#### THE UNSTEADY STATE

Analytical jurisprudence often proceeds with two key assumptions: that all law is either contained in or traceable back to an authorizing law-state and that states are stable and in full control of the borders of their legal systems. What would a general theory of law be like and do if these long-standing presumptions were loosened? *The Unsteady State* aims to assess the possibilities by enacting a relational approach to an explanation of law, exploring law's relations to environment, security and technology. The account provided here offers a rich and renewed perspective on the preconditions and continuity of legal order in systemic and non-systemic forms and further supports the view that the state remains prominent yet is now less dominant in the normative lives of norm-subjects and as an object of legal theory.

Keith Culver is Professor of Management at the University of British Columbia, Canada. His research blends jurisprudential scholarship with professional contributions to regional innovation capacity.

Michael Giudice is Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy at York University, Canada. His research focusses on philosophy of law and associated areas in political and moral philosophy.

# The Unsteady State

# GENERAL JURISPRUDENCE FOR DYNAMIC SOCIAL PHENOMENA

# **KEITH CULVER**

University of British Columbia

## MICHAEL GIUDICE

York University



### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi - 110002, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107134805 DOI: 10.1017/9781316471203

© Keith Culver and Michael Giudice, 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-13480-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

# Contents

Acknowledgements		<i>page</i> vii
	Introduction	1
Part I Preparing Analytical Legal Theory for New Challenges		
1	Pulling Off the Mask of Law: A Renewed Research Agenda for Analytical Legal Theory	13
2	Making Old Questions New: Legality, Legal System and State	34
3	Legal Systems and Presumptions of Unity and Validity	58
4	The Elements of Legal Order	86
Part II Law, Environment, Security and Technology		
5	Globalization, the Preconditions of Legality and Law's Relation to Environment	113
6	Legality, Security and Leviathan's Ghost	147
7	Information Communication Technologies and Legal Theory	179
8	Beyond the Unsteady State	234
Inde	X	241

# Acknowledgements

This book, like its predecessor, Legality's Borders, is the product of many conversations with many people in many places. We are grateful to colleagues and students who have responded to our interest in this book's topics with their own questions, criticisms, examples and counter-examples and sometimes even agreement. Amongst the many contributors to our thinking, we owe particular thanks to several who followed us into the sometimes murky realm of draft written work, providing thoughtful reactions which nonetheless leave us solely responsible for errors in our arguments. Stefan Sciaraffa provided substantial and expert advice on an earlier version of Chapter 2. Maks Del Mar and Roger Cotterrell read and responded to a version of Chapter 3. Two excellent PhD students in philosophy, Max Leonov (McMaster University) and Sam Steadman (York University), discussed an early version of Chapter 3 at a workshop and meeting of the legal philosophy reading group at York University. William Twining published a response to our arguments in a paper whose core occupies the beginning of Chapter 5 and, in personal discussion, generously offered sound suggestions we have tried to absorb. Brian Tamanaha tread through an early version of the nearly complete manuscript and provided valuable correctives and insights. Dennis Patterson is owed special thanks as an enthusiastic discussant of even our most embryonic ideas, through to reading of individual chapters and providing criticism and encouragement in the right measures and at the right moments. Julie Dickson also deserves special mention, as her thoughtful objections to our earlier work have in many ways shaped the objectives of this book. We owe an ongoing debt of gratitude to Wil Waluchow, whose patience with former students who disagree with him is surely the stuff of legend. Finally, we must not forget to thank our families, and particularly our daughters Gwen and Sophia, since they are the ones who show the greatest patience when co-author dads say they'll be ready 'in one more minute', just as soon as yet another Skype chat about the current chapter

viii

Acknowledgements

is brought to an end. The patience of our colleagues, students and families will be drawn upon yet again, and soon, as we are warming up for another run at persistent jurisprudential questions not yet addressed in work to date.

Most of the chapters in this book draw to some extent on material previously published or forthcoming. We gratefully acknowledge prior publication of the following articles and book chapters:

- K. Culver and M. Giudice, 'Pulling off the mask of law: a renewed research agenda for analytical legal theory', *Problema*, 5 (2012), pp. 81–116. (Chapter 1)
- K. Culver and M. Giudice, 'Old questions made new: law, legal system, and state', in S. Sciaraffa and W. Waluchow (eds.), *Philosophical Foundations of the Nature of Law* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. 279–300. (Chapter 2)
- K. Culver and M. Giudice, 'Claims to authority, legal systems, and dynamic social phenomena', in R. Cotterrell and M. Del Mar (eds.), *Authority in Transnational Legal Theory* (Cheltenham, UK: Edward Elgar, 2016). (Chapter 3)
- K. Culver and M. Giudice, 'Complementing comparison: renewing analytical legal theory to meet the explanatory challenge of globalisation', *Transnational Legal Theory*, 4 (2013), pp. 700–713. (Chapter 5)
- K. Culver, 'How the new ICT's matter to the theory of law', *Canadian Journal of Law* and Jurisprudence, 17 (2004), pp. 255–268. (Chapter 7)