

## CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	page xii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xiv
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xix
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Frontex Border Agency in an EU Legal and Political Setting	1
1.2 Aim and Scope	5
1.3 Structure of the Book	8
2 At the External Borders of the EU	15
2.1 Intergovernmentalism and Supranationalisation	15
2.2 The EU Power to Develop a Common Policy on External Border Control	20
2.2.1 An Area of Shared Competence	20
2.2.2 The Common Policy on External Border Control	21
2.2.2.1 Treaty Basis	21
2.2.2.2 Administrative Cooperation and the Standing Committee on Internal Security	23
2.2.3 Power Remaining with the Member States	26
2.2.3.1 The ‘Safeguard Clauses’ in the TFEU on Member State Sovereignty	26
2.2.3.2 Article 72 TFEU	27
2.2.3.3 Article 73 TFEU	27
2.3 Conclusions	30
3 Frontex Border Agency: Contradiction and Complexity	31
3.1 Setting the Scene	31

3.2	Preliminary Observations on Frontex's Structure	34
3.3	Joint Operations and Pilot Projects at the External Borders	37
3.4	European Border Guard Teams (EBGTs)	42
3.4.1	Current Relevant Features and Future Achievements	42
3.4.2	The Composition and Secondment of EBGTs	43
3.5	Conclusions	46
4	The International Responsibility of the EU and Its Member States in Frontex's Joint Operations	48
4.1	Objectives and Structure	48
4.2	Background to the International Responsibility of the EU and Its Member States	49
4.2.1	The EU's Legal Personality	49
4.2.2	The 'Organic Model' and the 'Competence Model'	51
4.2.3	Potential Breaches of the Principle of Non-Refoulement in Frontex's Joint Operations: Applying the Two Models	54
4.2.4	The International Law Commission's Work: A Matter of Legal Authority	58
4.3	The Constitutive Elements of an Internationally Wrongful Act	60
4.3.1	Responsibility of the EU	61
4.3.1.1	Attribution of Conduct to Frontex	61
4.3.1.2	Interpretation of the Concept of 'Effective Control' by the Courts	63
4.3.1.3	When 'Effective Control' Exists According to the Commentaries to ARIO	66
4.3.1.4	Does Frontex Exercise Effective Control over the Conduct of Border Guards?	68
4.3.2	Responsibility of the Member States	70
4.4	'Derivative Responsibility' of the EU and Its Member States	73
4.4.1	The Principle of 'Independent Responsibility'	73
4.4.2	'Derivative Responsibility' in the ASR and in the ARIO	75
4.4.3	Aid or Assistance When Committing an Internationally Wrongful Act	77

## CONTENTS

ix

4.4.4	The Element of ‘Knowledge’	80
4.4.5	Aid or Assistance Given by a Home Member State and by Frontex	85
4.5	Conclusions	87
5	The Principle of Non-Refoulement in the EU Legal Setting	89
5.1	The Interconnection of International Law and EU Law Sources	89
5.2	Obligations of Non-Refoulement Which Bind the EU and Its Member States Directly under International Law	91
5.2.1	Background to the EU’s Non-Refoulement Obligations	91
5.2.2	The 1951 Refugee Convention and ‘the Other Relevant Treaties’	95
5.2.3	The Principle of Non-Refoulement as Customary International Law	99
5.3	Obligations of Non-Refoulement Which Bind the EU and Its Member States within the EU Legal Order	103
5.3.1	Introduction	103
5.3.2	The Principle of Non-Refoulement and the Relevance of International Treaties in the EU Legal Order: Article 78(1) TFEU	104
5.3.3	The Principle of Non-Refoulement as Customary International Law in the EU Legal Order	108
5.3.4	The Principle of Non-Refoulement as a General Principle of EU Law	110
5.3.5	The EU Charter of Fundamental Rights	117
5.3.5.1	Overview	117
5.3.5.2	Specific Non-Refoulement Provisions; Collective Expulsions; the Right to Asylum and Their Legal Interaction with the General Provisions of the EU Charter	119
5.3.5.3	Scope and Application of the EU Charter’s Principle of Non-Refoulement	125
5.3.6	Non-Refoulement in EU Secondary Law Concerning Frontex’s Joint Operations at the EU’s External Borders	129

5.3.6.1	Introduction	129
5.3.6.2	How the Legal Instruments Are Connected	130
5.3.6.3	The Prohibition of Refoulement	132
5.4	Conclusions	134
6	Exploring the Legal Standing of Protection. The <i>Ratione Loci</i> Application of the Principle of Non-refoulement	136
6.1	Introduction	136
6.2	A Matter of International Law	137
6.2.1	Crossing the Borders	137
6.2.1.1	Article 33 of the 1951 Refugee Convention	140
6.2.1.2	International Human Rights Instruments	148
6.2.2	Beyond the Borders	150
6.2.2.1	The Concept of Jurisdiction in International Human Rights Law	153
6.2.2.2	European Convention of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms	155
6.2.2.2.1	Actual Control over Persons	155
6.2.2.2.2	Non-Refoulement under the ECHR	163
6.2.2.2.3	The <i>Al-Saadoon</i> Case	163
6.2.2.2.4	The <i>Hirsi</i> Case	165
6.2.2.3	The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	171
6.2.2.3.1	Non-Refoulement under the ICCPR	174
6.2.2.4	Convention against Torture	176
6.2.2.4.1	Non-Refoulement under the CAT	177
6.2.2.5	Extraterritorial Application of the 1951 Refugee Convention	180
6.2.2.5.1	Methodological Considerations	180
6.2.2.5.2	Application of Methodological Considerations	183
6.3	A Matter of EU Law	186
6.4	Conclusions	189

## CONTENTS

xi

7	Frontex Saving Lives at Sea	191
7.1	Interaction of Protection Regimes	191
7.2	Search and Rescue at Sea	192
7.3	Interaction with the Principle of Non-Refoulement	194
7.4	EU Sea External Borders Regulation	196
7.5	Greater Involvement for Frontex in Search and Rescue Operations?	198
7.6	Conclusions	203
8	The EU, Frontex and Non-Refoulement: Constructing Scenarios	205
8.1	Potential Triggers of EU and Member State Responsibility	205
8.2	Joint Operations at Sea	207
8.2.1	The Principle of Non-Refoulement	208
8.2.2	Frontex and the EU	210
8.3	Joint Operations on Land	213
8.3.1	In EU Territory	213
8.3.2	Outside EU Territory	214
8.3.2.1	Deployment of Technical Means	216
8.3.2.2	Member States' Border Guards in the Territory of a Third Country	217
8.3.2.3	The Principle of Non-Refoulement	218
8.3.2.4	Jurisdiction in Third-Country Territories	218
8.3.2.5	Frontex and the EU	220
8.4	Conclusions	221
9	General Conclusions	222
9.1	The Process of Embedding the EU/Frontex's Border Control and Surveillance in a Fundamental Rights Milieu	222
9.2	The Contribution of This Study	225
	<i>Bibliography</i>	231
	<i>Index</i>	245