

## Contents

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page</i> xiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xix
<i>About the Authors</i>	xxi
<b>1 Intelligence Analysis: “Connecting the Dots” . . . . .</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 How Easy Is It to Connect the Dots?	1
1.1.1 How Many Kinds of Dots Are There?	2
1.1.2 Which Evidential Dots Can Be Believed?	3
1.1.3 Which Evidential Dots Should Be Considered?	5
1.1.4 Which Evidential Dots Should We Try to Connect?	5
1.1.5 How to Connect Evidential Dots to Hypotheses?	7
1.1.6 What Do Our Dot Connections Mean?	9
1.1.7 Whose Evidential Dots Should Be Connected?	11
1.2 Imaginative Reasoning in Intelligence Analysis	12
1.2.1 Imaginative Reasoning	12
1.2.2 What Ingredients of Analysis Are to Be Generated by Imaginative Thought?	13
1.2.3 Generating Main Hypotheses to Be Defended by Evidence and Argument	14
1.2.4 Generating the Evidential Grounds for Arguments	15
1.2.5 Generating Arguments Linking Evidence and Hypotheses	16
1.3 Intelligence Analysis as Discovery of Evidence, Hypotheses, and Arguments	17
1.3.1 Intelligence Analysis in the Framework of the Scientific Method	17
1.3.2 Evidence in Search of Hypotheses	18
1.3.3 Hypotheses in Search of Evidence	19
1.3.4 Evidentiary Testing of Hypotheses	22
1.3.5 Completing the Analysis	23
1.4 Review Questions	26
<b>2 Marshaling Thoughts and Evidence for Imaginative   Analysis . . . . .</b>	<b>28</b>
2.1 Sherlock Holmes and Investigation or Discovery	28
2.2 Mycroft Holmes and Evidence Marshaling	29
2.3 Marshaling “Magnets” or Attractors	30

2.4	Types of Marshaling Magnets	32
2.4.1	Believability Magnet	32
2.4.2	Chronology Magnet	33
2.4.3	Question Magnet	35
2.4.4	Hypothesis Magnet	36
2.4.5	Argument Magnet	37
2.4.6	Eliminative Magnet	38
2.4.7	Scenario Magnet	39
2.5	Use of the Marshaling Magnets	41
2.6	Review Questions	42
<b>3</b>	<b>Disciple-CD: A Cognitive Assistant for Connecting the Dots</b>	<b>45</b>
3.1	System Overview	45
3.2	Obtaining Disciple-CD	48
3.3	Hands On: Working with Knowledge Bases	49
3.3.1	Overview	49
3.3.2	Basic Operations	50
3.4	Knowledge Base Guidelines	52
3.5	Hands On: Browsing an Argumentation	53
3.5.1	Overview	53
3.5.2	Practice	57
3.5.3	Basic Operations	58
<b>4</b>	<b>Evidence . . . . .</b>	<b>59</b>
4.1	What Is Evidence?	59
4.2	The Credentials of All Evidence	62
4.2.1	Relevance	62
4.2.2	Believability or Credibility	65
4.2.3	Force or Weight of Evidence	67
4.3	Assessing the Relevance, Believability, and Inferential Force of Evidence	68
4.4	Basic Operations with Disciple-CD	73
4.4.1	Hands On: Define and Evaluate Evidence	73
4.4.1.1	Overview	73
4.4.1.2	Practice	76
4.4.1.3	Basic Operations	76
4.5	Advanced Operations with Disciple-CD	79
4.5.1	Hands On: From Information to Evidence	79
4.5.1.1	Overview	79
4.5.1.2	Practice	80
4.5.1.3	Advanced Operations	80
4.6	Review Questions	80
<b>5</b>	<b>Divide and Conquer: A Necessary Approach to Complex Analysis . . . . .</b>	<b>82</b>
5.1	Holistic Approach to Analysis	82
5.2	Divide and Conquer	83
5.3	Assessing Complex Hypotheses through Analysis and Synthesis	84

**Contents****vii**

5.4	Inquiry-driven Analysis and Synthesis	86
5.5	Types of Reductions and Corresponding Syntheses	87
5.5.1	Necessary and Sufficient Conditions	87
5.5.2	Sufficient Conditions and Scenarios	88
5.5.3	Indicators	88
5.6	Problems with Argument Construction	90
5.7	Basic Operations with Disciple-CD	93
5.7.1	Hands On: Was the Cesium Canister Stolen?	93
5.7.1.1	Hypothesis in Search of Evidence: Illustration	93
5.7.1.2	Hands-On Overview	95
5.7.1.3	Practice	97
5.7.1.4	Basic Operations	97
5.7.2	Hands On: Development and Evaluation of an Argument	98
5.7.2.1	Overview	98
5.7.2.2	Practice	99
5.7.2.3	Basic Operations	99
5.7.3	Hands On: Analysis Based on Previously Learned Patterns and Synthesis Functions	101
5.7.3.1	Overview	101
5.7.3.2	Practice	101
5.7.3.3	Basic Operations	101
5.8	Advanced Operations with Disciple-CD	102
5.8.1	Hands On: Abstraction of Analysis	102
5.8.1.1	Overview	102
5.8.1.2	Practice	103
5.8.1.3	Advanced Operations	103
5.8.2	Hands On: Hypothesis Analysis and Evidence Search	104
5.8.2.1	Overview	104
5.8.2.2	Practice	107
5.8.2.3	Advanced Operation	107
5.8.3	Hands On: Justifications of Assumptions	108
5.8.3.1	Overview	108
5.8.3.2	Practice	108
5.8.3.3	Advanced Operation	108
5.8.4	Hands On: Top-down and Bottom-up Argument Development	109
5.8.4.1	Overview	109
5.8.4.2	Practice	112
5.8.4.3	Advanced Operations	112
5.9	Analysis Guidelines	114
5.10	Review Questions	116
<b>6</b>	<b>Assessing the Believability of Evidence . . . . .</b>	<b>118</b>
6.1	Believability: The Foundation of All Arguments from Evidence	118
6.2	Classification of Evidence Based on Believability	119
6.3	Tangible Evidence	119

6.3.1	Real Tangible Evidence: Authenticity	120
6.3.2	Demonstrative Tangible Evidence: Authenticity, Accuracy, and Reliability	120
6.3.3	Examples of Tangible Evidence	121
6.4	Testimonial Evidence	122
6.4.1	Competence	122
6.4.1.1	Access	122
6.4.1.2	Understandability	122
6.4.2	Credibility	123
6.4.2.1	Veracity or Truthfulness	123
6.4.2.2	Objectivity	123
6.4.2.3	Observational Sensitivity	124
6.4.3	Types of Testimonial Evidence	125
6.4.4	Examples of Testimonial Evidence	126
6.5	Missing Evidence	126
6.5.1	Uncertainties Associated with Missing Evidence	126
6.5.2	Example of Missing Evidence	127
6.6	Authoritative Records	128
6.7	Mixed Evidence	128
6.7.1	Analysis of Mixed Evidence	128
6.7.2	Examples of Mixed Evidence	128
6.8	Deep Believability Analysis	130
6.9	Advanced Operations with Disciple-CD	133
6.9.1	Hands On: Believability Analysis	133
6.9.1.1	Overview	133
6.9.1.2	Practice	135
6.9.1.3	Advanced Operation	136
6.10	Review Questions	137
<b>7</b>	<b>Chains of Custody . . . . .</b>	<b>139</b>
7.1	What Is a Chain of Custody?	139
7.2	A Case Involving Chains of Custody	140
7.3	A Chain of Custody for Testimonial Evidence	141
7.4	A Chain of Custody for Demonstrative Tangible Evidence	143
7.4.1	Chain of Custody for a Photo Given Directly to the Analyst	144
7.4.2	Chain of Custody for a Written Description of a Photo Given to the Analyst	145
7.5	Analyzing a Chain of Custody	146
7.6	Drill-Down Analysis of Chains of Custody	147
7.7	Review Questions	147
<b>8</b>	<b>Recurrent Substance-Blind Combinations of Evidence . .</b>	<b>148</b>
8.1	Harmonious Evidence	148
8.1.1	Basic Forms of Harmonious Evidence	148
8.1.2	Patterns of Evidential Harmony	149
8.2	Dissonant Evidence	150
8.2.1	Basic Forms of Dissonant Evidence	150
8.2.2	Patterns of Evidential Dissonance	152
8.3	Redundant Evidence	152

**Contents****ix**

8.3.1	Basic Forms of Redundant Evidence	152
8.3.2	Patterns of Evidential Redundance	153
8.4	Why Considering Evidence Combinations Is Important	154
8.5	Basic Operations with Disciple-CD	154
8.5.1	Hands On: Who Has Stolen the Cesium Canister?	154
8.5.1.1	Overview	154
8.5.1.2	Practice	156
8.6	Review Questions	156
<b>9</b>	<b>Major Sources of Uncertainty in Masses of Evidence . . .</b>	<b>159</b>
9.1	Incompleteness	159
9.1.1	What Is Incompleteness of Evidence?	159
9.1.2	Examples of Incompleteness	160
9.2	Inconclusiveness	162
9.2.1	What Is Inconclusiveness of Evidence?	162
9.2.2	Examples of Inconclusiveness	163
9.3	Ambiguity	163
9.3.1	What Is Ambiguity of Evidence?	163
9.3.2	Examples of Ambiguity	164
9.4	Dissonance	165
9.4.1	What Is the Dissonance of Evidence?	165
9.4.2	Examples of Dissonance	166
9.5	Imperfect Believability	166
9.5.1	What Is Imperfect Believability of Evidence?	166
9.5.2	Examples of Imperfect Believability	166
9.6	Basic Operations with Disciple-CD	167
9.6.1	Hands On: Does a Terrorist Organization Have the Cesium Canister?	167
9.6.1.1	Overview	167
9.6.1.2	Extracting Evidence from Information	168
9.6.1.3	Practice	170
9.7	Review Questions	171
<b>10</b>	<b>Assessing and Reporting Uncertainty: Some Alternative Methods . . . . .</b>	<b>173</b>
10.1	Introduction	173
10.2	General Classes of Probability and Uncertainty	174
10.3	Enumerative Probabilities: Obtained by Counting	174
10.4	Nonenumerative Probabilities: Nothing to Count	177
10.5	Epistemic Probability (1): The Subjective Bayesian View	177
10.5.1	Likelihood Ratios	178
10.5.1.1	Analysis Using Likelihood Ratios	178
10.5.1.2	Examples	179
10.5.2	Bayesian Networks	183
10.5.2.1	Constructing the Argument Structure	183
10.5.2.2	Forming the Key List	183
10.5.2.3	Identifying the Likelihoods and Prior Probabilities	184
10.5.2.4	Using the Bayesian Network	187

	10.5.2.5 Utility and Feasibility of Bayesian Network Analyses	189
10.6	Epistemic Probability (2): Belief Functions	189
	10.6.1 Belief Functions and Evidential Support	189
	10.6.2 Examples of Assigning Evidential Support	192
	10.6.3 Dempster's Rule for Combining Partial Beliefs	193
10.7	Baconian Probability and the Importance of Evidential Completeness	197
	10.7.1 Variative and Eliminative Inferences	197
	10.7.2 Importance of Evidential Completeness	197
	10.7.3 Baconian Probability of Boolean Expressions	201
10.8	Imprecision and Fuzzy Probability	202
	10.8.1 Fuzzy Force of Evidence	202
	10.8.2 Fuzzy Probability of Boolean Expressions	204
	10.8.3 On Verbal Assessments of Probabilities	204
10.9	A Summary of Uncertainty Methods and What They Best Capture	205
10.10	Basic Operations with Disciple-CD	208
	10.10.1 Hands On: Will a Bomb Be Set Off in Washington, D.C.?	208
	10.10.1.1 Overview	208
	10.10.1.2 Practice	209
10.11	Review Questions	211
<b>11</b>	<b>Analytic Bias . . . . .</b>	<b>213</b>
11.1	Basic Interpretations of the Term "Bias"	213
11.2	Biases of the Analyst	214
	11.2.1 Biases in the Evaluation of Evidence	215
	11.2.2 Biases in the Perception of Cause and Effect	216
	11.2.3 Biases in Estimating Probabilities	217
	11.2.4 Hindsight Biases in Evaluating Intelligence Reporting	218
11.3	Some Frequently Overlooked Origins of Bias	219
	11.3.1 HUMINT Sources	219
	11.3.2 Persons in Chains of Custody of Evidence	220
	11.3.3 Consumers of Intelligence Analyses	221
11.4	Biases and the Evaluation of Analysts	222
11.5	Recognizing and Countering Biases with Disciple-CD	223
11.6	Review Questions	223
<b>12</b>	<b>Learning and Reusing Analytic Expertise: Beyond Disciple-CD . . . . .</b>	<b>225</b>
12.1	Introduction	225
12.2	Learning Agent Shell	225
12.3	Learning Agent Shell for Evidence-based Reasoning	228
	12.3.1 Disciple-EBR	228
	12.3.2 Disciple-CD	229
12.4	Development of a Cognitive Assistant	231
12.5	Evidence-Based Reasoning Everywhere	236

**Contents****xi**

<i>Glossary of Terms</i>	239
<i>References</i>	249
<i>Appendixes</i>	255
1 Methodological Guidelines	255
2 Hands-On Exercises	255
3 Operations with Disciple-CD	256
<i>Index</i>	257