

## Musical Witness and Holocaust Representation

This is the first musicological study entirely devoted to a comprehensive analysis of musical Holocaust representations in the Western art music tradition. Through a series of chronological case studies grounded in primary source analysis, Amy Lynn Wlodarski analyzes the compositional processes and conceptual frameworks that provide key pieces with their unique representational structures and critical receptions. The study examines works composed in a variety of musical languages – from Arnold Schoenberg’s dodecaphonic *A Survivor from Warsaw* to Steve Reich’s minimalist *Different Trains* – and situates them within interdisciplinary discussions about the aesthetics and ethics of artistic witness. At the heart of this book are important questions about how music interacts with language and history, memory and trauma, politics and mourning. Wlodarski’s detailed musical and cultural analyses provide new models for the assessment of the genre, illustrating the benefits and consequences of musical Holocaust representation in the second half of the twentieth century.

AMY LYNN WLODARSKI is Associate Professor of Music at Dickinson College, Pennsylvania, where she has earned both institutional and national teaching awards. She is the co-editor, with Elaine Kelly, of *Art Outside the Lines: New Perspectives on GDR Art Culture* (2011) and was the 2012 recipient of the Irving Lowens Prize for an outstanding musicological article (Society of American Music). Her scholarship has appeared in leading journals, including the *Journal of the American Musicological Society* and the *Journal of Musicology*, as well as in select edited volumes. She is the recipient of a number of prestigious fellowships, including funding from the Harry Starr Fellowship at Harvard’s Center for Jewish Studies, the National Endowment for the Humanities, the Fulbright Commission, and the Presser Music Foundation. She also takes part in regular speaking engagements and preconcert lectures with leading musical ensembles, such as the Los Angeles Opera and the Philadelphia Orchestra.

## Music Since 1900

GENERAL EDITOR Arnold Whittall

This series – formerly Music in the Twentieth Century – offers a wide perspective on music and musical life since the end of the nineteenth century. Books included range from historical and biographical studies, concentrating particularly on the context and circumstances in which composers were writing, to analytical and critical studies concerned with the nature of musical language and questions of compositional process. The importance given to context will also be reflected in studies dealing with, for example, the patronage, publishing, and promotion of new music, and in accounts of the musical life of particular countries.

### *Titles in the series*

**Jonathan Cross**

The Stravinsky Legacy

**Michael Nyman**

Experimental Music: Cage and Beyond

**Jennifer Doctor**

The BBC and Ultra-Modern Music, 1922–1936

**Robert Adlington**

The Music of Harrison Birtwistle

**Keith Potter**

Four Musical Minimalists: La Monte Young, Terry Riley, Steve Reich, Philip Glass

**Carlo Caballero**

Fauré and French Musical Aesthetics

**Peter Burt**

The Music of Toru Takemitsu

**David Clarke**

The Music and Thought of Michael Tippett: Modern Times and Metaphysics

**M. J. Grant**

Serial Music, Serial Aesthetics: Compositional Theory in Post-War Europe

**Philip Rupprecht**

Britten's Musical Language

**Mark Carroll**

Music and Ideology in Cold War Europe

**Adrian Thomas**

Polish Music since Szymanowski

**J. P. E. Harper-Scott**

Edward Elgar, Modernist

**Yayoi Uno Everett**

The Music of Louis Andriessen

**Ethan Haimo**

Schoenberg's Transformation of Musical Language

**Rachel Beckles Willson**

Ligeti, Kurtág, and Hungarian Music during the Cold War

**Michael Cherlin**

Schoenberg's Musical Imagination

**Joseph N. Straus**

Twelve-Tone Music in America

**David Metzger**

Musical Modernism at the Turn of the Twenty-First Century

**Edward Campbell**

Boulez, Music and Philosophy

**Jonathan Goldman**

The Musical Language of Pierre Boulez: Writings and Compositions

**Pieter C. van den Toorn and John McGinness**

Stravinsky and the Russian Period: Sound and Legacy of a Musical Idiom

**David Beard**

Harrison Birtwistle's Operas and Music Theatre

**Heather Wiebe**

Britten's Unquiet Pasts: Sound and Memory in Postwar Reconstruction

**Beate Kutschke and Barley Norton**

Music and Protest in 1968

**Graham Griffiths**

Stravinsky's Piano: Genesis of a Musical Language

**Martin Iddon**

John Cage and David Tudor: Correspondence on Interpretation and Performance

**Martin Iddon**

New Music at Darmstadt: Nono, Stockhausen, Cage, and Boulez

**Alastair Williams**

Music in Germany since 1968

**Ben Earle**

Luigi Dallapiccola and Musical Modernism in Fascist Italy

**Thomas Schuttenhelm**

The Orchestral Music of Michael Tippett: Creative Development and the Compositional Process

**Marilyn Nonken**

The Spectral Piano: From Liszt, Scriabin, and Debussy to the Digital Age

**Jack Boss**

Schoenberg's Twelve-Tone Music: Symmetry and the Musical Idea

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-11647-4 - Musical Witness and Holocaust Representation  
Amy Lynn Wlodarski  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

**Deborah Mawer**

French Music and Jazz in Conversation: From Debussy to Brubeck

**Philip Rupprecht**

British Musical Modernism: The Manchester Group and Their Contemporaries

**Amy Lynn Wlodarski**

Musical Witness and Holocaust Representation

# Musical Witness and Holocaust Representation

Amy Lynn Wlodarski



Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-11647-4 - Musical Witness and Holocaust Representation  
Amy Lynn Wlodarski  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107116474](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107116474)

© Amy Lynn Wlodarski 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Limited, Padstow Cornwall

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

Wlodarski, Amy.

Musical witness and Holocaust representation / Amy Lynn Wlodarski.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-11647-4 (Hardback : alk. paper) – ISBN 978-1-107-53884-9 (pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Holocaust, Jewish (1939–1945), in music. 2. Schoenberg, Arnold, 1874–1951. Survivor from Warsaw. 3. Adorno, Theodor W., 1903–1969 – Criticism and interpretation.

4. Eisler, Hanns, 1898–1962. *Nuit et brouillard*. 5. *Jüdische Chronik*. 6. Reich, Steve, 1936– *Different trains*. I. Title.

ML3921.6.J83W56 2015

781.5'9–dc23 2015009557

ISBN 978-1-107-11647-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-11647-4 - Musical Witness and Holocaust Representation  
Amy Lynn Wlodarski  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

*For Mitchel and Wanda Korzenko – my past*  
*For Benjamin and Eleanor – my future*

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-11647-4 - Musical Witness and Holocaust Representation  
Amy Lynn Wlodarski  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---



## Contents

<i>List of music examples</i>	page x
<i>List of tables</i>	xii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xvi
Introduction	1
1 The composer as witness: Arnold Schoenberg's <i>A Survivor from Warsaw</i>	11
2 The philosopher as witness: Theodor Adorno's <i>A Survivor from Warsaw</i>	36
3 The composer as witness: Hanns Eisler's Film Score to <i>Nuit et Brouillard</i>	57
4 The state as witness: <i>Jüdische Chronik</i> in the German Democratic Republic	92
5 The composer as witness: Steve Reich's <i>Different Trains</i>	126
Epilogue	164
Notes	177
Works cited	213
Index	230

## Music Examples

- 1.1 Arnold Schoenberg, *A Survivor from Warsaw*, m. 51, collective musical expression of the {0,4,8} trichords  
 © Copyright 1947 by Schott Music GmbH & Co. KG.  
 Reprinted by permission of European American Music Distributors Company and Belmont Music Publishers. page 30
- 3.1 Hanns Eisler, *Nuit et Brouillard*, No. 3 (“Military parade”), mm. 4–8, Nazi motive  
 © Copyright by Deutscher Verlag für Musik, Leipzig. Reprinted by permission. 75
- 3.2 Hanns Eisler, *Nuit et Brouillard*, No. 8 (“Resistance/medical treatment”), mm. 10–15  
 © Copyright by Deutscher Verlag für Musik, Leipzig. Reprinted by permission. 78
- 3.3 Hanns Eisler, *Nuit et Brouillard*, No. 11 (“Gas chambers”), mm. 1–9  
 © Copyright by Deutscher Verlag für Musik, Leipzig. Reprinted by permission. 80
- 3.4 Hanns Eisler, *Nuit et Brouillard*, No. 12 (“Use of body parts”), mm. 1–26  
 © Copyright by Deutscher Verlag für Musik, Leipzig. Reprinted by permission. 84
- 4.1 Twelve-tone row for *Jüdische Chronik* 104
- 4.2 Karl Amadeus Hartmann, *Jüdische Chronik*, opening melodic phrases (“Ghetto”), mm. 1–16  
 © Copyright 1961 by Bote & Bock Musik und Bühnenverlag GMBH & Co.  
 Reprinted by permission. 105
- 4.3 Karl Amadeus Hartmann, *Second Piano Sonata*, “April 27, 1945,” m. 1  
 © Copyright 1945 by Schott Music GmbH & Co. KG.  
 Reprinted by permission of European American Music Distributors Company. 105
- 5.1 Steve Reich, *Different Trains*, opening speech melody (“From Chicago to New York”), mvt. 1, mm. 45–46 (violin)  
 © Copyright 1998 by Hendon Music, Inc. Reprinted by permission. 128
- 5.2a Steve Reich, *Different Trains*, Paul’s speech melody (“And the war was over”), mvt. 3, m. 28 (cello)  
 © Copyright 1998 by Hendon Music, Inc. Reprinted by permission. 144

**List of music examples**

xi

- 5.2b Steve Reich, *Different Trains*, opening musical context for Paul's speech melody, mvt. 3, mm. 23–27  
© Copyright 1998 by Hendon Music, Inc. Reprinted by permission. 145
- 5.3a Steve Reich, *Different Trains*, Rachel's speech melody ("No More School"), mvt. 2, mm. 115–116  
© Copyright 1998 by Hendon Music, Inc. Reprinted by permission. 147
- 5.3b Steve Reich, *Different Trains*, Rachel's speech melody ("You must go away"), mvt. 2, mm. 123–124  
© Copyright 1998 by Hendon Music, Inc. Reprinted by permission. 148
- 5.4 Steve Reich, *Different Trains*, Rachella's speech melody ("And when she stopped singing they said, 'More! More!' and they applauded"), mvt. 3, mm. 596–601  
© Copyright 1998 by Hendon Music, Inc. Reprinted by permission. 158

## Tables

- 1.1 Motivic recapitulation in *A Survivor from Warsaw*, mm. 1–25 and 60–80 *page* 18
- 1.2 Twelve-tone matrix for *A Survivor from Warsaw*; {0,4,8} 26
- 1.3 Expressions of the augmented triad at various structural levels 31
- 3.1 Division of the film score into movements (Nos. 1–14) 68
- 5.1 Shared textual motifs in the original testimonies of Paul and Rachella 154
- 5.2 Dramatic suturing of Paul and Rachella’s discrete testimonies into Reich’s libretto 155
- 5.3 Comparison of Rachella’s original testimony with Reich’s final version of the libretto 157

## Acknowledgments

I am greatly indebted to the support and guidance of my initial mentors for this project, which was hatched during my time as a graduate student at the Eastman School of Music. Kim Kowalke and Ralph Locke have continually offered their time and expertise from the earliest stages of this project. I cannot express the depth of my gratitude for their guidance – they have helped shape me as a musicological thinker. Celia Applegate was an early reader of the project, providing essential insight into German cultural and political life. Over the years, I have also benefited from rigorous – and always generous – conversations about my work with colleagues both within and without the field. In particular, Joy Calico, Elaine Kelly, Sabine Feisst, Ronit Seter, Berthold Hoeckner, Gabriela Currie, Bob Fink, Sandra Alfes, Andrea Lieber, Elise Bartosik-Velez, Elizabeth Lee, and Victoria Sams all provided essential feedback at critical stages of the project – whether they knew it at the time or not. I also wish to acknowledge two of my earliest teachers from Middlebury College, Marjorie Lamberti and Greg Vitercik, who laid the groundwork for this project in ways immeasurable.

I am also grateful for the generous financial and institutional support this project has received, which allowed for travel to archives and the opportunity to share my work within various communities of inquiry. An initial Fulbright research grant to Germany (2003–2004) allowed me to access a wealth of archival sources. Dickinson College – my academic home for the past nine years – provided essential research grants to Yale University (2006), Berlin (2007), and Basel (2012), as well as two full-year research leaves, during which the manuscript was written and revised. The Dickinson College Research and Development Committee also provided necessary subvention funding and travel support to share these ideas at scholarly conferences. The National Endowment for the Humanities (2009) provided an opportunity to relocate to beautiful Stanford University for six weeks, where conversations with Russell Berman and my summer seminar colleagues encouraged and developed my reading of Adorno's critiques of post-Holocaust music. My year spent in residence at Harvard University as a Harry Starr Fellow in Judaica (2012–2013) was a game-changer for this project; the intellectual community that I found among my "fellow fellows" provoked these ideas and shaped them in ways I could not

have anticipated. Many thanks to Kay Kaufmann Shelemay, Evan Rapport, Judah Cohen, Maureen Jackson, Edwin Seroussi, and Stacy Wolf for their guidance, questions, and encouragement.

Archival work was central to *Musical Witness*, and I am thankful to the following institutions and individuals for their help in locating materials: Stiftung Archiv of the Akademie der Künste in Berlin (Werner Grünzweig and Daniela Reinhold); Fortunoff Video Archive for Holocaust Testimony (Joanne Rudolf); Paul Sacher Foundation (Matthias Kassel and Tina Kilvio Tüscher); Arnold Schoenberg Center; SAPMO Bundesarchiv in Berlin; New York Public Library, Dorot Division; and the Library of Congress, Music Division. My thanks also to Kirk Doran of the Dickinson College Library, whose help with certain bibliographic rabbit holes made all the difference in several cases.

Every good-faith effort was made to secure the necessary permissions for archival documents. Special thanks to Maxim Dessau, who provided permission to reprint unpublished letters from the Paul Dessau Collection (AdK); Daniel Pozner, for permission to reprint select correspondence from the Hanns Eisler Collection (AdK); and Larry Schoenberg, who provided permission to reprint unpublished materials by Arnold Schoenberg, which appear in this book by permission of Belmont Music Publishers. I am also thankful to the Fortunoff Archive for helping me secure permissions for the Holocaust testimonies referenced in Chapter 5.

I am also grateful for the professional skills and talents of those who helped me to ready the book for publication. The manuscript benefited immensely from the comments of my anonymous reviewer and series editor Arnold Whitall. Thanks also to Vicki Cooper for believing in the book and to Fleur Jones for her assistance in preparing the final materials. David Glasgow generated all of the musical examples for the book, and Ann Fogler provided bibliographic support. Portions of this book also benefited from the review process of earlier published portions. A version of Chapter 1 appeared as “‘An Idea Can Never Perish’: Memory, the Musical Idea, and Schoenberg’s *A Survivor from Warsaw* (1947)” in the *Journal of Musicology* 24/4 (2007): 581–608, (c) 2007 by the American Musicological Society and published by the University of California Press. An early version of Chapter 3 appeared as “Excavating Eisler: Relocating the Memorial Voice in *Nuit et Brouillard* (1956)” in *Eisler-Studien – Beiträge zu einer kritischen Musikwissenschaft*, Vol. 3: Composing for the Films, edited by Peter Schweinhardt, 163–184 (Weisbaden: Breitkopf und Härtel, 2008). A select portion of Chapter 4 appeared as “National Identity after National Socialism: German Receptions of the Holocaust Cantata, *Jüdische Chronik* (1960/61)” in *Music, Geopolitics, and Violence*, edited by

### Acknowledgments

xv

Susan Fast and Kip Pegley, 223–238 (Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 2012). A version of Chapter 5 appeared as “The Testimonial Aesthetics of Different Trains” in the *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 63/1 (2010): 99–142, (c) 2010 by the American Musicological Society and published by the University of California Press.

And then there is the personal support. My thanks to my parents, Fred and Teresa Wlodarski, for their continual love and support. I am also so blessed to have such a caring network of friends (you know who you are), who listened when the work became difficult both academically and personally. And then there is my husband, Jeremy Ball, who is the most selfless and generous love I have ever known. You make all things possible, least of all this book.

## Abbreviations

AdK	Akademie der Künste (Academy of the Arts), Berlin, Germany
ASC	Arnold Schoenberg Center, Vienna, Austria
BArch	Bundesarchiv (Federal Archives), Berlin, Germany
FRG	Bundesrepublik Deutschland (Federal Republic of Germany, or West Germany)
FVAHT	Fortunoff Video Archive for Holocaust Testimonies, Yale University, New Haven, CT
GDR	Deutsche Demokratische Republik (German Democratic Republic, or East Germany)
GMS	Gedanke Manuscripts (Schoenberg)
LOC	Library of Congress, Washington, DC
NYPL	New York Public Library, New York, NY
PSS-SSR	Steve Reich Sammlung, Paul Sacher Stiftung, Basel, Switzerland
SAPMO	Stiftung Archiv der Parteien und Massenorganisationen im Bundesarchiv (Foundation Archives of Parties and Mass Organizations of the GDR in the Federal Archives), Berlin, Germany
SBZ	Sowjetische Besatzungszone (Soviet Occupation Zone)
SED	Sozialistische Einheitspartei Deutschlands (Socialist Unity Party of Germany)