

Does War Make States?

Arising from renewed engagement with Charles Tilly's canonical work on the relationship between war and state formation, this volume situates Tilly's work in a broader theoretical landscape, and brings it into contemporary debates on state formation theory. Starting with Tilly's famous dictum "war made the state, and the state made war," the book takes his claim further, examining it from a philosophical, theoretical and conceptual view, and asking whether it is applicable to non-European regions such as the Middle East, South America and China. The authors question Tilly's narrow view of the causal relationship between warfare and state-making, and use a positive yet critical approach to suggest alternative ways to explain how the state is formed. Readers will gain a comprehensive view of the most recent developments in the literature on state formation, as well as a more nuanced view of Charles Tilly's work.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-14150-6 — Does War Make States?
Edited by Lars Bo Kaspersen , Jeppe Strandsbjerg
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Does War Make States?

*Investigations of Charles Tilly's
Historical Sociology*

Edited by

Lars Bo Kaspersen and Jeppe Strandsbjerg



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-14150-6 — Does War Make States?
Edited by Lars Bo Kaspersen, Jeppe Strandsbjerg
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107141506

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Kaspersen, Lars Bo, 1961– editor. | Strandsbjerg, Jeppe, 1973– editor.

Title: Does war make states? : investigations of Charles Tilly's historical sociology / edited by Lars Bo Kaspersen and Jeppe Strandsbjerg.

Description: 1 Edition. | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016011210 | ISBN 9781107141506 (Hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: War and society. | State, The. | Tilly, Charles—Political and social views.

Classification: LCC HM554 .D64 2016 | DDC 303.6/6—dc23 LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2016011210>

ISBN 978-1-107-14150-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in his publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xii
Introduction: State Formation Theory: Status, Problems, and Prospects	1
LARS BO KASPERSEN, UNIVERSITY OF COPENHAGEN; JEPPE STRANDBJERG, COPENHAGEN BUSINESS SCHOOL; AND BENNO TESCHKE, UNIVERSITY OF SUSSEX	
Part I Lineages	23
1 After the Tilly Thesis: Social Conflict, Differential State-formation and Geopolitics in the Construction of the European System of States	25
BENNO TESCHKE, UNIVERSITY OF SUSSEX	
2 Otto Hintze, Stein Rokkan and Charles Tilly's Theory of European State-building	52
THOMAS ERTMAN, NEW YORK UNIVERSITY	
Part II Challenges	71
3 War and State Formation: Amending the Bellicist Theory of State Making	73
HENDRIK SPRUYT, NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY	
4 Beyond the Tilly Thesis: "Family Values" and State Formation in Latin Christendom	98
PHILIP GORSKI, YALE UNIVERSITY AND VIVEK SWAROOP SHARMA, POMONA COLLEGE	

vi	Table of Contents	
	Part III Omissions	125
5	The Space of State Formation JEPPE STRANDBJERG, COPENHAGEN BUSINESS SCHOOL	127
6	The Realm as a European Form of Rule: Unpacking the Warfare Thesis through the Holy Roman Empire PETER HALDÉN, SWEDISH DEFENCE UNIVERSITY	154
7	War, Conflict and the State Reconsidered VIVEK SWAROOP SHARMA, POMONA COLLEGE	181
	Part IV Vistas	219
8	War and State in the Middle East: Reassessing Charles Tilly in a Regional Context DIETRICH JUNG, UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHERN DENMARK	221
9	Beyond Mere War: Authority and Legitimacy in the Formation of the Latin American States ROBERT H. HOLDEN, OLD DOMINION UNIVERSITY	243
10	How Tilly's State Formation Paradigm is Revolutionizing the Study of Chinese State-making VICTORIA TIN-BOR HUI, UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME	268
	<i>Bibliography</i>	296
	<i>Name Index</i>	325
	<i>Subject Index</i>	330

Contributors

Thomas Ertman (b. 1959) is Associate Professor of Sociology and Director of the College Core Curriculum at New York University. He received his BA in Philosophy and PhD in Sociology from Harvard University, where he was also a faculty member in the Department of Government for ten years. He is author of *Birth of the Leviathan: Building States and Regimes in Medieval and Early Modern Europe* and editor of *Max Weber's "Economic Ethos of the World Religions": An Analysis* (Cambridge University Press, 2016).

Philip Gorski (b. 1963) is Professor of Sociology and Religious Studies at Yale University. He received his BA from Harvard (1986) and his PhD from Berkeley (1996). His early work focuses on the political development of early modern Europe with special attention to the impact of the Reformation. He recently completed a book on American civil religion, which is forthcoming from Princeton University Press.

Peter Haldén (b. 1977) completed his undergraduate education in Berlin and Stockholm, and he received his PhD at the European University Institute in Florence in 2006. He is currently an Associate Professor of Political Science at the Swedish Defence University (SDU) in Stockholm. His research interests include social theory, state formation, Eurasian history, international politics, and the political use of armed force. At the SDU he teaches courses in military strategy and the political use of military force. Haldén's recent publications include the monograph *Stability without Statehood* (Palgrave, 2011); the articles "Reconceptualising state-formation as collective power" (*Journal of Political Power*, 2014), "A non-sovereign modernity. Attempts to engineer stability in the Balkans 1820–1890" (*Review of International Studies*, 2013); and the co-edited volume *New Agenda for Statebuilding* (Routledge, 2013).

viii List of Contributors

Robert H. Holden (b. 1947) holds his PhD (history) from the University of Chicago. He has been Professor of Latin American History at Old Dominion University (Norfolk, Virginia) since 1993. Holden's research interests include state formation, violence, rule of law and legitimacy. His publications include *Armies without Nations: Public Violence and State Formation in Central America, 1821–1960* (Oxford University Press, 2004), *Contemporary Latin America: 1970 to the Present* (Wiley-Blackwell, 2013), and forthcoming essays, "Violence, the State and Revolution in Latin America" for the *Cambridge World History of Violence* (vol. 4) and "Borderlands and Public Violence in a Shadow Polity: Costa Ricans, Nicaraguans and the Legacy of the Central American Federation" for *Politics and History of Violence and Crime in Central America*, eds. Sebastian Huhn and Hannes Warnecke (Palgrave Macmillan). Holden's principal teaching interests include Spain in America, Latin American independence, political order, religion and the state, social revolution, democratization and economic development.

Victoria Tin-bor Hui (b. 1967) is an associate professor in Political Science at the University of Notre Dame. She received her PhD in Political Science from Columbia University and her BSSc from the Chinese University of Hong Kong. Hui's research examines the centrality of war in the formation and transformation of China through the whole span of Chinese history. She is the author of *War and State Formation in Ancient China and Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge University Press, 2005). She has published the articles "Toward a Dynamic Theory of International Politics" (*International Organization*), "The Emergence and Demise of Nascent Constitutional Rights" (*Journal of Political Philosophy*), "History and Thought in China's Traditions" (*Journal of Chinese Political Science*), "Building Castles in the Sand" (*Chinese Journal of International Politics*), and book chapters "The China Dream: Revival of What Historical Greatness?", "The Triumph of Domination in the Ancient Chinese System" and "Problematising Sovereignty." As a native from Hong Kong, Hui also analyses Hong Kong politics. She maintains a blog on the Umbrella Movement (<https://victoriatbhui.wordpress.com>) and has published the article "Hong Kong's Umbrella Movement: The Protest and Beyond" (*Journal of Democracy*). Hui teaches courses on the state and contentious politics.

Dietrich Jung (b. 1959) is a professor and Head of Department at the Center for Contemporary Middle East Studies, University of Southern Denmark. He holds an MA in Political Science and Islamic Studies, as

well as a PhD from the Faculty of Philosophy and Social Sciences, University of Hamburg, Germany, and has large field experience in the Muslim world. In different capacities Jung has taught graduate and undergraduate courses in International Relations, Islamic Studies, Political Science, Sociology and Middle Eastern Area Studies. He has published numerous scholarly articles on causes of war, peace and conflict studies, political Islam, modern Turkey and on conflicts in the Middle East. His most recent published books are *Orientalists, Islamists and the Global Public Sphere: A Genealogy of the Modern Essentialist Image of Islam* (Sheffield: Equinox, 2011), and *The Politics of Modern Muslim Subjectivities: Islam, Youth and Social Activism in the Middle East*, together with Marie Juul Petersen and Sara Lei Sparre (New York: Palgrave, 2014).

Lars Bo Kaspersen (b. 1961) holds a BA (Copenhagen), MA (Copenhagen), MA (Sussex) and PhD (Aarhus). He teaches history, politics and sociology and is currently Professor and Head of the Department of Political Science, University of Copenhagen. He has published widely on social theory and political sociology and is the author of “Anthony Giddens: An Introduction to a Social Theorist,” and “Denmark in the World.” Kaspersen’s research areas are state formation processes in Europe, the transformation of the welfare state, sociology of war and civil society (including the idea of associative democracy), social theory, in particular relational theory. Together with Norman Gabriel, he is working on a book about Norbert Elias’s political sociology. Kaspersen recently received a grant from the Carlsberg Foundation to study “the civil society in the shadow of the state,” focusing on the role of civil society in the development of the Danish welfare state and its future.

Vivek Swaroop Sharma (b. 1970) holds a BA from Pitzer College (History), MA from Claremont Graduate School (History), MA from New York University (International Relations) and a PhD from Pitzer College (Comparative Politics). He now teaches at Pomona College in Claremont, California. His research interests are focused broadly on problems of social order, conflict and violence with a special focus on religion and violence, state formation and failure, war and conflict, and the historical sociology of power and authority in South Asia and Western Europe. Sharma’s teaching addresses the traditional questions of political science through a historical institutional frame: his recent courses include Religion and Violence, Power and Authority in India, The Social Foundations of Order, Conflict and Violence, Colonialism and Nationalism, Political Authority and State in Europe, War

x List of Contributors

and Society, and State Failure and State Building. His recent publications include “Give Corruption a Chance,” *The National Interest*, vol. 128 November/December 2013; “A Social Theory of War: Clausewitz and War Reconsidered,” *Cambridge Review of International Affairs*, 19 August 2014; “Kinship, Property and Authority,” *Politics and Society*, 27 February 2015; and “Secularism and Democracy in India,” *The National Interest*, forthcoming. He is also the author of *War, Authority and the State: European State Formation Reconsidered*, Cambridge University Press, under review.

Hendrik Spruyt (b. 1956) is the Norman Dwight Harris Professor of International Relations at Northwestern University. He previously taught at Columbia University and Arizona State University. He has also been a visiting faculty member of the Institut d’Etudes Politiques in Paris. He received a Doctorandus from the University of Leiden, School of Law (The Netherlands) in 1983, and his PhD in Political Science from the University of California, San Diego, in 1991. He was Chair of the Department of Political Science at Northwestern from 2005 to 2008, and Director of the Buffett Center for International and Comparative Studies from 2008 to 2013. Spruyt has also served as co-editor of *The Review of International Political Economy*. He has published several books, including *The Sovereign State and Its Competitors* (Princeton University Press, 1994), which won the Greenstone Prize for best book in History and Politics; *Ending Empire: Contested Sovereignty and Territorial Partition* (Cornell University Press, 2005), which was a runner-up for the Greenstone Prize in 2006; *Global Horizons* (University of Toronto, 2009); co-author with Alexander Cooley of *Contracting States: Sovereign Transfers in International Relations* (Princeton University Press, 2009), and co-editor with Miriam Elman and Oded Haklai of *Democracy, Religion, and Conflict: The Dilemmas of Israel’s Peacemaking* (Syracuse University Press, 2013).

Among his recent publications are “Empires, Past and Present: The Relevance of Empire as an Analytic Concept,” in Noel Parker, ed., *Empire and International Order* (2013); “New Institutionalism and International Relations,” in Ronen Palan, ed., *Global Political Economy* (2012); “Indonesia,” in Richard Caplan, ed., *Exit Strategies and State Building* (2012).

Jeppe Strandsbjerg (b. 1973) is Associate Professor at the Department of Business and Politics, Copenhagen Business School. He is an International Relations scholar with a DPhil in International Relations (Sussex) and master degrees in Political Science (Copenhagen) and International Relations (Aberystwyth, Wales). His research is generally

preoccupied with the concept of space in International Relations and the relationship between space and politics. Previously he has analysed the role of cartography in the process where territory emerged as a defining concept for sovereignty in European state formation (*Territory, Globalization and International Relations* (2010) Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan). More recently he has been studying the significance of spatial knowledge technologies in Arctic Geopolitics (“Cartopolitics, Geopolitics and Boundaries in the Arctic” in *Geopolitics* 17(4) 2012). Strandsbjerg is currently working along two tracks dealing with Arctic geopolitics: a project on security, sovereignty and natural resources; and a project investigating the politic impact of sustainability discourse. He teaches courses on International Relations, Globalisation Theory and Political Theory.

Benno Teschke (b. 1967) is currently a Reader in the Department of International Relations at the University of Sussex, United Kingdom, and an affiliated Visiting Professor in the Department of Political Science at the University of Copenhagen. He received his PhD from the International Relations (IR) Department at the London School of Economics and Political Science and was subsequently a post-doctoral fellow at the Center for Social Theory and Comparative History at the University of California, Los Angeles. Teschke is the author of *The Myth of 1648: Class, Geopolitics and the Making of Modern International Relations* (London/New York: Verso), which was awarded the Isaac Deutscher Memorial Prize in 2004 (translated into German, Japanese, Russian and Turkish). More recently he published in the *New Left Review*, *International Theory* and the *Oxford Handbook of Carl Schmitt* on Schmitt’s international legal and political thought. Teschke’s research interests comprise IR Theory, International History, Historical Sociology and Marxism.

Acknowledgements

This volume is the result of two meetings held at Copenhagen Business School (2–3 October 2009 and 28–9 May 2010) where participants were asked to critically investigate Tilly’s claim that “war makes states and states make war” and to review and contribute to the state-formation theory debate. The meetings were generously funded by the recently renamed *Danish Society for Education and Business* (then FUHU). After the first meeting in 2009, which turned out to be both intellectually stimulating and enriching, we planned a follow-up meeting the year after where papers were more specifically geared towards publication. In addition to the authors included in this volume we were fortunate to get input during the meetings from Anna Leander, Gorm Harste, Erik Lind, John Hall and Clemens Hoffmann.

We hope that the selection of contributions to the present volume will provide further inspiration and reflection for those concerned with historical processes of state formation.

Along the way a number of dedicated people with a flair for organisation have contributed immensely to the realisation of this collection. Lonni Nielsen at the former International Center for Business and Politics was instrumental in organising the meetings. Kathrine Nistrup Madsen, Cecilie Falch Ovesen and Susanna Dyre-Greensite worked tirelessly on collecting and editing the different chapters and creating the index. We would also like to extend our gratitude to the three anonymous reviewers for providing excellent and challenging comments on how to improve the collection. At Cambridge University Press, John Haslam was a pleasure to work with. Finally, we would like to thank each of the contributors, not only for writing such excellent chapters, but also for their admirable patience in what ended up being a much longer journey than we had imagined – or would have believed – when we first met in Copenhagen six years ago.