

## WHY ENVIRONMENTAL POLICIES FAIL

This book is for those who are not just interested in the ways humans have harmfully altered their environment, but instead wish to learn why the many governmental policies in place to curb such behavior have been unsuccessful. Since humans began to exploit natural resources for their own economic ends, we have ignored a central principle: nature and humans are not separate, but are a unified, interconnected system in which neither is superior to the other. Policy must reflect this reality. We failed to follow this principle in exploiting natural capital without expecting to pay any price, and in hurriedly adopting environmental laws and policies that reflected how we wanted nature to work instead of how it does work. This study relies on more accurate models for how nature works and humans behave. These models suggest that environmental laws should be consistent with the laws of nature.

JAN LAITOS holds the John A. Carver, Jr. Chair in Environmental and Natural Resources Law at the University of Denver Sturm College of Law. He has previously published natural resources and environmental law books and treatises with all the major law publishers in the United States as well as several in Europe. He has taught and lectured throughout America as well as in Spain, Hungary, Argentina, Ireland, Turkey, and Scotland. He is a graduate of Yale College and the University of Colorado Law School. He has a Doctorate in American Legal History from the University of Wisconsin Law School.

# WHY ENVIRONMENTAL POLICIES FAIL

JAN LAITOS

*University of Denver Sturm College of Law*

WITH JULIANA OKULSKI



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107546745](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107546745)

DOI: 10.1017/9781316343326

© Jan Laitos 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Laitos, Jan, author.

Title: Why environmental policies fail / Jan Laitos.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom, New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2017. |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017000354 | ISBN 9781107121010 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781107546745 (paperback)

Subjects: LCSH: Environmental law. | Environmental policy. | Nature –

Effect of human beings on. | Human behavior. | Human ecology. |

BISAC: LAW / Environmental.

Classification: LCC K3585.L345 2017 | DDC 333.7–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017000354>

ISBN 978-1-107-12101-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-54674-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-12101-0 — Why Environmental Policies Fail  
Jan Laitos  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

To  
Erik Jan Peter Laitos  
May you live in a world where you and your  
environment are in harmony

CONTENTS

*Acknowledgments*      page xi

- Prologue      1
- A. The Economic System      2
- B. The Earth System      5
- C. The Policy System      9

**PART I Nature: Humans and Their Environmental Surroundings      13**

- 1 The Gardener and the Sick Garden      16
  - A. Introduction      16
  - B. A Realistic Picture of Nature and Humans and Their Natural Environment      19
  - C. Environmental Policies Fail Because They Are Built on a Skewed Worldview and on Three Flawed Models      28
  - D. Have Environmental Policies Failed?      33
  - E. How Better to Address Earth’s Environmental Issues      35

**PART II A History and Assessment of Environmental Policies      41**

- 2 Four Troubled Eras of Environmental Policies      43
  - A. Era One – Resource Use      43
  - B. Era Two – Conservation      47
  - C. Era Three – Preservation      51
  - D. Era Four – Protection      55
- 3 An Assessment: Environmental Policies Have Failed      59
  - A. Climate      64
  - B. Loss of Biodiversity and Extinctions      69
  - C. Exploitation of the Atmosphere      71

D.	Depletion and Degradation of Natural Resources	73
E.	Alteration of Natural Cycles and Ecosystems	75
<b>PART III Why Environmental Policies Fail I: Faulty Assumptions Behind Environmental Rules</b>		<b>77</b>
4	A False Worldview	80
A.	Human Separation from Environmental Surroundings	80
B.	Human Exceptionalism	87
5	Failed Model #1: How Nature Works	91
A.	The Standard, but Flawed, Earth System Model	91
B.	A Better Model – Nature as a Complex Adaptive System	95
C.	Nature as a Social-Ecological System	100
6	Failed Model #2: How to Value Nature	104
A.	How Humans Should View, and Value, Nature	106
B.	Adaptive Management	114
7	Failed Model #3: How Humans Behave	116
A.	The Myth of Homo Economicus	117
B.	Humans as Masters and Degraders of Nature	122
C.	The Rise of Behavioral Economics	125
D.	An Essential Property of Human Behavior: Symmetry	130
<b>PART IV Why Environmental Policies Fail II: A Critique of Existing and Proposed Strategies</b>		<b>135</b>
8	A Narrative of Failed Environmental Strategies	139
A.	Introduction	139
B.	Direct Government Action	141
C.	Command and Control (Regulatory) Policies	142
D.	Economic Policies	145
E.	Information	150
F.	Adjustments to Property and Tort Law	153
G.	Legal Rights for Nature	153
H.	Preservationist Rules	159
I.	Human-Nature Linkages	160
J.	Behavioral	164
K.	Delegate to Private Parties	166

<b>PART V</b>	<b>Environmental Policy Must Obey the Fundamental Laws of Nature</b>	<b>171</b>
9	Nature and Symmetry	173
A.	The Laws of Nature Deduced from the Requirement of Symmetry	174
B.	Three Principles of Symmetry and the Environmental Policies That Should Follow from Them	177
10	Toward a New Legal Alignment of Humans and Nature	184
A.	A Positive Right for the Earth's SES	186
B.	A Positive Duty to Nature Imposed on Humans	195
	Epilogue	203
A.	Anthropomorphic Superiority	204
B.	Human Separation from Nature	205
C.	A False Model for the Dynamics of the Natural World	206
D.	A False Model for Human Behavior	206
E.	The Limitations of Existing and Proposed Environmental Policy	208
F.	Failure to Conform to the Laws of Nature	209
	<i>Index</i>	211

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

A book of this scope is due to the insight, inspiration, support, and encouragement of many people. I would like here to acknowledge some of those who helped contribute to the ideas and arguments set forth in many of the chapters. Certain people directly educated me in matters about which I had a thin background. Either directly or metaphorically, they sat me down and “taught” me the science behind our natural environment. Or they wrote about environmental law and policy, and about how policy has too often fallen short, or how it has been endlessly tinkered with in attempts to make it more effective. Some of these sources have written about concepts, usually grounded in science, that I have relied on to make proposals about how better to shape workable environmental policy. Some have written groundbreaking studies about humans and their environmental surroundings, pointing out how law and policy have often conspired to facilitate anthropomorphic alteration of Nature, natural resources, and natural systems. Others have simply directly encouraged me, or have made it possible for me to acquire the best thinking out there on this important topic, and to analyze just why some of our best ideas about affecting our natural world have not been able to slow the pace of environmental damage. To each of them, listed here, and cited elsewhere in the book, I am grateful. Although I am solely responsible for the contents of this book, and although there is only one “author,” that author is indebted to a number of scholars, thinkers, scientists, and truly creative individuals who helped educate and inspire in countless ways.

First and foremost, I must acknowledge and express my gratitude to Juliana Okulski. In many ways, this book is as much her idea, her product, as it is mine. She was the one who first introduced me to the importance of science – particularly biology and the workings of Earth’s natural systems – as an important element in environmental policy that too often has been underplayed by policymakers. She also introduced me to how modern ecologists perceive Nature, and humans’ effect on Nature, and how Nature operates. She also alerted me to the role humans play in affecting



the interconnected human-Nature unit, termed a Social Ecological System. She was the first one who urged me to explore the underlying explanations for policy ineffectiveness, instead of simply focusing on the effects of policy disappointments and then proposing some grandiose solution. She helped me understand how policy models, when flawed, cause policy failures, and how many of the models that we have been using are flawed because they are too often not based on good science. This book is a testament to all of her hard work, and infinite patience in me. She has been, in effect, my copilot on this journey.

Several people set in motion events that permitted me to think through, organize, propose, and write this book. I must acknowledge the support and confidence in me by John Berger, Senior Editor at Cambridge University Press. John too has been patient with me, and had confidence in the idea of a book that dealt with the “why” question of environmental policy failures. I am grateful that he waited for me to hatch the concept, and stood by me when I first raised with him the central idea behind the book. Dean Marty Katz of the University of Denver Sturm College of Law was also supportive. He granted me a timely research leave in order to allow me the time to actually sit down and write the book. Micah Desaire, part of the support staff at my law school, labored through draft after draft of the book, mastering without complaint topics far from traditional legal scholarship, such as complex adaptive systems management, behavioral economics, the science of symmetry, and Einstein’s “unification” principle, extending even to the underlying unity of humans and Nature originally espoused by Taoism.

Several prominent American law professors have been either influential in guiding my thinking while I worked through the book’s many chapters or directly supportive of me when I was initially proposing the book to Cambridge University Press. Professor J. B. Ruhl of the Vanderbilt Law School is someone who did both. He is one of the giants in the world of environmental law trying to figure out how laws can be made more suitable to addressing environmental and natural resource issues. His numerous articles on environmental policy have been seminal to a generation of academics and policymakers (and me). J. B. also helped me focus my topic and my approach to my topic, as well as to realize the daunting task ahead for me. I thank him for his insight and backing. Other law professors have also considered some of the same issues that are contained in the book’s chapters, and I have read, pondered, and been influenced by their thinking (although they were not in direct contact with me). Professor Robin Kundis Craig of the Utah Law School and Professor

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

xiii

Eric Biber of the University of California Law School at Berkeley have engaged in scholarship that I found incredibly useful – indirectly helping me in their various articles to test my ideas against their well-thought-through arguments about environmental policy. Professor Dan Tarlock from IIT Chicago Kent College of Law was and is a scholar who long ago saw that environmental policies were too eager to return the planet to some kind of ideal natural “baseline” that in fact never existed. I have been influenced by his thinking. Professor Mary Christina Wood from the University of Oregon Law School and Professor Michael Blumm from the Lewis and Clark Law School are two nationally leading advocates of the public trust doctrine as potential paradigm-shifting environmental policy, and I have cited and referred to their influential thinking. Professor Shi-Ling Hsu has also been influential with respect to his important scholarship in the field of resource economics.

The writings, scholarship, and findings of other ecological scientists and Earth system academics have been useful to me throughout the writing of the book. A number of ecologists, environmentalists, and resource academics have changed the way we perceive Nature and Earth systems, as well as the impact humans are having on natural goods and capital, ecosystem services, and planetary boundaries that permit humans as a species to survive. Rather than list all of these researchers and commentators, I offer here the names of the leading authors of the works via which they, along with a long list of other authors, have advanced the groundbreaking ideas essential to the arguments in this book. The names of these leading authors of the key articles on scientific environmental realism, which have changed the thinking of so many policymakers, scientists, academics, and researchers, are Carl Folke, Simon Levin, Johan Rockstrom, and Will Steffen. They appear most frequently at the forefront of the lists of numerous contributors who are beginning to alter how we perceive the world around us and our place in that world. Behavioral economics has also helped transform how we, and how policymakers, understand how humans respond to environmental policy. I have been greatly influenced by the significant scholarship advanced by Professors Cass Sunstein and Richard Thaler, who have caused us to rethink how laws can best reach the roots of humans’ behavioral dynamics.

Other researchers have written on disparate topics that were instrumental in some of the conclusions and proposals offered in the book. Mario Livio and Frank Wilczek have written extensively and eloquently on the Law of Symmetry. Their scholarship and explanations of the ubiquitousness of symmetry in Nature helped persuade me that symmetry needs to

underscore any environmental policy designed to address Nature. Mario Livio's important book – *The Equation That Couldn't Be Solved* (2005) – was a catalyst for much of my thinking laid out in Chapter 9 of this book. Similarly, the earlier writings of the late Willard Hurst, one of America's most outstanding legal historians, helped me, and many others, see how laws themselves could contribute to and even encourage the eradication of natural goods and ecosystem services. I have tried to acknowledge the influence Hurst has had on my thinking, particularly in Chapter 2.

Finally, I wish to acknowledge that much of what appears in the first two chapters first appeared in articles I have had published elsewhere. These are the *Environmental Law Reporter*, Volume 45, No. 5 (May 2015) (coauthored with Juliana Okulski) (Chapter 1), and the *William and Mary Environmental Law and Policy Review*, Volume 39, Issue 1 (Fall 2014) (coauthored with Lauren J. Wolongevicz) (Chapter 2).