

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10655-0 - Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform

Michael Albertus

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Autocracy and Redistribution

### *The Politics of Land Reform*

When and why do countries redistribute land to the landless? What political purposes does land reform serve, and what place does it have in today's world? A long-standing literature that dates back to Aristotle and is echoed in important recent works holds that redistribution should be both more prevalent and more targeted at the poor under democracy. Yet comprehensive historical data to test this claim has been lacking. This book shows that land redistribution – the most consequential form of redistribution in the developing world – occurs more often under dictatorship than democracy. It offers a novel theory of land reform and develops a typology of land reform policies. Michael Albertus leverages original data from around the world dating back to 1900 to extensively test this theory using statistical analysis and case studies of key countries, such as Egypt, Peru, Venezuela, and Zimbabwe. These findings call for rethinking much of the common wisdom about redistribution and political regimes.

Michael Albertus is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Chicago. His research interests include redistribution, political regime transitions and regime stability, politics under dictatorship, clientelism, and conflict. Albertus's most recent work has been published in journals such as the *British Journal of Political Science*, *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, *Comparative Political Studies*, *Economics & Politics*, and *Comparative Politics*. He has also conducted extensive field research throughout Latin America.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10655-0 - Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform

Michael Albertus

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Cambridge Studies in Comparative Politics

### General Editors

Kathleen Thelen *Massachusetts Institute of Technology*

Erik Wibbels *Duke University*

### Associate Editors

Robert H. Bates *Harvard University*

Gary Cox *Stanford University*

Thad Dunning *University of California, Berkeley*

Anna Grzymala-Busse *University of Michigan, Ann Arbor*

Stephen Hanson *The College of William and Mary*

Torben Iversen *Harvard University*

Stathis Kalyvas *Yale University*

Margaret Levi *Stanford University*

Peter Lange *Duke University*

Helen Milner *Princeton University*

Frances Rosenbluth *Yale University*

Susan Stokes *Yale University*

### Other Books in the Series

Ben W. Ansell, *From the Ballot to the Blackboard: The Redistributive Political Economy of Education*

Leonardo R. Arriola, *Multi-Ethnic Coalitions in Africa, Business Financing of Opposition Election Campaigns*

David Austen-Smith, Jeffry A. Frieden, Miriam A. Golden, Karl Ove Moene, and Adam Przeworski, eds., *Selected Works of Michael Wallerstein: The Political Economy of Inequality, Unions, and Social Democracy*

Andy Baker, *The Market and the Masses in Latin America: Policy Reform and Consumption in Liberalizing Economies*

Lisa Baldez, *Why Women Protest? Women's Movements in Chile*

Stefano Bartolini, *The Political Mobilization of the European Left, 1860–1980: The Class Cleavage*

Robert Bates, *When Things Fell Apart: State Failure in Late-Century Africa*

Mark Beissinger, *Nationalist Mobilization and the Collapse of the Soviet State*

Nancy Bermeo, ed., *Unemployment in the New Europe*

Carles Boix, *Democracy and Redistribution*

Carles Boix, *Political Order and Inequality: Their Foundations and Their Consequences for Human Welfare*

Carles Boix, *Political Parties, Growth, and Equality: Conservative and Social Democratic Economic Strategies in the World Economy*

Catherine Boone, *Merchant Capital and the Roots of State Power in Senegal, 1930–1985*

(Continued after the Index)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10655-0 - Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform

Michael Albertus

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# Autocracy and Redistribution

## *The Politics of Land Reform*

MICHAEL ALBERTUS

*University of Chicago*



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10655-0 - Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform

Michael Albertus

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107514300](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107514300)

© Michael Albertus 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Albertus, Michael, 1983–

Autocracy and redistribution : the politics of land reform / Michael Albertus.

pages cm. – (Cambridge studies in comparative politics)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-10655-0 (hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-51430-0 (paperback)

1. Land reform – Political aspects. 2. Land reform – Developing countries – History.

3. Developing countries – Politics and government. I. Title.

HD1332.A43 2015

333.3'1091724–dc23 2015012675

ISBN 978-1-107-10655-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-51430-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of Figures</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
1 Introduction	1
2 Actors, Interests, and the Origins of Elite Splits	26
3 A Theory of Land Reform	60
4 Measuring Land Reform	112
5 A Cross-National Analysis of Land Reform in Latin America	142
6 Elite Splits and Redistribution under Autocracy: Peru’s “Revolution from Above”	190
7 Land Reform Transformed to Redistribution: Venezuela’s Punto Fijo Democracy and Chávez’s Bolivarian Revolution	225
8 Latin America in Comparative Perspective	266
9 Conclusion	304
<i>References</i>	321
<i>Index</i>	345

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10655-0 - Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform

Michael Albertus

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

List of Tables

2.1 Land Distribution in Latin America, 1950–1970	<i>page</i> 30
2.2 Key Ruling Political Elites in Venezuela, 1945–1948	36
2.3 Cases of Large-Scale Rural Protest and Organization in Latin America, 1910–2008	43
3.1 Required Steps to Create and Implement Land Reform	62
3.2 Land Redistribution and Ruling Political Elite Survival	73
4.1 A Typology of Land Reform	126
5.1 Summary Statistics	145
5.2 Land Redistribution by Elite Splits and Veto Points	154
5.3 Land Redistribution, Political Institutions, and Elite Splits in Latin America, 1930–2008	156
5.4 Alternative Explanations for Land Redistribution, 1930–2008	160
5.5 Land Negotiation, Land Colonization, and Aggregate Land Reform, 1930–2008	176
5.6 IV and Heckman Estimates of Land Redistribution, 1930–2008	182
6.1 Land Reform in Peru, 1939–2006	196
6.2 Determinants of Land Expropriation in Peru, 1969–1980	219
7.1 Land Reform in Venezuela, 1908–2013	229
7.2 Land Reform in Venezuela by State, 1958–1990	253
7.3 Land Reform in Venezuela by Municipality in Rural Municipalities, 1958–1988	256
7.4 Land Distribution in Venezuela by Municipality in Rural Municipalities, 2007–2009	263
8.1 Major and Minor Cases of Land Redistribution Outside of Latin America, 1900–2010	271
8.2 Land Redistribution, Political Institutions, and Elite Splits around the World, 1900–2008	280

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10655-0 - Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform

Michael Albertus

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---



List of Figures

2.1 Percentage of the Economically Active Population in Agriculture in Latin America, 1950	<i>page 39</i>
3.1 An Economy of the Landed Elite, Ruling Political Elite, and Rural Poor	79
3.2 Intra-Elite Splits and Land Redistribution	86
3.3 A Three-Actor Model of Land Redistribution	88
3.4 Model Equilibria	96
4.1 Land Reform in Latin America, 1930–2008	131
4.2 Land Reform in Latin America by Country, 1930–2008	132
4.3 Country-Level Contributions to Total Latin American Land Reform, 1930–2008	136
4.4 Change in Land Inequality in Latin America, 1950–1990	140
5.1 Veto Points across Political Regimes in Latin America, 1930–2008	147
5.2 Land Redistribution, Elite Splits, and Veto Points in Latin America, 1930–2008	153
5.3 Marginal Effects of Elite Split on Land Redistribution as Veto Points Vary	157
6.1 Haciendas, Indigenous Communities, and Small Properties in Ollantaytambo District, Cusco, 1960s	194
6.2 Elite Splits, Institutional Constraints, and Land Redistribution in Peru, 1930–2008	206
6.3 Landholding Inequality and Expropriation in Peru	214
6.4 Number of Properties Affected by Expropriation in Peru by Year, 1969–1980	215
7.1 Land Transfer Types and Compensation under Venezuela’s 1960 Agrarian Reform Law	236

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-10655-0 - Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform  
Michael Albertus  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

x	<i>List of Figures</i>
7.2	Elite Splits, Institutional Constraints, and Land Reform in Venezuela, 1930–2009 241
7.3	Land Reform in Venezuela, 1958–1990 246
7.4	Long-Term Electoral Effects of Land Transfers by State 258

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10655-0 - Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform

Michael Albertus

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Acknowledgments

This book has its deepest roots in my early graduate work at Stanford University, although it only truly sprouted wings after numerous trips to the field and seemingly endless input and support from colleagues and mentors. I have consequently accumulated enormous intellectual and personal debts in its production.

Perhaps my greatest debt is to David Laitin. His ability to nurture the seed of a good intuition is unsurpassable. When I first found that autocratic regimes redistribute more land than democratic ones, he immediately grasped on to the finding and urged me to develop it. Over the next five years, he taught me how to plumb the depths of a topic while keeping it broadly relevant and testing its generalizability – essential skills for any scholar of comparative politics. His mastery of the intellectual topography of the discipline constantly prodded me to engage with the big questions while paying plenty of attention to nitty-gritty details.

The rest of my dissertation committee – Jim Fearon, Steve Haber, and Jonathan Rodden – was equally indispensable. Jim, as always, cut straight to the heart of any inconsistency or shortcoming in my logic. Steve helped critically shape my understanding of the politics of authoritarian regimes as well as the limits of what we currently know. And Jonathan was an endless font of suggestions about framing the project and how to make the most out of the data that I had to test the theory. This committee supported not only my work on what would ultimately become this book but also the related bits and pieces that have trickled out in other venues.

My other colleagues and peers at Stanford gave me invaluable feedback along the way. Beatriz Magaloni and Alberto Diaz-Cayeros helped shape my understanding of Mexico's land reform and pushed me to consider the coercive and clientelistic aspects of land redistribution as experienced by beneficiaries. Barry Weingast encouraged my thinking on institutional constraints to rule

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10655-0 - Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform

Michael Albertus

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

under both democracy and autocracy. Lisa Blaydes and Karen Jusko provided helpful early suggestions about turning the project into a book. My fellow graduate students and close friends Thomas Brambor and Victor Menaldo sounded out numerous iterations of my early ideas and generously provided comments without fail.

My colleagues at the University of Chicago energetically and enthusiastically brought me into the fold after graduate school. I have benefited enormously from the insights of Gary Herrigel, Ben Lessing, Stan Markus, John McCormick, Monika Nalepa, Tianna Paschel, Alberto Simpser, Betsy Sinclair, Dan Slater, Paul Staniland, Lisa Wedeen, and Dali Yang. The indefatigable Dan Slater read several versions of various parts of the manuscript and provided incredibly detailed and thoughtful comments and critiques that are inextricably woven throughout the text. He has been a champion of the project and the rest of my work since I first came to Chicago; for this, I am eternally grateful. John has, on many occasions, left me pondering big questions about the nature of democracy, how it might work versus how it often does, and how the masses can possibly tame elites when the deck is stacked so heavily against them. Lisa provided me with comparative perspective on several Middle Eastern land reforms and encouraged me to think carefully through the role of foreign powers in shaping and even imposing land reform agendas. Paul gave me cogent and crucial advice on reorganizing parts of the manuscript in the wake of my book workshop. Monika provided detailed and extremely helpful suggestions about how to revise the manuscript in response to reviews.

My department at Chicago, and Cathy Cohen in particular as chair, also supported an exceptionally fruitful workshop for the book manuscript. As key participants of that workshop, David Brown, Kevin Morrison, Guillermo Trejo, and Daniel Ziblatt read the manuscript in incredible detail and gave me invaluable advice and suggestions that helped improve it dramatically. Their devotion to ideas and scholarship, as well as their public-spiritedness, represent the best of our profession. I owe all of them a deep debt of gratitude. I am also appreciative of the participation and feedback of my colleagues and the graduate students at the workshop.

Beyond the outsized influence of these individuals on the final manuscript, countless others also shaped my thinking along the way. Of particular note are Ben Ansell, Reo Matsuzaki, Jim Robinson, and Milan Svolik, all of whom provided insightful comments on the project. Reo read the first few iterations of the early chapters of the book while we were both postdoctoral Fellows at Stanford's Center on Democracy, Development, and the Rule of Law. Various parts of the project similarly benefited from the comments of Pablo Bera-mendi, Rikhil Bhavnani, Cathy Boone, José Cheibub, Michael Coppedge, Scott Gehlbach, Hein Goemans, Gretchen Helmke, Wendy Hunter, Ollie Kaplan, Ethan Kapstein, Terry Karl, Herb Klein, Bethany Lacina, Scott Mainwaring, Aila Matanock, Enrique Mayer, Cynthia McClintock, Vicky Murillo, Ana de la O, Daniel Ortega, Maggie Peters, Guillermo Rosas, Jake Shapiro, Ali

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10655-0 - Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform

Michael Albertus

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgments*

xiii

Valenzuela, Nikki Velasco, Jeremy Wallace, Jeremy Weinstein, and Kurt Weyland. I also thank the many workshop and seminar participants at the Juan March Institute, Stanford University, University of California-Berkeley, University of Chicago, University of Illinois, University of Notre Dame, University of Rochester, University of Texas-Austin, University of Wisconsin-Madison, and Washington University–St. Louis for their critical and constructive comments.

Equally important to the final product were anonymous manuscript reviewers for Cambridge University Press and Oxford University Press who provided excellent and thoughtful reviews. The manuscript is undoubtedly better as a result, hopefully to a degree equal to their expectations. I thank Lew Bateman at Cambridge and David McBride at Oxford for soliciting such brilliant reviews, and for doing so in such short order. Lew has been a fantastic editor – responsive, deft, and quick – at every stage of the process. Erik Wibbels and Kathleen Thelen enthusiastically brought me into the Cambridge Studies in Comparative Politics series, for which I am honored and thankful.

This manuscript could never have been written without the vast quantities of data that I have collected on land reform. Such an undertaking is daunting in retrospect. I never would have conceived it even possible without the enthusiastic and emphatic call of an early mentor, J. David Singer of the University of Michigan, to systematically collect data in an effort to form a better empirical – and consequently theoretical – understanding of the world around us. His dedication to political science as science served as a siren’s call as I was completing degrees in electrical engineering and mathematics. Jim Morrow and Paul Huth further encouraged my initial foray into political science, generously sharing their time with me and providing feedback on my thesis of a quality far beyond my undergraduate expectations.

A special thanks goes to those who facilitated data collection at a host of land reform agencies, including the Instituto Nacional de Reforma Agraria (INRA) in Bolivia, the Instituto Nacional de Colonização e Reforma Agrária (INCRA) in Brazil, the Servicio Agrícola y Ganadero (SAG) in Chile, the Instituto Colombiano de Desarrollo Rural (INCODER) in Colombia, the Instituto Nacional de Desarrollo Agrario (INDA) in Ecuador, the Registro Agrario Nacional (RAN) in Mexico, the Comisión de Formalización de la Propiedad Informal (COFOPRI) in Peru, the Instituto Nacional de Colonización (INC) in Uruguay, and the Instituto Nacional de Tierras (INTi) in Venezuela. These were the lifeblood of my data collection, along with archival work. The dedicated people working at these agencies taught me volumes during my field research about the varieties of land reform, the process of land reform, and the inner workings of how reform programs are implemented and how they are hijacked or hobbled. Without the insights of many bureaucrats with their sleeves rolled up, such as Edgar Pajares (COFOPRI), Juan Alvarez (SAG), Napoleón Jaramillo (INDA), Noel Miranda (INTi), and Juan de Dios Fernández (INRA), the accounts of land reform in this book would be conceptually much thinner.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10655-0 - Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform

Michael Albertus

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Similarly vital were the experts I interviewed and engaged with during my field research throughout Latin America, among whom I would especially like to thank Carlos Balderrama, Olivier Delahaye, Román Duque, Absalón Machado, Carlos Machado, Genaro Méndez, and Esteban Sanjinés. Discussions with countless land reform beneficiaries, whose voices are often surprisingly absent from the assessments of these programs, critically helped shape my understanding and views on the long-term impacts of land reform as redistribution. I would like to thank all of those whose lives have been profoundly marked by land reform who shared their precious time and experiences with me on long bus rides, in their homes or fields, in the waiting rooms at land reform agencies, at corner stores, or in public squares. Beyond these important individuals, national statistics agencies, archives, and libraries too numerous to list augmented my data collection in Bolivia, Chile, Colombia, Ecuador, Mexico, Peru, Uruguay, Venezuela, and, of course, the United States.

Generous funding and institutional support backed the research that is foundational to this book. My fieldwork and data coding were funded by two Stanford University Graduate Research Opportunity grants, a Diversity Dissertation Research Opportunity grant from Stanford's Office of the Vice Provost for Graduate Education, an Ayacucho Foundation grant accompanied by generous institutional support from Venezuela's Instituto de Estudios Superiores de Administración as facilitated by Francisco Monaldi and Michael Penfold, Stanford's Center on International Conflict and Negotiation, and a grant from the University of Chicago's Social Sciences Division. An O'Bie Shultz Dissertation Completion grant and a predoctoral fellowship from the Stanford Institute of Economic Policy Research helped fund my final year of graduate school, allowing me to focus on my research. Larry Diamond and the Stanford Center on Democracy, Development, and the Rule of Law provided a home for me as a postdoctoral Fellow and the time to complete data collection and compilation and to start converting what was then a dissertation paper into a much more involved book project.

Able research assistance was provided by Frank Alarcón, Mark Deming, Victor Gay, and Bogdan Popescu. Frank was invaluable in gathering and compiling materials for the case studies in Chapter 8. Mark and Bogdan assiduously took on the task of coding coalitional splits between political and landed elites across the entire world since 1900 and aided in wrestling with the conceptual issues associated with applying this framework to substantive contexts that are very different from those in Latin America. We met countless times to discuss the cases, which also helped with the honing of the theoretical formulation behind elite splits. Victor happily agreed to review the formal model in Chapter 3 and generously aided in the graphical depiction of the model equilibria.

Selected parts of Chapter 6 previously appeared in my 2015 article "Explaining Patterns of Redistribution under Autocracy: The Case of Peru's Revolution from Above," *Latin American Research Review* 50(2): 107–134, © 2015

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10655-0 - Autocracy and Redistribution: The Politics of Land Reform

Michael Albertus

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgments*

xv

by the Latin American Studies Association. Related versions of some materials in Chapter 7 were published in my 2013 article “Vote Buying with Multiple Distributive Goods,” *Comparative Political Studies* 46(9): 1082–1111, doi: 10.1177/0010414012463897. Elements of Chapter 3 were published in my 2012 article “If You’re Against Them You’re with Us: The Effect of Expropriation on Autocratic Survival,” *Comparative Political Studies* 45(8): 973–1003, doi: 10.1177/0010414011428593. I thank the publishers of these journals for their permission to draw from this work.

Last, but hardly least, I thank all of my friends and family for their gracious and stalwart support. An unusually close group of friends, especially though hardly exclusively “The Club,” has long supported me, laughed with me, provided counsel, adventured with me, reminded me not to take myself too seriously, and accepted many of the crazy ideas I have had or pursued. Chelo Perales has been a lively, sage, and engaging teacher of many things Latin American since I first met her at Stanford, and she is now a great and irreplaceable friend.

I have also been incredibly lucky when it comes to family, and I dedicate this book to them. My parents, Anne and Steve, inspired me from a young age to learn and to question. They also taught through example a deep dedication to social justice and service to others. It is hard to imagine my route to the present without such constant role models and unfailing champions on my behalf. My siblings, Julie, Paul, Jim, and Daniel, have been my closest and most important companions throughout the years. They have always encouraged me to reach higher, to live a reflective and engaged life, and to laugh and have fun, and they have accompanied me time and again into the natural spaces of this world to which I have grown so attached. I am humbled to walk among them. I met my wife, Ally Stewart, at the end of graduate school at Stanford, and my life has been richer every day since because of her. Her spirit of adventure, authenticity, and enthusiasm is infectious. She has been steadfastly supportive in every way I could have imagined, and in many ways I could not have imagined. The words of a profound Machado verse that Chelo taught me are even more exciting with Ally to journey with: “[C]aminante, no hay camino, se hace camino al andar.”