

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12365-6 - Diversity In Practice: Race, Gender, and Class in Legal and Professional Careers

Edited By Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer and David B. Wilkins
Frontmatter[More information](#)

DIVERSITY IN PRACTICE

Expressions of support for diversity are nearly ubiquitous among contemporary law firms and corporations. Organizations back these rhetorical commitments with dedicated diversity staff and various diversity and inclusion initiatives. Yet, the goal of proportionate representation for people of color and women remains unrealized. Members of historically underrepresented groups remain seriously disadvantaged in professional training and work environments that white, upper-class men continue to dominate. While many professional labor markets manifest patterns of demographic inequality, these patterns are particularly pronounced in the law and elite segments of many professions. *Diversity in Practice* analyzes the disconnect between expressed commitments to diversity and practical achievements, revealing the often obscure systemic causes that drive persistent professional inequalities. These original contributions build on existing literature and forge new paths in explaining enduring patterns of stratification in professional careers. These more realistic assessments provide opportunities to move beyond mere rhetoric to something approaching diversity in practice.

SPENCER HEADWORTH is Graduate Research Coordinator at the American Bar Foundation and a PhD Candidate in Northwestern University's Department of Sociology, and will begin as Assistant Professor of Sociology at Purdue University in August 2016. He studies crime, social control, law, inequality, organizations, and professions. His dissertation, "Policing Welfare," examines dedicated welfare fraud control units, a novel intersection between the worlds of public benefits and law enforcement.

ROBERT L. NELSON is the MacCrate Research Chair in the Legal Profession at the American Bar Foundation and Professor of Sociology and Law at Northwestern University. He studies law, inequality, and the legal profession. He is the author of *Legalizing Gender Inequality: Courts, Markets, and Unequal Pay for Women in America* (with William Bridges) which won the best book award from the American Sociological Association. From 2004–2015, Nelson served as Director of the American Bar Foundation.

RONIT DINOVITZER is Associate Professor of Sociology at the University of Toronto and is cross-appointed to the Institute for Management and Innovation. Her work focuses on the social structure of the legal profession and on professional ethics. Ronit is a Faculty Fellow of the American Bar Foundation where she is a co-investigator on "After the JD," the first national longitudinal study of US law graduates, and she has now completed the first national survey of Canadian law graduates.

DAVID B. WILKINS is Lester Kissel Professor of Law and Director of the Center on the Legal Profession at Harvard Law School. He is a globally recognized scholar on the legal profession, having written more than eighty articles and coauthored one of the leading casebooks in the field. Professor Wilkins is a Member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences and a Corresponding Member of the Spanish Royal Academy of Doctors.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12365-6 - Diversity In Practice: Race, Gender, and Class in Legal and Professional Careers

Edited By Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer and David B. Wilkins
Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LAW AND SOCIETY

Cambridge Studies in Law and Society aims to publish the best scholarly work on legal discourse and practice in its social and institutional contexts, combining theoretical insights and empirical research.

The fields that it covers are: studies of law in action; the sociology of law; the anthropology of law; cultural studies of law, including the role of legal discourses in social formations; law and economics; law and politics; and studies of governance. The books consider all forms of legal discourse across societies, rather than being limited to lawyers' discourses alone.

The series editors come from a range of disciplines: academic law; socio-legal studies; sociology; and anthropology. All have been actively involved in teaching and writing about law in context.

Series editors

Chris Arup *Monash University, Victoria*

Sally Engle Merry *New York University*

Susan Silbey *Massachusetts Institute of Technology*

A list of books in the series can be found at the back of this book.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12365-6 - Diversity In Practice: Race, Gender, and Class in Legal and Professional Careers

Edited By Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer and David B. Wilkins

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

DIVERSITY IN PRACTICE
Race, Gender, and Class in
Legal and Professional Careers

Edited by

SPENCER HEADWORTH

ROBERT L. NELSON

RONIT DINOVITZER

DAVID B. WILKINS



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12365-6 - Diversity In Practice: Race, Gender, and Class in Legal and Professional Careers

Edited By Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer and David B. Wilkins
Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107123656

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Diversity in practice : race, gender, and class in legal and professional careers / Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer, and David Wilkins, editors.

pages cm. – (Cambridge studies in law and society)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-12365-6 (Hardback : alk. paper)

1. Practice of law. 2. Law—Vocational guidance. 3. Social perception. 4. Multiculturalism—Law and legislation. 5. Discrimination. 6. Minorities. 7. Prejudices. I. Headworth, Spencer, editor. II. Nelson, Robert L., 1952– editor. III. Dinovitzer, Ronit, 1971– editor.

K120.D58 2015

331.11—dc23 2015028169

ISBN 978-1-107-12365-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12365-6 - Diversity In Practice: Race, Gender, and Class in Legal and Professional Careers

Edited By Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer and David B. Wilkins
Frontmatter[More information](#)

CONTENTS

	<i>List of contributors</i>	page vii
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
1	Introduction SPENCER HEADWORTH AND ROBERT L. NELSON	1
I	RHETORIC AND REALITIES	35
2	The action after the Call: What general counsels say about the value of diversity in legal purchasing decisions in the years following the “Call to Action” DAVID B. WILKINS AND YOUNG-KYU KIM	37
3	Diversity and talent at the top: Lessons from the boardroom KIMBERLY D. KRAWIEC, JOHN M. CONLEY, AND LISSA L. BROOME	81
4	Explaining social exclusion and the ‘war for talent’ in the UK’s elite professional service firms LOUISE ASHLEY AND LAURA EMPSON	114
2	ENTERING PROFESSIONAL CAREERS: BARRIERS, LADDERS, AND BASEMENT DOORS	139
5	Typecast socialization: Race, gender, and competing expectations in law school YUNG-YI DIANA PAN	141
6	Rethinking the intersectionality of race, gender, and class identity: Educating underrepresented minority women for elite careers in science, technology, math, and engineering CARROLL SERON	173

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12365-6 - Diversity In Practice: Race, Gender, and Class in Legal and Professional Careers

Edited By Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer and David B. Wilkins

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CONTENTS

7	Access to a career in the legal profession in England and Wales: Race, class and the role of educational background	
	LISA WEBLEY, JENNIFER TOMLINSON, DANIEL MUZIO, HILARY SOMMERLAD, AND LIZ DUFF	198
8	The new “professionalism” in England and Wales: Talent, diversity, and a legal precariat	
	HILARY SOMMERLAD	226
3	INEQUALITY AND OPPORTUNITY IN THE CAREERS OF DIVERSE ATTORNEYS	261
9	Which kinds of law firms have the most minority lawyers? Organizational context and the representation of African-Americans, Latinos, and Asian-Americans	
	FIONA M. KAY AND ELIZABETH H. GORMAN	263
10	Gendered pathways: Choice, constraint, and women’s job movements in the legal profession	
	JULIET R. AIKEN AND MILTON C. REGAN, JR.	301
11	The effectiveness of inheritance vs. rainmaking strategies in building books of business for female and minority partners	
	FORREST BRISCOE AND ANDREW VON NORDENFLYCHT	328
12	Career mobility and racial diversity in law firms	
	CHRISTOPHER I. RIDER, ADINA D. STERLING, AND DAVID TAN	357
13	Immigrant offspring in the legal profession: Exploring the effects of immigrant status on earnings among American lawyers	
	MEGHAN DAWE AND RONIT DINOVTZER	383
	<i>Index</i>	425

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12365-6 - Diversity In Practice: Race, Gender, and Class in Legal and Professional Careers

Edited By Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer and David B. Wilkins
Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CONTRIBUTORS

Juliet R. Aiken is the Program Director of and Clinical Assistant Professor for the Master's in Industrial Organizational Psychology at the University of Maryland, College Park. Juliet's research focuses on diversity, professional development, and statistics/measurement. Prior to her work at the University of Maryland, she was the Deputy Director of the Center of the Study of the Legal Profession, where she conducted empirical research on the legal profession and advised Georgetown Law administration, faculty, staff, and students on conducting empirical research.

Louise Ashley is a lecturer in Human Resource Management and Organizational Behaviour at Royal Holloway, University of London and a Visiting Fellow at the Centre for Professional Service Firms at Cass Business School. She specializes in researching the implementation and development of diversity and inclusion programs in large, multinational professional service firms, with a particular focus on gender and social class. Louise has published articles in leading academic journals and recently co-wrote the chapter on diversity and inclusion in the Oxford University Press *Handbook of Professional Service Firms*.

Forrest Briscoe (AB Harvard, PhD MIT) is an Associate Professor of Management at the Smeal College of Business, Penn State University, and an International Research Fellow at the Centre for Professional Service Firms, Oxford. His research interests include professional organizations, employment practices and careers, and change and diffusion processes in organizational fields. He also recently completed a fellowship from the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation supporting his investigations into the role of workplace networks in the careers of corporate lawyers. Forrest currently serves as an Associate Editor for *Administrative Science Quarterly*, and also for the *Academy of Management Annals*, and he sits on the board of the Organization & Management Theory division of the Academy of Management. Forrest enjoys teaching at all levels, and on occasion also provides consulting services to law and healthcare organizations.

Lissa L. Broome is the Wells Fargo Professor of Banking Law at the University of North Carolina School of Law. She directs the Center for Banking and Finance and serves as the Faculty Advisor to the North Carolina Banking

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12365-6 - Diversity In Practice: Race, Gender, and Class in Legal and Professional Careers

Edited By Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer and David B. Wilkins
Frontmatter

[More information](#)

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Institute journal. She also heads the Director Diversity Initiative (DDI), whose goal is to increase the gender, racial, and ethnic diversity on public company boards of directors. Professor Broome teaches Banking Law and Secured Transactions and writes about the regulation of financial institutions in addition to corporate board diversity.

John M. Conley is William Rand Kenan, Jr. Professor of Law at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. A lawyer and anthropologist, he has written several books and numerous articles on such topics as the anthropological and linguistic study of the American legal system, the culture of business and finance (with William O'Barr), scientific evidence, and the law of intellectual property as applied to emerging technologies. Recent research projects have focused on the cultural and linguistic aspects of the corporate social responsibility movement (with Cynthia Williams), corporate boards (with Lissa Broome and Kimberly Krawiec), and the emerging discipline of genetic medicine.

Meghan Dawe is a PhD Candidate in the Department of Sociology at the University of Toronto. Her dissertation analyzes stratification in the legal profession, comparing data on lawyers from the After the JD project, the first national longitudinal study of law graduates in the United States, and the Canadian Law and Beyond Study, the first national study of law graduates in Canada. Meghan's research focuses on the sociology of work and professions and the sociology of law, crime, and punishment.

Ronit Dinovitzer is Associate Professor of Sociology at the University of Toronto, where she is cross appointed to the Institute for Management and Innovation (IMI). She is also a Faculty Fellow at the American Bar Foundation in Chicago. As a sociologist of the professions, she conducts research on the legal profession, including the social organization of lawyers, the context of labor markets, and the role of diversity in professional careers. She has pursued this work through her involvement with the After the JD project and the Law and Beyond Study.

Liz Duff is Head of Westminster Law School at the University of Westminster. She was one of the founders of the Law and Diversity program at the University of Westminster School of Law. Her principal research focus is currently law, diversity, and equality. She has been a consultant to the UKCLE on matters relating to the LLB curriculum and widening participation and she has also advised a number of universities on this area. She has carried out funded empirical research for a number of organizations including the Law Society of England and Wales and the Legal Services Board and has previously published articles in the *Journal of Law and Society*, the *Modern Law Review*, the *Journal of the Sociology of Law*, and the *Law Teacher*.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12365-6 - Diversity In Practice: Race, Gender, and Class in Legal and Professional Careers

Edited By Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer and David B. Wilkins

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Laura Empson is Director of the Centre for Professional Service Firms, Cass Business School, London. Her research into professional service firms encompasses issues such as: leadership, governance, succession planning, organizational, cultural and identity change, professionalization of management, mergers and acquisitions, knowledge transfer, and partner evaluation and reward systems. She has published numerous articles in leading international academic journals, as well as translating her research for a practitioner audience, most notably in her 2007 book, *Managing the Modern Law Firm* (Oxford University Press) which was described by The Times as marking a “seminal moment in the development of management theory in this sector.” Together with colleagues she is currently editing the *Oxford Handbook of Professional Service Firms* (Oxford University Press), to be published in late 2015. She was previously Associate Professor (Reader) at the University of Oxford. Before becoming an academic, Laura worked as an investment banker and strategy consultant. She has a PhD and MBA from London Business School and a BSc(Econ) from University College, London.

Elizabeth H. Gorman is Associate Professor of Sociology at the University of Virginia. She holds a JD from the University of Chicago and a PhD in Sociology from Harvard University. Her research on professional work, the legal profession, and inequality in professional organizations has been published in the *American Journal of Sociology*, *American Sociological Review*, *Law and Society Review*, *Work and Occupations*, and other journals.

Spencer Headworth is Graduate Research Coordinator at the American Bar Foundation and a PhD Candidate in Northwestern University’s Department of Sociology, and will begin as Assistant Professor of Sociology at Purdue University in August 2016. He studies crime, social control, law, inequality, organizations, and professions. His dissertation, “Policing Welfare,” examines dedicated welfare fraud control units, a novel intersection between the worlds of public benefits and law enforcement.

Fiona M. Kay is Professor of Sociology at Queen’s University. She researches the sociology of law and sociology of work and occupations. Her scholarship includes investigations of inequality in the legal profession, mentorship and professional development, lawyers’ pro bono service, and jurisdictional boundaries across professions of law. She is currently engaged in a longitudinal study examining career pathways of lawyers in Canada. A second study, in collaboration with Elizabeth Gorman, focuses on retention and advancement of racial minorities in corporate US law firms. These projects are funded by grants from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC) and the Law School Admission Council (LSAC).

Young-Kyu Kim is an Assistant Professor of Management at Korea University Business School. He received his PhD from the University of Chicago Booth

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12365-6 - Diversity In Practice: Race, Gender, and Class in Legal and Professional Careers

Edited By Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer and David B. Wilkins

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

School of Business in 2008. From 2008 to 2010, he was with the Harvard Law School Center on the Legal Profession as a postdoctoral research fellow. His research interests include social networks, organizational status and identity, and social mobility of individuals and firms. Currently, he looks into education reform in Korea, based on his past experience on various legislative reform projects in Korean public sectors, and studies careers of Korean law school graduates.

Kimberly D. Krawiec is the Kathrine Robinson Everett Professor of Law at Duke University and teaches courses on corporate law, financial regulation, and contested or “taboo” trades. Her research on corporate boards employs an ethnographic method to analyze directors’ views on the workings of the corporate boardroom and board relations with management, with a special emphasis on directors’ views on race and gender diversity in the boardroom.

Daniel Muzio is Professor of Professions and Organization at the University of Newcastle, a director of the Professions Work and Organization Research Group, and a founding editor of the *Journal of Professions and Organization*. Previously he has held academic positions at the Universities of Manchester, Leeds, and Lancaster and he currently holds visiting positions at Manchester Business School, Cass Business School, the University of Law in London, and Said Business School at the University of Oxford. His research focuses on professions and knowledge workers, their work, management, and organization. His research has been published in leading journals, including *Organization Studies*, *Sociology*, *Human Relations*, *The Journal of Management Studies*, and *The Journal of Economic Geography*. Daniel is currently coediting the *Oxford Handbook of Professional Services Firms* to be published in 2015 by the Oxford University Press.

Robert L. Nelson is a sociologist of law who studies law, inequality, and the legal profession. His books include *Legalizing Gender Inequality: Courts, Markets, and Unequal Pay for Women in America* (with William Bridges) which won the best book award from the American Sociological Association, and *Urban Lawyers* (with John Heinz, Edward Laumann, and Rebecca Sandefur). He was Director of the American Bar Foundation from 2004–2015, is co-director of the Research Group on Legal Diversity, and is a principal investigator in the After the JD Study of Lawyer Careers.

Yung-Yi Diana Pan is Assistant Professor of Sociology at Brooklyn College – City University of New York, and earned her PhD from University of California, Irvine. She has broad research interests in race and ethnicity, processes of racialization, immigrant adaptation, identity formation, professional socialization, and law and society. Her current research challenges traditional theories of immigrant integration by underscoring the significance of race and phenotype in elite professions. She is working on her first book, which examines the professional socialization and continued racialization of Asian American and Latino law students.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12365-6 - Diversity In Practice: Race, Gender, and Class in Legal and Professional Careers

Edited By Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer and David B. Wilkins
Frontmatter

[More information](#)

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Milton C. Regan, Jr. is Co-Director of the Center for the Study of the Legal Profession and McDevitt Professor of Jurisprudence at Georgetown University Law Center. His work focuses on ethics, the legal profession, corporations, and national security. He has taught at law schools in China, Spain, and Australia. Before joining Georgetown, he clerked for Judge Ruth Bader Ginsburg on the US Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit and for Justice William J. Brennan, Jr. of the Supreme Court of the United States, and worked as an associate at Davis Polk & Wardwell in Washington, DC. He is the author of numerous books, articles, and book chapters.

Christopher I. Rider is an Assistant Professor of Strategy at Georgetown University's McDonough School of Business. His research draws on organization theory to study individual outcomes like entrepreneurship and mobility; organizational behaviors like hiring and staffing; and organizational outcomes like founding, change, and survival.

Carroll Seron is a Professor in the Department of Criminology, Law and Society, with courtesy appointments in the Department of Sociology and School of Law at the University of California, Irvine. Her research focuses on the sociology of the professions, where she has conducted research on the impact of changes in the gender and racial composition of the legal profession and engineering.

Hilary Sommerlad is Professor of Law and Social Justice, University of Leeds. She is a Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences, serves on the editorial boards of the *Journal of Law and Society* and the *International Journal of the Legal Profession*, and is Articles Editor of *Legal Ethics*. She practiced as a legal aid lawyer, and this experience is reflected in her research interests; these include the cultural practices of the professional workplace and diversity in the legal profession. She has published widely on these issues, including a report commissioned by the Legal Services Board and a chapter (with Louise Ashley) "Equality, Diversity and Inclusion" in the *Oxford Handbook of Professional Service Firms* (2015).

Adina D. Sterling is an Assistant Professor of Organizational Behavior at Stanford University's Graduate School of Business. Her research investigates social structure in labor and product markets, strategic HR practices, and careers. Currently much of her research investigates the impact of trial employment on labor market and intra-organizational outcomes. She earned a PhD in Organization and Management from Emory University's Goizueta Business School in 2011 and a BS degree in chemical engineering from Ohio State University in 2002.

David Tan is Assistant Professor of Management and Organization at the University of Washington's Foster School of Business. His research focuses on

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12365-6 - Diversity In Practice: Race, Gender, and Class in Legal and Professional Careers

Edited By Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer and David B. Wilkins
Frontmatter[More information](#)

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

the institutional and legal environment of business, including work examining careers and organizations within the legal services industry.

Jennifer Tomlinson is Professor of Gender and Employment Relations and Director of the Centre for Employment Relations Innovation and Change at the University of Leeds. Her research is grounded in the discipline of sociology and engages with questions relating to how social theory can help to explain patterns of gender and inequality in employment relations, labor markets, and organizations. Her research on inequalities, gender, and diversity within the professions and professional organizations has been published in leading journals including *Human Relations*, *Work*, *Employment and Society*, and *Gender, Work and Organization*.

Andrew von Nordenflycht is an Associate Professor of Strategy at the Beedie School of Business at Simon Fraser University in Vancouver, British Columbia. He received a BA in History from Stanford University and his PhD in Management from the MIT Sloan School of Management. He researches the ownership and management of human capital intensive firms, with a focus on professional services and airlines. In particular, he has studied the emergence of publicly-traded corporations in professional services and their effects on industry structure, creativity, and professional ethics. His research is published in leading management journals and he is the coauthor of *Up in the Air: How Airlines Can Improve Performance by Engaging Their Employees*.

Lisa Webley is Professor of Empirical Legal Studies at the University of Westminster, Westminster Law School and Faculty Research Director for Social Sciences and Humanities. She is also Senior Fellow at the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London. As a socio-legal researcher she conducts research on equality, diversity and inclusion in the legal profession, legal ethics, access to justice, and alternative dispute resolution and the law. She is Secretary of the International Association of Legal Ethics, and a member of the Equality, Diversity and Inclusion Committee of the Law Society of England and Wales.

David B. Wilkins is a world-renowned scholar on the legal profession. He has written more than eighty articles and is the coauthor of one of the leading casebooks in the field, and has given more than forty-five endowed academic lectures around the world. His recent professional accomplishments include: Aptissimi Scholar of the Year (ESADE Law School 2014), Honorary Doctorate in Law (Stockholm University 2012), Distinguished Visiting Mentor Award (Australia National University 2012), Genest Fellowship (Osgood Hall Law School 2012), and the Scholar of the Year Award (American Bar Foundation 2010). Professor Wilkins is Member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, and a Corresponding Member of the Spanish Royal Academy of Doctors.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12365-6 - Diversity In Practice: Race, Gender, and Class in Legal and Professional Careers

Edited By Spencer Headworth, Robert L. Nelson, Ronit Dinovitzer and David B. Wilkins
Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The editors would like to thank the contributors, the American Bar Foundation and its supporters, and the Research Group on Legal Diversity for making this project possible. They also gratefully acknowledge the participants in the 2013 Conference of the RGLD and the generous Northwestern University partners who helped sponsor that event: the Office of the Provost, the School of Law, the Graduate School, Weinberg College of Arts and Sciences, and Kellogg Graduate School of Management.