The Law of the Whale Hunt

Whale oil lit the cities and greased the machines of the Industrial Revolution. In light of its importance, competition between whalers was high. Far from courts and law enforcement, competing crews of American whalers not known for their gentility and armed with harpoons tended to resolve disputes at sea over ownership of whales. Left to settle arguments on their own, whalemen created norms and customs to decide ownership of whales pursued by multiple crews.

The Law of the Whale Hunt provides an innovative examination of how property law was created in the absence of formal legal institutions regulating the American whaling industry in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Using depositions, court testimony, logbooks, and other previously unused primary sources, Robert Deal tells an exciting story of American whalers hunting in waters from the North Atlantic to the South Pacific and the Sea of Okhotsk.

Robert Deal is an assistant professor of history at Marshall University, West Virginia.
Cambridge Historical Studies in American Law and Society

Series editor
Christopher Tomlins, University of California, Berkeley

Previously published in the series:
Reuel Schiller, Forging Rivals: Race, Class, Law, and the Collapse of Postwar Liberalism
Ely Aaronson, From Slave Abuse to Hate Crime: The Criminalization of Racial Violence in American History
Stuart Chinn, Recalibrating Reform: The Limits of Political Change
Yvonne Pitts, Family, Law, and Inheritance in America: A Social and Legal History of Nineteenth-Century Kentucky
David M. Rabban, Law’s History
Kunal M. Parker, Common Law, History, and Democracy in America, 1790–1900
Steven Wilf, Law’s Imagined Republic
James D. Schmidt, Industrial Violence and the Legal Origins of Child Labor
Rebecca M. McLennan, The Crisis of Imprisonment: Protest, Politics, and the Making of the American Penal State, 1776–1941
Tony A. Freyer, Antitrust and Global Capitalism, 1930–2004
Davison Douglas, Jim Crow Moves North
Andrew Wender Cohen, The Racketeer’s Progress
Michael Willrich, City of Courts, Socializing Justice in Progressive Era Chicago
Barbara Young Welke, Recasting American Liberty: Gender, Law and the Railroad Revolution, 1865–1920
Michael Vorenberg, Final Freedom: The Civil War, the Abolition of Slavery, and the Thirteenth Amendment
Robert J. Steinfeld, Coercion, Contract, and Free Labor in Nineteenth Century America
David M. Rabban, Free Speech in Its Forgotten Years
Michael Grossberg, A Judgment for Solomon: The d’Hauteville Case and Legal Experience in the Antebellum South
For Liz
## Contents

*Figures*  
page ix

*Acknowledgments*  
xi

1. Introduction  
   1

2. The biology, economics, and geography of Anglo-American whaling  
   14

3. Fast-fish, loose-fish  
   29

4. Iron holds the whale  
   58

5. Laws of honor  
   82

6. Halves  
   106

7. The environment of litigation  
   133

8. An untragic commons  
   144

9. Conclusion  
   159

*Index*  
173
Figures

1 Greenland whale; Sperm whale. Naturgeschichte der Säugethiere: mit colorirten Abbildungen zum Anschauungs-Unterricht für die Jugend, 1872. page 15
2 Bowhead whale head on deck. 19
3 Baleen in warehouse of William Lewis and Son. 19
4 Toggle iron. 24
5 “Trying Out.” Harper’s Magazine, 1874. 26
6 Tryworks at full blast. 27
7 Map of the North Polar Regions, 1882. 30
8 Rev.d William Scoresby, 1824. 31
9 Vessel in ice with icebergs behind at left. 32
10 “Grand Ball Given by the Whales in Honor of Oil Wells in Pennsylvania.” Vanity Fair, 1861. 157
Acknowledgments

This book began as a doctoral dissertation in the history department at Temple University. I must confess that I entered graduate school without ever having given whales or whaling any thought. My advisor, Andrew Isenberg, suggested whales as an area of study and lacking any other ideas I took on the topic. Drew probably never expected a project that started out as an environmental history of whaling to quickly become an exercise in legal history. I am extremely grateful that he allowed and encouraged me to take the dissertation off in the direction that made the most sense to me. Drew was a superb advisor and mentor and my debt to him is large. The other members of my dissertation committee – David Waldstreicher, Elizabeth Varon, and Harwell Wells – were extremely helpful and encouraging. It is difficult to imagine a finer group of scholars and people to work with. The history department at Temple University was a remarkably pleasant and supportive place to study, and I have nothing but thanks and praise for the faculty and my fellow graduate students.

As this project has progressed I have accumulated a great many debts. I would like, in particular, to thank the staffs of the following institutions for their assistance: The New Bedford Whaling Museum Library (New Bedford, MA), The John Carter Brown Library (Providence, RI), Baker Library Historical Collections (Cambridge, MA), Houghton Library (Cambridge, MA), National Archives (Waltham, MA), Hawaii State Archives (Honolulu), New York Public Library, and the Hull Maritime Museum (Kingston upon Hull, England). Portions of this work have been presented at a number of different conferences and venues. I have benefited greatly from the comments, criticisms, and suggestions offered at the Society of Historians of the Early American Republic Conference, the Ohio Valley History Conference, University of Toronto Faculty of Law, Law and Humanities Junior Scholar Workshop, World History Association Conference, the Harvard Graduate Student Conference on International History, and at Final Frontiers: Exploring Oceans,
Islands, and Coastal Environments sponsored by the Rachel Carson Center for Environment and Society (Munich) and the Island Institute (Rockland, ME).

I have also benefitted greatly from the encouragement, comments, assistance, and suggestions of many individuals. I would particularly like to thank: Bryant Simon, Drew Isenberg, Elizabeth Varon, David Waldstreicher, Harwell Wells, Angela Fernandez, Bruce Ziff, Robert C. Ellickson, Christopher Tomlins, David Armitage, Arthur F. McEvoy, Carol Rose, Robert Gordon, John Gillis, Franziska Torma, Jeffrey Bolster, Michael Dyer, Mark Procknik, Travis Roy, Joshua Parsons, Chris Calton, several anonymous reviewers, the many students I have taught at Marshall University, and – long before this project was ever conceived – Meredith Parsons Lillich who instilled in me the idea that I might just have the aptitude for this sort of work.

I would like to thank all of the people at Cambridge University Press and particularly series editor Christopher Tomlins for championing this book. It is a much better book because of his involvement.

I must admit that I always viewed the language stating that an author thanks contributors but is responsible for any errors as boilerplate. It is only now – having gone through this process – that I understand just how heartfelt that sentiment is.


I have also accumulated a great many debts of a more personal nature, and I would very much like to acknowledge the support offered by colleagues, friends, and family. My colleagues in the history department at Marshall University have been unfailingly supportive of my work, and I am forever grateful that they took a chance and hired a rather nontraditional candidate. Dan Holbrook, as the Chair of the History Department since my arrival at Marshall in 2010, has eased my transition into academia and teaching. I also appreciate the support of the larger community of scholars at Marshall University. Many friends and family have provided a welcome diversion from work and so have also added much to this project. I would particularly like to acknowledge my brothers Bruce Deal and Bill Deal, Waite Stuhl, Joan Halbert, Beth Zimmerman, Phil Rutherford, Laura Michele Diener, Kat Williams, Greta Rensenbrink, Michael Woods, Margie Hutzayluk, Dave Hutzayluk, Mary Virginia Heyse, Jim Hoffman, and Liz Hoffman.
Acknowledgments

The one sorrow of a first book published deep into one’s middle years is that friends and family members one would like to thank are no longer around. In particular, my parents, Gerry and Clarence Deal, were always supportive and I am confident that they would have been proud of this book. The joy, however, of a first book published on the cusp of sixty is that I can thank new family members – Kate Deal, Jason Kelly, and Aiden Kelly – for their support and the pleasure of their company.

I would like to thank my children – Christopher, Beverly, and Lydia – for their love, support, and understanding of why going to graduate school and pursuing an academic career was so important to me. I only hope that they are half as proud of me as I am of them.

My wife Liz has been my partner and the great love of my life for nearly forty years, and I owe more to her than I even understand or know how to express. This book is for her.