This book examines government ethics rules and their enforcement in China (as well as in three other jurisdictions for comparative insights). Empirical research methods (involving primarily semi-structured interviews) were employed to explore the dynamics of actual enforcement policies and practices in China. This book formed an analytical framework through reviewing existing theories on government ethics regulation and general regulation literature and analysing government ethics rules in the US, the UK, and Hong Kong. Using this framework, it seeks to explore the patterns and features of government ethics rules and their enforcement in China. It shows that the inadequacy of government ethics rules per se and the deterrence-oriented criminal enforcement style of government ethics regulation are important but ignored elements of the problem of rampant corruption in China. Such analysis has generated important and practical policy implications for China’s government ethics rules and their enforcement.

Chonghao Wu received his PhD in Law from the University of Hong Kong in 2014.
REGULATING
GOVERNMENT ETHICS

An Underused Weapon in China’s
Anti-Corruption Campaign

CHONGHAO WU
CONTENTS

List of figures viii
List of tables ix
Foreword x
Acknowledgements xi
Abbreviations xii

1 Introduction 1
1.1 Corruption and anti-corruption 1
1.2 Regulating government ethics 3
1.3 Argument of the book 6
1.4 Organization of the book 13

2 The role of a regulatory enforcement system against corruption in China 14
2.1 Introduction 14
2.2 What is a regulatory regime against corruption? 16
2.3 The relationship between regulation against corruption and criminal approach in anti-corruption 22
2.3.1 Both are necessary and complementary 22
2.3.2 Limited room for improvement of criminal enforcement against corruption 25
2.3.3 The potential for regulation against corruption 32
2.3.4 Minor maladministration and misconduct paves the way for serious corruption in government 37
2.4 Anti-corruption approaches and ruling legitimacy of the CCP 49
2.4.1 Ruling legitimacy of the CCP 49
2.4.2 Criminal approach against corruption and the CCP legitimacy 57
2.4.3 Regulatory approach against corruption and the CCP legitimacy 60
2.5 Conclusion 61
vi  TABLE OF CONTENTS

3  Government ethics rules  63
3.1 Introduction  63
3.2 Government ethics rules in the United States, the United Kingdom, and Hong Kong  64
   3.2.1 Regulating conflicts of interest  66
   3.2.2 Regulating appearance of corruption  74
   3.2.3 Regulating financial disclosure  82
   3.2.4 Regulating outside employment and activities  85
3.3 Patterns observed in the three jurisdictions  88
3.4 Government ethics rules in China  91
   3.4.1 Regulating conflicts of interest  93
   3.4.2 Regulating appearance of corruption  102
   3.4.3 Regulating financial disclosure  107
   3.4.4 Regulating outside employment/activity  112
   3.4.5 Unjustified restrictions  114
3.5 Patterns of government ethics rules in China  118
3.6 Insights and implications for the improvement of government ethics rules in China  127
3.7 Conclusion  130

4  Enforcement of government ethics rules  132
4.1 Introduction  132
4.2 Key elements of government ethics rules enforcement: the United States, the United Kingdom, and Hong Kong  134
   4.2.1 Enforcement agencies  134
   4.2.2 Legal authorities and responsibilities  142
   4.2.3 Enforcement approaches/styles  146
   4.2.4 Enforcement techniques: tactics, methods, and tools  159
   4.2.5 Enforcement resource allocation  169
   4.2.6 Common features of government ethics enforcement in the three jurisdictions  171
4.3 Enforcement of government ethics rules in China  173
   4.3.1 Enforcement agencies  173
   4.3.2 Legal enforcement power and responsibilities  196
   4.3.3 Enforcement styles  199
   4.3.4 Enforcement techniques: tools and tactics  211
   4.3.5 Enforcement resources  215
4.4 Conclusion  218

5  Conclusion  230
5.1 Summing up: key findings and policy implications  230
5.2 Contributions  236
5.3 Recent anti-corruption developments in China  238
5.4 Further research  240
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Appendices 242
A A note on research methods 242
B Key issues addressed in government ethics rules in the United States, the United Kingdom, and Hong Kong 244
C Key issues addressed in government ethics rules in China 252
D Key interview questions for DIC officials 256
E Key interview questions for regulated officials 258
F Survey questionnaire 260
Bibliography 263
Index 290
FIGURES

2.1 Integrity system spectrum of behaviour. 21
4.1 The relationship in practice among anti-corruption enforcement agencies in China. 195
TABLES

2.1 The amount of money in corruption cases from January to April 2009. 30
2.2 Process of moving from minor deviance to serious corruption for Li Zhen. 44
4.1 Key features of compliance enforcement as contrasted with deterrence enforcement. 150
4.2 Actual enforcement of existing rules governing government ethics in several DICs. 178
4.3 Cases handled by N County DIC in 2009. 186
4.4 Cases handled by R District DIC in 2008. 186
4.5 Cases handled by X City DIC in 2008. 186
4.6 DICs’ internal offices/divisions and each office’s major work. 217
Regulating government ethics is the missing but essential component in China’s struggle against corruption. This is the central thesis in Dr Chonghao Wu’s book. It is a thesis that needs to be taken seriously. President Xi Jinping’s crackdown on corruption has made international headlines, but it is only another example in a long series of such campaigns in China’s history. Though unprecedented in its breadth and intensity, it will not be China’s last. While the current campaign stretches to all corners of the earth in search of fugitives and stolen assets, it remains a backwards-looking journey. What is missing is the forward-looking campaign that inculcates a culture of compliance with integrity rules and leads to a sustainable system of prevention. This is where Dr Wu’s study makes an important contribution. With reference to the experiences of three jurisdictions that rank within Transparency International’s top twenty least corrupt countries, Dr Wu makes the case for establishing in China a two-tier system of regulating ethics and prosecuting corruption crimes. He finds that China lacks a comprehensive set of public sector integrity rules and a suitable agency to enforce such rules and promote compliance. He provides an incisive critique of the discipline inspection committees and explains why a separate government ethics agency is urgently needed. This book is essential reading for anyone interested in the reform and sustainability of China’s anti-corruption system.

Dr Wu is to be congratulated on his in-depth study of a serious problem that continues to hold China back from reaching its full potential. As his supervisor, I could not have wished for a more diligent and talented student. As my first student to graduate, Dr Wu sets a high standard for all those to follow.

Simon N. M. Young
The University of Hong Kong

x
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to express my sincere gratitude to Professor Simon N. M. Young, who supervised my PhD thesis on which this book is based, for his encouragement, dedication, patience, and support. He guided me in the right direction with the breadth and depth of his knowledge of public law in general and anti-corruption law in specific. He always provided timely and valuable advice and comments on my research throughout the time of my PhD study. He also provided me with the opportunities to attend several ICAC conferences in which I met some helpful experts in the area of anti-corruption law. He continued to give support and advice as I revised the thesis into a book. I could not have completed this book without his support and guidance. In addition to his academic training and guidance, he is also genuinely interested in my personal well-being and career development. Professor Young is a great supervisor and I consider myself extremely lucky to be his first PhD student.

I would like to thank Professor David Donald, Professor Fu Hualing, Mr Benny Tai, and three anonymous reviewers who provided encouraging and constructive comments on an early draft of the book.

I also owe my appreciation to a number of people who have helped my research. First, I would like to thank all the interviewees and survey participants for their participation in the research. Second, I would like to thank the staff at the Faculty of Law, law library, and main library at the University of Hong Kong for their professional support.

I would like to express my gratitude to Jennifer Eagleton for her help on proofreading.

I would also like to thank Joe Ng, Finola O’Sullivan, and Claire Wood at Cambridge University Press for their help and encouragement during various stages of preparing this book for publication.

Finally, I am most thankful for the support and encouragement from my parents. I would like to dedicate this book to my parents.
ABBREVIATIONS

CCDI Central Commission for Discipline Inspection
CCP Chinese Communist Party
CSB Civil Service Bureau
DAEO Designated Agency Ethics Official
DICs Discipline Inspection Committees
ICAC Independent Commission against Corruption
IPSA Independent Parliament Standards Authority
MP Member of Parliament
NIS National Integrity System
OGE Office of Government Ethics
POBO Prevention of Bribery Ordinance