

Meaning and Power in the Language of Law

Legal practitioners, linguists, anthropologists, philosophers and others have all explored fundamental challenges presented by language in formulating, interpreting and applying laws. Building on centuries of interaction between legal practice and jurisprudence, the modern field of ‘law and language’, or ‘forensic linguistics’, brings insights in linguistics and related fields to bear on topics including legal drafting and translation, statutory interpretation, expert evidence on language use and dynamics of courtroom interaction. This volume presents an interlocking series of research studies engaged with different legal jurisdictions and sociopolitical contexts as well as with the more abstract notion of ‘law’. Together the chapters, written by international leaders in their fields, highlight recent directions in research and investigate in particular how law expresses yet also conceals power relations in its crafted use of words and in the gaps and silence between those words.

JANNY HC LEUNG is Associate Professor of English and Programme Director of Law and Literary Studies at the University of Hong Kong. She co-authored the book *Language and Law: A Resource Book for Students* with Alan Durant (2016); her monograph, titled *Shallow Equality and Symbolic Jurisprudence in Multilingual Legal Orders*, is forthcoming.

ALAN DURANT is Professor of Communication in the School of Law at Middlesex University, London. His recent books include *Language and Law*, co-authored with Janny HC Leung (2016), *Language and Media*, co-authored with Marina Lambrou (2009) and *Meaning in the Media: Discourse, Controversy and Debate* (2010).

Meaning and Power in the Language of Law

Edited by

Janny HC Leung

University of Hong Kong

Alan Durant

Middlesex University, London



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-11284-1 — Meaning and Power in the Language of Law
Edited by Janny H. C. Leung, Alan Durant
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107112841

DOI: 10.1017/9781316285756

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-11284-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	page vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiii
Editors' Introduction	1
JANNY HC LEUNG AND ALAN DURANT	
Part I <i>Sui generis</i> or Socially Problematic: The Character of Legal Language	
1 The Unspoken Language of the Law	19
LAURA NADER	
2 Seeing Sense: The Complexity of Key Words That Tell Us What Law Is	32
ALAN DURANT	
3 Hiding in Plain Sight: The Category of Ordinary Language and the Case Law Domain of Transgender Marriage	71
CHRISTOPHER HUTTON	
Part II Imperfect Fit between Legal Categories and Social Discourse	
4 Effects of Translation on the Invisible Power Wielded by Language in the Legal Sphere: The Case of Nepal	95
KATSUO NAWA	
5 The Language of Film and the Representation of Legal Subjectivity in Juno Mak's <i>Rigor Mortis</i>	118
MARCO WAN	

vi Contents

Part III Written in Silence: Hidden Social Meanings in Legal Discourse

- | | | |
|---|---|-----|
| 6 | Let the Fingers Do the Talking: Language, Gesture and Power in Closing Argument | 137 |
| | GREG MATOESIAN AND KRISTIN ENOLA GILBERT | |
| 7 | Questions about Questioning: Courtroom Practice in China and the United States | 164 |
| | MEIZHEN LIAO | |
| 8 | Law, Language and Community Sentiment: Behind Hate Speech Doctrine in India | 186 |
| | SIDDHARTH NARRAIN | |

Part IV Conflict between Linguistic and Legal Ideologies

- | | | |
|----|---|-----|
| 9 | When Voices Fail to Carry: Voice Projection and the Case of the ‘Dumb’ Jury | 207 |
| | CHRIS HEFFER | |
| 10 | Ideology and Political Meaning in Legal Translation | 236 |
| | JANNY HC LEUNG | |

Part V Demands of Law and Limits of Language

- | | | |
|----|--|-----|
| 11 | Law and the Grammar of Judgment | 259 |
| | JANET AINSWORTH | |
| 12 | Legal Indeterminacy in the Spoken Word | 277 |
| | LAWRENCE M. SOLAN AND SILVIA DAHMEN | |

Afterword

- | | | |
|----|------------------------|-----|
| 13 | The Said of the Unsaid | 305 |
| | PETER GOODRICH | |

	<i>Index</i>	320
--	--------------	-----

Contributors

JANET AINSWORTH is the John D. Eshelman Professor of Law at Seattle University. Before joining the law school faculty in 1988, she practiced law at the Seattle-King County Public Defender Association. Her research interests lie at the intersection of law, language and culture. Author of more than thirty articles and book chapters, she has published in law reviews such as the *Yale Law Journal* and the *Cornell Law Review* as well as in linguistics journals; her articles have been reprinted or excerpted in six anthologies. Her most recent publications include *Speaking of Language and Law*, with Roger Shuy and Lawrence Solan, published in 2015, and *Discursive Constructions of Consent in the Legal Process*, with Susan Ehrlich and Diana Eades, published in 2016. She serves on the editorial boards of several international journals and, with Lawrence Solan, is co-editor of the Oxford University Press series, *Studies on Language and the Law*. In 2016, she was awarded a Lifetime Achievement Award by the Germanic Society for Forensic Linguistics. Her *pro bono* legal activities include authoring *amicus curiae* briefs to appellate courts, including the US Supreme Court, serving as a member of Washington State Supreme Court Committee on Pattern Jury Instructions and volunteering as appellate consultant to the National Association of Criminal Defense Lawyers, from which she received its Outstanding Service Award in recognition of her contributions.

SILVIA DAHMEN teaches phonetics and linguistics at the English department of Cologne University in Germany. Prior to this position, she taught at the German department of Cologne University. She holds a PhD in phonetics, an MA in English Linguistics and Literature and in Scandinavian Languages, and a degree in Intercultural Education. Her main fields of research are the influence of first-language phonetics and phonology on the pronunciation of German and English as a second language, effectiveness of pronunciation training methods for second-language learners and the role of phonetics in the field of language and law.

ALAN DURANT is Professor of Communication in the School of Law at Middlesex University, London. Before transferring into law, he was Professor

viii List of Contributors

of Communication at Middlesex University Business School, and earlier Professor and Head of the School of English, Cultural and Communication Studies, also at Middlesex. Previous posts include Professor and Head of English at Goldsmiths' College, University of London (1990–93) and Director of the Programme in Literary Linguistics, University of Strathclyde, Glasgow (1986–90). Among his earlier books, *Meaning in the Media: Discourse, Controversy and Debate* was published in 2010 and *Language and Media*, co-authored with Marina Lambrou, was published in 2009. With Janny HC Leung, he is co-author of *Language and Law: a Resource Book for Students* (2016).

KRISTIN ENOLA GILBERT is a PhD candidate in the Department of Criminology, Law & Justice at the University of Illinois at Chicago. She is the author of peer-reviewed articles in *Gesture* and *Multimodal Communication*. She studied gesture with Susan Goldin-Meadow at the University of Chicago and is completing a dissertation on multimodal conduct in focus groups evaluating community policing training in the United States.

PETER GOODRICH was the founding Dean of the Department of Law, Birkbeck College, University of London, where he was Corporation of London Professor of Law before he moved to Cardozo School of Law, New York, in 1999. In the expansive domains of international legal education, Goodrich teaches and researches law, aesthetics and film, and, not afraid of medieval-length titles, recently published *Legal Emblems and the Art of Law: Obiter depicta as the Vision of Governance* (2014). He co-authored and co-produced the feature documentary *Auf Wiedersehen: 'Til We Meet Again* (2011) and is the artistic director of the short documentary *Of Many* (2014). Currently completing a book on Judge Daniel Paul Schreber, titled *Schreber's Law: Jurisprudence and Judgment*, he is Director of the Program in Law and Humanities at Cardozo School of Law and Affiliate Professor of Law in the School of Social Science at New York University, Abu Dhabi.

CHRIS HEFFER is Director of MA Programmes, including the MA in Forensic Linguistics, in the Centre for Language and Communication Research at Cardiff University, and co-founder of Cardiff Language and Law (CaLL). He has published articles in linguistic and legal journals on various theoretical and communicational aspects of the trial process and jury instruction and is the author of *The Language of Jury Trial: A Corpus-aided Analysis of Legal-Lay Discourse* (2005) and co-editor of *Legal-Lay Communication: Textual Travels in the Law* (2013). He has a particular interest in communication breakdown between judge and jury and has advised judicial studies boards on this. Heffer is currently completing a book on untruthfulness, *Lying and Bullshit in Life and Law: The Untruthfulness Framework*, and has also been

working for several years on a monograph, *Rhetoric and Rights: A Theory of Forensic Discourse*. He sits on the editorial board of the Oxford University Press Language and Law series and is possibly the only forensic linguist to have testified in a trademark case in the United Kingdom.

CHRISTOPHER HUTTON is Chair Professor in the School of English at the University of Hong Kong. He taught Yiddish Studies as an assistant professor in the Department of Germanic Languages at the University of Texas at Austin from 1987 to 1989 before moving to Hong Kong. His research concerns the history of linguistics, in particular the relationship between linguistics and race theory, linguistics and colonialism, and linguistics and fascism. In the last decade he has been working on the politics of language and interpretation in the context of the law. His publications include *Linguistics and the Third Reich* (1999), *Race and the Third Reich* (2005), *Language, Law and Definition* (with Roy Harris, 2007), *Language, Meaning and the Law* (2009), *Word Meaning and Legal Interpretation* (2014), and *Signs, Meaning and Experience* (with Adrian Pablé, 2015).

JANNY HC LEUNG is Associate Professor of English at the University of Hong Kong. She has an LLM from Yale and a PhD in applied linguistics from Cambridge, and currently coordinates a double degree programme in Law and Literary Studies at the University of Hong Kong. Her research interest lies in the interdisciplinary area of language and law, with a particular focus on bilingual and multilingual jurisdictions. Her articles have appeared in journals including *Semiotica*, *International Journal of Speech, Language and Law*, *Journal of Legal Pluralism*, *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development* and *International Journal of the Semiotics of Law*. She was a Visiting Scholar at the Harvard-Yenching Institute, Harvard University, in 2013–14, and, with Alan Durant, is co-author of *Language and Law: A Resource Book for Students* (2016). Her monograph, titled *Shallow Equality and Symbolic Jurisprudence in Multilingual Legal Orders*, is forthcoming.

MEIZHEN LIAO obtained his PhD in linguistics from the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences. He is currently Professor of Linguistics of the School of Foreign Languages, Central China Normal University. His academic interests include forensic linguistics, pragmatics and discourse metaphor. Among his publications are ‘Metaphor as a Textual Strategy in English’ (*Text*, 1999); ‘A Study of Interruption in Chinese Criminal Courtroom Discourse’ (*Text & Talk*, 2009); *A Study of Courtroom Questions, Responses and their Interaction* (2003); ‘The Goal-Driven Principle of Communication’ (*Journal of Foreign Languages*, 2009); and ‘Courtroom Discourse in China’ (in *Handbook of Language and Law*, 2012).

x List of Contributors

GREGORY MATOESIAN is a professor in the Department of Criminology, Law & Justice at the University of Illinois at Chicago. He is a formally trained linguist and social theorist. His main interest is multimodal conduct in the construction and co-construction of legal context. He is the author of *Reproducing Rape: Domination through Talk in the Courtroom* (1993) and *Law & the Language of Identity: Discourse in the William Kennedy Smith Rape Trial* (2001), and co-editor (along with Elizabeth Mertz and David Ford) of *Translating the Social World for Law* (2016).

LAURA NADER is Professor of Anthropology at the University of California, Berkeley. Her current work focuses on how central dogmas are made and how they work. *Energy Choices in a Democratic Society* (1980) is a multi-disciplinary collaborative effort of the National Academy of Sciences. *Harmony Ideology – Justice and Control in a Zapotec Mountain Village* (1990) and *Essays in Controlling Processes* (1994, 1996, 2002) emerge from a theoretical perspective that crosses disciplinary boundaries. *Naked Science – Anthropological Inquiry into Boundaries, Power and Knowledge* (1996) provides a framework for understanding power arrangements in global science. *The Life of the Law* (2002) is about the interface between law and anthropology with an argument that the plaintiff is the life of the law. Her films *To Make the Balance* and a later PBS film *Little Injustices* are widely disseminated, as is the book (with Ugo Mattei) *Plunder – When the Rule of Law is Illegal* (2008). Her most recent publication is *What the Rest Think of the West – Since 600 AD*, published 2015. In 1995 the Law and Society Association awarded her the Kalven Prize for distinguished research on law and society. Nader is a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

SIDDHARTH NARRAIN is a lawyer and legal researcher based in Delhi. He is currently a Visiting Faculty at the School of Law, Governance & Citizenship, Ambedkar University Delhi and an Honorary Visiting Fellow at The Sarai Programme, Centre for the Study of Developing Societies (CSDS), Delhi. His research focuses on legal issues arising around the circulation of excitable speech on social media during communal and ethnic violence in India. He follows and contributes to debates around freedom of speech and expression and gender and sexuality rights in India. Narrain has previously worked with the Alternative Law Forum, Bangalore, and as a journalist with *The Hindu* Group of publications in Delhi. He is co-editor of *The Shifting Scales of Justice: The Supreme Court in Neo-liberal India* (2014), a collection of essays on the politics of the Indian Supreme Court. His work has been published in a number of journals, magazines and websites including the *Economic and Political Weekly*, *Seminar*, *The Indian Express*, *The Asian Age*, *The New Indian Express*, *Kafila*, *The Hoot*, *The Wire*, *Scroll.In*,

Yahoo News, *The Alternative*, *Infochange India*, *Himal Southasian* and *Time Out Bengaluru*. Narrain studied at the National Law School of India University, Bangalore; the Asian College of Journalism, Chennai; and Harvard Law School.

KATSUO NAWA is Professor of Cultural Anthropology, Institute for Advanced Studies on Asia, the University of Tokyo. He was Research Scholar at the Centre of Nepal and Asian Studies, Tribhuvan University, Nepal (1992–95), Visiting Fellow, Clare Hall, the University of Cambridge (2002–03), and Visiting Scholar, Harvard-Yenching Institute (2013–14). Largely based on his ethnographic fieldwork in Far Western Nepal, he has written extensively on interethnic and inter-caste relations, the sococultural transformation and ritual process, and language use and its objectification. His current research interests include ethnohistory of a Himalayan village, politics and poetics of ‘ethnic’ movements and literacy, translation and language ideologies in Nepal. His major publication includes *Nepal, Byans oyobi Shuhen Chiiki niokeru Girei to Shakai Hanchu ni kansuru Minzokushiteki Kenkyu: Mouhitotu no ‘Kindai’ no Fuchi (An Ethnographic Study on Rituals and Social Categories of Byans, Nepal and Adjacent Regions: Another Constellation of ‘Modernity’)* (2002), which won the 30th Shibusawa prizes from the Shibusawa Fund for Ethnological Studies in 2004; and two volumes of books co-edited with Hiroshi Ishii and David N. Gellner, *Nepalis Inside and Outside Nepal: Social Dynamics in Northern South Asia* vol. 1, and *Political and Social Transformations in North India and Nepal: Social Dynamics in Northern South Asia* vol. 2 (2007). He is a co-editor of *Asian Anthropology*.

LAWRENCE M. SOLAN is the Don Forchelli Professor of Law and Director of the Center for the Study of Law, Language and Cognition at Brooklyn Law School. He holds a PhD in Linguistics from the University of Massachusetts and a JD from Harvard Law School. Much of his writing concerns the interpretation of statutes and contracts. His books include *The Language of Judges* (1993), *Speaking of Crime* (2005, with Peter Tiersma) and *The Language of Statutes: Laws and Their Interpretation* (2010). Solan and Peter Tiersma co-edited *The Oxford Handbook of Language and Law* (2012), and, with Janet Ainsworth and Roger Shuy, Solan is co-editor of *Speaking of Language and Law: Conversations on the Work of Peter Tiersma* (2015). Solan has been a visiting professor at Yale Law School, as well as in the Psychology Department and Humanities Council at Princeton University.

MARCO WAN is Associate Professor of Law and Honorary Associate Professor of English at the University of Hong Kong, where he directs the programme in Law and Literary Studies. He has published widely in law and the humanities. He edited *The Legal Case: Cross Currents between Law and the*

xii List of Contributors

Humanities (2012) and is the author of *Masculinity and the Trials of Modern Fiction* (2016). He is Managing Editor of *Law and Literature*. He received his PhD and law degree from the University of Cambridge, where he was an Evan-Lewis Thomas Law Scholar and Sir Edward Youde Memorial Fellow. He also holds a BA from Yale University and an LLM from Harvard Law School. He is currently working on a monograph on law and Hong Kong cinema.

Acknowledgements

This volume would not have been possible without an event that provided its initial focus: an international roundtable held at Harvard in 2014, from which further discussion of the topics, critical exchanges and new and fundamentally revised contributions followed. The editors gratefully acknowledge the generous support of the Harvard-Yenching Institute in funding that scholarly meeting, during a period when Leung was a visiting scholar (academic year 2013–14). Not all the discussants at the roundtable were able to contribute to this volume, and not all contributors to the volume could attend the initial roundtable. But the 2014 sessions have remained an essential reference point in guiding the book's aims and significantly helped to shape its final content.

At Cambridge University Press the editors would like to thank Helen Barton for her encouragement of and continuing support to work at the intersection between linguistics and law, and Stephanie Taylor and Bethany Johnson for assistance in preparing the final version of the book from our manuscript.