Canonical Texts and Scholarly Practices

In this collection of richly documented case studies, experts in many textual traditions examine the ways in which important texts were preserved, explicated, corrected, and used for a variety of purposes. The authors describe the multiple ways in which scholars in different cultures have addressed some of the same tasks, revealing both radical differences and striking similarities in textual practices across space, time, and linguistic borders. This volume shows how much is learned when historians of scholarship, like contemporary historians of science, focus on earlier scholars’ practices, and when Western scholarly traditions are treated as part of a much larger, cross-cultural inquiry.

ANTHONY GRAFTON teaches European history at Princeton University. He is the author of numerous books and articles on the history of classical scholarship, the history of science, and the history of learning, from late antiquity to the twentieth century.

GLENN W. MOST is Professor of Greek Philology at the Scuola Normale Superiore di Pisa, Visiting Professor on the Committee on Social Thought at the University of Chicago, and External Scientific Member of the Max Planck Institute for the History of Science, Berlin. He has published numerous books and articles on classics; the history and methodology of classical studies; the classical tradition and comparative literature; modern philosophy and literature; literary theory; the history of science; and the history of art.
Canonical Texts and Scholarly Practices

A Global Comparative Approach

Edited by

ANTHONY GRAFTON and
GLENN W. MOST
Contents

List of illustrations  [page vii]
List of contributors  [ix]

How to do things with texts: An introduction  [1]
Anthony Grafton and Glenn W. Most

1 Reliable books: Islamic law, canonization, and manuscripts in the
Ottoman Empire (sixteenth to eighteenth centuries)  [14]
Guy Burak

2 Obscurity  [34]
Ineke Sluiter

3 Allegoresis and etymology  [52]
Glenn W. Most

4 Classifying the Rigveda on the basis of ritual usage: The deity-of-
the-formula system  [75]
Paolo Visigalli

5 Maryādām Ullaṅghya: The boundaries of interpretation in early
modern India  [90]
Christopher Minkowski

6 Making sense of Suetonius in the twelfth century  [110]
Robert A. Kaster

7 From philology to philosophy: Zhu Xi as a
reader-annotator  [136]
Lianbin Dai

8 Gods on clay: Ancient Near Eastern scholarly practices and the
history of religions  [164]
Aaron Tugendhaft

9 An unknown medieval Coptic Hebraism? On a momentous
junction of Jewish and Coptic biblical studies  [183]
Ronny Vollandt
Contents

10 Picturing as practice: Placing a square above a square in the central Middle Ages [200]
   Megan C. McNamee

11 Inimitable sources: Canonical texts and rhetorical theory in the Greek, Latin, Arabic, and Hebrew Traditions [224]
   Filippomaria Pontani

12 Excerpts versus fragments: Deconstructions and reconstitutions of the Excerpta Constantiniana [253]
   András Németh

13 Johann Buxtorf makes a notebook [275]
   Anthony Grafton and Joanna Weinberg

14 World bibliographies: Libraries and the reorganization of knowledge in Late Renaissance Europe [299]
   Paola Molino

Bibliography [323]
Indexes
   Manuscripts index [379]
   Names index [381]
   Subject index [387]
Illustrations

1.1 A copy of the collection of rulings issued by the seventeenth-century chief imperial jurist Minḳârîzâde. Istanbul, Süleymaniye Library, MS Hekimoğlu 421.

1.2 A list of reliable books from the notebook of a seventeenth-century anonymous jurist. Istanbul, Süleymaniye Library, MS Fazıl Ahmed Paşa 1581-1, 104b.

2.1 Typology of Obscurity

6.1 Sample stemma

6.2 Stemma of the family γ

6.3 Stemma of the family β

6.4 Durham, Cathedral Library C.III.18 (D) fol. 52v

6.5 Oxford, Bodleian Library Lat. class. d. 39 (C) fol. 5v


7.2 Examination of Variants in Han Yu’s Writings (Changli xiansheng ji kaoyi, 1229; reproduced in the Zhonghua zaizao shanben [Zhu Xi 2006a]). National Library of China, Beijing.

7.3 The Great Learning in Chapters and Verses (Daxue zhangju, 1252), in which Zhu Xi clearly noted his amendment to the commentary. National Library of China, Beijing.


9.1 The opening of the book of Genesis with interlinear and marginal apparatus, Paris, BnF, MS Ar. 1, fol. 3v
List of illustrations

10.1 London, British Library, Harley MS 2772, fol. 46r [201]
10.2 London, British Library, Harley MS 2772, fol. 46r, detail [203]
10.3 Bern, Burgerbibliothek, MS 101, fol. 26r [211]
10.4 Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Auct. T. 2. 27, fol. 14v [213]
10.5 Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS 10146, fol. 19v [214]
10.6 Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS lat. 7299, fol. 31v [217]
10.7 Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS lat. 7299, fol. 31v (detail) [218]
12.1 Title page of Polybius, Tours 980, fol. 256v [264]
12.2 Orsini's autograph copy of the first unpublished fragment of Polybius from the collection On Embassies of the Romans, Vat. gr. 1419, fol. 1r [268]
13.1 Buxtorf's notes on Edom, Basel, Öffentliche Bibliothek, MS A XII 20 [280]
13.2 Buxtorf pulls a dictum from the Talmud, Basel, Öffentliche Bibliothek, MS A XII 20 [281]
13.3 Buxtorf reads the Talmud with its commentaries, Basel, Öffentliche Bibliothek, MS A XII 20 [284]
13.4 Buxtorf takes extracts from Bahya, Basel, Öffentliche Bibliothek, MS A XII 20 [287]
13.5 Buxtorf converses with a Jew, Basel, Öffentliche Bibliothek, MS A XII 20 [290]
13.6 Buxtorf's copy of de Pomis, Basel, Öffentliche Bibliothek, FA IV 23 [295]
14.1 Cover page of the copy of the catalog dedicated to the archduke Karl von Innerösterreich in 1576, in which both the meaning of the synopsis and the goal of the catalog are summarized in the drawing (ÖNB, MS 8680*). [304]
14.2 A sample page from Blotius's catalog with the signature on the left side, the title in the middle, and the notes on the edition on the right side (ÖNB, MS 12582, fol. 7v, p. 2 of the old pagination). [309]
Contributors

Guy Burak is the Middle Eastern and Islamic Studies Librarian at the Elmer Bobst Library at New York University. He is the author of The Second Formation of Islamic Law: The Hanafi School of Law in the Early Modern Ottoman Empire (Cambridge University Press, 2015). He is interested in legal history and the textuality of the post-Mongol Islamic east.

Lianbin Dai is currently a postdoctoral fellow in the University of Alberta Museums, Canada. He received his D.Phil degree from the University of Oxford and is the author of several journal articles and book chapters focusing on book culture and textual scholarship in late imperial China (1368–1911).

Anthony Grafton teaches European history at Princeton University. He studied at the University of Chicago and University College London. His books include Joseph Scaliger (Oxford: 1983–93), The Culture of Correction in Renaissance Europe (London: 2011), and, with Joanna Weinberg, “I have always loved the holy tongue”: Isaac Casaubon, the Jews, and a Forgotten Chapter in Renaissance Scholarship (2011).

Robert A. Kaster is Professor of Classics and Kennedy Foundation Professor of Latin Language and Literature at Princeton University. He has written on Latin textual criticism and produced several critical editions of classical Latin texts, as well as books and articles on ancient education, the understanding of the emotions in antiquity, and other topics.

Megan C. McNamee received her PhD in the History of Art from the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor (2015). She is currently the A. W. Mellon Postdoctoral Fellow at The Center for Advanced Study in the Visual Arts in Washington, DC (2016–18). Her work explores period-specific notions of perception, cognition, and strategies of representation in the Middle Ages, with a focus on intersections between education and aesthetics.

Christopher Minkowski is Boden Professor of Sanskrit at the University of Oxford. His current research is focused on the intellectual and social history of the early modern Indian world, with special reference to Brahman
List of contributors

authors and scholars who specialized in the astral sciences and in the Vedic tradition. He is also interested in the comparative history of philology.

Paola Molino is a postdoctoral research fellow at the Austrian Historical Institute in Rome. She is interested in the history of libraries and classification in the early modern world, the history of information, and Renaissance scholarship. She is the author of L’Impero di carta: Vienna, una biblioteca un bibliotecario (Rome: Viella, 2015) and coauthor with Katrin Keller of the monograph Die Fuggerzeitungen im Kontext: Zeitungssammlungen im Alten Reich und in Italien (Vienna: Böhlau, 2015).

Glenn W. Most is Professor of Greek Philology at the Scuola Normale Superiore di Pisa, a frequent Visiting Professor in the Committee on Social Thought at the University of Chicago, and an External Scientific Member of the Max Planck Institute for the History of Science in Berlin. He has published numerous books and articles on Greek and Latin classics, on the history and methodology of classical studies, on the classical tradition and comparative literature, on modern philosophy and literature, on literary theory, and on the history of art.

András Németh is currently a curator of Greek manuscripts in the Vatican Apostolic Library; previously he was a research scholar at the Max Planck Institute for the History of Science in Berlin. His main focus of research is on the cultural history of tenth-century Byzantium and the reception of Greek manuscripts in Renaissance libraries. His monograph on the Byzantine historical excerpts of Constantine VII is forthcoming from Cambridge University Press.

Filippomaria Pontani is Associate Professor of Classical Philology at the University of Venice “Ca’ Foscari.” While primarily concerned with issues of manuscript transmission, he is currently editing the ancient and medieval scholia to Homer’s Odyssey, and he has published extensively on Greek and Latin poetry and prose, as well as on Byzantine, humanist, and modern Greek literature.

Ineke Sluiter is Professor of Greek at Leiden University. She has published widely on ancient and medieval ideas on language, in particular the grammatical, rhetorical, philological, and commentary traditions. She is cofounder and editor of the Penn-Leiden Colloquia on Ancient Values. Currently, she is academic director and Principal Investigator of the research agenda on “Anchoring Innovation” of OIKOS, the Dutch National Research School in Classical Studies.
List of contributors

Aaron Tugendhaft is Collegiate Assistant Professor of the Humanities and Harper Fellow in the Society of Fellows in the Liberal Arts at the University of Chicago. He is the editor, with Josh Ellenbogen, of Idol Anxiety (Stanford University Press, 2011) and the author of several articles on the relationship between myth and politics in the ancient world. In 2013 he was awarded the Jonas Greenfield Prize for Younger Semitists by the American Oriental Society.

Paolo Visigalli holds a Ph.D. in South Asian Studies from the University of Cambridge and is currently a postdoctoral research fellow at the Ludwig Maximilian University, Munich. His research focuses on ancient Indian literature, both Brahmanical and Buddhist sources. He is particularly interested in early speculations on language and ritual.

Ronny Vollandt is a Professor of Jewish Studies at the Ludwig Maximilian University, Munich. He received his Ph.D. at the University of Cambridge and is the author of several articles and Arabic Versions of the Pentateuch: A Comparative Study of Jewish, Christian, and Muslim Sources (Leiden: Brill, 2015), all focused on various aspects of the translation, transmission, and study of the Bible in Arabic and the transmission of scriptural knowledge among Jewish, Christian, and Muslim communities.

Joanna Weinberg is Professor of early modern Jewish history and rabbinics at the University of Oxford and Catherine Lewis Fellow in rabbinics at the Oxford Centre for Hebrew and Jewish Studies. She has produced annotated translations of the writings of the sixteenth-century Jewish historiographer Azariah de’ Rossi. With Anthony Grafton she has published “I have always loved the holy tongue”: Isaac Casaubon, the Jews, and a Forgotten Chapter in Renaissance Scholarship (Harvard, 2011)