

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-13689-2 - The Rule of Law in the Real World
Paul Gowder
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

THE RULE OF LAW IN THE REAL WORLD

In *The Rule of Law in the Real World*, Paul Gowder defends a new conception of the rule of law as the coordinated control of power, and demonstrates that the rule of law, thus understood, creates and preserves social equality in a state. In a highly engaging, interdisciplinary text that moves seamlessly from theory to reality, using examples ranging from ancient Greece through the present, Gowder sheds light on how societies have achieved the rule of law, how they have sustained it in the face of political upheaval, and how it may be measured and developed in the future. *The Rule of Law in the Real World* is an essential work for scholars, students, policy makers, and anyone else who believes the rule of law is critical to the proper functioning of society. For more information, visit <http://rulelaw.net>.

Paul Gowder is an associate professor of law and of political science at the University of Iowa, researching constitutional law, ethics, normative and conceptual jurisprudence, political philosophy, computational and empirical legal studies, and game theory. Before joining academia, he worked as a public interest litigator practicing poverty and civil rights law.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-13689-2 - The Rule of Law in the Real World
Paul Gowder
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-13689-2 - The Rule of Law in the Real World
Paul Gowder
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

The Rule of Law in the Real World

PAUL GOWDER

University of Iowa



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-13689-2 - The Rule of Law in the Real World
Paul Gowder
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107136892

© Paul Gowder 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Gowder, Paul, author.

The rule of law in the real world / Paul Gowder.

New York : Cambridge University Press, 2016.

LCCN 2015038101 | ISBN 9781107136892 (hardback)

LCSH: Rule of law.

LCC K3171 .G69 2016 | DDC 340/.11-dc23

LC record available at <http://lccn.loc.gov/2015038101>

ISBN 978-1-107-13689-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-50202-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-13689-2 - The Rule of Law in the Real World
Paul Gowder
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

For Vero

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-13689-2 - The Rule of Law in the Real World
Paul Gowder
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page xi</i>
Introduction	1
1 The rule of law: a basic account	7
I Opening technicalities	8
II The weak version of the rule of law in two principles	12
A Regularity	12
B Publicity	15
III Vertical equality	18
A Respect and hubris	19
B Terror	20
C Normative robustness	22
IV Closing technicalities	24
2 The strong version of the rule of law	28
I Generality and the idea of a relevant distinction	29
A Many conceptions of generality	29
B Against the formal conception of generality	29
C Public reason as relevance criterion	33
II How to apply the public reason conception of generality	33
A Public reason: expressive	33
B Finding the expressive content of a law	35
1 Reasons and meanings	35
2 Proof of concept	38
III Generality as egalitarian principle	40
3 Generality and hierarchy	42
I The literacy tests: a model of nongeneral law	42
II The rule of law and social facts	45
A The disjunctive character of rule of law commands	45

III	The rule of law and the criminalization of poverty	45
A	The rule of law critique of economic injustice	47
IV	Is this still the rule of law?	48
V	Private power and ordinary citizens	51
A	Does the rule of law require ordinary citizens to obey the law?	51
B	The Jim Crow challenge	53
4	Egalitarian liberty and reciprocity in strategic context	58
I	The rule of law as a technology of constraint	59
II	Some arguments for the liberty thesis	62
A	The incentives argument	62
B	The chilling effects argument	63
1	The problem of complexity	66
C	The planning argument	68
D	Neorepublican liberty	70
E	Democratic liberty	73
III	Libertarian equality	74
5	Isonomia: The dawn of legal equality	78
I	How was the rule of law implemented in Athens?	79
A	An overview of the Athenian legal system	79
B	The rule of law and the oligarchy	80
C	The Athenian rule of law	80
1	Regularity	81
2	Publicity	83
3	Generality	84
II	Equality and the Athenian rule of law	85
A	A catalog of Athenian evidence	86
1	Forensic evidence for the Athenian equality thesis	86
2	Evidence from poets, philosophers, and historians	89
III	But is the rule of law really consistent with egalitarian democracy?	91
A	The conceptual objection: constitutionalism as the rule of law	91
B	The practical objection: arbitrary democracy and the trial of the generals	93
C	The problem of informality	94
IV	Law contra oligarchy	95
V	Appendix: A brief time line of the late-fifth-century Athenian upheavals	95
6	The logic of coordination	97
I	The strength <i>topos</i> and the amnesty	97
A	The struggle between oligarchs and democrats, an overview	98
B	The puzzle of the amnesty	99

Contents

ix

C	Did the Athenians learn from experience?	103
D	The problems of commitment: disagreement and temptation	105
E	Athens as a case of transitional justice	108
II	Formalizing and generalizing Athens	109
A	The model	112
1	Proof	117
2	Analysis	117
7	Parliament, Crown, and the rule of law in Britain	120
I	The British rule of law: illusory?	121
A	Hobbesian sovereignty and the absolute-power coalition	123
B	Constraint, coordination, custom, and the constitution	124
C	A historical precedent: customary manorial courts	128
II	The rule of law and equal status in seventeenth-century England	129
A	Magna Carta as egalitarian text	130
B	The parliamentary debates of 1628	134
1	Villeins and status	136
2	Dishonor, fear, and contempt	137
3	Political liberty and coordination	139
4	Reviewing the evidence	140
III	Civic trust and the British rule of law in later years	141
8	The logic of commitment	143
I	The rule of law's teleology of equality?	145
A	Commitment, full generality, and the internal point of view	151
II	Commitment and institutions	154
A	Democracy and the rule of law	158
III	Diversity, generality, and democracy	160
IV	Simulating legal stability	161
9	The role of development professionals: measurement and promotion	168
I	Rule of law development	168
A	Persuasive commitment-building	171
B	Generality development	172
C	Radical localism	172
1	Locally driven project design	175
II	Studying the rule of law: new empirical directions	176
A	The new measure: methods	179
1	Structure and scaling	179
2	Item selection and scale-fitting	181
B	Limitations	183
C	Behavior of the measure	183

III Appendix: Scores and states	184
A Rule of law scores	185
B The rule of law and other measures of political well-being	186
Conclusion: a commitment to equality begins at home	189
<i>Notes</i>	197
<i>References</i>	249
<i>Index</i>	271

Acknowledgments

Part of this book is derived from my prior publications, although all have been heavily revised and no chapter has previously appeared elsewhere in its entirety. Parts of Chapter 1 and Chapter 2 have previously appeared in part in Paul Gowder, 2013, “The Rule of Law and Equality,” *Law and Philosophy* 32(5): 565–618 (reproduced by permission per Springer copyright transfer agreement). Parts of Chapter 2 and Chapter 3 have previously appeared in part in Paul Gowder, 2014, “Equal Law in an Unequal World,” *Iowa Law Review* 99(3): 1021–81 (copyright retained and republication rights reserved by the undersigned). Parts of Chapter 5 and Chapter 6 have previously appeared in part in Paul Gowder, 2014, “Democracy, Solidarity, and the Rule of Law: Lessons from Athens,” *Buffalo Law Review* 62(1): 1–67 (copyright retained and republication rights reserved by the undersigned). Finally, part of Chapter 6 has appeared in part in Paul Gowder, 2015, “Trust and Commitment: How Athens Rebuilt the Rule of Law,” in Claudio Corradetti, Nir Eisikovits, and Jack Volpe Rotondi, eds., *Theorizing Transitional Justice* (Ashgate, 2015) (copyright retained and republication rights reserved by the undersigned). In addition, parts of “The Rule of Law and Equality” and “Democracy, Solidarity, and the Rule of Law: Lessons from Athens” as well as parts of Chapter 1 and Chapter 4 were previously part of my (unpublished, and not otherwise available) Stanford University PhD dissertation (2012) (during which process I received financial support from the Gerhard Casper Stanford Graduate Fellowship and the Geballe Dissertation Prize Fellowship). The final months of the writing of this book were supported by the Institute for Advanced Study, School of Social Science.

So many people have offered kind feedback that the only possible way to acknowledge them all is in a soulless alphabetical list (and many are unfortunately forgotten), to wit: Arash Abizadeh, Danielle Allen, Elizabeth Anderson, Marcus Arvan, Kristen Bell, Patricia Broussard, Rachel Brule, Dustin Buehler, Steven Burton, Joshua Cohen, Charlton Copeland, David Dyzenhaus, James Fearon, Gary Fine, Evan Fox-Decent, Tom Gallanis, Robert Gordon, Avner Greif, Enrique Guerra, Peter Halewood, Herb Hovenkamp, John Inazu, Patti Lenard,

Jacob Levy, Catherine Lu, Dan Markel (late and greatly missed), Candace McCoy, Hudson Meadwell, Frank Michelman, Ebrahim Moosa, Muriel Morisey, Victor Muñoz-Fraticelli, Michael Nafi, Josiah Ober, Angela Onwuachi-Willig, Mark Osiel, Andrew Rehfeld, John Reitz, Tobey Scharding, Micah Schwartzman, Ahmed Souaiaia, Natalie Stoljar, Brian Tamanaha, Alexander Tsesis, Eli Wald, Daniel Weinstock, and Adrian Wing, as well as those others who helped out in the many workshops noted below. Joshua Cohen and Josiah Ober in particular provided endless support and inspiration, both intensively during the writing of the PhD dissertation that suggested the skeleton for this book and with wise advice thereafter.

I would also like to thank the University of Iowa research assistants who have contributed to the preparation of this book, Brett Holubeck, Shawn McCullough, Malvika Rawal, Estiven Rojo, and Eric Schmitt, as well as Seth Jones, a professional copy editor who rescued my references after a technological catastrophe, and Rhonda DeCook and her students in a University of Iowa statistical consulting seminar, Stephanie Kriewall and Laura Hosch, who provided invaluable assistance with early modeling attempts. Alejandro Ponce of the World Justice Project very kindly provided the raw data on which the analyses in Chapter 9 were carried out, and Margaret Levi kindly connected us. Corey Yanofsky and Joe Foley provided kind advice for writing the R code that made up the simulation in Chapter 8. The assistance of Brenna Miller and Benjamin Rogers at the University of Iowa High Performance Computing cluster has been invaluable in actually getting that simulation running. Mandy Keifetz miraculously conjured an index out of thin air (and experience, and skill, and training).

Various parts of this book have been presented in numerous workshops and conferences, including the Sharing Scholarship, Building Teachers Workshop at Albany Law School; Arizona State University Legal Scholars Workshop; ClassCrits V, Culp Colloquium at Duke University; Big Ten Untenured Faculty Conference at Indiana University Maurer School of Law; the workshop on egalitarianism at the Institute for Advanced Study, School of Social Science; Iowa Legal Studies Workshop; Mid-Atlantic People of Color Legal Scholarship Conference; Midwest Junior Scholars Workshop at Washington University, St. Louis; Montreal Political Theory Manuscript Workshop of the Groupe de Recherche Interuniversitaire en Philosophie Politique de Montréal; Southeast/Southwest People of Color Legal Scholarship Conference; Stanford Humanities Center Workshop, Stanford Political Theory Workshop, a classics/political science seminar at Stanford, a Stanford Law School workshop, and a joint workshop between the Freeman Spogli Institute for International Studies and Stanford Law School; and faculty job talks in 2011 and 2012 at the University of California (Hastings), University of Iowa, University of Virginia, and Washington University (St. Louis); I have benefited greatly from feedback from the participants therein, some, but not all, of whom are individually mentioned above.