Defamation and privacy are now two central issues in media law. While defamation law has long posed concerns for media publications, the emergence of privacy as a legal challenge has been relatively recent in many common law jurisdictions outside the US. A number of jurisdictions have seen recent defamation and privacy law reforms, which have often drawn on, or reacted against, developments elsewhere. This timely book examines topical issues in defamation and privacy law focussed on media, journalism and contemporary communication. Aimed at a wide legal audience, it brings together leading and emerging analysts of media law to address current and proposed reforms and the impact of changes in communication environments and to re-examine basic principles such as harm and free speech. This book will be of interest to all those working on commonwealth or US law, as well as comparative scholars from wider jurisdictions.

ANDREW T. KENYON is Professor of Law and a Director of the Centre for Media and Communications Law at the University of Melbourne, Australia.
As its economic potential has rapidly expanded, intellectual property has become a subject of front-rank legal importance. *Cambridge Intellectual Property and Information Law* is a series of monograph studies of major current issues in intellectual property. Each volume contains a mix of international, European, comparative and national law, making this a highly significant series for practitioners, judges and academic researchers in many countries.

**Series editors**
Lionel Bently *Herchel Smith Professor of Intellectual Property Law, University of Cambridge, United Kingdom*
William R. Cornish *Emeritus Herchel Smith Professor of Intellectual Property Law, University of Cambridge, United Kingdom*

**Advisory editors**
François Dessemontet, *Professor of Law, University of Lausanne, Switzerland*
Paul Goldstein, *Professor of Law, Stanford University, United States*
The Rt Hon. Sir Robin Jacob, *Hugh Laddie Professor of Intellectual Property, University College London, United Kingdom*

A list of books in the series can be found at the end of this volume.
Comparative Defamation and Privacy Law

Edited by

Andrew T. Kenyon

Centre for Media and Communications Law, Melbourne Law School, University of Melbourne, Australia
CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge. It furthers the University’s mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107123649

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data

Kenyon, Andrew T., editor.
Comparative defamation and privacy law / edited by Andrew T. Kenyon. Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Series: Cambridge intellectual property and information law ; 32 | Includes papers presented at a workshop held at the Centre for Media and Communications Law at the University of Melbourne. – ECIP preface and acknowledgements.
LCCN 2015048603 | ISBN 9781107123649 (hardback)
LCG K3253. A6 C658 2016 | DDC 346. 03/4–dc23
LC record available at http://lccn.loc.gov/2015048603


Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of contributors</th>
<th>page vii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Defamation and privacy in an era of ‘more speech’

ANDREW T. KENYON

2 ‘Anyone . . . in any medium’? The scope of Canada’s responsible communication defence

HILARY YOUNG

3 Ceci n’est pas une pipe: the autopoietic inanity of the single meaning rule

ANDREW SCOTT


DAVID PARTLETT

5 Defamation and democracy

RUSSELL L. WEAVER

6 ‘A reasonable expectation of privacy’: a coherent or redundant concept?

ERIC BARENDT

7 Media intrusion into grief: lessons from the Pike River mining disaster

N.A. MOREHAM AND YVETTE TINSLEY

8 Press freedom, the public interest and privacy

GAVIN PHILLIPSON

9 The Atlantic divide on privacy and free speech

KIRSTY HUGHES AND NEIL M. RICHARDS

115

136

164
Contents

10 The ‘right to be forgotten’ by search engines under data privacy law: a legal and policy analysis of the Costeja decision
   DAVID LINDSAY 199

11 Privacy for the weak, transparency for the powerful
   MELISSA DE ZWART 224

12 The trouble with dignity
   AMY GAJDA 246

13 The uncertain landscape of Article 8 of the ECHR: the protection of reputation as a fundamental human right?
   TANYA APLIN AND JASON BOSLAND 265

14 Vindicating reputation and privacy
   DAVID ROLPH 291

15 Divining the dignity torts: a possible future for defamation and privacy
   URSULA CHEER 309

16 Reverberations of Sullivan? Considering defamation and privacy law reform
   ANDREW T. KENYON AND MEGAN RICHARDSON 331

Bibliography 354
Index 373
Contributors

TANYA APLIN, Professor, The Dickson Poon School of Law, King’s College London, United Kingdom
ERIC BARENDT, Emeritus Professor, Faculty of Laws, University College London, United Kingdom
JASON BOSLAND, Senior Lecturer, Melbourne Law School, University of Melbourne, Australia
URSULA CHEER, Professor of Law, University of Canterbury School of Law, New Zealand
AMY GAJDA, Professor of Law, Tulane University Law School, New Orleans, Louisiana, United States
KIRSTY HUGHES, University Lecturer in Public Law, University of Cambridge, United Kingdom
ANDREW T. KENYON, Professor, Melbourne Law School and Joint-Director, Centre for Media and Communications Law, University of Melbourne, Australia
DAVID LINDSAY, Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, Monash University, Australia
N.A. MOREHAM, Reader in Law, Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand
DAVID PARTLETT, Asa Griggs Candler Professor of Law, Emory University School of Law, United States
GAVIN PHILLIPSON, Professor of Law, Durham Law School, University of Durham, United Kingdom
NEIL M. RICHARDS, Professor of Law, Washington University School of Law, United States
MEGAN RICHARDSON, Professor, Melbourne Law School and Joint-Director, Centre for Media and Communications Law, University of Melbourne, Australia

DAVID ROLPH, Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Sydney, Australia

ANDREW SCOTT, Associate Professor, Department of Law, London School of Economics and Political Science, United Kingdom

YVETTE TINSLEY, Reader in Law, Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand

RUSSELL L. WEAVER, Professor of Law and Distinguished University Scholar, University of Louisville Louis D Brandeis School of Law, United States

HILARY YOUNG, Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, University of New Brunswick, Canada

MELISSA DE ZWART, Professor, Adelaide Law School, University of Adelaide, Australia
It has been a privilege to work with academic colleagues from five common law countries in developing this collection. Contributions address issues in defamation and privacy law, examining UK, US, Canadian, New Zealand and Australian developments. The project was made possible through support from the Australian Research Council and its Discovery programme (Kenyon DP0985337). A two-day workshop was held at the Centre for Media and Communications Law at the University of Melbourne, Australia, where almost all contributors participated, along with further colleagues whose valuable contributions greatly helped the final development of the chapters, participated. Many thanks to everyone who took part, as well as to those whose work is seen in the pages that follow; thanks also to Roy Baker, Eric Descheemaeker, Steve Friedland, Lyrissa Lidsky, Barbara McDonald and Andrew Roberts. Wide-ranging debate and discussion at the workshop led to revised chapters and substantially improved the final collection.

Thanks to all at Cambridge University Press for their support of the publication; to James Nunez and Hamish Carr, who assisted me with some of the editorial tasks; and to the Melbourne Law School for its continuing support of the Centre for Media and Communications Law. But above all, thanks to the contributors for their thought, care and engagement in addressing a range of evolving and challenging issues in media law.

As readers will see, a wide range of views are presented in the chapters that follow, and it should be clear that I could not agree with all of them. Given my interest in diverse public speech, however, it should not be surprising that I think it is valuable for these varied analyses to be presented. I hope readers also find much of value in the work.