The Roots of Ethnic Cleansing in Europe

Using a new approach to ethnicity that underscores its relative territoriality, Zeynep Bulutgil brings together previously separate arguments that focus on domestic and international factors to offer a coherent theory of what causes ethnic cleansing. The author argues that domestic obstacles based on nonethnic cleavages usually prevent ethnic cleansing whereas territorial conflict triggers this policy by undermining such obstacles. The empirical analysis combines statistical evaluation based on original data with comprehensive studies of historical cases in central and eastern Europe as well as Bosnia in the 1990s. The findings demonstrate how socioeconomic cleavages curb radical factions within dominant groups whereas territorial wars strengthen these factions and pave the way for ethnic cleansing. The author further explores the theoretical and empirical extensions in the context of Africa. Its theoretical novelty and broad empirical scope make this book highly valuable to scholars of comparative and international politics alike.

H. Zeynep Bulutgil is an assistant professor of Comparative Politics at the Fletcher School, Tufts University. She received her PhD from the University of Chicago in 2009. Her research on ethnic cleansing has been supported by fellowships from the Program on Order, Conflict, and Violence at Yale University, the Belfer Center at Harvard Kennedy School, the Woodrow Wilson School at Princeton University, and the National Science Foundation.
The Roots of Ethnic Cleansing in Europe

H. ZEYNEP BULUTGIL

Tufts University, Massachusetts
For Yvan Chaxel and Candan & Nese Bulutgil
## Contents

**List of Tables**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Introduction**

- Conceptual and operational definition of ethnic cleansing: 1
- Theoretical and empirical evaluation of the literature: 7
- The argument of the book: 14
- The plan of the book: 18

**Theory**

- Ethnic conflict in Europe: 21
- Non-ethnic cleavages as obstacles against ethnic cleansing: 23
- Territoriality of ethnic hierarchy: 29
- Territorial conflict and ethnic cleansing: 35
- Potential endogeneity: 39
- Conclusion: 40

**Appendix 1.1** Competitive configurations and obstacles against ethnic cleansing under different cleavage structures: 42

**Empirical implications I: cross-national test**

- The data: 44
- Empirical analysis: 54
- Conclusion: 65

**Appendix 2.1** Ethnic cleansing cases in Europe 1900–2000: 67

**Appendix 2.2** Main sources used to code ethnic cleansing in Europe: 69

**Empirical implications II: historical cases**

- Czechoslovakia: Germans: 75
- Poland: Germans and Ukrainians: 87

© in this web service Cambridge University Press  
www.cambridge.org
# Contents

1. The Ottoman Empire: Greeks
   - Summary of the findings

2. Empirical implications III: Bosnia-Herzegovina
   - Background to the war and the ethnic cleansing campaign
   - Ethnic cleansing in Bosnia as an empirical challenge
   - Does the nature of ethnic cleavages explain nationalist voting in Bosnia?
   - Non-ethnic cleavages and the success of nationalist parties in Bosnia
   - External territorial conflict and ethnic cleansing in Bosnia
   - Conclusion

3. Negative and atypical cases in Europe
   - Negative cases: The Italians, Serbs, and Czechs in Austro-Hungary
   - Atypical cases: Germany, Hungary, and the Soviet Union
   - Conclusion

4. Theoretical and empirical extensions: relative absence of ethnic cleansing in Africa
   - The applicability of the argument to Africa
   - Territorial conflict and ethnic cleansing in Europe and Africa
   - Further discussion: alternative explanations
   - Conclusion
   - Appendix 6.1 Ethnic cleansing in Africa 1955–2010
   - Appendix 6.2 Main sources used to code ethnic cleansing in Africa
   - Conclusion

References
Index
Tables

1.1 Potential factions in a context with a class and an ethnic cleavage........................................ page 25
1.2 Potential obstacles to ethnic cleansing in a multi-ethnic society with a salient class cleavage........ 28
2.1 Ethnic cleansing in Europe.................................................. 55
2.2 Ethnic cleansing in Europe (40% and 10% thresholds)........................................ 56
2.3 Ethnic cleansing in Europe (fixed effects)........................................ 57
3.1 Empirical implications that support or contradict the theory ........................................ 72
3.2 Summary of empirical evidence from the cases........................................ 120
4.1 Municipalities with more than 500 persons missing and dates of ethnic cleansing.................. 128
4.2 Second world war and nationalist vote in the 1990 elections ........................................ 135
4.3 Second world war and patterns of ethnic cleansing 1992–1995........................................ 137
4.4 Average per capita income according to region........................................ 139
4.5 Urban-rural cleavage within ethnic groups and nationalist voting in the 1990 elections .......... 141
Figures

1.1 Distribution of ethnic groups on hypothetical territory “T”  page 30
1.2 Distribution of social classes on hypothetical territory “T”  30
1.3 Distribution of religious and secular groups on hypothetical territory “T”  31
1.4 Ethnic groups in State A and State B on hypothetical territory “T”  32
2.1 Ethnic cleansing in Europe 1900–2000  47
2.2 Probability of ethnic cleansing based on political competition  59
2.3 Probability of ethnic cleansing based on leftwing vote  60
2.4 Probability of ethnic cleansing based on family farms  61
Acknowledgments

This book in particular and my thinking as a social scientist in general have been greatly influenced by two scholars who were my advisors at the University of Chicago. Stathis Kalyvas’ works on political cleavages and civil wars have been a source of inspiration both when I agreed and when I disagreed with his arguments. Carles Boix has been an important influence through his work on economic inequality and his combination of analytical rigor with detailed knowledge of history. Both Stathis and Carles provided invaluable advice in the process of writing this book. They continue to be role models as scholars and teachers. I would also like to acknowledge the contributions of the other two members of my dissertation committee, Lisa Wedeen and John Mearsheimer. Lisa’s critical eye and encouragement has been and continues to be important for me both academically and personally. John Measheimer’s comments at the beginning of the project, always directed to sharpen the theory, were also much appreciated.

I am indebted to those who provided helpful feedback and suggestions on various aspects of this project at different junctures: Erica Chenoweth, Alex DeWaal, Dan Drezner, Alex Downes, Ian Johnstone, Matt Kocher, Adria Lawrence, Stanislav Markus, Mara Marin, Harris Mylonas, Boriana Nikolova, Jake Shapiro, Dan Slater, Abbey Steele, Peter Uvin, Pinar Uyan and Nils Weidmann. I would also like to thank the participants of the many workshops at which I have presented parts of this work whom I have failed to mention by name. I owe special thanks to the two anonymous readers of Cambridge University Press, whose comments did much to improve the manuscript. At Cambridge University Press, I would like to thank Lewis Bateman and the editorial and production teams that guided the manuscript through various stages.

This book benefited from the generous support and the intellectual environment provided by the Program on Order, Conflict and Violence at Yale.
University; the Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs at the Harvard Kennedy School; and the Empirical Studies of Conflict Project at Princeton University. A National Science Foundation Dissertation Improvement Grant enabled me to carry out the research and collect the data that culminated in my analysis of Bosnia-Herzegovina in Chapter 4. My heartfelt gratitude goes to the individual Bosnians who agreed to discuss the invariably painful experiences they went through before and during the civil war of 1992–1995. Their impact on this book as well as my thinking on ethnicity goes well beyond Chapter 4.

I would also like to thank the MIT press and Belfer Center for allowing me use parts of an article, “War, collaboration, and endogenous ethnic polarization,” which previously appeared in Rethinking Violence: States and Non State Actors in Conflict, edited by Erica Chenoweth and Adria Lawrence. Parts of Chapter 2 also appeared in my article “Social Cleavages, Wartime Experience, and Ethnic Cleansing in Europe,” Journal of Peace Research 52(5) (2015).

Last but not least, my deepest thanks go to the members of my family. My parents, Nese and Candan Bulutgil, raised me in a home full of books that most of my friends would never encounter and, against an education system designed to stifle originality, taught me to question accepted ways of seeing the world. They have since supported me in every possible way whenever I needed them. Among the many gifts they have bestowed on me, the most precious is the lifetime companionship of my sister Ipek, whose common sense and affection has been invaluable throughout the project and before. My husband, Yvan Chaxel, who has been with me since the very beginnings of this project, has provided the right mixture of love, encouragement, and critique that I needed. He continues to bring joy to my life along with our two wonderful daughters, Eda and Viviane. This book is dedicated to him and my parents.