

The Roots of Ethnic Cleansing in Europe

Using a new approach to ethnicity that underscores its relative territoriality, Zeynep Bulutgil brings together previously separate arguments that focus on domestic and international factors to offer a coherent theory of what causes ethnic cleansing. The author argues that domestic obstacles based on nonethnic cleavages usually prevent ethnic cleansing whereas territorial conflict triggers this policy by undermining such obstacles. The empirical analysis combines statistical evaluation based on original data with comprehensive studies of historical cases in central and eastern Europe as well as Bosnia in the 1990s. The findings demonstrate how socioeconomic cleavages curb radical factions within dominant groups whereas territorial wars strengthen these factions and pave the way for ethnic cleansing. The author further explores the theoretical and empirical extensions in the context of Africa. Its theoretical novelty and broad empirical scope make this book highly valuable to scholars of comparative and international politics alike.

H. ZEYNEP BULUTGIL is an assistant professor of Comparative Politics at the Fletcher School, Tufts University. She received her PhD from the University of Chicago in 2009. Her research on ethnic cleansing has been supported by fellowships from the Program on Order, Conflict, and Violence at Yale University, the Belfer Center at Harvard Kennedy School, the Woodrow Wilson School at Princeton University, and the National Science Foundation.

Problems of International Politics

Series Editors

Keith Darden, *American University*
 Ian Shapiro, *Yale University*

The series seeks manuscripts central to the understanding of international politics that will be empirically rich and conceptually innovative. It is interested in works that illuminate the evolving character of nation-states within the international system. It sets out three broad areas for investigation: (1) identity, security, and conflict; (2) democracy; and (3) justice and distribution.

Titles in the Series

- Adam Baczko, Gilles Dorransoro and Arthur Quesnay, *Civil War in Syria: Mobilization and Competing Social Orders*
- Matthew Longo, *The Politics of Borders: Sovereignty, Security, and the Citizen after 9/11*
- Joshua Simon, *The Ideology of Creole Revolution: Imperialism and Independence in American and Latin American Political Thought*
- Reyko Huang, *The Wartime Origins of Democratization: Civil War, Rebel Governance, and Political Regimes*
- H. Zeynep Bulutgil, *The Roots of Ethnic Cleansing in Europe*
- Hyeran Jo, *Compliant Rebels: Rebel Groups and International Law in World Politics*
- Henry E. Hale, *Patronal Politics: Eurasian Regime Dynamics in Comparative Perspective*
- Lisa Baldez, *Defying Convention: US Resistance to the UN Treaty on Women's Rights*
- Séverine Autesserre, *Peaceland: Conflict Resolution and the Everyday Politics of International Intervention*
- Tarek Masoud, *Counting Islam: Religion, Class, and Elections in Egypt*
- Shaul Mishal and Ori Goldberg, *Understanding Shi'ite Leadership: The Art of the Middle Ground in Iran and Lebanon*
- Adria K. Lawrence, *Imperial Rule and the Politics of Nationalism: Anti-Colonial Protest in the French Empire*
- Donald L. Horowitz, *Constitutional Change and Democracy in Indonesia*
- Harris Mylonas, *The Politics of Nation-Building: Making Co-Nationals, Refugees, and Minorities*
- Şener Aktürk, *Regimes of Ethnicity and Nationhood in Germany, Russia, and Turkey*
- Steven Levitsky and Lucan A. Way, *Competitive Authoritarianism: Hybrid Regimes after the Cold War*

The Roots of Ethnic Cleansing in Europe

H. ZEYNEP BULUTGIL
Tufts University, Massachusetts



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-13586-4 — The Roots of Ethnic Cleansing in Europe
H. Zeynep Bulutgil
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107135864

© H. Zeynep Bulutgil 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: Bulutgil, H. Zeynep.

Title: The roots of ethnic cleansing in Europe / H. Zeynep Bulutgil (Tufts University, Massachusetts).

Description: New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016000900 | ISBN 9781107135864 (Hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Europe, Eastern—Ethnic relations—Political aspects. | Europe, Central—Race relations—Political aspects. | Ethnicity—Government policy—Europe, Eastern. | Ethnicity—Government policy—Europe, Central. | Genocide—Europe, Eastern. | Genocide—Europe, Central. | Forced migration—Europe, Eastern. | Forced migration—Europe, Central. | Human territoriality—Political aspects—Europe, Eastern. | Human territoriality—Political aspects—Europe, Central.

Classification: LCC DJK26 .B94 2016 | DDC 304.6/6309437—dc23 LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2016000900>

ISBN 978-1-107-13586-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For Yvan Chaxel and Candan & Nese Bulutgil

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	page ix
<i>List of Figures</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
Introduction	I
<i>Conceptual and operational definition of ethnic cleansing</i>	4
<i>Theoretical and empirical evaluation of the literature</i>	7
<i>The argument of the book</i>	14
<i>The plan of the book</i>	18
1 Theory	21
<i>Ethnic conflict in Europe</i>	22
<i>Non-ethnic cleavages as obstacles against ethnic cleansing</i>	23
<i>Territoriality of ethnic hierarchy</i>	29
<i>Territorial conflict and ethnic cleansing</i>	35
<i>Potential endogeneity</i>	39
<i>Conclusion</i>	40
<i>Appendix 1.1 Competitive configurations and obstacles against ethnic cleansing under different cleavage structures</i>	42
2 Empirical implications I: cross-national test	44
<i>The data</i>	45
<i>Empirical analysis</i>	54
<i>Conclusion</i>	65
<i>Appendix 2.1 Ethnic cleansing cases in Europe 1900–2000</i>	67
<i>Appendix 2.2 Main sources used to code ethnic cleansing in Europe</i>	69
3 Empirical implications II: historical cases	71
<i>Czechoslovakia: Germans</i>	75
<i>Poland: Germans and Ukrainians</i>	87
	vii

	<i>The Ottoman Empire: Greeks</i>	108
	<i>Summary of the findings</i>	119
4	Empirical implications III: Bosnia-Herzegovina	122
	<i>Background to the war and the ethnic cleansing campaign</i>	124
	<i>Ethnic cleansing in Bosnia as an empirical challenge</i>	126
	<i>Does the nature of ethnic cleavages explain nationalist voting in Bosnia?</i>	128
	<i>Non-ethnic cleavages and the success of nationalist parties in Bosnia</i>	136
	<i>External territorial conflict and ethnic cleansing in Bosnia</i>	144
	<i>Conclusion</i>	149
5	Negative and atypical cases in Europe	150
	<i>Negative cases: The Italians, Serbs, and Czechs in Austro-Hungary</i>	151
	<i>Atypical cases: Germany, Hungary, and the Soviet Union</i>	161
	<i>Conclusion</i>	170
6	Theoretical and empirical extensions: relative absence of ethnic cleansing in Africa	171
	<i>The applicability of the argument to Africa</i>	172
	<i>Territorial conflict and ethnic cleansing in Europe and Africa</i>	176
	<i>Further discussion: alternative explanations</i>	178
	<i>Conclusion</i>	180
	<i>Appendix 6.1 Ethnic cleansing in Africa 1955–2010</i>	182
	<i>Appendix 6.2 Main sources used to code ethnic cleansing in Africa</i>	183
	<i>Conclusion</i>	185
	<i>References</i>	195
	<i>Index</i>	215

Tables

1.1 Potential factions in a context with a class and an ethnic cleavage	<i>page 25</i>
1.2 Potential obstacles to ethnic cleansing in a multi-ethnic society with a salient class cleavage	28
2.1 Ethnic cleansing in Europe	55
2.2 Ethnic cleansing in Europe (40% and 10% thresholds)	56
2.3 Ethnic cleansing in Europe (fixed effects)	57
3.1 Empirical implications that support or contradict the theory	72
3.2 Summary of empirical evidence from the cases	120
4.1 Municipalities with more than 500 persons missing and dates of ethnic cleansing	128
4.2 Second world war and nationalist vote in the 1990 elections	135
4.3 Second world war and patterns of ethnic cleansing 1992–1995	137
4.4 Average per capita income according to region	139
4.5 Urban-rural cleavage within ethnic groups and nationalist voting in the 1990 elections	141

Figures

1.1	Distribution of ethnic groups on hypothetical territory “T”	<i>page</i> 30
1.2	Distribution of social classes on hypothetical territory “T”	30
1.3	Distribution of religious and secular groups on hypothetical territory “T”	31
1.4	Ethnic groups in State A and State B on hypothetical territory “T”	32
2.1	Ethnic cleansing in Europe 1900–2000	47
2.2	Probability of ethnic cleansing based on political competition	59
2.3	Probability of ethnic cleansing based on leftwing vote	60
2.4	Probability of ethnic cleansing based on family farms	61

Acknowledgments

This book in particular and my thinking as a social scientist in general have been greatly influenced by two scholars who were my advisors at the University of Chicago. Stathis Kalyvas' works on political cleavages and civil wars have been a source of inspiration both when I agreed and when I disagreed with his arguments. Carles Boix has been an important influence through his work on economic inequality and his combination of analytical rigor with detailed knowledge of history. Both Stathis and Carles provided invaluable advice in the process of writing this book. They continue to be role models as scholars and teachers. I would also like to acknowledge the contributions of the other two members of my dissertation committee, Lisa Wedeen and John Mearsheimer. Lisa's critical eye and encouragement has been and continues to be important for me both academically and personally. John Measheimer's comments at the beginning of the project, always directed to sharpen the theory, were also much appreciated.

I am indebted to those who provided helpful feedback and suggestions on various aspects of this project at different junctures: Erica Chenoweth, Alex DeWaal, Dan Drezner, Alex Downes, Ian Johnstone, Matt Kocher, Adria Lawrence, Stanislav Markus, Mara Marin, Harris Mylonas, Boriana Nikolova, Jake Shapiro, Dan Slater, Abbey Steele, Peter Uvin, Pinar Uyan and Nils Weidmann. I would also like to thank the participants of the many workshops at which I have presented parts of this work whom I have failed to mention by name. I owe special thanks to the two anonymous readers of Cambridge University Press, whose comments did much to improve the manuscript. At Cambridge University Press, I would like to thank Lewis Bateman and the editorial and production teams that guided the manuscript through various stages.

This book benefited from the generous support and the intellectual environment provided by the Program on Order, Conflict and Violence at Yale

University; the Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs at the Harvard Kennedy School; and the Empirical Studies of Conflict Project at Princeton University. A National Science Foundation Dissertation Improvement Grant enabled me to carry out the research and collect the data that culminated in my analysis of Bosnia-Herzegovina in Chapter 4. My heartfelt gratitude goes to the individual Bosnians who agreed to discuss the invariably painful experiences they went through before and during the civil war of 1992–1995. Their impact on this book as well as my thinking on ethnicity goes well beyond Chapter 4.

I would also like to thank the MIT press and Belfer Center for allowing me use parts of an article, “War, collaboration, and endogenous ethnic polarization,” which previously appeared in *Rethinking Violence: States and Non State Actors in Conflict*, edited by Erica Chenoweth and Adria Lawrence. Parts of Chapter 2 also appeared in my article “Social Cleavages, Wartime Experience, and Ethnic Cleansing in Europe,” *Journal of Peace Research* 52(5) (2015).

Last but not least, my deepest thanks go to the members of my family. My parents, Nese and Candan Bulutgil, raised me in a home full of books that most of my friends would never encounter and, against an education system designed to stifle originality, taught me to question accepted ways of seeing the world. They have since supported me in every possible way whenever I needed them. Among the many gifts they have bestowed on me, the most precious is the lifetime companionship of my sister Ipek, whose common sense and affection has been invaluable throughout the project and before. My husband, Yvan Chaxel, who has been with me since the very beginnings of this project, has provided the right mixture of love, encouragement, and critique that I needed. He continues to bring joy to my life along with our two wonderful daughters, Eda and Viviane. This book is dedicated to him and my parents.