

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-14057-8 - Kant's Dialectic
Jonathan Bennett
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Kant's Dialectic

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-14057-8 - Kant's Dialectic
Jonathan Bennett
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-14057-8 - Kant's Dialectic
Jonathan Bennett
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Kant's Dialectic



JONATHAN BENNETT



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-14057-8 - Kant's Dialectic
 Jonathan Bennett
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316506073

© Cambridge University Press 1974

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1974

Reprinted 1977, 1981, 1986, 1990

Re-issued in a digitally printed version 2009

Cambridge Philosophy Classics edition 2016

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: Bennett, Jonathan, 1930– author.

Title: Kant's dialectic / Jonathan Bennett.

Description: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Originally published: New York : Cambridge University Press, 1974 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2015048475 | ISBN 9781107140578 (Hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9781316506073 (Paperback : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Kant, Immanuel, 1724-1804. | Dialectic.

Classification: LCC B2799.D47 B4 2016 | DDC 193–dc23 LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2015048475>

ISBN 978-1-107-14057-8 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-50607-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents



<i>Preface to this edition by</i> KARL AMERIKS	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Preface</i>	xi
<i>System of references</i>	xiii
1 Introduction	1
1 Locating the subject-matter	1
2 The main topics	4
3 Background materials	5
2 Concepts and intuitions	9
4 The sensory/intellectual continuum	9
5 Trouble from the continuum	12
6 Kant's breakthrough	16
7 Content v. activity	20
8 Concepts and judgments	23
9 Concept-empiricism	26
10 The theory of categories	30
11 Categories and 'innate ideas'	35
3 Substances and reality	40
12 Substances and aggregates	40
13 Cartesian substances	42
14 Leibniz on substances and reality	44
15 Leibniz on relations and reality	46
16 Kant on reality	49
17 Things in themselves	52
18 Imposition and things in themselves	54
19 Substances as sempiternal	56
20 The balance principle	60
21 Existence-changes and quantifiers	62
4 The substantiality of the soul	66
22 The Cartesian basis	66
23 The search for the thinking subject	69
24 The soul as substance	72

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-14057-8 - Kant's Dialectic
 Jonathan Bennett
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

25	Inflating the first paralogism	76
26	My death	78
5	The simplicity of the soul	82
27	The soul as simple	82
28	Mental fission	85
29	Mental disunity	87
30	Simplicity and immateriality	90
6	The identity of the soul	94
31	The third paralogism: blind alleys	94
32	Locating the third paralogism	96
33	Quasi-memory	98
34	Kant's observer	101
35	Identity and substrata	104
36	Substrata: two sources	107
37	Substrata: four consequences	109
38	Strawson on the paralogisms	112
7	Infinity	115
39	The antinomies chapter	115
40	The limits of the world	118
41	Infinite tasks	122
42	The futurizing move	124
43	Infinite number	127
44	Numbers and natural numbers	130
45	The weakening move	133
46	Infinite and indefinite	139
8	Limits	145
47	Leibniz on space	145
48	Leibniz on vacuum	148
49	Why the world is not finite	154
50	Other arguments	157
51	Why the world did not begin	161
9	Divisibility	165
52	Simple substances	165
53	The divisibility of the extended	166
54	Real divisibility	170
55	Kant against atomism	172
56	Substance and substances	176
57	The supposed infinity problem	179
58	The divisibility of space	183

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-14057-8 - Kant's Dialectic
 Jonathan Bennett
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CONTENTS

vii

10	Freedom	186
59	The third antinomy	186
60	From cosmology to humanity	189
61	The skeleton of a theory	192
62	A reconciliation?	195
63	Hume and Schlick	197
64	Restricting determinism	201
65	When does freedom occur?	203
66	Reactive attitudes	207
67	Kant and reactivity	211
68	Agency	213
69	Self-prediction	217
70	Kant and agency	221
71	Excuses for Kant's theory	225
11	God	230
72	The Kant–Frege view	230
73	Existence and necessary existence	234
74	Why Malcolm's argument fails	237
75	Aquinas's third way	240
76	The fourth antinomy	242
77	The cosmological argument	246
78	The second step	250
79	Kant's attack	253
80	The radical criticism	255
81	The argument from design	257
12	Reason	261
82	Inferences of reason	261
83	Ascending reason	263
84	Conditions	267
85	The source of dialectical error	270
86	Regulative principles	273
87	Are there any regulative principles?	277
88	Regulative and constitutive	279
89	The architectonic of the Dialectic	284
90	Reason and cosmology	287
	<i>Index</i>	292

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-14057-8 - Kant's Dialectic
Jonathan Bennett
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Preface to this edition

KARL AMERIKS



Jonathan Bennett's *Kant's Dialectic* is a landmark work in modern scholarship. Its appearance in 1974 was one of the first expressions of a confluence of three major trends that for fifty years now have played a major role in philosophy. The first trend is the general re-emergence of metaphysics as a source of positive attraction for the best and the brightest in the field. A second surprising trend has been the renaissance of studies in the history of philosophy. Whereas earlier, history and philosophy were often contrasted as two different fields, a historical turn has now taken the form of an avalanche of detailed studies of major modern figures (e.g., Bennett's *Locke, Berkeley, Hume: Central Themes*, 1971), as well as an incorporation of historical considerations directly in the content of significant systematic argumentation. A third trend is the rehabilitation of Kant's philosophy, and a reconsideration of all aspects of his system as relevant to contemporary thought. Along with P. F. Strawson and Wilfrid Sellars, Jonathan Bennett was a prime analytic instigator of this movement already in the 1960s, with his first book on Kant, *Kant's Analytic* (1966). This book made Bennett famous as a practitioner of an approach that favours reconstructing a concise and interesting form of argument that seems to be present in the text, and then not hesitating to mercilessly expose its apparent shortcomings, all for the purpose of leading to more satisfactory arguments on the important topics under discussion. *Kant's Dialectic* employs a somewhat similar approach but expresses a broader perspective, one enriched with considerably more historical detail and reference to relevant predecessors. After an extremely helpful review, in the first three chapters, of the general themes of the 'Analytic', that is, the first major section of Kant's *Critique of Pure Reason*, *Kant's Dialectic* launches into a path-breaking and detailed treatment of the key metaphysical terms of the second major section of the *Critique*: substantiality, simplicity, identity, infinity, limits, divisibility, freedom, God, and reason. The mere fact that this part of Kant's text – which had for so long been ignored because of its seemingly old-fashioned themes: rational psychology, cosmology, theology – received such careful attention by Bennett was already a revolution in its time. The content of the attention is even more remarkable, and the issues

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-14057-8 - Kant's Dialectic
Jonathan Bennett
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

that are raised, about matters such as 'quasi-memory', relations, vacuum, agency, and regulative principles, remain just as central in leading work in current philosophy. Bennett's discussion is especially valuable because of his in-depth understanding of Leibniz's relevance (see his new Cambridge edition of Leibniz's *New Essays on Human Understanding*). Among the many highlights of the book, especially for advanced students, is the discussion of 'inflating the first paralogism' (section 25), of the 'weakening move' (section 45) in consideration of the antinomies of the infinite, and the complexities of 'real divisibility' (section 54). There is no better way to prepare oneself for a serious contemporary study of the central concepts of Kant's Dialectic than by working through every page of Bennett's still invaluable commentary.

Preface



This book is a sequel to my *Kant's Analytic*, but it does not presuppose knowledge of the earlier work. It is the only English book-length commentary on the Dialectic in Kant's *Critique of Pure Reason*. It may be suggested that one is one too many – that my book fills a welcome gap in the literature – but I would dispute that. I have found that the Dialectic, together with relevant materials from earlier philosophers, especially Descartes and Leibniz, provides the basis for a satisfactory course of fifty-odd classroom hours for graduate students and able undergraduates. Such a course covers a useful amount of 'history of philosophy', guided throughout by an interest in a varied but not too scattered set of philosophical problems. *Kant's Dialectic* might be a help, but what I am confidently recommending is a different work – Kant's Dialectic.

I continue to be, in the words of an unhappy reviewer of my earlier work, 'one of those commentators who are more interested in what Kant ought to have thought than in what he actually did think'. Still, I try to describe the Dialectic accurately and in some detail. This part of Kant's work is at once knottier and more interesting than is commonly supposed, but the interest is lost if the knots are left tied, and so my philosophical aims have driven me to endeavours which may count as scholarly.

The Dialectic is full of mistakes and inadequacies, or so I shall contend, and *of course* this is consistent with its being a valuable contribution to philosophy. Still, there are doubtless fewer mistakes than I allege: my charge-list has gradually shortened as I have gained in understanding of the work, and presumably it could be reduced further. But I have worked for as long as I am prepared to, and I now offer what now seems to me to be true. Anyway, when there is evidence of error the truth is better served by an open accusation than by a respectful averting of one's eyes, even in cases where the charge of error can eventually be refuted.

Throughout, I use existing translations of non-English works, modifying them where accuracy demands it. I follow Kemp Smith's translation of the *Critique* except for a few changes in the interests of clarity and a larger number of corrections of mistranslations which are philosophically significant. The most serious of the latter are noted as they arise. For help with

the German – my knowledge of which is very limited – I am indebted to Lewis White Beck, Petra von Morstein and Margaret Jackson.

Kant's Dialectic grew out of teaching, scattered through a decade, at several universities. My largest block of indebtedness is to students at the University of British Columbia, where I have taught courses on the Dialectic in 1971–3. A few of them are named in the text, in acknowledgment of particular contributions; but to many others – far more than I could appropriately name in a Preface – I owe stimulation, encouragement, criticism and guidance of a high order.

I have been glad of the help of Michael Beebe, who served as my research assistant and gave me, among other things, most of what grasp I have of the issue about absolute space. I am also grateful for help with various parts of the book from my colleagues D. G. Brown, Howard Jackson, Peter Remnant, Richard E. Robinson, Steven Savitt and John Stewart; from J. J. Macintosh; and especially from M. J. Scott-Taggart.

Secretarial and other expenses were met by research grants – here gratefully acknowledged – from the Canada Council and the University of British Columbia.

Vancouver, B.C. J.F.B.
July 1973

System of references



To keep down the number of footnotes, some references are given in the text. Also, sometimes references which could occupy several footnotes are gathered into one. Each composite footnote refers forwards, and never beyond the end of the paragraph.

Numerals occurring alone refer to page-numbers in the second edition ('B') of the *Critique of Pure Reason*. Numerals immediately preceded by 'A' refer to pages in the first edition, and concern material omitted from B. The following abbreviations are also used:

* <i>Bounds of Sense</i>	P. F. Strawson, <i>The Bounds of Sense</i> (London, 1966).
* <i>Commentary</i>	N. Kemp Smith, <i>A Commentary to Kant's Critique of Pure Reason</i> (London, 1918).
<i>Essay</i>	Locke, <i>An Essay Concerning Human Understanding</i> .
Gerhardt	C. I. Gerhardt (ed.), <i>Die philosophischen Schriften von G. W. Leibniz</i> (Berlin, 1875–90).
Haldane & Ross	E. S. Haldane and G. R. T. Ross (eds.), <i>Philosophical Works of Descartes</i> (Cambridge, 1911–12), Vol. II.
<i>Kant's Analytic</i>	J. Bennett, <i>Kant's Analytic</i> (Cambridge, 1966).
<i>Kant's Arguments</i>	S. J. Al-Azm, <i>The Origins of Kant's Arguments in the Antinomies</i> (Oxford, 1972).
* <i>Leibniz–Arnauld</i>	H. T. Mason (ed.), <i>The Leibniz–Arnauld Correspondence</i> (Manchester, 1967).
* <i>Leibniz–Clarke</i>	G. H. Alexander (ed.), <i>The Leibniz–Clarke Correspondence</i> (Manchester, 1956).
	For references to this work in Chapter 8, see that chapter's first footnote.
<i>Locke, Berkeley, Hume</i>	J. Bennett, <i>Locke, Berkeley, Hume: Central Themes</i> (Oxford, 1971).
Loemker	L. E. Loemker (ed.), <i>G. W. Leibniz: Philosophical Papers and Letters</i> , 2nd edn (Dordrecht, 1969).
* <i>Metaphysical Foundations</i>	Kant, <i>Metaphysical Foundations of Natural Science</i> (trans. J. Ellington, Indianapolis, 1970).

(cont.)

<i>New Essays</i>	Leibniz, <i>New Essays Concerning Human Understanding</i> .
* <i>Practical Reason</i>	L. W. Beck, <i>A Commentary on Kant's Critique of Practical Reason</i> (Chicago, 1960).
<i>Prolegomena</i>	Kant, <i>Prolegomena to any Future Metaphysic that will be able to present itself as a Science</i> (trans. P. G. Lucas, Manchester, 1953).

* I offer as a Select Bibliography of the most important readily available writings on matters treated in this book: the *Critique of Pure Reason*, Descartes' *Meditations*, and the starred items in the above list.