

Crossroads

In this ambitious study, Anna K. Boucher and Justin Gest present a unique analysis of immigration governance across thirty countries. Relying on a database of immigration demographics in the world's most important destinations, they present a novel taxonomy and an analysis of what drives different approaches to immigration policy over space and time. In an era defined by inequality, populism, and fears of international terrorism, they find that governments are converging toward a "Market Model" that seeks immigrants for short-term labor with fewer outlets to citizenship – an approach that resembles the increasingly contingent nature of labor markets worldwide.

Anna K. Boucher is Senior Lecturer in Public Policy and Political Science at the University of Sydney. She is the author of *Gender, Migration, and the Global Race for Talent* and numerous peer-reviewed articles. She is the holder of major research grants, including from the Australian Research Council. She frequently reports to governmental reviews on immigration matters and comments in the media on migration topics, including for the BBC, *The Guardian*, *Die Zeit*, *The Australian Financial Review*, and the Australian Broadcasting Corporation. In 2007, she co-founded the Migration Studies Unit at the London School of Economics.

Justin Gest is Assistant Professor of Public Policy at George Mason University's Schar School of Policy and Government. He is the author of *The New Minority: White Working Class Politics in an Age of Immigration and Inequality* and *Apart: Alienated and Engaged Muslims in the West*. He has authored many peer-reviewed articles appearing in journals including *Comparative Political Studies*, *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, and the *International Migration Review*, and has provided analysis for numerous news organizations including the BBC, CNN, *The Guardian*, NPR, Politico, Reuters, and *The Washington Post*. In 2007, he co-founded the Migration Studies Unit at the London School of Economics.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-12959-7 — Crossroads
Anna K. Boucher , Justin Gest
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Crossroads

Comparative Immigration Regimes in a World of Demographic Change

ANNA K. BOUCHER

University of Sydney

JUSTIN GEST

George Mason University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-12959-7 — Crossroads
Anna K. Boucher, Justin Gest
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107129597

DOI: 10.1017/9781316416631

© Anna K. Boucher and Justin Gest 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-12959-7 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-57005-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> vi
<i>List of Tables</i>	vii
<i>Preface: The Start of a Conversation</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
1 The Liberal Model and the Market Model	I
2 The Classification of Immigration Regimes	II
3 Drivers of Immigration Regimes Over Time	39
4 Visa Mix: A Global Preference for Labor Immigration?	66
5 Temporary Ratio: The Return of the Guest Worker?	94
6 Naturalization: A Final Barrier to Immigration	II4
7 The Crossroads Taxonomy of Thirty Immigration Regimes	135
8 What Explains Variation in Immigration Regimes?	161
<i>Methodological Appendix</i>	187
<i>References</i>	207
<i>Index</i>	239

Figures

2.1	Total migrant stock over time across the fifty selected non-OECD and OECD countries	<i>page</i> 34
2.2	Stock as a percentage of total population by country over time	36
3.1	Herfindahl Indices by country over time	45
3.2	Gravity Measures by country over time	47
4.1	Permanent Visa Mix into selected countries, 2011	74
4.2	Visa Mix into selected countries, 2011	75
5.1	Temporary Ratio and Visa Mix, 2011	105
5.2	Temporary Ratio across available countries from 2006 to 2011	107
6.1	Naturalization Rates over time in selected countries	129
7.1	Neoliberal Regimes spider plot	142
7.2	Humanitarian Regimes spider plot	144
7.3	Intra-Union Regimes spider plot	145
7.4	Extra-Union Regimes spider plot	146
7.5	Constrained Regimes spider plot	147
7.6	Kafala Regimes spider plot	148
7.7	Quasi-Kafala Regimes spider plot	149
7.8	Global taxonomy dendogram	150
7.9	Mean Naturalization Rates (1990–2014)	159
8.1	Colonial legacies and regime clustering results	165
8.2	Aging and clustering results	167
8.3	Economic freedom and regime clustering results	169
8.4	Natural resources and regime clustering results	171
8.5	Welfare state generosity and regime clustering results	172
8.6	Executive party position means and regime clustering	175

Tables

2.1 Existing immigration and membership typologies and taxonomies	<i>page</i> 14
2.2 Top ten countries, migrants as percentage of total population, 2015	24
2.3 Top ten countries, absolute number of migrants, 2015	24
2.4 Stock as a percentage of total population by country	37
4.1 Accompanying family migration as a percentage of total flows in select GCC states and China, 2006–11	76
4.2 Family migration as a percentage of overall immigration flows into the OECD, Latin America, Russia, and South Africa, 2006–11	80
4.3 Permanent work-related immigration as a percentage of total flows across time in the OECD, Latin America, Russia, and South Africa, 2006–11	83
4.4 Free movement immigration as a percentage of total flows across the OECD, 2006–11	84
4.5 Humanitarian immigration across the OECD, Russia, and South Africa as a percentage of total flows, 2006–11	87
5.1 Temporary Ratio across countries, 2000s	104
6.1 Comparison between OECD and Janoski (2010) data, with multipliers	125
6.2 Historical Naturalization Rates for <i>jus soli</i> countries	126
6.3 Naturalization Rates across fifty countries	127
A.1 Global cluster solutions	199
A.2 OECD cluster solutions	200
A.3 Six-cluster solution for demand-related factors only	201

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-12959-7 — Crossroads
Anna K. Boucher , Justin Gest
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Preface

The Start of a Conversation

This book starts a conversation.

It is a conversation about how countries around the world vary in their migration demographic outcomes. It is a conversation about which countries' profiles are similar and which are exceptional. It is a conversation about what drives immigration regimes and demographic trends across these different countries. And ultimately, it is a conversation that we – as immigration researchers – wanted to have with each other, but found impossible given the current state of the field.

We asked ourselves, “What information would we need in order to pursue such a conversation?” And ultimately, we needed concepts and data that simply did not exist or which existed but had not been adequately collated and compiled. We needed a comprehensive conceptualization of an immigration regime. We needed an enumeration of the different dimensions of an immigration regime. We needed a way to measure these dimensions in a systematic way across space and time. We needed a taxonomy that grouped different regimes according to their similarities.

These are substantial goals. And after initially wrestling with the available concepts and data, we decided more needed to be developed. Accordingly, in this book we offer a number of contributions:

- (1) We construct a new conceptualization of what constitutes an immigration regime and how one might measure its outcomes in a valid and reliable manner across countries and time.
- (2) We build a database measuring these dimensions and their constitutive metrics for fifty countries around the world. After five years of data collection and assembly, this database brings together available data from international institutions and data from independent

- reports, national statistics agencies, and newspaper reports, which we standardize to United Nations and OECD measurements.
- (3) Using this first-of-its-kind, standardized, statistical database, we produce a taxonomy of thirty countries' immigration regimes for which we have full data across all dimensions.
 - (4) Finally, we undertake an early analysis of this new demographic data-derived taxonomy that seeks to understand what drives immigration regimes and governance.

By the end of this book, the conversation is far from over. Rather, it can now get started – or resume – with access to greater information. Indeed, with this book, we hope to provide the tools and data that will permit others to carry on this conversation with newer data and with a broader group of people. We make an initial attempt at analysis based on our conceptual development and data collection. However, in scope, this book sets up others to expand the available data according to universal standards and definitions, and to undertake a more extensive analysis that incorporates new variables and other phenomena related to the migration of people around the world.

Acknowledgments

A book with global scope relied upon a truly global network of support. Our colleagues, advisors, and research assistants spanned as many countries as we covered in our data collection. Indeed, our co-authoring partnership depended upon strong internet connections and stronger relationships that crossed the earth.

We conceived the book in 2010 when we were newly minted lecturers at the University of Sydney and Harvard University, respectively. Having concluded over multiple video calls that we would like to see a big-picture book on migration regimes worldwide, we embarked on what turned out to be a lengthy and, at times, challenging journey. Beyond our perseverance and partnership, it was made possible by countless pieces of guidance, feedback, and information from scores of colleagues, friends, and family members.

We are especially indebted to the volunteer attendees at two book workshops we held at George Mason University and the City University of New York in April 2016: Jeremy Ferwerda, Phil Kasinitz, Susan Martin, John Mollenkopf, Maggie Peters, Marty Schain, Audrey Singer, and Matt Wright.

We sincerely thank a number of colleagues in the interdisciplinary field of migration research. These include many members of the American Political Science Association (APSA) Migration and Citizenship Section: Irene Bloemraad, Katrina Burgess, Antje Ellerman, Gary Freeman, Terri Givens, Sara Wallace Goodman, Jim Hollifield, Rey Koslowski, Gallya Lahav, Willem Maas, Jeannette Money, Jill Stein, and

Maarten Vink. We have also received helpful feedback from Dovelyn Agunias, Alex Aleinikoff, Lora Berg, Hamutal Bernstein, Spencer Boyer, Lucie Cerna, Rafaela Dancygier, Sarah de Lange, Feline Freier, Aubrey Grant, Dominik Hangartner, David Held, Dan Hopkins, Konrad Kalicki, Gregory Maniatis, Henrietta Moore, Caglar Özden, Demetri Papademetriou, Dilip Ratha, Catherine Smith, Joo-Cheong Tham, Carlton Yearwood, Reymundo Zambrano, Yang-Yang Zhou, and the various discussants who offered feedback about our research at conferences over the years.

We learned an enormous amount from our colleagues as part of the International Migration Policy And Law Analysis (IMPALA) Database consortium: Michel Beine, Brian Burgoon, Mary Crock, Michael Hiscox, Pat McGovern, Hillel Rapoport, Joep Schaper, and Eiko Thielemann. In many ways, this book was in response to our work together.

We also want to thank our colleagues who are or were our contemporaries at our respective institutions, who offered generous advice on argument, structure, presentation, and method. At the University of Sydney: Stephen Castles, Ben Goldsmith, Ryan Griffiths, John Keane, Allan McConnell, Pippa Norris, Nicola Piper, Simon Tormey, Ariadne Vromen, Colin Wight, and Chris Wright. At Harvard University: Bart Bonikowsky, Amy Catalinac, Ryan Enos, Noah Feldman, Filiz Garip, Noam Gidron, Peter Hall, Ben Herzog, Jennifer Hochschild, Michèle Lamont, Steve Levitsky, Shawn Ling Ramirez, Noora Lori, Gwyneth McClendon, Rich Nielsen, Gerry Neuman, Hilary Rantisi, Jared Schachner, Shauna Shames, Arthur Spirling, Jessica Tollette, Sid Verba, Mary Waters, and Daniel Ziblatt. At George Mason University: Katrin Anacker, Terry Clower, Des Dinan, Jim Finkelstein, Jack Goldstone, Bassam Haddad, David Hart, Naoru Koizumi, Mariely López-Santana, Peter Mandaville, Jerry Mayer, Jim Pfiffner, Mark Rozell, Bill Schneider, Louise Shelley, Jen Victor, Janine Wedel, and Jim Witte.

Experts within international organizations have been very helpful in providing data and insights on interpretation, in particular the OECD's Migration Section former head, Georges Lemaître, Thomas Liebig, Cecile Thoreau and the United Nations' Hania Zlotnik and Bela Hovy. The GLLM provided important Gulf country data and we thank Françoise De Bel-Air for her assistance in interpreting this information. We are very grateful to Tom Janoski for sharing the cross-national naturalization data that he has collected since his 2010 book. In countries where we undertook original data collection the following government officials and external experts were very important. For the Russian Federation: Kirill Boychenko, Tim Colton, and Esther Tetrushvili. In Kuwait: Khalid

Acknowledgments

xiii

AlMuhailan, Weam Al Othman, and Hilary Rantisi. In South Africa, we would like to thank Mark Addleson and Loren Landau for their assistance. In interpreting the Singapore data, Leong Chang Hoong. In Chile, Rodolfo Honorato Torrealba. In China, Pang Lihua and in Singapore, Brenda Yeoh and Leong Chan Hoong.

We have benefited from the assistance of some very talented research assistants and country experts, who have gone on to do wonderful things in their own research and careers: Andrea Ortiz, Andrew Butters, Colin Brown, Sam Clark, Max Dikkers, Emma Franklin, Tarsha Gavan, Eda Gunaydin, Ting Luo, Nadica Pavlovska, Tyler Reny, Aaron Roper, Ari Rubin, Yang Shen, Maria Teresa Vanikiotis, Megan Eloise Vincent, Alexander Wang, Laila Parada Worby, and Jin Yunan.

We are grateful to our editors at Cambridge University Press, Lew Bateman and Robert Dreesen, for their support and shepherding of our manuscript. We also acknowledge the use of content from our 2015 article, “Migration Studies at a Crossroads: A Critique of Immigration Regime Typologies” in *Migration Studies*, 3(2) pages 182–198, published by Oxford University Press.

Our research has been generously supported by the following sources: the Kuwait Foundation for the Advancement of Science, through the Middle East Initiative and Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs at the Harvard Kennedy School; Harvard University’s Institute for Quantitative Social Science; Harvard University’s Center for European Studies; the Institute for Social Sciences and the School of Social and Political Sciences at the University of Sydney; and a Data Visualisation Grant from the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences at the University of Sydney. We also appreciate the interest and assistance of Jeff Blossom, Giovanni Zambotti, Devika Kakkar, and Fei Carnes from Harvard University’s Center for Geographic Analysis, who helped prepare the visualizations and maps on the book’s website: crossroads.earth.

We thank our families for their backing: Robert Boucher for his unpaid proofreading and data-checking; Gail, Max, Darren, Rebecca, and Phillip Gest for their enthusiasm and for giving Anna refuge in Los Angeles during Hurricane Isaac. Most profoundly, we would like to thank our spouses, Kare and Monika, who have tolerated our weekly calls at ridiculously anti-social hours and our demands for work trips with complex stop-over arrangements. This book is dedicated to our new babies, now toddlers, who were both born over the period we wrote this book: Jasper and Valentina.

Finally, we would like to thank each other: Justin for his optimistic big-picture thinking and vision; and Anna for her exceptional diligence and attention to detail. We laughed, we clashed, we confided, we kvetched, but ultimately, we thoroughly enjoyed our time working together.

To view data maps, visualizations, and related content, please visit the book's companion website: crossroads.earth.