

The Loyalist Problem in Revolutionary New England

The Loyalist Problem in Revolutionary New England begins with a snapshot of the region on the eve of the Boston Tea Party. The colonists' republican tradition helped them spark the Revolution, but their special history also threatened the unity of the United States throughout the Revolutionary War. For loyalists tried to discredit New Englanders as a naturally rebellious people. Yet Ingersoll shows that the rebels never sought to drive the dissenters out of the new nation, and accorded them a remarkable degree of liberal toleration, with the great majority of loyalists ultimately becoming citizens of the new states.

Thomas N. Ingersoll is Associate Professor at Ohio State University. His first book was *Mammon and Manon in Early New Orleans: The First Slave Society in the Deep South, 1718–1819* (1999). In *To Intermix with Our White Brothers: Indian Mixed Bloods in the United States from Earliest Times to the Indian Removals* (2005), he explores the social and political problems created by racial mixture. His guiding interest is how people in early America defined legitimate membership in society, who had rights and who did not.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-12861-3 — The Loyalist Problem in Revolutionary New England
Thomas N. Ingersoll
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

The Loyalist Problem in Revolutionary New England

THOMAS N. INGERSOLL
The Ohio State University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-12861-3 — The Loyalist Problem in Revolutionary New England
Thomas N. Ingersoll
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107128613

© Thomas N. Ingersoll 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-12861-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-12861-3 — The Loyalist Problem in Revolutionary New England
Thomas N. Ingersoll
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For GBN

Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
<i>A Note on Sources</i>	xv
<i>Chronology of the English Revolution in the Seventeenth Century</i>	xvii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xix
Introduction: History, Revolutionary Ideology, and the Loyalist Problem	I
PART I. NEW ENGLAND IN DECEMBER, 1773	
1 The New England People in their Towns on December Sixteenth, 1773: A Historic Mission at Risk	15
2 Loyalists and Oliver Cromwell's Ghost: The Problem of the Radical Tradition in 1773	50
3 "A Moral Distemper in the British Government": Loyalists, the Ruling Class, and the Mailed Fist	84
PART II. FROM THE BOSTON TEA PARTY TO THE WAR AND INDEPENDENCE	
4 Rebels and Loyalists from December Sixteenth, 1773 to September 1774	119
5 "The Attempts of a Wicked Administration to Enslave America": The Peace of the Towns Destroyed and the Loyalist Cause, September 1774 to April 19, 1775	149
6 "Avoid Blood and Tumult": Loyalist Policy During the War	181

	PART III. THE LOYALIST PROBLEM AND IDEOLOGY AFTER 1776	
7	The Radical Critique of Tory Oligarchy, Slavery, and Patriarchy	215
8	The “Ugly Question” of Confiscation	247
9	“A Day of Strict Reckoning” for “a Multitude of Subtil Enemies”? New England Loyalists After 1783	274
	Conclusion	302
	<i>Index</i>	307

Illustrations

Figures

1.1	Paul Revere, <i>A View of the Year 1765</i> , engraving	page 33
2.1	[Anonymous] <i>The Yankie Doodles Intrenchments near Boston</i> , 1776, engraving	58
4.1	Paul Revere, <i>Mr. Samuel Adams</i> , April, 1774	124
5.1	Paul Revere, <i>A Warm Place – Hell</i> , engraving, 1768	162
7.1	Paul Revere, <i>The Wicked Statesman, or the Traitor to his Country</i> , metal cut, 1773	218
9.1	[William Humphrey, publisher, London] <i>The Savages let loose, or The cruel fate of the Loyalists</i> , etching, 1783	275

Map

1	New England in 1773	xx
---	---------------------	----

Tables

1.1	Population of New England, Including Vermont, in 1770	<i>page</i> 24
5.1	Distribution of Loyalist Offenders in Massachusetts, 1775–83, Including Exiles and Accused, and Number of Towns Represented	151
5.2	Distribution of Loyalists in Connecticut by County in Order of Number of Estates Confiscated, 1775–83	152
8.1	Acts of the Connecticut Legislature Concerning Loyalists and Their Estates, 1775–84	256

Acknowledgments

This book began with a presentation at the Annual Meeting of the Organization of American Historians on March 31, 1995. My thanks to Rosemarie Zaggari, Michael McGiffert, the late Richard E. Ellis, and other members of the audience for their comments. A later version was read and commented upon very helpfully by participants in the Ohio Seminar in Early American History and Culture, Columbus, April 6, 2007.

Mere words fail to express sufficient gratitude to colleagues who have saved me from as many errors as possible and provided criticism to improve the book. The entire manuscript was critiqued by Robert M. Calhoon, David D. Hall, John L. Brooke, and an anonymous reader for Cambridge University Press. I owe a large debt to the late William Pencak, who plowed through an early, unrefined version and offered strong support at a point when I needed it most, just before he died. I am one of many scholars who will miss this colleague's unfailing warm generosity.

Over a period of years, one or more chapters improved greatly because of criticism by Joyce Appleby, Ruth H. Bloch, T. H. Breen, Staughton Lynd, Gary B. Nash, Carla Gardina Pestana, J. G. A. Pocock, the late Alfred F. Young, Michael Zuckerman, and various members of the Early American Thesis Seminar in Pacific Palisades.

Finally, improbable as it may sound, I remember fondly the late Samuel Eliot Morison. My irrepressible Boston landlady arranged a meeting with him despite my protests, and the Admiral kindly brought me into his home just before he died, patiently ignored the primitive state of my scholarship at that time, and encouraged me to continue studying his beloved Massachusetts.

Anyone who works in the local archives of New England must be grateful to the dedicated and kind staff members who manage them. I owe thanks to the archivists and librarians at the Massachusetts State Archives, Boston, Rhode Island State Archives, Providence, New Hampshire State Archives, Concord, and the State Archives of the Connecticut State Library, Hartford. The personnel of the last named, in particular, manage their enormous and complicated holdings with unfailing kindness to researchers. The same can be said of the tireless workers in the National Archives of the United Kingdom, or Public Record Office, Kew Gardens, Surrey, and the British Library, London. I am also grateful to those who labor in the National Library and Archives of Canada, Ottawa, the William Clements Library, Ann Arbor, the Massachusetts Historical Society, Boston, The John Carter Brown Library, Providence, and the American Antiquarian Society, Worcester.

I thank the diligent librarians who assisted me and tidied up after my visits, in particular to those posted in the libraries of McGill University, The Ohio State University, University of California–Los Angeles, University of California–Berkeley, Stanford University, Boston Public Library, the Library of Congress, University of Massachusetts–Boston, Georgetown University, Trinity College, Brown University, New York University, University of Vermont, University of Michigan, and Université de Montréal.

Brandon F. Nicholson kindly reproduced the illustrations and created the map. Student researchers who sorted evidence for the book include Christian Alcindor and David Pricer. The research could not have been completed without very generous sabbatical leave from the Département d'histoire, Université de Montréal, with financial aid from the McConnell Foundation, as well as sabbatical leave from the Department of History, The Ohio State University.

A Note on Sources

This essay rests on a broad array of primary and secondary sources, and has more breadth than depth on certain subjects. I have canvassed the entire spectrum of primary sources, including all major political sources (state and local records), newspapers, political sermons, private correspondence, including many older neglected collections. My method in casting such a wide net was to capture as truly as possible the domestic conflict as it unfolded from day to day in the wrestling between rebel and loyalist.

Chronology of the English Revolution in the Seventeenth Century

- 1625–49 Reign of Charles I
 1628 Petition of Right by the House of Commons, agreed to by Charles I
 1629 Repudiation of the Petition of Right by Charles I; his dissolution of Parliament; begins his eleven years of personal rule
 1640 April: Short Parliament
 1640–9 November: Long Parliament
 1649 Execution of Charles I on January 30; members of the House of Commons then abolish the crown and the House of Lords
 1649–53 Republic [“Commonwealth”]; rule by a purged “Rump” Parliament; then by the “Barebones” Parliament (July–December, 1653)
 1653–8 Protectorate of Oliver Cromwell (with First [1654–5] and Second [1656–8] Parliaments)
 1658–9 Protectorate of Richard Cromwell (with one Parliament, January–April, 1659)
 1659–60 Republic
 May–October, 1659: restored Rump;
 October–December, 1659: army rule;
 December 1659–February 1660: re-restored Rump;

This chronology is adapted from Christopher Hill, *The Century of Revolution, 1603–1714* (New York, 1961), 315–16

- February–March 1660: enlarged Rump with Secluded Members;
 April–May: Convention Parliament recalls Charles II; House of Lords restored
- 1660–85 Reign of Charles II
- 1679–81 Exclusion Crisis, when a formative party of “Whigs,” opposed by the party of “Tories,” attempts and fails to exclude James, Duke of York from the succession after he converted to Roman Catholicism
- 1685–8 Reign of James II (with one Parliament, 1685–7)
 Faced with rebellion, he fled into exile in France late in 1688
- 1688–9 Glorious Revolution; Interregnum
 Convention Parliament, January–February 1689, declares William III and Mary II monarchs upon their agreement to the Bill of Rights, an enlarged version of the Petition of Right of 1628, which Parliament subsequently passes as a statute on December 16, 1689, along with several other statutes comprising the English constitution

Abbreviations

<i>Amer. Arch.</i>	<i>American Archives</i> , ed. M. St. Clair Clarke and Peter Force, 4th ser., 6 vols. (Washington, D.C., 1837)
CSA	Connecticut State Archives
Gage Papers	The Military Papers of Thomas Gage, American Series, William Clements Library, Ann Arbor, Mich.
Hansard	[Thomas C. Hansard], <i>The Parliamentary History of England from the Earliest Period to the Year 1803</i> (London, 1813)
LDC	<i>Letters of Delegates to Congress, 1774–1789</i> , ed. Paul H. Smith, 26 vols. (Washington, D.C., 1976–2000)
NHSA	New Hampshire State Archives, Concord, N.H.
PRO AO	The National Archives, Public Records Office, Kew Gardens, Audit Office
PRO CO	Public Records Office, Kew Gardens, Colonial Office
RG	Connecticut State Library, Record Group
RIHS	Rhode Island Historical Society, Providence, R.I.,
<i>Sibley's Harvard Graduates</i>	Clifford K. Shipton, <i>Biographical Sketches of Those Who Attended Harvard College [Sibley's Harvard Graduates]</i> , 18 vols. (Boston, Mass., 1933–75)