

KANT AND HIS GERMAN CONTEMPORARIES

Volume I

Logic, Mind, Epistemology, Science and Ethics

This collection of new essays, the first of its kind in English, considers the ways in which the philosophy of Immanuel Kant engages with the views of lesser-known eighteenth-century German thinkers. Each chapter casts new light on aspects of Kant's complex relationship with these figures, particularly with respect to key aspects of his logic, metaphysics, epistemology, theory of science and ethics. The portrait of Kant that emerges is of a major thinker thoroughly engaged with his contemporaries – drawing on their ideas and approaches, targeting their arguments for criticism and responding to their concerns, and seeking to secure the legacy of his thought among them. This volume will open the door for further research on Kant and his methods of philosophical inquiry, while introducing readers to the distinctive and influential philosophical contributions of several previously neglected figures.

COREY W. DYCK is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Western Ontario in Canada. He is the author of *Kant and Rational Psychology* (2014).

FALK WUNDERLICH is Lecturer in Philosophy at Martin Luther University of Halle-Wittenberg in Halle, Germany. His publications include *Kant und die Bewusstseinstheorien des 18. Jahrhunderts* (2005).

KANT AND HIS GERMAN CONTEMPORARIES

Volume 1

Logic, Mind, Epistemology, Science and Ethics

EDITED BY

COREY W. DYCK

University of Western Ontario

FALK WUNDERLICH

Martin Luther University of Halle-Wittenberg



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107140899

DOI: 10.1017/9781316493229

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Dyck, Corey, editor.

TITLE: Kant and his German contemporaries / edited by Corey Dyck, University of Western Ontario, Falk Wunderlich, Martin Luther University of Halle-Wittenberg.

DESCRIPTION: First [edition]. | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2017- | Includes bibliographical references and index. Contents: Volume 1. Logic, Mind, Epistemology, Science and Ethics.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2017029300 | ISBN 9781107140899 (volume 1 : Hardback : alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Kant, Immanuel, 1724-1804. | Philosophy, German-18th century. | Philosophy, German-19th century.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC B2798 .K36 2017 | DDC 193-dc23 LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017029300>

ISBN 978-1-107-14089-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	page vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	x
<i>List of Abbreviations and Citations</i>	xi
Introduction	I
<i>Corey W. Dyck and Falk Wunderlich</i>	
PART I GENERAL AND TRANSCENDENTAL LOGIC	I 5
1 Wolff's Empirical Psychology and the Structure of the Transcendental Logic	17
<i>Brian A. Chance</i>	
2 From Logical Calculus to Logical Formality: What Kant Did with Euler's Circles	35
<i>Huaping Lu-Adler</i>	
PART II METAPHYSICS AND THE MIND	57
3 Kant and Tetens on the Unity of the Self	59
<i>Udo Thiel</i>	
4 G. F. Meier and Kant on the Belief in the Immortality of the Soul	76
<i>Corey W. Dyck</i>	
5 Maimon and Kant on the Nature of the Mind	94
<i>Brandon C. Look</i>	

PART III TRUTH, IDEALISM AND SCEPTICISM	I I I
6 Lambert and Kant on Truth <i>Thomas Sturm</i>	I I 3
7 Mendelssohn, Kant and the Refutation of Idealism <i>Paul Guyer</i>	I 34
8 Platner on Kant: From Scepticism to Dogmatic Critique <i>Falk Wunderlich</i>	I 55
PART IV HISTORY AND PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE	I 73
9 Lambert and Kant on Cognition (<i>Erkenntnis</i>) and Science (<i>Wissenschaft</i>) <i>Eric Watkins</i>	I 75
10 Kant and the Skull Collectors: German Anthropology from Blumenbach to Kant <i>Jennifer Mensch</i>	I 92
PART V FREEDOM, IMMORTALITY AND HAPPINESS	2 I I
11 Kant and Crusius on the Role of Immortality in Morality <i>Paola Rumore</i>	2 I 3
12 Kant and Feder on the Will, Happiness and the Aim of Moral Philosophy <i>Stefano Bacin</i>	2 32
13 The Antithetic between Freedom and Natural Necessity: Garve's Problem and Kant's Solution <i>Heiner F. Klemme</i>	2 50
<i>Bibliography</i>	2 65
<i>Index</i>	2 90

Contributors

STEFANO BACIN is Assistant Professor of History of Philosophy at the University of Milan in Milan, Italy. He is the author of *Il senso dell'etica. Kant e la costruzione di una teoria morale* (2006) and *Fichte in Schulpforta (1774–1780)* (2007), and co-editor, with Marcus Willaschek, Georg Mohr and Jürgen Stolzenberg, of the *Kant-Lexikon* (2015).

BRIAN A. CHANCE is Professor of Humanities at the Oklahoma School of Science and Mathematics and an affiliate faculty member in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Oklahoma, United States. He has written widely on Kant and his relation to other figures in the German and British traditions, and his work has appeared in the *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*, *European Journal of Philosophy*, *Kantian Review*, *Kant-Studien*, *Kant Yearbook* and in several edited volumes.

COREY W. DYCK is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Western University, Canada. He is the author of *Kant and Rational Psychology* (2014), has published numerous articles on Kant's philosophy and its history, is the translator of the collection *Early Modern German Philosophy (1690–1750)* and co-translator of Moses Mendelssohn's *Morning Hours: Lectures on God's Existence* (2011, with Daniel O. Dahlstrom).

PAUL GUYER is the Jonathan Nelson Professor of Humanities and Philosophy at Brown University in Rhode Island, United States. He is author of ten books, including *Kant and the Claims of Knowledge* (1987), *Kant* (2006), *Knowledge, Reason, and Taste: Kant's Response to Hume* (2008) and most recently *A History of Modern Aesthetics* in three volumes (2014), and he is co-translator of the *Critique of Pure Reason* (1998, with Allen Wood), the *Critique of the Power of Judgment* (2001, with Eric Matthews) and Kant's *Notes and Fragments* (2009, with Curtis Bowman and Frederick Rauscher), all in the Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant.

HEINER F. KLEMME is Professor for the History of Philosophy at Martin Luther University of Halle-Wittenberg in Halle, Germany. In addition to numerous articles, he has published several monographs, including *Kants Philosophie des Subjekts* (1996) and *Kants Grundlegung zur Metaphysik der Sitten: Ein systematischer Kommentar* (2017), as well as a number of anthologies and reference works, including *The Bloomsbury Dictionary of Eighteenth Century German Philosophers* (2016, co-edited with Manfred Kuehn).

BRANDON C. LOOK is University Research Professor and Chair of the Department of Philosophy at the University of Kentucky, United States. He has published numerous articles on topics in the history of modern philosophy, and he is the author of *Leibniz and the 'Vinculum Substantiale'* (1999), co-editor/translator of *The Leibniz-Des Bosses Correspondence* (2007, with Donald Rutherford) and editor of *The Continuum Companion to Leibniz* (2011, 2014).

HUAPING LU-ADLER is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Georgetown University in Washington, DC, United States. She has articles published or forthcoming in *Kantian Review*, *Journal of the History of Philosophy* and *European Journal of Philosophy*.

JENNIFER MENSCH is Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at Western Sydney University, Australia. She is the author of *Kant's Organicism: Epigenesis and the Development of Critical Philosophy* (2013), and has published widely on the intellectual history of the Enlightenment, including articles in *European Journal of Philosophy*, *Kantian Review* and *The Southern Journal of Philosophy*.

PAOLA RUMORE is Associate Professor for History of Philosophy in the Philosophy Department of the University of Turin, Italy. In addition to numerous articles, she is the author of *Materia cogitans: L'Aufklärung di fronte al materialismo* (2013), and has recently edited a volume of *Quaestio* entitled *Another 18th-Century German Philosophy? Rethinking German Enlightenment* (2016).

THOMAS STURM is Research Professor at the Catalan Institution for Research and Advanced Studies (ICREA) and the Department of Philosophy at the Autonomous University of Barcelona (UAB) in Spain. Among his publications are two books, including *Kant und die Wissenschaften vom Menschen* (2009), and articles in *Kant-Studien*, *Kantian Review*, *Kant*

Yearbook, Studies in History and Philosophy of Science, Synthese, Erkenntnis, Inquiry and Journal of the History of the Behavioral Sciences.

UDO THIEL is Professor of the History of Philosophy in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Graz, Austria. He has published numerous articles and edited collections, and is the author of three monographs, including *The Early Modern Subject: Self-Consciousness and Personal Identity from Descartes to Hume* (2011).

ERIC WATKINS is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California in San Diego, United States. He is the author of *Kant and the Metaphysics of Causality* (2005), the editor of *Kant and the Sciences* (2001), *Immanuel Kant: Natural Science* (2012) and *The Divine Order, the Human Order, and the Order of Nature* (2014), and the editor and translator of *Kant's 'Critique of Pure Reason': Background Source Materials* (2009).

FALK WUNDERLICH is Lecturer at the Department of Philosophy at Martin Luther University of Halle-Wittenberg in Halle, Germany. He is the author of *Kant und die Bewußtseinstheorien des 18. Jahrhunderts* (2005) and co-editor most recently of *Michael Hifsmann: Briefwechsel* (2016, with Hans-Peter Nowitzki, Udo Roth and Gideon Stiening) and of a special issue of the *British Journal for the History of Philosophy* on "Varieties of Early Modern Materialism" (2016, with Patricia Springborg).

Acknowledgements

Many of the contributions to this volume derive from presentations given in connection with the ‘Kant and His German Contemporaries’ conference held at the University of Western Ontario in London, Ontario, Canada, from 17 to 19 October 2014. Accordingly, the editors of the present volume (who were also the co-organizers of the original conference) remain grateful to the many sponsors of that highly successful event: the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, the *Canadian Journal of Philosophy*, as well as Research Western, the Dean’s Office for the Faculty of Arts and the Philosophy Department of the University of Western Ontario. We are also grateful to Hilary Gaskin of Cambridge University Press for her enthusiasm for this project from start to finish. In preparing this volume, we have benefitted enormously from the help of a number of graduate student assistants. We would like to extend our thanks to Richard Creek and Nick Nash for their diligent assistance in proofreading the chapters and compiling the bibliography, and to Brian Ohlman for his work in preparing the index. Special thanks are owed to Sean Coughlin for taking the photo that graces the front cover.

Abbreviations and Citations

Abbreviations of Kant's Works

Kant's works are cited according to the abbreviations given in the list below (which is derived from that provided in the forthcoming *Cambridge Kant Lexicon*, ed. Julian Wuerth). This is followed by the volume and page number in *Kants Gesammelte Schriften*, ed. Deutsche (formerly Königlich-Preussische) Akademie der Wissenschaften (Berlin: G. Reimer, 1900–19; De Gruyter, 1920–), abbreviated as 'Ak.' below, unless otherwise indicated. As is conventional, the *Critique of Pure Reason* is cited according to the page numbers in the first ('A') and/or second ('B') editions. Whenever available, English translations are taken from *Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant*, abbreviated as 'CE' in the list below.

- Anth *Anthropology from a Pragmatic Point of View*
(CE *Anthropology, History, and Education*, pp. 227–428;
Ak, 7:117–333)
- CBHH *Conjectural Beginning of Human History* (CE *Anthropology,*
History, and Education, pp. 160–75; Ak, 8:107–24)
- CF *The Conflict of the Faculties* (CE *Religion and Rational*
Theology, pp. 233–327; Ak, 7:1–116)
- Corr Correspondence (CE *Correspondence*; Ak, 10–13)
- CPJ *Critique of the Power of Judgment* (CE *Critique of the Power*
of Judgment; Ak, 5:165–485)
- CPR *Critique of Pure Reason* (CE *Critique of Pure Reason*;
Ak, 4:1–252)
- CPrR *Critique of Practical Reason* (CE *Practical Philosophy*, 133–72;
Ak, 5:1–163)
- DDS *Concerning the Ultimate Ground of the Differentiation of*
Directions in Space (CE *Theoretical Philosophy, 1755–1770*,
pp. 361–72; Ak, 2:375–83)

- DSS *Dreams of a Spirit-Seer Elucidated by Dreams of Metaphysics* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy, 1755–1770*, pp. 301–59; Ak, 2:315–73)
- ETP *Concerning the Employment of Teleological Principles in Philosophy* (Ak, 8:157–84)
- FS *The False Subtlety of the Four Syllogistic Figures Demonstrated by M. Immanuel Kant* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy, 1755–1770*, pp. 85–105; Ak, 2:45–61)
- G *Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals* (CE *Practical Philosophy*, pp. 37–108; Ak, 4:385–463)
- HR *Determination of the Concept of a Human Race* (CE *Anthropology, History, and Education*, pp. 143–59; Ak, 8:89–106)
- IC *Inquiry Concerning the Distinctness of the Principles of Natural Theology and Morality, Being an Answer to the Question Proposed for Consideration by the Berlin Royal Academy of Sciences for the Year 1763* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy, 1755–1770*, pp. 243–75; Ak, 2:273–301)
- ID *On the Form and Principles of the Sensible and the Intelligible World* (Inaugural Dissertation) (CE *Theoretical Philosophy, 1755–1770*, pp. 373–416; Ak, 2:385–419)
- IUH *Idea for a Universal History with a Cosmopolitan Aim* (CE *Anthropology, History, and Education*, pp. 107–20; Ak, 8:15–31)
- JL Jäsche Logic (CE *Lectures on Logic*, pp. 517–640; Ak, 9:1–150)
- LB Blomberg Logic (CE *Lectures on Logic*, pp. 1–246; Ak, 24:7–301)
- LDW Dohna-Wundlacken Logic (CE *Lectures on Logic*, pp. 425–516; Ak, 24:687–784)
- LPh Philippi Logic (Ak, 24:303–496)
- LPö Pölitz Logic (Ak, 24:497–602)
- LV Vienna Logic (CE *Lectures on Logic*, pp. 249–377; Ak, 24:785–940)
- LW Warschauer Logic (in Tillmann Pinder, ed. *Logik-Vorlesung: Unveröffentlichte Nachschriften*, 2 vols., Hamburg: Meiner, 1998, vol.2, 503–662 [cited according to page number of the Pinder edition])
- MD *Metaphysics Dohna* (CE *Lectures on Metaphysics*, pp. 355–92; Ak, 28:611–704)

- MH Metaphysics Herder (CE *Lectures on Metaphysics*, pp. 3–16; Ak, 28:1–166, 843–931)
- MK₂ Metaphysics K₂ (CE *Lectures on Metaphysics*, pp. 395–413; Ak, 28:709–816)
- ML₁ Metaphysics ML₁ (CE *Lectures on Metaphysics*, pp. 19–106; Ak, 28:167–350)
- ML₂ Metaphysics L₂ (CE *Lectures on Metaphysics*, pp. 299–354; Ak, 28:525–609)
- MM *The Metaphysics of Morals* (CE *Practical Philosophy*, pp. 353–604; Ak, 6:203–493)
- MMr Metaphysics Mrongovius (CE *Lectures on Metaphysics*, pp. 107–286; Ak, 29:747–940)
- MNS *Metaphysical Foundations of Natural Science* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy after 1781*, pp. 171–270; Ak, 4:465–565)
- MoC Moral Philosophy Collins (CE *Lectures on Ethics*, pp. 37–222; Ak, 27:237–471)
- MoH Practical Philosophy Herder (CE *Lectures on Ethics*, pp. 1–36; Ak, 27:3–89)
- MoM Moral Philosophy Mrongovius (CE *Lectures on Ethics*, pp. 223–48; Ak, 27:1395–1581)
- MoM₂ Moral Philosophy Mrongovius II (Ak, 29:593–641)
- MoP Practical Philosophy Powalski (Ak, 27:91–235)
- MoV Metaphysics of Morals Vigilantius (CE *Lectures on Ethics*, pp. 249–452; Ak, 27:475–732)
- MPT *On the Miscarriage of all Philosophical Trials in Theodicy* (CE *Religion and Rational Theology*, pp. 19–38; Ak, 8:253–71)
- MVi Metaphysics Vigilantius (K₃) (CE *Lectures on Metaphysics*, pp. 417–506; Ak, 28:819–38, 29:941–1040)
- MVo Metaphysics Volckmann (CE *Lectures on Metaphysics*, pp. 289–96; Ak, 28:357–460)
- NE *A New Elucidation of the First Principles of Metaphysical Cognition* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy 1755–1770*, pp. 1–45; Ak, 1:385–416)
- NM *Attempt to Introduce the Concept of Negative Magnitudes into Philosophy* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy, 1755–1770*, pp. 207–41; Ak, 2:165–204)
- OCS *On the Common Saying: That May Be Correct in Theory, but It Is of No Use in Practice* (CE *Practical Philosophy*, pp. 273–310; Ak, 8:273–313)

- OD *On a Discovery Whereby Any New Critique of Pure Reason Is to Be Made Superfluous by An Older One* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy after 1781*, pp. 271–336; Ak, 8:185–252)
- ODR *Of the Different Races of Human Beings* (CE *Anthropology, History, and Education*, pp. 82–97; Ak, 2:427–43)
- OPA *The Only Possible Argument in Support of a Demonstration of the Existence of God* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy, 1755–1770*, pp. 107–201; Ak, 2:63–163)
- Pr *M. Immanuel Kant's Announcement of the Programme of His Lectures for the Winter Semester 1765–1766* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy, 1755–1770*, pp. 287–300; Ak, 2:303–13)
- Pro *Prolegomena to Any Future Metaphysics That Will Be Able to Come Forward as Science* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy after 1781*, pp. 29–170; Ak, 4:253–383)
- R Reflection (+ number) (CE *Notes and Fragments*; Ak, 14–19)
- RHe *Review of Johann Gottfried Herder's Ideas for the Philosophy of the History of Humanity. Parts 1 and 2* (CE *Anthropology, History, and Education*, pp. 121–42; Ak, 8:43–66)
- RP *What Real Progress Has Metaphysics Made in Germany Since the Time of Leibniz and Wolff?* (CE *Theoretical Philosophy after 1781*, pp. 337–424; Ak, 20:253–351)
- RSc *Review of Schulz's Attempt at an Introduction to a Doctrine of Morals for all Human Beings Regardless of Different Religions* (CE *Practical Philosophy*, pp. 1–10; Ak, 8:9–14)
- UNH *Universal Natural History and Theory of the Heavens, or an Essay on the Constitution and Mechanical Origin of the Entire World Edifice Treated According to Newtonian Principles* (CE *Natural Science*, pp. 182–308; Ak, 1:215–368)