Pakistan Moving the Economy Forward

Edited by Rashid Amjad Shahid Javed Burki



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge House, 4381/4 Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi 110002, India

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107109520

© Lahore School of Economics 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in India

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-10952-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of figures and tables Preface		v xi
1	Overview Rashid Amjad and Shahid Javed Burki	1–21
2	Failed Economic Promise: Lessons from Pakistan's Development Experience Parvez Hasan	22–47
3	Economic Management Under IMF Tutelage: Key Lessons from the Musharraf and PPP Rule 1999–2013 R <i>ashid Amjad</i>	48-83
4	A Country and an Economy in Transition Shahid Javed Burki	84–107
5	Tackling the Energy Crisis <i>Afia Malik</i>	108–134
6	Exports: Lessons from the Past and the Way Forward Hamna Ahmed, Naved Hamid, and Mahreen Mahmud	135–170
7	The Future Path of Tax Reforms in Pakistan Hafiz A. Pasha and Aisha Ghaus-Pasha	171–197

CAMBRIDGE

Contents

8	Pakistan's Indus Basin Water Strategy: Past, Present and Future Shahid Amjad Chaudhry	198–223
9	Economic Governance and Institutional Reforms Ishrat Husain	224–253
10	Benefiting from Foreign Direct Investment Khalil Hamdani	254–279
11	An Analysis of the Remittances Market in Pakistan Rashid Amjad, M. Irfan, and G. M. Arif	280–310
12	The Prospects for Indo-Pakistan Trade Hafiz A. Pasha and Muhammad Imran	311–331
13	Beyond the Poverty Line: A Multidimensional Analysis of Poverty in Pakistan Azam Chaudhry, Theresa Chaudhry, Muhammad Haseeb, and Uzma Afzal	332–357
14	Can the New Intergovernmental Structure Work in Pakistan? Learning from China Ehtisham Ahmad	358–392
Contributors		393–394
Index		395–398

List of figures

Figure 3.1:	Pakistan's macroeconomic performance, 1999–2013	50
Figure 6.1:	Manufacturing export performance (share in total exports)	138
Figure 6.2:	Financial depth	150
Figure 6.3:	Bank credit as a share of working capital (%)	151
Figure 6.4:	Agricultural export performance (commodity share in total exports)	155
Figure 6.5:	Benefits of engaging with the Pakistani diaspora (in ascending order)	163
Figure 6.6:	Ranking by various dimensions of the business environment: A cross-country comparison	165
Figure 6.7:	Country rankings on the LPI, 2012	166
Figure 7.1:	Structure of tax administration in Pakistan	178
Figure 8.1:	Western rivers: Inflow at rim stations (MAF)	211
Figure 9.1:	Pakistan's ranking in governance indicators	236
Figure 10.1:	FDI inflows in the early years (USD million)	256
Figure 10.2:	FDI inflows in recent years (USD million)	259
Figure 10.3:	Growth of the manufacturing sector (per cent)	263
Figure 10.4:	Repatriation of profits and dividends	274
Figure 11.1:	Percentage distribution of overseas Pakistanis by occupation, 2001–12	291
Figure 11.2:	Methods used to transfer money from abroad by rural and urban origin of migrants (per cent)	297
Figure A11.1:	Trends in remittances in four selected countries (USD million)	309

Figure 14.1:	China: Total tax revenue, local government	
	revenue, and central government share of	
	total revenue, 1985–2011	365
Figure 14.2:	General government revenue and GDP	
	per capita, 2012	368
Figure 14.3:	Modified subsidiarity principles	369

List of tables

Table 2.1:	Export of goods and services as a percentage of GDP	34
Table 2.2:	Net official assistance to Pakistan and India	36
Table 2.3:	Gross fixed capital formation as a percentage of GDP	37
Table 4.1:	Pakistan's position on the Legatum prosperity index	89
Table 4.2:	Pakistan's socioeconomic performance in the global context	90
Table 5.1:	Power sector performance: Some technical indicators	110
Table 5.2:	Fuel cost in public and private utilities (paisas/kWh)	114
Table 5.3:	Average electricity tariffs (PRs/kWh)	117
Table 5.4:	T&D losses in DISCOs (%)	120
Table 5.5:	Average cost of units delivered to DISCOs, 2011/12	122
Table 6.1:	Country-wise share of world exports (1980-2012)	137
Table 6.2:	Pakistan garment exports by major products (2012)	142
Table 6.3:	Traditional and emerging SME exports	145
Table 6.4:	Dimensions of the LPI: Pakistan and comparator countries	167
Table 7.1:	Fiscal powers of the federal government as per the Constitution	173
Table 7.2:	Share of revenues from different taxes (PRs billion)	176

vi

CAMBRIDGE

List of figures and tables

Table 7.3:	Tax-to-GDP ratio of Pakistan, 2000/01–2011/12 (percentage of GDP)	179
Table 7.4:	Comparison of tax-to-GDP ratio and taxation structure in selected countries	180
Table 7.5:	Base and rate effects on the change in tax-to-GDP ratio, 2007/08 to 2010/11 (%)	181
Table 7.6:	Comparison of tax rates in selected countries (%)	182
Table 7.7:	Major tax expenditures in Pakistan	184
Table 7.8:	Incidence of taxes in Pakistan, 2007/08	188
Table 7.9:	Revenue yield from tax reforms (with a tax base of 2012/13)	194
Table 8.1:	IBIS canal withdrawals	204
Table 8.2:	Seasonality in the Indus river system	205
Table 8.3:	Indus basin salt balances	207
Table 8.4:	Pakistan's overall water availability, $2007/08$ (MAF)	208
Table 8.5:	Storage yield curves for the Indus river	212
Table 8.6:	IBIS aquifer balances 2001/02 (MAF)	214
Table 8.7:	Comparison of Haryana, India, and Punjab, Pakistan (per hectare)	216
Table 8.8:	IBIS environmental flow requirements	219
Table 10.1	Technological content of manufactures (per cent)	267
Table 10.2	Income on US direct investment, 2009	272
Table 11.1	Official remittances from countries of origin	286
Table 11.2:	Stock of overseas Pakistanis/Pakistani diaspora (millions)	289
Table 11.3	: Official remittances per Pakistani diaspora/per working Pakistani (USD)	290

vii

	ercentage increase in number of workers/remittances, 004–12	291
Table 11.5:	Percentage distribution of households who received remittances through hundi and reasons for not using a bank	298
Table 11.6:	Migrants' level of educational attainment and the methods used for money transfer	299
Table 11.7:	Migrants' duration of stay abroad and methods used to transfer money (per cent)	300
Table 11.8:	Effects of demographic and socioeconomic factors on methods used to transfer money from abroad (logistic regression model)	301
Table A11.1:	Outflow of overseas Pakistanis by occupational category (numbers)	308
Table A11.2:	Percentage distribution of overseas Pakistanis by occupational category, 2001–12	309
Table A11.3:	Cost, distance, and time spent on dealing with banks and the hundi system	310
Table 12.1:	Trade between Pakistan and India, 2000/01–2010/11	313
Table 12.2:	Positive list of items for import from India	314
Table 12.3:	Pakistan's major imports from India, 2010/11 and 2011/12	315
Table 12.4:	Pakistan's major exports to India, 2010/11 and 2011/12	316
Table 12.5:	Simultaneously significant Indian exports and Pakistani imports, 2010/11 (at 4-digit HC level)	320
Table 12.6:	Simultaneously significant Pakistani exports and Indian imports, 2010/11 (at 4-digit HC level)	322
Table 12.7:	MFN-applied tariffs by product group in India and Pakistan	323

viii

Table 12.8:	Distribution of effective ad valorem tariffs on textiles in India	324
Table 12.9:	OTRI in a sample of Asian countries	327
Table 13.1:	Percentage of population below the income-based poverty line for the entire population	339
Table 13.2:	Percentage of population below the income-based poverty line for the entire population: Rural vs. urban breakdown	339
Table 13.3:	Percentage of population below the income-based poverty line for the entire population: Provincial breakdown	340
Table 13.4:	Breakdown of population above the age of 20 who have not completed their primary education (%)	341
Table 13.5:	Breakdown by gender of population above the age of 20 who have not completed their primary education	341
Table 13.6:	Rural/urban breakdown of population above the age of 20 who have not completed their primary education	342
Table 13.7:	Province-wise breakdown of population above the age of 20 who have not completed their primary education	342
Table 13.8:	Breakdown of population by access to drinking water (%) $$	343
Table 13.9:	Rural–urban breakdown of population by access to drinking water	343
Table 13.10:	Province-wise breakdown of population by access to drinking water	344
Table 13.11:	Percentage breakdown of overall population below the multidimensional poverty line (income, education, and health)	347
Table 13.12:	Rural/urban breakdown of overall population below the multidimensional poverty line (income, education, and health)	347
Table 13.13:	Province-wise breakdown of overall population below the multidimensional poverty line (income, education, and health)	348

ix

Table 13.14:	Galtonian regressions of intergenerational persistence: Income and education	351
Table 13.15:	Decomposition of inequality measures due to unequal opportunities	354
Table 14.1:	Main traits of recent intergovernmental reforms in selected countries	362
Table 14.2:	GST productivity—declining and low in comparison with competitors	376
Table 14.3:	NFC projections 2010–14 (percentage of GDP)	380

Preface

Today, well into the seventh decade of its existence as an independent state, Pakistan is passing through a critical period. It is navigating a perfect storm and faces not one but several daunting challenges. Extremist forces continue to challenge the state and the Constitution. The economy remains under stress and depends on large external flows to remain solvent. The rate of population growth remains relatively high; every year, the country adds close to four million people to its large population. Its human resources are poorly developed. There are severe power shortages; apportioning the limited supply of power means plunging large areas into complete darkness several times a day and for several hours at a time.

While fully aware of the depth and spread of such problems, we were equally convinced that there were enough "positives" in Pakistan's economic and social systems to think in terms of a better future for the country. It is difficult to practice development economics without a tinge of optimism. Pakistan is richly endowed with resources that could be deployed to produce a higher rate of growth. It has the world's largest contiguous irrigated area, for instance, and if it were to move toward the production of higher value-added crops, agriculture could become an even more significant part of the economy. The country has rich, if largely unexplored, mineral resources and traditional engineering skills that could be developed into supply chains to feed some of the large industrial production systems in the neighborhood. There is also Pakistan's proximity to Asia's two mega-economies, China and India—not only could it develop strong and beneficial economic relations with these two economic powerhouses, but it could also provide land routes for commerce, linking China and India with energy-rich Central Asia and the Middle East.

Supportive public policies are required to make these and other "positives" work for the country. We felt that a collection of essays by a group of development scholars and practitioners was needed—one that policymakers could use in making public policy choices. In asking writers to contribute to this volume, we agreed that the following three criteria would be kept in view. First,

Preface

the discussion should be about the future. One could analyze the past, but only if it informed one's thinking about the future. Second, the book would deal with a variety of topics but not venture into disciplines that were very far from economics. In other words, the proposed volume would be a book by economists on economics, but written to evoke interest among and be understood easily by a general readership. By focusing on many subjects within the broad discipline of economics, we wanted to emphasize the "micro" without neglecting the "micro". Third, we would invite authors to present their recipes for the future, keeping in mind that Islamabad is searching for solutions to the country's many problems.

As its title suggests, this is a forward-looking book. It is also a collection of essays that discards the notion that Pakistan is inexplicably condemned to being the "sick man" of South Asia. As the volume's coeditors, we have enough international experience between us to know that there are no permanent trends in the lives of individuals or nations. Countries have their ups and downs; Pakistan is passing through a "down". It has enough inherent strength, however—in its people and its endowments—to pull itself out of this difficult situation.

As a politician said not too long ago, a crisis is too precious a thing to waste. Pakistan is, undeniably, in a deep crisis—a fact that all its citizens recognize. What is needed at this juncture is a development paradigm that seeks to "go over" the number of obstacles that have slowed down the pace of the country's economic and social advance. To carry the metaphor forward, these are not "speed bumps" that we need to cross by slowing down; these are real walls that block our way. We need to pull them down, not skirt around them as we have tended to do in the past. Bringing the walls down involves something economists call structural change. Policymakers in Pakistan have shied away from this, taking the easy route ahead and avoiding the economic reforms so badly needed to make the economy more productive and efficient. This structuralist approach is the main theme of this collection of essays. Reading them together—as they should be read—there are enough ideas present to help policymakers move the country forward and onto a trajectory of high, sustained, and inclusive growth.

In putting this volume together, we must acknowledge a number of people and institutions that have made this book possible. First and foremost are the authors of the different chapters, who set aside their precious time to contribute to the volume and have done so purely as a labor of love and because of their commitment to improving the lives of the people of Pakistan. We must also

Preface

thank the reviewers of the manuscript, appointed by Cambridge University Press. Their suggestions were valuable and welcomed by the authors. We would also like to acknowledge the work put in by Cambridge University Press, New Delhi, in preparing this volume for publication. Our special thanks to Dhiraj Pandey, commissioning editor, Management and Economics, in steering the manuscript through its different stages and to Ranjini Majumdar, production editor, for carefully going through the manuscript and giving helpful suggestions. In preparing the manuscript, Maheen Pracha did an excellent job in editing the different chapters and her work drew praise from all the authors.

> Rashid Amjad Shahid Javed Burki