TARGETED KILLING

Looking beyond the events of the second intifada and 9/11, this book reveals how targeted killing is intimately embedded in both Israeli and US statecraft and in the problematic relationship between sovereign authority and lawful violence underpinning the modern state system. It details the legal and political issues raised in targeted killing as it has emerged in practice, including questions of domestic constitutional authority, the use of force in international law, the law of belligerent occupation, the law of targeting and human rights law. The distinctive nature of Israeli and US targeted killing is analysed in terms of the compulsion of legality characteristic of the liberal constitutional state, a compulsion that demands the ability to distinguish between legal 'targeted killing' and extra-legal 'political assassination'. The effect is a highly legalized framework for the extraterritorial killing of designated terrorists that may significantly affect the international law of force.

MARKUS GUNNEFLO is a postdoctoral researcher and lecturer in public international law at Lund University, Sweden, where he researches the theory and history of international law, particularly in the areas of the use of force, humanitarian law, human rights and migration.
TARGETED KILLING

A Legal and Political History

MARKUS GUNNEFLO
'Only the State has the right to use force'
(and every use of its force stands in need of a particular law).

Walter Benjamin, 1920
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements page ix

1 Targeted Killing in the History of Israel, the United States and International Law 1
History, Practice, International Law 2
Sovereignty, Protection, Liberal Legality 5
Chapter Overview 11

2 The Emergence of Targeted Killing in the Israeli-Palestinian Common Entrapment of Enmity 15
Public Committee Against Torture v. The Government of Israel 15
Walter Benjamin and the High Court of Justice 24
Trajectories of Israeli State Protection 32
Political Zionism as State Protection 34
Protection: The Difference a State Makes 38
'A Nation in Arms': The Israeli History of Wars of Existence and Assassinations 43
Occupation, Intifada, Targeted Killing 51
1967: Deepening the Common Entrapment of Enmity 52
The Legal Regime of the Occupation 55
Debating Legal Authority for Lethal Force in the First Intifada 60
Targeted Killing in the Second Intifada and Beyond 70

3 The Emergence of Targeted Killing in an American Homeland which Is the Planet 82
Al-Aulaqi v. Obama 83
Carl Schmitt and the US District Court for the District of Columbia 87
Carl Schmitt and the Law and Politics of Protection 89
Schmitt’s Sovereign Protection 91
Protection: From Extra-legal to Apocryphal Sovereignty 94
Protection: From Westphalian to Post-Westphalian International Law 97
CONTENTS

NSDD 138 and George P. Shultz’s Active Defense: Declaring War Against an Unspecified Terrorist Foe, to be Fought at an Unknown Place and Time with Weapons yet to be Chosen 109
Measures to Neutralise Terrorist Leaders and Organisations 109
From Passive to Active Defense against Terrorism 115
Abraham D. Sofaer and the Legal Authority for Active Defense 127
W. Hays Parks and the Lawful Killing of Terrorists under the Law of Armed Conflict 145

From Words to a Deed, Concept and Tool 154
Attempts to Kill Osama bin Laden in Afghanistan 157
Introducing the Targeted Killing Concept 161
A New Tool for Targeted Killing: The Predator Drone 163

The American Targeted Killing Scheme after 9/11 166
The Law of Targeted Killing after 9/11 167
From Targeted Killing to Drone War 175
9/11, a New Kind of Terrorism and a Planetary Homeland Security 177
The Disease Metaphor in Targeted Killing: Death as a Means to Sustain Life 186

4 Targeted Killing and the Struggle over International Law’s Sanctioning of Lethal Force 193
Individualisation of Enmity? 194
Deterritorialisation of Enmity? 206
Enemy or Rights-bearer? 215
Brief History of the Relation of Human Rights and Humanitarian Law 219
The Doctrine of Lex Specialis 226
Substituting a Hybridised for a Mutually Exclusive Relation 229

5 The Law of Targeted Killing 232

Bibliography 240
Table of Cases 266
Index 268
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, thank you Bo for being an unfailing source of joy in the sometimes trying times of completing this book, and Annika for sharing this experience with me.

This book is a substantially revised version of a PhD thesis that was defended at Lund University in 2014. I would like to thank the supervisor of that work, Gregor Noll, for all the time spent reading and commenting on drafts, and for always maintaining a critical, yet constructive, mindset. More than anything else, I want to thank Gregor for stretching my imagination on what international legal scholarship might mean. His influence made this project possible and he continues to make international legal scholarship seem, to me, like a profession worth pursuing. Jens Bartelson’s (my secondary supervisor) incisive comments and criticism were also a great help. Moreover, Jens provided confidence by always being clear about how the work could be improved and what it had already achieved.

At the public defence, I was enormously impressed by faculty opponent Anne Orford’s ability to delicately unpick the nature and stakes of the project, while also being very attentive to detail. My notes taken during the defence provided both direction and a sense of purpose in revising the manuscript for publication as a book. My heartfelt thanks to Anne, as well as to the members of the grading committee – Susanne Krasmann, Ulf Linderfalk and Pål Wrange – for their contribution, questions and comments.

Numerous colleagues have read and commented, discussed or otherwise supported this work over the years. Thanks are due, in particular, to Matilda Arvidsson, Leila Brännström, Eduardo Gill-Pedro, Rens van Munster, Amin Parsa, Niklas Selberg and Daniel Steuer.

I am most grateful for the institutional and other support of the Faculty of Law at Lund University, and to the Ragnar Söderberg Foundation for financially supporting the postdoctoral position – the most important result of which is this book. Early in this project, I spent a few months as
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A visiting fellow at the Institute for International Law and the Humanities (IILAH) at Melbourne Law School. This visit would prove to have a lasting impact on the project. Several aspects of the study have been tested, at informal workshops in Lund and at the Faculty of Law at Helsinki University, between doctoral candidates with an interest in the heterodox strands of the legal discipline. At the end of the project, I was fortunate to participate in the Harvard Law School Institute for Global Law and Policy (IGLP) workshop in Doha and conference in Boston. This provided important input and energy at a time in which fatigue was becoming a serious factor. To all of these institutions – and to the people who make them what they are – thank you.

Gerhard Nordström kindly gave permission to use his 1965 etching, *The Attack*, for the cover. Although the medium is a different one, I would like to believe that the critical spirit of Gerhard’s extensive 1960s and 70s production on war finds expression in this book.

Elizabeth Spicer, at Cambridge University Press, skilfully guided the manuscript through a publication process that had a very positive influence on the manuscript, not least through the comments by the anonymous referees. Thank you all.