

CHRISTIANITY AND FREEDOM

VOLUME 1: HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES

In *Christianity and Freedom, Volume 1*, leading historians uncover the unappreciated role of Christianity in the development of basic human rights and freedoms from antiquity through today. These include radical notions of dignity and equality, religious freedom, liberty of conscience, limited government, consent of the governed, economic liberty, autonomous civil society, and church-state separation, as well as more recent advances in democracy, human rights, and human development. Acknowledging that the record is mixed, scholars document how the seeds of freedom in Christianity antedate and ultimately undermine later Christian justifications and practices of persecution. Drawing from history, political science, and sociology, this volume will become a standard reference work for historians, political scientists, theologians, students, journalists, business leaders, opinion shapers, and policy makers.

Timothy Samuel Shah is the Associate Director of the Religious Freedom Project at the Berkley Center for Religion, Peace, and World Affairs and Associate Professor of the Practice of Religion and Global Politics in the Government Department, Georgetown University. He is the author most recently of *Religious Freedom: Why Now? Defending an Embattled Human Right* and *God's Century: Resurgent Religion and Global Politics* (with Monica Duffy Toft and Daniel Philpott).

Allen D. Hertzke is an internationally recognized scholar of religion and politics. He is author of *Freeing God's Children: The Unlikely Alliance for Global Human Rights* and editor of *The Future of Religious Freedom*. A past fellow for the Pew Research Center, he directed the study "Lobbying for the Faithful: Religious Advocacy Groups in Washington DC." He is a member of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences.

LAW AND CHRISTIANITY

Cambridge Studies in Law and Christianity

Series Editor:

John Witte Jr., Emory University

Editorial Board:

Nigel Biggar, University of Oxford
 Marta Cartabia, Italian Constitutional Court / University of Milan
 Sarah Coakley, University of Cambridge
 Norman Doe, Cardiff University
 Brian Ferme, Marcianum, Venice
 Richard W. Garnett, University of Notre Dame
 Robert P. George, Princeton University
 Mary Ann Glendon, Harvard University
 Kent Greenawalt, Columbia University
 Robin Griffith-Jones, the Temple, the Inns of Court
 R. H. Helmholz, University of Chicago
 Mark Hill, the Inns of Court / Cardiff University
 Wolfgang Huber, Bishop Emeritus, United Protestant Church of Germany /
 Universities of Heidelberg, Berlin, and Stellenbosch
 Michael W. McConnell, Stanford University
 John McGuckin, Columbia University
 Mark A. Noll, University of Notre Dame
 Michael Welker, University of Heidelberg

The Law and Christianity series publishes cutting-edge work on Catholic, Protestant, and Orthodox Christian contributions to public, private, penal, and procedural law and legal theory. The series aims to promote deep Christian reflection by leading scholars on the fundamentals of law and politics, to build further ecumenical legal understanding across Christian denominations, and to link and amplify the diverse and sometimes isolated Christian legal voices and visions at work in the academy. Works collected by the series include groundbreaking monographs, historical and thematic anthologies, and translations by leading scholars around the globe.

Volumes in the series:

The Western Case for Monogamy over Polygamy John Witte (2015)
Pope Benedict XVI's Legal Thought Marta Cartabia and Andrea Simoncini (2015)
The Distinctiveness of Religion in American Law Kathleen A. Brady (2015)
Christianity and Freedom, edited by Timothy Samuel Shah and Allen D. Hertzke (2016)

Christianity and Freedom

HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES

VOLUME 1

Edited by

TIMOTHY SAMUEL SHAH

Georgetown University

ALLEN D. HERTZKE

University of Oklahoma



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-107-12458-5 — Christianity and Freedom
 Edited by Timothy Samuel Shah, Allen D. Hertzke
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107124585

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2016

Chapter 2 originally appeared as “The First Enlightenment: The Patristic Roots of Religious Freedom” in *Religion and Innovation: Antagonists or Partners?*, Donald A. Yerxa, ed., © Bloomsbury Academic 2015.

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Christianity and freedom / edited by Allen D. Hertzke, Timothy Samuel Shah.

2 volumes cm. – (Law and Christianity)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Contents: – v. 2. Contemporary perspectives.

Description based on: v. 2, published in 2016.

ISBN 978-1-107-12472-1 (hardback)

I. Liberty – Religious aspects – Christianity. I. Hertzke, Allen D., editor.

II. Shah, Timothy Samuel, editor.

BT810.3.C48 2016

261.7-dc23 2015027373

ISBN 978-1-107-12458-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

The Religious Freedom Research Project

This volume is the fruit of research conceived and supported by the Religious Freedom Research Project (RFRP) of the Berkley Center for Religion, Peace, and World Affairs at Georgetown University. Under the leadership of Director Thomas Farr and Associate Director Timothy Samuel Shah, the Religious Freedom Research Project is the world's only university-based program devoted exclusively to the analysis of religious freedom, a basic human right restricted in many parts of the globe. The RFRP is made possible by significant grants from the John Templeton Foundation, a partnership with Baylor University's Institute for Studies of Religion, and the generous support of numerous other individuals and foundations.

The goal of the RFRP is to deepen scholarly understanding, inform policy deliberation, and educate the wider public concerning the meaning and value of religious freedom. It achieves this goal through publications such as this one, as well as conferences, workshops, media appearances, a vigorous web presence, and a blog, *Cornerstone: A Conversation on Religious Freedom and Its Social Implications*. Find out more at www.berkeleycenter.georgetown.edu/rfp.

Contents

<i>Contributing Authors</i>	<i>page xi</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xiii</i>
Introduction: Christianity and Freedom: Ancient Roots and Historical Innovations	1
Timothy Samuel Shah	
1. The Roots of Religious Freedom in Early Christian Thought	33
Timothy Samuel Shah	
2. The Christian Roots of Religious Freedom	62
Robert Louis Wilken	
3. Lactantius on Religious Liberty and His Influence on Constantine	90
Elizabeth DePalma Digeser	
4. Augustine and Religious Freedom	103
John Rist	
5. Christianity and the Roots of Human Dignity in Late Antiquity	123
Kyle Harper	
6. Liberty of Conscience and Freedom of Religion in the Medieval Canonists and Theologians	149
Ian Christopher Levy	
7. Faith, Liberty, and the Defense of the Poor: Bishop Las Casas in the History of Human Rights	176
David M. Lantigua	

8.	Calvinist Contributions to Freedom in Early Modern Europe John Witte Jr.	210
9.	Constitutional Protection of the Freedom of Conscience in Colonial America: The Rhode Island and Pennsylvania Experiments David Little	235
10.	Christianity and Freedom in the American Founding Matthew J. Franck	264
11.	Vibrant Christian Pluralism and the Evolution and Defense of Religious Liberty in America Judge Ken Starr	290
12.	Orthodox Christian Contributions to Freedom: Historical Foundations, Contemporary Problematics Elizabeth H. Prodromou	301
13.	Christianity: A Straggler on the Road to Liberty? Daniel Philpott	333
14.	Protestant Missionaries and the Centrality of Conversion Attempts for the Spread of Education, Printing, Colonial Reform, and Political Democracy Robert D. Woodberry	367
15.	God and Freedom: Biblical Roots of the Western Idea of Liberty Rémi Brague	391
	<i>Index</i>	403

Contributing Authors

Rémi Brague is Professor Emeritus of medieval and Arabic philosophy at the University of Paris. He also teaches at the Ludwig-Maximilian-Universität of Munich where he holds the Romano Guardini Chair and is a member of the Institut de France.

Elizabeth DePalma Digeser is Professor of Roman history at the University of California, Santa Barbara. Her research interests include the pursuit of philosophy, religion, and politics in the third and fourth centuries CE.

Matthew J. Franck is Director of the William E. and Carol G. Simon Center on Religion and the Constitution at the Witherspoon Institute, Professor Emeritus of political science at Radford University, and Visiting Lecturer in politics at Princeton University.

Kyle Harper is Senior Vice President and Provost, Professor of classics and letters, and Director of the Institute for the American Constitutional Heritage at the University of Oklahoma. A historian of the Roman world, he is the author of *Slavery in the Late Roman World, 275–425*, and *From Shame to Sin: The Christian Transformation of Sexual Morality in Late Antiquity*.

David Lantigua, Ph.D., is Assistant Professor of moral theology and ethics at the Catholic University of America. He is Coeditor with Lawrence A. Clayton for *The Essential Bartolomé de las Casas: A Brief History with Documents* and his articles have appeared in *Modern Theology* and *Journal of Moral Theology*.

Ian Christopher Levy is Professor of theology at Providence College in Providence, Rhode Island. His research focuses on medieval ecclesiology, sacraments, and biblical exegesis.

David Little is a Fellow at the Berkley Center for Religion, Peace, and World Affairs at Georgetown University, and is retired Professor Emeritus of religion and international affairs at Harvard Divinity School.

Daniel Philpott is Professor of political science and peace studies and Director of the Center for Civil and Human Rights at the University of Notre Dame.

Elizabeth H. Prodromou is Visiting Associate Professor of conflict resolution at the Fletcher School for Law & Diplomacy at Tufts University. She chairs the Eastern Mediterranean and Europe Study Group at Harvard University's Center for European Studies.

John Rist is Professor Emeritus of classics and philosophy at the University of Toronto and former Kurt Pritzl Professor of Philosophy at the Catholic University of America.

Timothy Samuel Shah is Associate Director of the Religious Freedom Project at the Berkley Center for Religion, Peace, and World Affairs and Associate Professor of the Practice of Religion and Global Politics in the Government Department at Georgetown University.

Kenneth Winston Starr is the President and Chancellor of Baylor University and serves on the faculty of Baylor Law School as the Louise L. Morrison Chair of Constitutional Law.

Robert Louis Wilken is the William R. Kenan Jr. Professor of the History of Christianity (emeritus) at the University of Virginia. His most recent book is *The First Thousand Years: A Global History of Christianity* from Yale University Press.

John Witte Jr. is the Robert W. Woodruff University Professor of Law, McDonald Distinguished Professor, and Director of the Center for the Study of Law and Religion at Emory University. He has published 220 articles and 27 books, most recently, *The Western Case for Monogamy over Polygamy* (Cambridge University Press, 2015).

Robert D. Woodberry is Director of the Project on Religion and Economic Change, an associate professor of political science at the National University of Singapore, and a Senior Research Professor at the Institute for the Studies of Religion at Baylor University.

Acknowledgments

This book is Volume 1 of a two-volume project, *Christianity and Freedom: Historical and Contemporary Perspectives*. The volumes emerged from a two-year cooperative research initiative conceived and supported by the Religious Freedom Research Project (RFRP) of the Berkley Center for Religion, Peace, & World Affairs at Georgetown University. Founded in 2011, the RFRP has been made possible by significant grants from the John Templeton Foundation, a partnership with Baylor University's Institute for Studies of Religion, and the generous support of numerous other individuals and foundations. At the same time, the opinions expressed in this volume are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Templeton Foundation or any other supporting foundations or individuals.

The *Christianity and Freedom* initiative was set in motion by an initial, catalytic grant from the Lynde and Harry Bradley Foundation in 2011. For his crucial role in helping us to conceptualize the project and then inviting us to seek Bradley support, we gratefully acknowledge Daniel Schmidt, Bradley's Vice President for Program. Serendipitously and almost simultaneously, in September 2011, Donald Yerxa and Wilfred McClay went out of their way to encourage us to seek major funding from the Historical Society's Religion and Innovation in Human Affairs Program (RIHA), an initiative they had just launched with the support of the Templeton Foundation. Don Yerxa in particular has proven a constant source of warm encouragement, not least through his gracious invitation to one of the editors (Timothy Shah) to deliver the Donald A. Yerxa Lecture in History on *Christianity and Freedom* at Eastern Nazarene University in April 2014. At a crucial point, before it was clear how much support the project would ultimately secure, Matthew Franck and the Witherspoon Institute stepped in to provide generous bridge funding that enabled us to organize and hold the first planning meeting with our Steering Committee of distinguished scholar-advisers and thus get our work under way in the spring of 2012.

We are delighted to have enjoyed the support of Baylor University, whose investment in this project has blossomed into an ongoing partnership with

Georgetown University's Religious Freedom Research Project. It is a pleasure to single out Ken Starr, President and Chancellor of Baylor University and a contributor to Volume 1, and Byron Johnson, Director of Baylor's Institute for Studies of Religion (ISR) and a member of our Steering Committee, for the depth and constancy of their personal and institutional commitment to this project and its goal of advancing scholarship in the cause of human freedom. We also gratefully acknowledge the extraordinary enthusiasm and wisdom of Carey Newman, Director of Baylor University Press. Carey joined us for the conference in Rome that previewed the project findings and gave us singularly generous and profound counsel concerning the process of taking the fruit of our work to publication. He has also worked closely with us to develop a monograph encapsulating the findings of the *Christianity and Freedom* initiative, making heavy investments of his time (and that of his staff) along the way.

The contributors to the *Christianity and Freedom* volumes presented their initial research at a global conference in Rome on December 13–14, 2013. We are especially grateful to the extraordinary representatives of the Acton Institute for the Study of Religion and Liberty in Rome – particularly Kishore Jayabalan and Michael Severance – for their counsel and indefatigable assistance in conference organization and planning over many months. We also gratefully acknowledge the Pontificia Università Urbaniana (Pontifical Urban University) and its Secretary General, Father Roberto Cherubini, for their generosity in throwing open the university's beautiful facilities for our use throughout the conference. And we warmly thank the Honorable Kenneth Hackett, United States Ambassador to the Holy See, for hosting a welcome reception in the ambassadorial residence on the eve of the conference for participants and special guests.

Three additional people deserve special mention for their memorable contributions to our Rome gathering. A most dramatic moment was the keynote address of His Beatitude, Louis Raphaël I Sako, Chaldean Catholic Patriarch of Iraq, who challenged us to raise our voices on behalf of Christians imperiled in their ancient lands. His ongoing fight to salvage and restore the pluralist fabric of Middle Eastern societies – now under existential threat – personifies and dramatizes the aims and themes of this project. We were also humbled and buoyed to receive the blessing of the Holy Father, Pope Francis, in a personal audience on the morning of the final day of the conference. With his zest for close ecumenical cooperation, nurtured over many years of friendship with evangelical and other non-Catholic religious leaders in Argentina, he took particular delight that our project and our conference represented a “Baptist-Catholic” collaboration between Georgetown University, America's oldest Catholic university, and Baylor University, the world's largest Baptist university. We interpreted his decision to meet with us – less than a year into his pontificate – as a concrete sign of his passionate concern for religious

liberty as well as the growing plight of persecuted Christians worldwide. On both of these issues he has spoken with ever-greater poignancy and clarity over the last two years. Finally, we gratefully acknowledge the role of then-Archbishop Dominique Mamberti, at that time the Vatican Secretary for Relations with States (since made a cardinal by Pope Francis), in launching our conference with a compelling keynote address interweaving the historic significance of the Edict of Milan and the contemporary importance of religious freedom. We also thank Cardinal Mamberti for his role in facilitating our personal audience with Pope Francis.

The success of this endeavor hinged in large measure on the foundational work of the distinguished members of our Steering Committee. These members identified contributing scholars, honed the themes and research questions of the volumes, and diligently reviewed and provided detailed feedback on draft chapters. Furthermore, their own scholarship served as an inspiration and model for many of the contributors to these volumes. Our thanks go out to these outstanding individuals: Thomas Farr, Matthew Franck, Yvonne Haddad, Amaney Jamal, Byron Johnson, David Little, Paul Marshall, and Robert Wilken. We especially want to acknowledge our colleague Thomas Farr, Director of the Religious Freedom Project at Georgetown, for his sage counsel and assiduous work at every stage of this initiative. Robert Wilken also deserves special thanks. In sharing his own pivotal research and expertise on the roots of religious freedom in the early Church Fathers proved an indispensable inspiration for this entire project, and his close involvement ever since has guaranteed that we have never been without his infectious intellectual enthusiasm.

This project could not have been fulfilled without the vital support of Georgetown University, and particularly the leadership and staff of the Berkley Center for Religion, Peace, and World Affairs. We are profoundly grateful to Thomas Banchoff, Director of the Berkley Center and Georgetown's Vice-President for Global Engagement, as well as Michael Kessler, the Berkley Center's Managing Director. From the very beginning, they have generously contributed their support and encouragement, both intellectual and administrative. Other Berkley Center colleagues who provided essential support include Erin Taylor, Amy Vander Vliet, Melody Fox Ahmed, and Randolph Pelzer.

If the multipronged efforts leading up to the publication of these volumes had a single headquarters, however, it was the Religious Freedom Research Project and its dedicated staff and team of student assistants. More than anyone, these friends and colleagues managed the successful execution of every aspect of this project, down to the last detail, with unfailing cheerfulness and consummate professionalism. We are particularly grateful to Senior Project Associate Claudia Winkler, who in effect played the role of managing editor of both of the project volumes, and former Senior Project Associate Kyle Vander Meulen, who more than any other single person worked to ensure the success of the Rome conference. We are also thankful for the many

contributions of Project Associate Nicholas Fedyk and former Project Associate A. J. Nolte. In addition, we acknowledge the many Georgetown students who contributed outstanding research and editorial assistance, especially Louis Cona, Justin Pinkerman, Matthew Quallen, Kevin Sullivan, Timothy Yin, and Harry Green.

Allen Hertzke's work as coeditor of these volumes was supported by the University of Oklahoma's Religious Freedom Project, which he directs under the auspices of the Institute for the American Constitutional Heritage. That program funded two energetic undergraduate research assistants, Gabriella Skillings and Erin Byrne, who helped us manage this complex endeavor. It also funded the work of our talented and assiduous indexer, Alexa Selph.

We are profoundly grateful to John Witte Jr., Series Editor of the Cambridge Studies in Law and Christianity, for his enthusiastic backing of this project. We are honored and delighted to be included in his series. We also laud the superb work of Cambridge University Press in publishing these volumes, and we are particularly grateful to Senior Editor John Berger, Managing Editor Stephen Acerra, and the entire team involved in copyediting, production, and marketing.

The John Templeton Foundation deserves a special note of thanks. Without the Templeton Foundation's generous funding in 2011, there would have been no Rome conference and no volume of outstanding essays. In fact, there would have been no Religious Freedom Project at all. The decision to bet on the Religious Freedom Project with a major start-up grant ultimately rested with Dr. Jack Templeton, President of the John Templeton Foundation. It was thus a blow to us and to the visionary philanthropy the Templeton Foundation uniquely embodies that he passed away on May 19, 2015 as this volume was being completed. We take this opportunity to record our unpayable debt of gratitude to Dr. Jack Templeton. And we take this opportunity to pray: Eternal rest grant unto him. . . . Long may his work continue.

For both of us this project is more than an academic exercise, as we have been inspired and challenged by the faithful witness of our many brothers and sisters in Christ around the world who live under conditions of persecution, yet whose very struggle sows the seeds of a more hopeful future and indeed a new humanity. We pay homage to their inestimable gifts, both to global Christianity and to human freedom. More than anything, these volumes acknowledge and honor the fact that they are not mere victims, passive and mute, but stirring witnesses and incomparably powerful agents of world-historical change.

The process of expressing thanks (however inadequate) to the many people who inspired, supported, and carried this initiative to fruition takes us to a place of deeper gratitude – for our very lives, our liberties, our families, and the many blessings of God's love we experience. To all of this we can only pray: *Deo Gratias*.

Timothy Samuel Shah and Allen D. Hertzke
November 22, 2015, *The Solemnity of Christ the King*