

## The Age of Charisma

An innovative examination of American society, culture, and politics, *The Age of Charisma* argues that the modern relationship between American leaders and followers grew out of a unique group of charismatic social movements prominent in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Drawing on hundreds of letters and testimonials, Jeremy C. Young illustrates how “personal magnetism” in public speaking shaped society by enabling a shift from emotionally inaccessible leadership to emotionally available leadership. This charismatic speaking style caused a rapid transformation in the leader–follower relationship, creating an emotional link between speakers and listeners, and the effects of this social transformation remain with us today. Young argues that, ultimately, charismatic movements enhanced American democracy by encouraging the personalization of leadership – creating a culture in which today’s leaders appeal directly to Americans through mass media.

Jeremy C. Young is an assistant professor of history at Dixie State University.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-11462-3 — The Age of Charisma  
Jeremy C. Young  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

# The Age of Charisma

*Leaders, Followers, and Emotions in American  
Society, 1870–1940*

JEREMY C. YOUNG  
*Dixie State University*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-11462-3 — The Age of Charisma  
Jeremy C. Young  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India  
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107114623](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107114623)  
10.1017/9781316335369

© Jeremy C. Young 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

ISBN 978-1-107-11462-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

*To Chelsea McCracken*

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-11462-3 — The Age of Charisma  
Jeremy C. Young  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	page viii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ix
<i>Introduction</i>	xii
1 Magnetic America: Personal Magnetism in American Culture, 1870–1900	I
2 Command Performances: Leaders and Their Technologies, 1890–1910	40
3 Transformations: The Follower Experience, 1890–1920	93
4 Competing Visions: Imagining Charisma and Social Change, 1890–1910	138
5 Changing Society: The Rise and Fall of Progressive Charisma, 1910–1920	175
6 End of an Age: From Magnetism to Mass Communication, 1920–1940	220
<i>Conclusion</i>	273
<i>Bibliography</i>	282
<i>Index</i>	314

## Illustrations

1.1	Moss Engraving Co., “The Man of Many Moods,” 1904	page 17
1.2	Thomas Nast, “The ‘Magnetic’ Blaine,” 1880	35
2.1	Anna Claypoole Peale, <i>James Rush</i> , 1829	45
2.2	James Rush, “First Outline of <i>The Philosophy of the Human Voice</i> ,” 1827	47
2.3	Jonathan Barber, <i>A Practical Treatise on Gesture</i> , 1831	50
2.4	Jonathan Barber, <i>A Practical Treatise on Gesture</i> , 1831, and William Jennings Bryan, 1908	52
3.1	George Bellows, <i>Billy Sunday</i> , 1923	107
3.2	George Bellows, <i>The Sawdust Trail</i> , 1915	118
3.3	William Jennings Bryan, 1906	126
4.1	Eugene V. Debs, 1912	170
5.1	Theodore Roosevelt, 1902	183
5.2	Woodrow Wilson, 1919	215
6.1	Marcus Garvey, 1920	250
6.2	Aimee Semple McPherson, 1931	254
6.3	Burriss Jenkins, Jr., “Champions!,” 1934	263



## Acknowledgments

Just as a charismatic movement cannot succeed without the army of leaders, followers, and organizers that constitute it, this book about charismatic movements would have been impossible without the help and support of mentors, colleagues, and friends. At Indiana University, Michael McGerr mentored me as a writer, fought hard for me when professional challenges blocked my path, and responded with forbearance when I insisted I was going to write a biography of Woodrow Wilson. In the end, I did write about Wilson, but only after discovering what I really wanted to say about him. I remain grateful to Professor McGerr for his friendship, guidance, and steadfast support. John Bodnar's insightful questions about the Lincoln Republic and American national identity encouraged me to think about my dissertation in the broadest of terms. Judith Allen supervised my initial research on Aimee Semple McPherson and helped me craft a leaner, more concise writing style. Rebecca Spang rightly urged me to abandon an overly theoretical approach and to explain exactly why I wanted to use the term "charisma." Their encouragement, constructive criticism, and intellectual comradeship are much appreciated.

Throughout my career, I have invariably found my senior colleagues within and outside of the academy both welcoming and generous. During my undergraduate years at St. Mary's College of Maryland, Chuck Holden and Christine Adams nurtured my interest in the American Progressive Era and showed me that history could be weird, fascinating, and fun. At History Associates Incorporated, Mike Reis provided me with a crash course in archival research that has served me well in the ensuing years. Thanks as well to Ann Blair, Jane Calvert, Jason Crouthamel, Nick Cullather, Jonathan Dresner, Wendy Gamber, Russell Hanson, Carl

Ipsen, Robert D. Johnston, Michael Kazin, M. Alison Kibler, James Livingston, Kathryn Lofton, James H. Madison, Stephen P. Marrone, Khalil Gibran Muhammad, Paul Murphy, Mike Reis, William E. Scheuerman, Carolyn Shapiro-Shapin, Janet L. Six, and the anonymous reviewers at Cambridge University Press for their generous advice and help.

I am grateful to several individuals and institutions for their financial and professional support of my research. At Cambridge University Press, Debbie Gershenowitz has been an unfailing champion of this project; her steadfast belief in my work has meant a great deal. Kristina Deusch, Amanda George, Katherine Law, Sri Hari Kumar, and others at Cambridge have been friendly and helpful throughout the production process. The Indiana University History Department was extremely generous in providing me with financial support and time for research and writing. The Roosevelt Institute provided me with a timely grant for research at the Franklin D. Roosevelt Library. Thanks as well to the Grand Valley State University History Department and the Indiana University Graduate and Professional Student Association for their helpful financial assistance. The Dixie State University History Department has been a friendly and supportive environment in which to complete final revisions on the manuscript. Finally, please note that Chapter 3 contains material originally published in my article “Transformation in the Tabernacle: Billy Sunday’s Converts and Emotional Experience in the Progressive Era,” *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era*, Vol. 14, No. 3 (July 2015): 367–385. ©2015 Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era; reprinted with permission.

Those who have aided my research in libraries and archives also deserve special mention. I am particularly grateful to Rhonda Long, Isabel Planton, Ronald Luedemann, and the rest of the Herman B. Wells Library Document Delivery Services staff at Indiana University; without their help, I could not have completed this book in anything resembling a timely manner. William E. Darr at the Morgan Library, Grace College and Theological Seminary, offered research assistance and expertise on the various Billy Sunday collections. Grand Valley State University’s Digital Studios generously provided digital scans for several images. Thanks also to the librarians and archivists at the Library of Congress, the Franklin D. Roosevelt Library, the Library Company of Philadelphia, and the Harry Ransom Center at the University of Texas-Austin, and to the staff at the Herman B. Wells Library at Indiana University; the Mary Idema Pew Library at Grand Valley State University; the Fondren Library at Rice

*Acknowledgments*

xi

University; the Cline Library at Northern Arizona University; and the Flagstaff Public Library in Flagstaff, Arizona.

Throughout this project, a number of friends have provided helpful advice, offered thoughtful critiques, and listened patiently while I rambled on about Billy Sunday. Dustin Abnet, an outstanding friend and colleague, read and critiqued the full manuscript. Despite the many demands of his professional life, Brian David Jennings sharpened my thinking about political leadership and was consistently supportive of the book project. Thanks as well to Neal Coleman, Rachel Coleman, Kalani Craig, Karen Dunak, Christine Dunn, Keith Eberly, Susan Eckelmann, Justin Ellison, Silva Kahl, Nicole Kozdron, Hyon Ju Lee, Sean McKee, Elizabeth Nelson, Katherine Nelson, Bogdan Popa, Heather Roberts, Tara Saunders, Jim Seaver, Carl Suddler, Victoria Wheeler, and Drew Zaitsoff for their help, suggestions, and support. Natasha Hollenbach graciously took time from her own graduate work to help me with archival research at the University of Tennessee, Knoxville. I am also thankful to the students in my courses at Indiana University and Grand Valley State University for helping me workshop my ideas on charisma and for being as amused as I was by James Rush's horses and Jonathan Barber's bamboo cage.

Finally, I am grateful for the support and assistance of my family, particularly my father, Bill Young, who taught me to be a historian; my mother, Karen Raskin-Young, who taught me to be a storyteller; my sister, Meredith Young, who encouraged me to pursue my academic dreams; and my in-laws, Jack and Deborah McCracken, who generously opened their home to me during my research trips to the Library of Congress. This book is dedicated to my wife, Chelsea McCracken, who accompanied me to archives, helped me understand James Rush's linguistic theories, challenged my assumptions about the absence of women from positions of charismatic leadership, read and critiqued the entire manuscript, edited several of the images, assisted with compiling the index, and helped shape my thinking at every stage of the project. As observers of charisma would be the first to recognize, for some things, no words in any language are enough.