Public emergencies such as civil wars, natural disasters, and economic crises test the theoretical and practical commitments of international human rights law. During national crises, international law permits states to suspend many human rights protections in order to safeguard national security. States frequently overstep the limits of this authority, violating even peremptory human rights such as the prohibitions against torture and prolonged arbitrary detention. In this volume, leading scholars from law, philosophy, and political science grapple with challenging questions concerning the character, scope, and salience of international human rights, and they explain how the law seeks to protect human rights during emergencies. The contributors also evaluate the law's successes and failures and offer new proposals for strengthening respect for human rights.

Evan J. Criddle is Professor of Law at William and Mary Law School, where he specializes in public international law, international legal theory, human rights, fiduciary law, and administrative law.
ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory

Series Editors

Elizabeth Andersen (ASIL)
Mortimer Sellers (University of Baltimore)

Editorial Board

Samantha Besson (Université de Fribourg)
Allen Buchanan (Duke University)
David Kennedy (Harvard University)
Jan Klabbers (University of Helsinki)
David Luban (Georgetown University)
Larry May (Vanderbilt University)
Mary Ellen O’Connell (University of Notre Dame)
Onuma Yasuaki (Meiji University)
Helen Stacy (Stanford University)
John Tasioulas (University College London)
Fernando Tésón (Florida State University)

The purpose of the ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory series is to clarify and improve the theoretical foundations of international law. Too often the progressive development and implementation of international law has foundered on confusion about first principles. This series raises the level of public and scholarly discussion about the structure and purposes of the world legal order and how best to achieve global justice through law.

This series grows out of the International Legal Theory project of the American Society of International Law. The ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory series deepens this conversation by publishing scholarly monographs and edited volumes of essays considering subjects in international legal theory.

Volumes in the Series:

- International Criminal Law and Philosophy
  edited by Larry May and Zachary Hoskins

- Customary International Law: A New Theory with Practical Applications
  by Brian D. Lepard

- The New Global Law
  by Rafael Domingo

- The Role of Ethics in International Law
  edited by Donald Earl Childress III

- Global Justice and International Economic Law: Opportunities and Prospects
  edited by Chios Carmody, Frank J. Garcia, and John Linarelli

- Parochialism, Cosmopolitanism, and the Foundations of International Law
  edited by Mortimer Sellers

- Morality, Jus Post Bellum, and International Law
  edited by Larry May and Andrew T. Forcehimes
The Future of International Law: Global Governance
by Joel P. Trachtman

Normative Pluralism and International Law: Exploring Global Governance
by Jan Klabbers and Touko Piparinen

Jus Post Bellum and Transitional Justice
by Larry May and Elizabeth Edenberg

Negotiating State and Non-State Law: The Challenge of Global and Local Legal Pluralism
edited by Michael A. Helfand

The Theory of Self-Determination
edited by Fernando R. Tesón

Human Rights in Emergencies
edited by Evan J. Criddle
Human Rights in Emergencies

EVAN J. CRIDDLE

William and Mary Law School
For my parents, Dean and Nancy, with love
Contents

List of Contributors
Acknowledgments

Introduction: Testing Human Rights Theory During Emergencies
Evan J. Criddle

PART I. DESIGNING A HUMAN RIGHTS REGIME FOR EMERGENCIES 13

1 Constrained Derogation in Positive Human Rights Regimes
   Gerald L. Neuman 15

2 Protecting Human Rights During Emergencies: Delegation, Derogation, and Deference
   Evan J. Criddle 32

3 Two Models of Normative Frameworks for Human Rights During Emergencies
   James W. Nickel 56

PART II. LAW, POLITICS, AND POWER 81

4 Emergency and Escape: Explaining Derogations from Human Rights Treaties
   Emilie M. Hafner-Burton, Laurence R. Helfer, and Christopher J. Fariss 83

5 The Cloak and Dagger Game of Derogation
   Fionnuala Ní Aoláin 124

6 The Law of Emergency and Reason of State
   Thomas Poole 148
Contents

7 Human Rights Lawyers v. Carl Schmitt
    William E. Scheuerman
    Part III. Emerging Challenges

8 Human Rights and Derogation in Peacekeeping:
    Addressing a Legal Vacuum Within the State of Exception
    Scott Sheeran

9 Austerity Measures and International Economic, Social,
    and Cultural Rights
    Diane A. Desierto

Index
Contributors

Evan J. Criddle, Professor of Law, College of William & Mary, Marshall-Wythe School of Law.

Diane A. Desierto, Associate Professor of Law (tenured) and Michael J. Marks Distinguished Professor in Business Law, University of Hawaii William S. Richardson School of Law; Co-Director, ASEAN Law & Integration Center; Research Fellow, WSD Handa Center, Stanford Global Studies; 2016–2017 Faculty Fellow, Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences, Stanford University.

Christopher J. Fariss, Jeffrey L. Hyde and Sharon D. Hyde and Political Science Board of Visitors Early Career Professor in Political Science, Pennsylvania State University.

Emilie M. Hafner-Burton, Professor and Director of the Laboratory on International Law and Regulation, School of International Relations and Pacific Studies and Department of Political Science, University of California, San Diego.

Laurence R. Helfer, Harry R. Chadwick, Sr. Professor of Law, Duke University.

Gerald L. Neuman, J. Sinclair Armstrong Professor of International, Foreign, and Comparative Law, Harvard University, and Member of the U.N. Human Rights Committee from 2011 to 2014.

Fionnuala Ní Aoláin, Robina Chair in Law, Public Policy, and Society, University of Minnesota.

James W. Nickel, Professor of Law and Philosophy, University of Miami.
xii Contributors

Thomas Poole, Professor of Law, London School of Economics and Political Science.

William E. Scheuerman, Professor of Political Science, Indiana University.

Scott Sheeran, Senior Legal Counsel and Sanctions Team Leader, New Zealand Delegation on the U.N. Security Council (2015–16), and Senior Lecturer (on leave), School of Law and Human Rights Centre, University of Essex.
Acknowledgments

On May 15, 2014, the American Society of International Law’s (ASIL) International Legal Theory Interest Group invited leading international lawyers, political scientists, and philosophers to a symposium in Washington, D.C., to discuss how international human rights law deals with emergencies. With one exception, the chapters in this volume are the product of these conversations. I owe a special debt of thanks to Trey Childress, Evan Fox-Decent, and Tim Sellers for their enthusiastic support for this project from day one, and to the Wes Rist, Sheila Ward, and the staff of ASIL’s Tillar House for their able assistance with the symposium. I also gratefully acknowledge the Canadian Social Science and Humanities Research Council and the College of William and Mary Marshall-Wythe School of Law for financial support that made this volume possible. Thanks also to John Berger, Kaylee Gum, Krishana Patel, and the editors at Cambridge University Press for their assistance in preparing this volume for publication. As in all things, I express my love and gratitude to Anika Criddle and our children, Isaac, Andrew, Elin, Claire, and Lucie, for their support, encouragement, and inspiration.