# Contents

_Preface_ .......................... xiii
_Acknowledgments_ .............. xix
_About the Authors_ .............. xxi

1 Intelligence Analysis: “Connecting the Dots” .......................... 1

1.1 How Easy Is It to Connect the Dots? .......................... 1

1.1.1 How Many Kinds of Dots Are There? .......................... 2

1.1.2 Which Evidential Dots Can Be Believed? .......................... 3

1.1.3 Which Evidential Dots Should Be Considered? ...................... 5

1.1.4 Which Evidential Dots Should We Try to Connect? .................. 5

1.1.5 How to Connect Evidential Dots to Hypotheses? ................. 7

1.1.6 What Do Our Dot Connections Mean? .......................... 9

1.1.7 Whose Evidential Dots Should Be Connected? ................... 11

1.2 Imaginative Reasoning in Intelligence Analysis ..................... 12

1.2.1 Imaginative Reasoning .......................... 12

1.2.2 What Ingredients of Analysis Are to Be Generated by Imaginative Thought? .................................................. 13

1.2.3 Generating Main Hypotheses to Be Defended by Evidence and Argument .................................................. 14

1.2.4 Generating the Evidentiary Grounds for Arguments ............. 15

1.2.5 Generating Arguments Linking Evidence and Hypotheses ........ 16

1.3 Intelligence Analysis as Discovery of Evidence, Hypotheses, and Arguments .................................................. 17

1.3.1 Intelligence Analysis in the Framework of the Scientific Method .................................................. 17

1.3.2 Evidence in Search of Hypotheses .................................. 18

1.3.3 Hypotheses in Search of Evidence .................................. 19

1.3.4 Evidentiary Testing of Hypotheses .............................. 22

1.3.5 Completing the Analysis .................................. 23

1.4 Review Questions .................................. 26

2 Marshaling Thoughts and Evidence for Imaginative Analysis .......................... 28

2.1 Sherlock Holmes and Investigation or Discovery ................... 28

2.2 Mycroft Holmes and Evidence Marshaling .......................... 29

2.3 Marshaling “Magnets” or Attractors .................................. 30
# Table of Contents

## 2.4 Types of Marshaling Magnets
- 2.4.1 Believability Magnet
- 2.4.2 Chronology Magnet
- 2.4.3 Question Magnet
- 2.4.4 Hypothesis Magnet
- 2.4.5 Argument Magnet
- 2.4.6 Eliminative Magnet
- 2.4.7 Scenario Magnet

## 2.5 Use of the Marshaling Magnets

## 2.6 Review Questions

## 3 Disciple-CD: A Cognitive Assistant for Connecting the Dots
- 3.1 System Overview
- 3.2 Obtaining Disciple-CD
- 3.3 Hands On: Working with Knowledge Bases
  - 3.3.1 Overview
  - 3.3.2 Basic Operations
- 3.4 Knowledge Base Guidelines
- 3.5 Hands On: Browsing an Argumentation
  - 3.5.1 Overview
  - 3.5.2 Practice
  - 3.5.3 Basic Operations

## 4 Evidence
- 4.1 What Is Evidence?
- 4.2 The Credentials of All Evidence
  - 4.2.1 Relevance
  - 4.2.2 Believability or Credibility
  - 4.2.3 Force or Weight of Evidence
- 4.3 Assessing the Relevance, Believability, and Inferential Force of Evidence
- 4.4 Basic Operations with Disciple-CD
  - 4.4.1 Hands On: Define and Evaluate Evidence
    - 4.4.1.1 Overview
    - 4.4.1.2 Practice
    - 4.4.1.3 Basic Operations
- 4.5 Advanced Operations with Disciple-CD
  - 4.5.1 Hands On: From Information to Evidence
    - 4.5.1.1 Overview
    - 4.5.1.2 Practice
    - 4.5.1.3 Advanced Operations
- 4.6 Review Questions

## 5 Divide and Conquer: A Necessary Approach to Complex Analysis
- 5.1 Holistic Approach to Analysis
- 5.2 Divide and Conquer
- 5.3 Assessing Complex Hypotheses through Analysis and Synthesis

© in this web service Cambridge University Press
5.4 Inquiry-driven Analysis and Synthesis 86
5.5 Types of Reductions and Corresponding Syntheses 87
  5.5.1 Necessary and Sufficient Conditions 87
  5.5.2 Sufficient Conditions and Scenarios 88
  5.5.3 Indicators 88
5.6 Problems with Argument Construction 90
5.7 Basic Operations with Disciple-CD 93
  5.7.1 Hands On: Was the Cesium Canister Stolen? 93
    5.7.1.1 Hypothesis in Search of Evidence: Illustration 93
    5.7.1.2 Hands-On Overview 95
    5.7.1.3 Practice 97
    5.7.1.4 Basic Operations 97
  5.7.2 Hands On: Development and Evaluation of an Argument 98
    5.7.2.1 Overview 98
    5.7.2.2 Practice 99
    5.7.2.3 Basic Operations 99
  5.7.3 Hands On: Analysis Based on Previously Learned Patterns and Synthesis Functions 101
    5.7.3.1 Overview 101
    5.7.3.2 Practice 101
    5.7.3.3 Basic Operations 101
5.8 Advanced Operations with Disciple-CD 102
  5.8.1 Hands On: Abstraction of Analysis 102
    5.8.1.1 Overview 102
    5.8.1.2 Practice 103
    5.8.1.3 Advanced Operations 103
  5.8.2 Hands On: Hypothesis Analysis and Evidence Search 104
    5.8.2.1 Overview 104
    5.8.2.2 Practice 107
    5.8.2.3 Advanced Operation 107
  5.8.3 Hands On: Justifications of Assumptions 108
    5.8.3.1 Overview 108
    5.8.3.2 Practice 108
    5.8.3.3 Advanced Operation 108
  5.8.4 Hands On: Top-down and Bottom-up Argument Development 109
    5.8.4.1 Overview 109
    5.8.4.2 Practice 112
    5.8.4.3 Advanced Operations 112
5.9 Analysis Guidelines 114
5.10 Review Questions 116
6 Assessing the Believability of Evidence 118
  6.1 Believability: The Foundation of All Arguments from Evidence 118
  6.2 Classification of Evidence Based on Believability 119
  6.3 Tangible Evidence 119
### Table of Contents

6.3.1 Real Tangible Evidence: Authenticity 120  
6.3.2 Demonstrative Tangible Evidence: Authenticity, Accuracy, and Reliability 120  
6.3.3 Examples of Tangible Evidence 121  
6.4 Testimonial Evidence 122  
6.4.1 Competence 122  
6.4.1.1 Access 122  
6.4.1.2 Understandability 122  
6.4.2 Credibility 123  
6.4.2.1 Veracity or Truthfulness 123  
6.4.2.2 Objectivity 123  
6.4.2.3 Observational Sensitivity 124  
6.4.3 Types of Testimonial Evidence 125  
6.4.4 Examples of Testimonial Evidence 126  
6.5 Missing Evidence 126  
6.5.1 Uncertainties Associated with Missing Evidence 126  
6.5.2 Example of Missing Evidence 127  
6.6 Authoritative Records 128  
6.7 Mixed Evidence 128  
6.7.1 Analysis of Mixed Evidence 128  
6.7.2 Examples of Mixed Evidence 128  
6.8 Deep Believability Analysis 130  
6.9 Advanced Operations with Disciple-CD 133  
6.9.1 Hands On: Believability Analysis 133  
6.9.1.1 Overview 133  
6.9.1.2 Practice 135  
6.9.1.3 Advanced Operation 136  
6.10 Review Questions 137  

7 Chains of Custody 139  
7.1 What Is a Chain of Custody? 139  
7.2 A Case Involving Chains of Custody 140  
7.3 A Chain of Custody for Testimonial Evidence 141  
7.4 A Chain of Custody for Demonstrative Tangible Evidence 143  
7.4.1 Chain of Custody for a Photo Given Directly to the Analyst 144  
7.4.2 Chain of Custody for a Written Description of a Photo Given to the Analyst 145  
7.5 Analyzing a Chain of Custody 146  
7.6 Drill-Down Analysis of Chains of Custody 147  
7.7 Review Questions 147  

8 Recurrent Substance-Blind Combinations of Evidence 148  
8.1 Harmonious Evidence 148  
8.1.1 Basic Forms of Harmonious Evidence 148  
8.1.2 Patterns of Evidential Harmony 149  
8.2 Dissonant Evidence 150  
8.2.1 Basic Forms of Dissonant Evidence 150  
8.2.2 Patterns of Evidential Dissonance 152  
8.3 Redundant Evidence 152
9 Major Sources of Uncertainty in Masses of Evidence

9.1 Incompleteness 159
  9.1.1 What Is Incompleteness of Evidence? 159
  9.1.2 Examples of Incompleteness 160
9.2 Inconclusiveness 162
  9.2.1 What Is Inconclusiveness of Evidence? 162
  9.2.2 Examples of Inconclusiveness 163
9.3 Ambiguity 163
  9.3.1 What Is Ambiguity of Evidence? 163
  9.3.2 Examples of Ambiguity 164
9.4 Dissonance 165
  9.4.1 What Is the Dissonance of Evidence? 165
  9.4.2 Examples of Dissonance 166
9.5 Imperfect Believability 166
  9.5.1 What Is Imperfect Believability of Evidence? 166
  9.5.2 Examples of Imperfect Believability 166
9.6 Basic Operations with Disciple-CD 167
  9.6.1 Hands On: Does a Terrorist Organization Have the Cesium Canister? 167
    9.6.1.1 Overview 167
    9.6.1.2 Extracting Evidence from Information 168
    9.6.1.3 Practice 170
9.7 Review Questions 171

10 Assessing and Reporting Uncertainty: Some Alternative Methods 

10.1 Introduction 173
10.2 General Classes of Probability and Uncertainty 174
10.3 Enumerative Probabilities: Obtained by Counting 174
10.4 Nonenumerative Probabilities: Nothing to Count 177
10.5 Epistemic Probability (1): The Subjective Bayesian View 177
  10.5.1 Likelihood Ratios 178
    10.5.1.1 Analysis Using Likelihood Ratios 178
    10.5.1.2 Examples 179
  10.5.2 Bayesian Networks 183
    10.5.2.1 Constructing the Argument Structure 183
    10.5.2.2 Forming the Key List 183
    10.5.2.3 Identifying the Likelihoods and Prior Probabilities 184
    10.5.2.4 Using the Bayesian Network 187
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.5.2.5</td>
<td>Utility and Feasibility of Bayesian Network Analyses</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>Epistemic Probability (2): Belief Functions</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6.1</td>
<td>Belief Functions and Evidential Support</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6.2</td>
<td>Examples of Assigning Evidential Support</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6.3</td>
<td>Dempster’s Rule for Combining Partial Beliefs</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>Baconian Probability and the Importance of Evidential Completeness</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7.1</td>
<td>Variative and Eliminative Inferences</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7.2</td>
<td>Importance of Evidential Completeness</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7.3</td>
<td>Baconian Probability of Boolean Expressions</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>Imprecision and Fuzzy Probability</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.8.1</td>
<td>Fuzzy Force of Evidence</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.8.2</td>
<td>Fuzzy Probability of Boolean Expressions</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.8.3</td>
<td>On Verbal Assessments of Probabilities</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>A Summary of Uncertainty Methods and What They Best Capture</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.10</td>
<td>Basic Operations with Disciple-CD</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.10.1</td>
<td>Hands On: Will a Bomb Be Set Off in Washington, D.C.?</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.10.1.1</td>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.10.1.2</td>
<td>Practice</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.11</td>
<td>Review Questions</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td><strong>Analytic Bias</strong></td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>Basic Interpretations of the Term “Bias”</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>Biases of the Analyst</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.1</td>
<td>Biases in the Evaluation of Evidence</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.2</td>
<td>Biases in the Perception of Cause and Effect</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.3</td>
<td>Biases in Estimating Probabilities</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2.4</td>
<td>Hindsight Biases in Evaluating Intelligence Reporting</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>Some Frequently Overlooked Origins of Bias</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3.1</td>
<td>HUMINT Sources</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3.2</td>
<td>Persons in Chains of Custody of Evidence</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3.3</td>
<td>Consumers of Intelligence Analyses</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>Biases and the Evaluation of Analysts</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>Recognizing and Countering Biases with Disciple-CD</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>Review Questions</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td><strong>Learning and Reusing Analytic Expertise: Beyond Disciple-CD</strong></td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>Learning Agent Shell</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>Learning Agent Shell for Evidence-based Reasoning</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.1</td>
<td>Disciple-EBR</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3.2</td>
<td>Disciple-CD</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>Development of a Cognitive Assistant</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>Evidence-Based Reasoning Everywhere</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Glossary of Terms</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendixes</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Methodological Guidelines</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Hands-On Exercises</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Operations with Disciple-CD</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>