Institute for the Study of Religious and Ethnic Diversity, which hosted a workshop, and especially my kind host Ayelet Shachar.

Ariella Azoulay co-organized a conference at Brown University – "What is a Refugee Crisis?" – that was enormously beneficial. At the conference I met Charles Heller and Lorenzo Pezzani, who have proven to be critical interlocutors, as one would expect based on their important work.

At the Center on National Security and the Law at Georgetown Law Center, I would like to thank Laura Donohue and Nadia Asanchayev for making this supportive environment possible. I also benefitted greatly from conversations with David Luban and David Koplow. During my time at Georgetown, Robin West and Greg Klass were especially helpful, as were Rabia Belt, Allegra McLeod, Sherally Munshi, and Julia Tomassetti.

Carmi Lecker offered research advice throughout my work.

Thanks also to the team at Cambridge University Press for their efficient and precise work on the book.

Many thanks to my friends who helped by reading or talking about the work, including Dov Alfon, Tomer Barak, Omri Boehm, Kiel Brennan-Marquez, Tom Dannenbaum, Ido Gideon, Florian Grisel, Kevin Jon Heller, Tatsushiko Inantani, Hassan Jabareen, Yoav Kenny, Zvika Lachman, Lilach Lachman, Nitzan Lebovic, Lital Levin, Darryl Li, Paul Linden-Retek, Claudia Medina-Aguilar, Liron Mor, Dina Omar, Mehrdad Payandeh, Kalyani Ramnath, Yaman Salahi, Diala Shamas, Pieter Shmugliakov, Assaf Tamari, Isaias Tesfalidet, and Reuven Ziegler.

Oded Na'aman and Dan-Avi Landau helped shape my arguments during special time we spent together in Cambridge, Massachusetts.

My family, Daniel, Eytan, Gabriella, and Kenneth Mann, have each had a distinct mark on what I wrote. I clearly identify each of you in specific parts of this book, and will tell you more about that when we meet. Above all

I'm thankful for your love. I'm grateful to Dalia and Moti Shmu'ely for always standing beside us. Shira Shmu'ely is my most critical and valued of readers. Nitai Mann-Shmu'ely slept on me during much of the early writing. He's now becoming quite a big boy, and is the joy of my life.

Washington DC, May 2016