THEORETICAL BOUNDARIES OF ARMED CONFLICT AND HUMAN RIGHTS

In the last two decades, human rights law has played an expanding role in the legal regulation of wartime conduct. In the process, human rights law and international humanitarian law have developed a complicated sibling relationship. For some, this relationship is viewed as a mutually reinforcing effort between like-minded regimes designed to civilize human behavior. For others, the relationship is a more complicated sibling rivalry. In this book, an unparalleled collection of legal theorists examine the relationship between these two bodies of law. Each chapter skilfully maps the possibilities of harmonization while, at the same time, raising cautionary flags about the limits of that project. The authors not only chart the existing state of the law, but also debate the normative implications of the continuing influence of human rights norms on current practices including torture, targeted killings, the conduct of non-international armed conflicts, and post-war state building.

Jens David Ohlin is Professor of Law and Associate Dean for Academic Affairs at Cornell Law School. He specializes in international law and all aspects of criminal law, including domestic, comparative, and international criminal law.
The purpose of the ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory series is to clarify and improve the theoretical foundations of international law. Too often the progressive development and implementation of international law has foundered on confusion about first principles. This series raises the level of public and scholarly discussion about the structure and purposes of the world legal order and how best to achieve global justice through law.

This series grows out of the International Legal Theory project of the American Society of International Law. The ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory series deepens this conversation by publishing scholarly monographs and edited volumes of essays considering subjects in international legal theory.

Volumes in the Series:

*International Criminal Law and Philosophy*
edited by Larry May and Zachary Hoskins

*Customary International Law: A New Theory with Practical Applications*
bym Brian D. Lepard

*The New Global Law* by Rafael Domingo

*The Role of Ethics in International Law*
edited by Donald Earl Childress III

*Global Justice and International Economic Law: Opportunities and Prospects*
edited by Chios Carmody, Frank J. Garcia, and John Linarelli

*Parochialism, Cosmopolitanism, and the Foundations of International Law*
edited by Mortimer Sellers
Morality, Jus Post Bellum, and International Law
edited by Larry May and Andrew T. Forcehimes

The Future of International Law: Global Governance
by Joel P. Trachtman

Normative Pluralism and International Law: Exploring Global Governance
by Jan Klabbers and Touko Piiparinen

Jus Post Bellum and Transitional Justice
by Larry May and Elizabeth Edenberg

Negotiating State and Non-State Law: The Challenge of Global and Local Legal Pluralism
edited by Michael A. Helfand

The Theory of Self-Determination
edited by Fernando R. Tesón
Theoretical Boundaries of Armed Conflict and Human Rights

Edited by

JENS DAVID OHLIN
For my family

-JDO
Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Contributors</th>
<th>page xi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction: The Inescapable Collision</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JENS DAVID OHLIN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PART I**

**Convergence & Divergence of Human Rights and Laws of War**

1 Laws for War
   *Adil Ahmad Haque*
   25

2 Human Rights Thinking and the Laws of War
   *David Luban*
   45

3 The Lost Origins of *Lex Specialis*: Rethinking the Relationship between Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law
   *Marko Milanovic*
   78

4 Acting as a Sovereign versus Acting as a Belligerent
   *Jens David Ohlin*
   118

**PART II**

**Conceptual Limits of the Law of War Framework**

5 Ending the Global War: The Power of Human Rights in a Time of Unrestrained Armed Conflict
   *Jonathan Horowitz*
   157

   *Naz K. Modirzadeh*
   192
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

7 The Use and Abuse of Analogy in IHL  
**KEVIN JON HELLER**

**PART III** New Frameworks for Regulating Armed Violence  
8 Forcible Alternatives to War: Legitimate Violence in 21st Century International Relations  
**JANINA DILL**

9 Whither International Martial Law?: Human Rights as Sword and Shield in Ineffectively Governed Territory  
**JOHN C. DEHN**

**BRIAN ORENDR**

Index 398
Contributors

John C. Dehn is Assistant Professor at Loyola University Chicago School of Law where he is Co-Director of the National Security and Civil Rights Program. Professor Dehn served over fifteen years as an Army judge advocate in positions ranging from detainee abuse prosecutor to faculty member at West Point where he taught courses in international, constitutional and military law, coordinated international law training for all academy programs, and coached the Jean-Pictet International Humanitarian Law Competition team.

Janina Dill is an Assistant Professor in Normative International Theory at the Department of International Relations at the London School of Economics and Political Science and a Research Fellow of the Oxford Institute for Ethics, Law and Armed Conflict (ELAC) at the University of Oxford. Her first monograph, Legitimate Targets? Social Construction, International Law and US Bombing, was published by Cambridge University Press in October 2014.

Adil Ahmad Haque is Professor of Law and Judge Jon O. Newman Scholar at Rutgers Law School. His scholarship focuses on the law of armed conflict, international criminal law, and criminal law theory. He is currently writing a book on the moral foundations of the law of armed conflict for Oxford University Press.

Kevin Jon Heller is Professor of Criminal Law, SOAS, University of London. He is the author of The Nuremberg Military Tribunals and the Origins of International Criminal Law (OUP, 2011) and the co-editor (with Gerry Simpson) of The Hidden Histories of War Crimes Trials (OUP, 2013).

Jonathan Horowitz is a Legal Officer at the Open Society Justice Initiative, where he focuses on issues relating to human rights, national
security and counterterrorism, and international humanitarian law. Prior, Mr. Horowitz worked at the U.S. Embassy in Kabul, Afghanistan, on detainee affairs; documented and reported on detainee and “night-raid” abuses in Afghanistan; and was an investigator for habeas lawyers representing Guantanamo Bay detainees.

David Luban is University Professor and Professor of Law and Philosophy at Georgetown University, as well as Class of 1984 Distinguished Chair in Ethics at the Stockdale Center for Ethical Leadership, U.S. Naval Academy. His more than 150 articles cover international criminal law, moral and legal philosophy, professional ethics, law and literature, just war theory, and the U.S. “war on terrorism.”

Marko Milanovic is Associate Professor at the University of Nottingham School of Law. He is Vice-President, European Society of International Law, an Associate of the Belgrade Centre for Human Rights, and Co-Editor of EJIL: Talk, as well as a member of the EJIL’s Editorial Board.

Naz K. Modirzadeh is Director of the Harvard Law School Program on International Law and Armed Conflict. Modirzadeh teaches, writes about, and engages in academic and policy initiatives concerning international law related to armed conflict.


Brian Orend is the Director of International Studies, and a Professor of Philosophy, at the University of Waterloo in Canada. He has taught at Columbia, Waterloo, and the University of Lund in Sweden (where he was recently Distinguished Visiting Professor of Human Rights). His research concentrates on three areas: the ethics of war and peace (especially post-war reconstruction); human rights; and happiness.
Acknowledgments

This book began with a conference in Washington, D.C. on November 8, 2013, co-sponsored by the Legal Theory Interest Group of the American Society of International Law (ASIL) and the Berger Program International Fund of Cornell Law School. Several staff members at ASIL worked diligently to ensure the conference’s success.

Associate Dean Laura Spitz and Prof. Jack Barcelo, both of Cornell Law School, were instrumental in securing the necessary funding for the conference.

Prof. Mortimer Sellers of the University of Baltimore School of Law offered his time and expertise in guiding the assembled papers toward ultimate publication in this volume. The papers from the conference workshops were revised and then supplemented by additional chapters from leading scholars in the field.