

## Making and Bending International Rules

All treaties, from human rights to international trade, include formal exceptions that allow governments to legally break the rules that they have committed to, in order to deal with unexpected events. Such institutional “flexibility” is necessary, yet it raises a tricky theoretical question: how to allow for this necessary flexibility, while preventing its abuse? Krzysztof Pelc examines how designers of rules in vastly different settings come upon similar solutions to render treaties resistant to unexpected events.

Essential for undergraduate students, graduate students, and scholars in political science, economics, and law, the book provides a comprehensive account of the politics of treaty flexibility. Drawing on a wide range of evidence, its multi-disciplinary approach addresses the paradoxes inherent in making and bending international rules.

Krzysztof J. Pelc is William Dawson Scholar and Associate Professor in the Department of Political Science at McGill University, Montréal. His research focuses on the politics of international economic rules and his work has been published in *International Organization*, *American Political Science Review*, *Journal of Politics*, *World Politics*, *International Studies Quarterly*, *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, *European Journal of International Relations*, *British Journal of Political Science*, and *Journal of International Economic Law*, among others.

# Making and Bending International Rules

*The Design of Exceptions and Escape  
Clauses in Trade Law*

KRZYSZTOF J. PELC



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-14086-8 — Making and Bending International Rules  
Krzysztof J. Pelc  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

One Liberty Plaza, New York NY 10006, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107140868](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107140868)

© Krzysztof J. Pelc 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Names: Pelc, Krzysztof J., author.

Title: Making and bending international rules : the design of exceptions and escape clauses in trade law / Krzysztof J. Pelc.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016010173 | ISBN 9781107140868 (Hardback : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Foreign trade regulation. | Foreign trade regulation—Language. | World Trade Organization.

Classification: LCC K3943 .P45 2016 | DDC 343.08/7—dc23 LC record available at <http://lccn.loc.gov/2016010173>

ISBN 978-1-107-14086-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

*Rodzicom.*

## Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
1 The “Architectural Challenge” of International Rules	1
1.1 <i>Introduction</i>	1
1.2 <i>The Trade Regime’s Architectural Challenge</i>	5
1.3 <i>The Dirty Secret of the Trade Regime</i>	7
1.4 <i>The Design of Escape Provisions</i>	10
1.5 <i>An Accident of History</i>	12
1.6 <i>Overview of Chapters</i>	13
2 A Theory of the Design of Flexibility	18
2.1 <i>The Debate over Flexibility in International Treaties</i>	18
2.2 <i>The Costs of Flexibility</i>	27
2.3 <i>Resolving the Architectural Challenge</i>	31
2.4 <i>Assessing Theoretical Expectations</i>	39
3 A Brief Intellectual History of Flexibility in Law	43
3.1 <i>The Universality of Flexibility</i>	44
3.2 <i>“Necessity Knows No Law”</i>	45
3.3 <i>Changed Circumstances</i>	75
4 The Twin GATT Exceptions: Fears and Solutions	93
4.1 <i>Article XXI: The GATT Security Exception</i>	93
4.2 <i>Article XX: The Value of Constraint</i>	122
4.3 <i>Conclusion: Article XXI vs. Article XX</i>	132

5	The Evolving Design of Flexibility	137
5.1	<i>From Compensation to Contingency</i>	138
5.2	<i>What Room for Efficient Breach?</i>	150
5.3	<i>Trade Policymakers' Remaining Flexibility Options</i>	161
5.4	<i>Flexibility in Preferential Trade Agreements</i>	185
5.5	<i>A Comparison Case: Flexibility in the Human Rights Regime</i>	189
6	The Bad News	206
6.1	<i>Does Flexibility Fuel the Law of Constant Protection?</i>	206
6.2	<i>The Empirical Data</i>	209
6.3	<i>Flexibility and Unpredictability</i>	220
7	The Good News	234
7.1	<i>Restraint in Allocation of Flexibility</i>	235
7.2	<i>"Country Seeks Credibility": How Governments Choose among Flexibility Options</i>	243
8	The Great Recession and Beyond	259
8.1	<i>Rules vs. Behavior during the Great Recession</i>	261
8.2	<i>What Does the Future Hold?</i>	264
	<i>Bibliography</i>	267
	<i>Index</i>	279

## Tables

4.1	Record of Use of GATT Article XX	<i>page</i> 134
5.1	Balancing Following Exercise of the Escape Clause	142
6.1	Ecuador's Tariff Hikes Post-Accession	213
6.2	Does Trade Remedy Usage Increase as Tariff Bindings Are Implemented?	218
6.3	The Effects of Binding Overhang on Trade Flows	232
7.1	Who Seeks Binding Overhang?	238
7.2	How Do Government Allocate Binding Overhang?	242
7.3	Governments' Usage of Flexibility Measures	250
7.4	What Drives Government's Choice of Flexibility Mechanism?	256

## Acknowledgments

As debt-ridden sovereigns soon learn, debts too large to be repaid must get rolled over onto future generations. And so it is with the intellectual debts this book rests on. I can only hope to serve others as well as I have been served by my PhD advisors, mentors, colleagues and friends. First among many, Marc Busch stimulated my interest in these topics when I was still an undergraduate in business school, on a dangerous trajectory to the private sector, and throughout my graduate work at Georgetown. His emphasis on the importance of selling ideas clearly and his formidable knowledge of the politics of trade rules have made him a model to follow. Erik Voeten pushed for greater rigor where it was most needed. Jim Vreeland, who completed my raucous dissertation committee, was a constant source of valuable advice, some of it occasionally relating to work. A number of friends enriched my time at Georgetown, and served as my first sounding boards. Luis Felipe Mantilla, Philipp Bleek and Adam Mount were my companions on night time walks through Glover Park, climbs in Great Falls, and bike rides through DC. Christina Davis was an invaluable conversation partner during my time at Princeton's Niehaus Center, where her door was always open, and conveniently across the hall from mine. My fruitful stay at the Niehaus Center was made possible by Helen Milner, my "academic grand-mother," who has been a mentor and source of support, as she has been to so many others. Emilie Hafner-Burton repeatedly proved herself a generous and willing reader, and this text is better for her ever-tactful suggestions. Peter Rosendorff and Edward Mansfield provided me with many words of wisdom, professional and otherwise, and inspired me through their work. Much of this book has been written at McGill, where I have benefited from wonderful



colleagues, and an idyllic research setting. Finally, I owe a great deal to my co-authorships. Many of the ideas in this book draw on collaborative work undertaken with Marc Busch, Christina Davis, Leslie Johns, Jeffrey Kucik, and Johannes Urpelainen. Lauren Konken provided invaluable research assistance, managing to track down the untrackable.

One of Marc Busch's favorite sayings, deployed whenever some long labored over bit of work leads us back to square one, as it often does, is T.S. Eliot's phrase in the *Four Quartets* about how "the end of all our exploring will be to arrive where we started and know the place for the first time." The line applies equally well to this book, which began with a question asked early in graduate school, and improved over the course of countless debates and conversations. I am grateful for all of these.