AFRICA AND THE ICC

Africa and the ICC: Perceptions of Justice comprises contributions from prominent scholars of different disciplines including international law, political science, cultural anthropology, African history and media studies. This unique collection provides the reader with detailed insights into the interaction between the African Union and the International Criminal Court (ICC), but also looks further at the impact of the ICC at a societal level in African states and examines other justice mechanisms on local and regional levels. This investigation of the ICC’s complicated relationship with Africa allows the reader to see that perceptions of justice are multilayered.

Kamari M. Clarke is Professor of Global and International Studies at Carleton University. Her research explores issues related to legal institutions, human rights and international law and the interface between culture, power and globalisation. Her recent publications include International Criminal Court and the Challenge of Legal Pluralism in Sub-Saharan Africa (Cambridge University Press, 2009) and Mirrors of Justice: Law and Power in the Cold-War Era (with Mark Goodale, Cambridge University Press, 2010).

Abel S. Knottnerus is currently a PhD researcher in International Law and International Relations at the University of Groningen. His research focuses on the law and politics of international courts and explores the interplay between perceptions, power and justice.

Eefje de Volder is currently a PhD researcher in International Law at Tilburg University. Her research focuses on the regionalisation of collective security, with a particular focus on the collective security of the African Union. In addition, she has researched the interconnection between conflict, migration and human trafficking.
Africa and the ICC

PERCEPTIONS OF JUSTICE

Edited by

KAMARI M. CLARKE, ABEL S. KNOTTNERUS
AND EEFJE DE VOLDER
Contents

Notes on Contributors vii
Acknowledgements xiii

1 Africa and the ICC: An Introduction
   Kamari M. Clarke, Abel S. Knottnerus, and Eefje de Volder 1

PART I THE ORIGINS OF A FRACTIOUS RELATIONSHIP 37

2 The ICC in Africa: The Fight against Impunity
   Shamiso Mbizvo 39

3 Africans and the ICC: Hypocrisy, Impunity, and Perversion
   Makau W. Mutua 47

4 The ICC’s Africa Problem: A Spotlight on the Politics and
   Limits of International Criminal Justice
   Solomon A. Dersso 61

5 International Justice and the Politics of Sentimentality
   Kamari M. Clarke 78

PART II AFRICAN STATES AND THE ICC 105

6 The ICC and Africa: Rhetoric, Hypocrisy Management, and
   Legitimacy
   Lee J. M. Seymour 107

7 France, Africa, and the ICC: The Neocolonialist Critique
   and the Crisis of Institutional Legitimacy
   Paul D. Schmitt 127
vi Contents

8 The AU, the ICC, and the Prosecution of African Presidents
   Abel S. Knottnerus
   152

PART III BEYOND AFRICAN STATES: THE ICC’S IMPACT IN AFRICAN
   COMMUNITIES
   185

9 Discursive Reconstruction of the ICC–Kenyan Engagement
   through Kenyan Newspapers’ Editorial Cartoons
   Sammy G. Gachigua
   187

10 A ‘Criminal Investigation’, Not a ‘Political Analysis’? Justice
   Contradictions and the Electoral Consequences of Kenya’s
   ICC Cases
   Thomas P. Wolf
   232

11 The ICC in the Democratic Republic of Congo: A Decade
   of Partnership and Antagonism
   Patryk I. Labuda
   277

12 Witness Testimony, Support, and Protection at the ICC
   Stephen Smith Cody, Alexa Koenig, and Eric Stover
   301

PART IV BEYOND THE ICC: LOCAL AND REGIONAL JUSTICE
   MECHANISMS IN AFRICA
   323

13 Darfur Tribal Courts, Reconciliation Conferences and
   ‘Judea’: Local Justice Mechanisms and the Construction
   of Citizenship in Sudan
   Karin Willemse
   325

14 Interpretations of Justice: The ICTR and Gacaca in Rwanda
   Kristin C. Doughty
   353

15 International Criminal Justice and the Early Formation of
   an African Criminal Court
   Abel S. Knottnerus and Eefje de Volder
   376

16 Beyond the ICC: State Responsibility for the Arms Trade
   in Africa
   Sara Kendall and Clare da Silva
   407

17 Epilogue: Perceptions of Justice
   Kamari M. Clarke, Abel S. Knottnerus, and Eefje de Volder
   437

Index
   445
Notes on Contributors

Kamari M. Clarke is Professor of Global and International Studies at Carleton University. Her research explores issues related to legal institutions, human rights and international law and the interface between culture, power and globalisation. She has held numerous prestigious fellowships, grants and awards, the most recent being a large three-year National Science Foundation research grant on the relationship between the ICC and Africa. Her publications in this area include International Criminal Court and the Challenge of Legal Pluralism in Sub-Saharan Africa (Cambridge University Press, 2009) and Mirrors of Justice: Law and Power in the Post-Cold War Era (with Mark Goodale, Cambridge University Press, 2010).

Stephen Smith Cody is Director of the Atrocity Response Program at the Human Rights Center at the University of California, Berkeley School of Law. He holds a PhD in sociology from the University of California, Berkeley, a JD from Berkeley Law School and an MPhil in social anthropology from Cambridge University. A former Fulbright Fellow and Truman Scholar, he has contributed to reports at Human Rights Watch and co-authored reports and articles on various topics within international criminal law. His current research focuses on victims’ participation in proceedings at the International Criminal Court. He is an active member of the California Bar.

Solomon A. Dersso serves as Commissioner at the African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights. Adjunct Professor of Law at the College of Law and Governance at Addis Ababa University and an analyst of African affairs, among other roles, he initiated and published a new yearly publication, the Annual Review of the AU Peace and Security Council, for which he received the ISS’s innovation award in 2014. His recent publications have covered issues such as the responsibility to protect and Africa’s relationship with the International Criminal Court.
Notes on Contributors

Kristin C. Doughty is Assistant Professor of Anthropology at the University of Rochester, New York. She has been conducting research on the political, legal and cultural dynamics of reconciliation in Rwanda since 2002, including undertaking twenty months of ethnographic fieldwork in Rwanda conducted in Kinyarwanda, French and English. She is currently finishing a book manuscript entitled Remediation of Rwanda: Harmony and Punishment in Grassroots Legal Forums, which examines the contradictory dynamics in how the Rwandan government embedded reconciliation efforts in grassroots legal forums. She has published her research for academic and practitioner audiences, and has presented this work at conferences in the United States, Canada, Rwanda and Israel.

Sammy G. Gachigua is a Kenyan researcher working towards a PhD in applied linguistics at Lancaster University, UK. His thesis focuses on the tensions between power-elite and public interests in Kenyan parliamentary debates using a discourse-historical approach. His research interests include: critical discourse analysis; argumentation theory; parliamentary, media and political discourses; cartoon research; and power and ideology.

Sara Kendall is Lecturer in International Law at the University of Kent, UK. She received her doctorate from the University of California at Berkeley, where she conducted research on the Special Court for Sierra Leone, followed by a four-year project at Leiden University investigating the socio-political effects of International Criminal Court interventions in African states. She has previously taught international law and international relations at Leiden University and at the University of Amsterdam.

Abel S. Knottnerus is a Junior Scholar in International Law, History and International Relations. His research focuses on the law and politics of international courts and explores the interplay between perceptions, power and justice. He holds a Master of Law in international and European law, as well as a Research Master in modern history and international relations from the University of Groningen, the Netherlands. Knottnerus is currently a PhD researcher at the University of Groningen.

Alexa Koenig, JD, PhD, is Executive Director of the Human Rights Center and a Lecturer in Residence at the University of California, Berkeley School of Law. Her most recent publications include Hiding in Plain Sight: The Pursuit of War Criminals from Nuremberg to the War on Terror (2016; co-authored with Eric Stover and Victor Peskin) and Extreme Punishment (2015; co-edited with Keramet Reiter). Koenig currently serves as a member of the Technology
Advisory Board of the Office of the Prosecutor at the International Criminal Court.

Patryk I. Labuda is a PhD Candidate at the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies and a Teaching Assistant at the Geneva Academy of International Humanitarian Law and Human Rights. He previously worked in Sudan and South Sudan as a Research Fellow for the Max Planck Institute for International Law and in the Democratic Republic of Congo as a Civilian Justice Expert for the European Union Police Mission. He holds an LLM from Columbia Law School, a Certificate of Transnational Law from the University of Geneva and degrees in law (Magister iuris) and history (BA) from Adam Mickiewicz University, Poland.

Shamiso Mbizvo is Associate International Cooperation Adviser in the Jurisdiction, Complementarity and Cooperation Division in the Office of the Prosecutor (OTP) of the International Criminal Court. She provides legal and policy advice on international cooperation issues arising in the context of the OTP’s engagement in Kenya. Mbizvo holds a JD from New York University School of Law, where she was a Filomen D’Agostino Scholar for Women’s and Children’s Rights. She received a Master of Science degree in forced migration (development studies) from Oxford University, where she was a Shell Centenary Scholar in 2003. She graduated magna cum laude in international relations from Harvard University in 2002.


Lee J. M. Seymour is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Amsterdam. He studied political science at Northwestern University, Sciences Po Paris, Dalhousie University and the University of British Columbia. His current research on factionalism, alignment and fragmentation in civil wars is supported by a VENI grant from the Dutch Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO). His work has appeared in the Journal of Conflict Resolution, Perspectives on Politics and the European Journal of International Relations. His interests include the role of truth and deception in international diplomacy, the politics of international justice and civil wars.
Notes on Contributors

Paul D. Schmitt is an Attorney with DLA Piper LLP (US). His practice focuses on appellate and international litigation, including foreign sovereign immunity, sovereign debt, anti-corruption issues and human rights. Dr Schmitt received his PhD in history from the University of Maryland and his JD from Georgetown University Law Center. His doctoral dissertation focused on France’s diplomatic relationship with its former colonies after World War II. Dr Schmitt previously served as a legal intern with the ICTY and has taught courses at the university level on human rights, war crimes and genocide, colonialism and European history.

Clare da Silva is a Canadian lawyer and legal consultant for the United Nations and others on addressing firearms trafficking and armed violence reduction. She was the legal advisor for Amnesty International (AI) on their Arms Control, Security Trade and Human Rights programme and represented the interests of AI in lobbying states during the drafting process of the Arms Trade Treaty. In the past she was a Research Fellow at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law at Cambridge University and acted as defence counsel at the Special Court for Sierra Leone.

Eric Stover is faculty director of the Human Rights Center and Adjunct Professor of Law and Public Health at the University of California, Berkeley School of Law. His most recent books include The Graves: Srebrenica and Vukovar (1998); My Neighbor, My Enemy: Justice and Community in the Aftermath of Mass Atrocity (2004; co-edited with Harvey Weinstein); The Guantánamo Effect: Exposing the Consequences of U.S. Detention and Interrogation Practices (2009, with Laurel E. Fletcher); and The Witnesses: War Crimes and the Promise of Justice in The Hague (2005).

Eefje de Volder is a Junior Scholar in International Law and Cultural Anthropology. She holds a Master of Science in cultural anthropology from Radboud University Nijmegen, the Netherlands, a Master of Law in international and European law from Tilburg University, the Netherlands, and a Research Master in Law from Tilburg University/University of Leuven, Belgium. Her research focuses on the regionalisation of collective security, with a particular focus on the collective security system of the African Union. Her research interests also include the interconnection between conflict, migration and human trafficking. De Volder is currently a PhD Researcher and Lecturer at the University of Tilburg and works simultaneously at the Coordination Centre on Human Trafficking.

Karin Willemse is Assistant Professor at the Erasmus School of History, Culture, and Communication, Erasmus University Rotterdam. She holds
Notes on Contributors

a PhD in anthropology from Leiden University (2001), and was Chair of the Netherlands Association of Feminist Anthropologist (LOVA) and a member of the Academic Advisory Board of the Islam Research Project (Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Leiden University). She has worked with scholars from South Africa, Senegal and Sudan, focusing on issues of gender, religion, violence, urban youth and migration. As a Fellow of the Royal Anthropological Institute, she currently conducts research in Nubia, Sudan, in cooperation with the British Museum.

Thomas P. Wolf is currently a Research Consultant/Analyst at Ipsos Public Affairs, Kenya. Dr Wolf first came to Kenya as a US Peace Corps secondary school teacher in 1967. He holds an MA in African studies (Ohio University) and a DPhil in comparative politics (University of Sussex). Previously he taught at the University of Nairobi, and served as Democracy/Governance Advisor for USAID/Kenya. The subject matter of his published works includes the political history of the Kenyan Coast, Kenya’s constitution, East African terrorism, several Afrobarometer Working Papers, the immunity of retired President Moi and the accuracy and political impact of political opinion/voter-intention polls in Kenya.
Acknowledgements

This volume comprises a selection of essays that were presented in May 2014 during the multidisciplinary conference entitled ‘Africans and Hague Justice: Realities and Perceptions of the International Criminal Court in Africa’, and further includes a handful of specially commissioned chapters. The themes and issues discussed during the conference that was hosted by The Hague University of Applied Sciences has been a tremendous source of inspiration in compiling this volume. The excellent contributions and challenging questions that were raised during the conference set the groundwork for a matrix of complex and invigorating debates concerning the relevance of international law today and the roles that justice projects play around the world – and in particular in Africa.

We are grateful to The Hague Municipality, the Netherlands Association of African Studies, The Hague University of Applied Sciences, the School of Human Rights Research, the African Studies Centre and the Democracy and Media Foundation for making this conference possible. We thank the conference organising committee (Froukje Krijtenburg, Ingrid Roestenburg, Jos Welenkamp, Abel S. Knottnerus and Eefje de Volder), the conference scientific committee (Felix Ameka, Margot Leegwater and Tom Zwart) and all those who helped in making the conference a success, and in particular Mirjam Schoenmaeckers-Damen, Colette van Heck and Monique van Casteren. We would also like to express our gratitude to Voices of Africa Media Foundation and Creative Court for organising wonderful side events.

We further thank Carleton University for its institutional support and Godfrey Mwampembwa (Gado), Victor Ndula, Celestine Wamiru (Celeste) and James Kamawira (Kham) for the rights to reproduce their cartoons in this volume. We express our appreciation to our editors and to the manuscript staff.
Acknowledgements

for the teamwork and commitment needed to prepare the volume for publication.

Finally, we would like to give a word of thanks to our friends and colleagues who supported this project from the start to its completion and without whom the road would have been a lot more difficult to traverse, and to our families and loved ones for their ongoing support during the life of this project.