THE HUMAN RIGHTS-BASED APPROACH TO CARBON FINANCE

This book explores the topical and contentious issue of the human rights risks associated with carbon projects, especially in developing countries. It outlines a human rights-based approach to carbon finance as a functional framework for mainstreaming human rights into the design, approval, finance and implementation of carbon projects. It also describes the nature and scope of carbon projects, available legal options for their financing and key human rights issues at stake in their planning and execution. Written in a user-friendly style, the proposal for a rightsbased due-diligence framework through which human rights risks can be anticipated and addressed makes this book relevant to all stakeholders in carbon, energy and environmental investments and projects.

DAMILOLA S. OLAWUYI is a senior lecturer in law and director of the Institute for Oil, Gas, Energy, Environment and Sustainable Development at Afe Babalola University, Nigeria. He also provides legal advice and services as an energy lawyer with the leading global law firm Norton Rose Fulbright Canada LLP. Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-10551-5 - The Human Rights - Based Approach to Carbon Finance Damilola S. Olawuyi Frontmatter More information

THE HUMAN RIGHTS-BASED APPROACH TO CARBON FINANCE

DAMILOLA S. OLAWUYI

Barrister and Solicitor, Norton Rose Fulbright Canada LLP Senior Lecturer and Institute Director, Afe Babalola University, Nigeria





University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107105515

© Damilola S. Olawuyi 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Olawuyi, Damilola S. (Damilola Sunday), 1983– author. The human rights-based approach to carbon finance / Damilola S Olawuyi, Barrister and Solicitor, Norton Rose Fulbright Canada LLP, Senior Lecturer and Institute Director, Afe

Babalola University, Nigeria. Cambridge, United Kingdom : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Based on author's thesis

(doctoral – University of Oxford, 2013) issued under title: The human rights based approach to climate change mitigation.

LCCN 2016003558 | ISBN 9781107105515 (hardback) LCSH: Carbon dioxide mitigation – Law and legislation. | Carbon offsetting – Law and legislation. | Law and economic development. | International law and human rights. LCC K3593.5.C37 O423 2016 | DDC 344.04/633–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2016003558

ISBN 978-1-107-10551-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To the memory of my mother, Victoria Ebunlomo Olawuyi

CONTENTS

Forewordpage xiiiPreface and acknowledgementsxviiList of abbreviationsxx

PART I Carbon projects and human rights: introductory context and principles 1

1 Introduction 3

1.1	Clin	nate cha	inge, carbon finance and human rights:	
	back	ground	and factual context 5	
	1.1.1	Human	rights risks in carbon projects: calls for change	14
	1.1.2	Emerger	nce of rights-based approaches to climate	
		change	17	
1.2	Scop	oe, defir	itions and structure 23	
	1.2.1	Scope	23	
	1.2.2	Definiti	on of key concepts 25	
		1.2.2.1	Human rights 25	
		1.2.2.2	Environment 28	
		1.2.2.3	Climate change and carbon finance mechanisms 29	
		1.2.2.4	Sustainable development 46	
		1.2.2.5	UN resolutions and soft law 52	
	1.2.3	Structur	e of the book 57	
	1.2.4	Conclus	ion 62	
Car	bon j	projects	and human rights struggles 63	
2.1	Intro	oductio	n 63	
	2.1.1	Design a	and development of carbon projects: example of	

the CDM project cycle 63

2.1.1.1 Project identification and scoping 66

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

2

viii

CONTENTS

		2.1.1.2	Host government approval 68	
		2.1.1.3	Project design 69	
		2.1.1.4	Project verification and validation 70	
		2.1.1.5	Project registration 71	
		2.1.1.6	Project implementation, monitoring, verific and credit issuance 72	ation
	2.1.	2 Evaluat	ion of the project approval process 73	
	fro 2.2.	m appro 1 The Ag	n projects violate human rights: lesson ved CDM projects 75 uan biogas project in Honduras 76 rale-Okpai CDM project in Nigeria 77	15
			rro Blanco hydroelectric power plant project	
	2.2.	in Pana		
	2.2.	4 REDD+	- projects 86	
	an 2.3. 2.3. 2.3. 2.3. 2.3. 2.3. 2.3.	evaluation 1 Forced 2 Loss of 3 Loss of 4 Loss of 5 Health 6 Inequal communication 7 Loss of 2.3.7.1 2.3.7.2	displacement and the right to property 9 benefits of culture and tradition 95 subsistence rights 98 life 102 concerns 104 ities and discrimination against minority nities and vulnerable groups 107 consultative/participatory rights 111 Right to information 111 Participation 120 Participation in environmental treaties	0 124
			to justice 130	
	2.4 Co	nclusion	: bringing human rights to the table	138
	PART I		nstreaming human rights in the rnational climate change regime	141
3	The con	ncept of	mainstreaming in international law	143
	3.1 Int	roductio	n 143	
		e	hts mainstreaming: a background of human rights mainstreaming 151	144

4

	CONTENTS	
3.3	Legal and theoretical basis for human rights mainstreaming 156 3.3.1 Principle of systemic integration in international law 156 3.3.2 Legal transplant theory/inter-doctrinal legal transplants 163	
	3.3.3 Participatory Development Theory1673.3.4 Full belly thesis172	
3.4	Theoretical critiques of the human rights mainstream paradigm 176 3.4.1 Proliferation debates 177 3.4.2 Novelty or duplication – redundancy debates 182 3.4.3 Neo-liberalism and human rights mainstreaming 184 3.4.4 Conflicts of human rights 191	
3.5	Conclusion 195	
	human rights mainstream paradigm and the question pproach 197	
4.1	Introduction 197	
4.2	Linking human rights and climate change: suggested approaches 198 4.2.1 Substantive human rights approach 200 4.2.1.1 Re-interpreting existing rights: the indirect approach 201 4.2.1.2 The new human rights approach 210 4.2.1.3 Climate change and human rights 214 4.2.2 Procedural rights approach: the human rights-based approach 217	
	4.2.2.1 Justifications 2174.2.2.2 The United Nations human rights-based approach 222	
4.3	Epistemic debates on the human rights-based approach to carbon finance 230 4.3.1 Can outsiders interpret and mainstream human rights? 230 4.3.2 Question of resources 235 4.3.3 Lack of an operational framework or precedence 236	
4.4	Conclusion 237	

ix

x

The human rights-based approach to PART III carbon finance: nature, elements and content 239 5 Normative contents/elements of the human rights-based approach 241 5.1 Introduction 241 5.2 Elements of the HRBA 242 5.2.1 Access to information 242 5.2.1.1 Contents of the right to information 242 5.2.2 Participation 255 5.2.2.1 Elements of participation 256 5.2.2.2 Taking part 256 5.2.2.3 Influencing 271 5.2.3 Non-discrimination, equality and prioritization of vulnerable groups 272 Elements of equality and 5.2.3.1 non-discrimination 273 5.2.4 Accountability 280 5.2.4.1 Elements/indicators of accountability 283 5.2.4.2 Monitoring project threshold: example of the World Bank Inspection Panel 289 5.2.5 Access to justice 296 5.2.5.1 Elements of access 297 5.3 Conclusion 309 6 Legal framework for implementing the human rights-based approach to carbon finance 311 6.1 Introduction 311 6.2 Minimum legal threshold for project approval 311 6.2.1 Pre-project eligibility screen 313 6.2.2 Sustainable development screen 314 6.2.3 Human rights impact assessment 322 6.2.4 Information disclosure system 327 6.2.5 Stakeholder identification and consultation 330 6.2.6 Project review mechanisms 333 6.3 Conclusion 335

CONTENTS

CONTENTS

xi

- 7 Mobilizing structures: institutional framework for implementing the human rights-based approach to carbon finance 337
 - 7.1 Introduction 337
 - 7.2 Institutional framework 338
 - 7.2.1 Human rights and climate change lead agency 338
 - 7.2.2 Reformed supervisory boards 343
 - 7.2.3 Project review panel 346

7.2.4 Monitoring institution or enforcement committee 350

- 7.2.4.1 Reformed compliance architecture 350
- 7.2.4.2 Public complaints branch 352
- 7.3 Conclusion 353

PART IV From theory to practice: practical challenges, paradoxes and potentials of a human rights-based approach to carbon finance 355

- 8 Making mainstreaming work: a three-step approach to implementation 357
 - 8.1 Introduction 357
 - 8.2 Three-step approach for mainstreaming human rights norms into the international climate change regime 357
 - 8.2.1 Reflecting human rights language in the international climate change regime 358
 - 8.2.2 Rights-based modalities and rules for project approval 361
 - 8.2.2.1 Participation guidelines or directives for project participants 362
 - 8.2.2.2 Internal control and due diligence guidance for project participants 365
 - 8.2.3 Carbon finance certification scheme 367
 - 8.3 Conclusion 370
- 9 Minding the gap: practical paradoxes and barriers to the adoption of a human rights-based approach to carbon finance 371

xii

- CONTENTS
- 9.1 Introduction 371
- 9.2 Practical barriers to a rights-based reform of the international climate change regime 371
 9.2.1 Political will 371
 - 9.2.2 Negotiation blocs and alignments 375
 - 9.2.3 Unresolved dilemmas and regime uncertainties 379
- 9.3 Conclusion 381
- 10 Implementing a human rights-based approach to carbon finance: summary for policymakers 383
 - 10.1 Summary 383
 - 10.2 Recommendations 387
 - 10.2.1 Integrate robust human rights provisions 388
 - 10.2.2 Redefine vulnerability 389
 - 10.2.3 Ensure equity and fairness 391
 - 10.2.4 Clarify the roles of responsible business cultures and corporate human rights risk management policies 393
 - 10.3 Further research 395

Index 397

FOREWORD

This book is about the big issue in the transition to sustainability – the linking of equity with sustainability. No longer is it tolerable to focus only on environmental impact. Development must be approached and financed through the triple lens of environmental, social and economic sustainability.

The message is one which courts will have to increasingly address, whether they are enforcing laws which governments have enacted, enforcing European Union law against their domestic governments or, more innovatively, finding in general domestic principles a basis for ordering further governmental action.

The UK Supreme Court recently made a mandatory order that the secretary of state prepare new air quality plans under Article 23(1) of Directive 2008/50/EC in accordance with a defined timetable to lead to revised plans being submitted to the European Commission not later than 31 December 2015. This followed the United Kingdom's failure to reduce nitrogen dioxide levels to the levels prescribed by the Directive. A court in The Hague recently held that plans by the Dutch government to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by 2020 by only 14–17 per cent compared to 1990 levels were unlawful under the general law of tort, having regard to the scale of the threat posed by such emissions, and that the Dutch government should instead reduce emissions by at least 25 per cent by the end of 2020. Its reasoning was expressly inspired by general constitutional, international legal and human rights principles and by its conviction that, as an industrialized country, the Netherlands must contribute towards the solution of a worldwide problem.

The essential background to the present book is Dr Damilola S. Olawuyi's doctoral degree in energy and environmental law from the University of Oxford, United Kingdom, and his extensive international experience as an academic and legal practitioner. The work is an innovative and valuable study of the human rights implications of climate change and carbon projects. Its starting point, supported by examples, is

xiii

xiv

FOREWORD

that development projects can violate human rights – in some cases even though these may have been conceived and supported in order to reduce carbon emissions. His thesis is that, what is required under international and national law is an approach recognizing human rights considerations at the heart of any development project.

Dr Olawuyi supports the view that all human rights – political, civil, social, cultural and economic – are equal in importance and none can be fully enjoyed without the others: 'without a belly full of food and other vital needs, human rights and fundamental freedoms become meaningless'.¹ But, at the same time, there needs to be 'a holistic approach that mainstreams human rights norms into environmental planning to avoid situations whereby governmental policies or project, for example in the areas of climate change mitigation impact, threaten social, economic and cultural rights'.²

The thread running through the book is human rights mainstreaming – the concept of embedding human rights norms in the design, finance and implementation of carbon projects, advocated by the United Nations for nearly twenty years (and echoed recently in the Pope's encyclical 'Laudato Si' – Care of our common home' addressed to 'every person living on this planet'). Rather than an approach involving the recognition or expansion of substantive rights, Dr Damilola Olawuyi focuses on a procedural approach to the achievement of such integration – better access to information, wider public participation, greater attention to the needs to ensure equality and avoid discrimination, improved accountability and monitoring, always backed by access to justice.

The book discusses what this means in practical terms – an expanded role for bodies presently engaged in screening carbon projects, a requirement for a specific human rights impact assessment, review mechanisms, better governance and compliance and complaints committees.

Dr Damilola Olawuyi has written a clear, well-informed and welldocumented work, in a field which should and does engage all of us evermore. If the world continues as it is, there may, as a commentator quoted in one footnote observes, come a time when the only habitable place is the Antarctic.³ This study will stimulate thinking not only about how to avoid that drastic infringement of all our human rights but about

¹ See Chapter 3, where Dr Olawuyi evaluates and reviews the full belly thesis.

² Dr Olawuyi discusses the potentials and paradoxes of mainstreaming human rights to climate governance in Chapter 4.

³ See Chapter 1, note 6.

FOREWORD

a whole range of potential infringements which carbon projects threaten in our present everyday existence. The author's skill and initiative in researching and writing it are to be commended. It will be an important stimulus for governments, peoples, industrial, commercial and nongovernmental organizations worldwide involved in or affected by carbon and other environmental projects.

> The Right Honourable the Lord Jonathan Hugh Mance Justice of the Supreme Court of the United Kingdom Chair, International Law Association

xv

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Over the last decade, the effects of an unprecedented rise in global temperature caused by climate change, on the enjoyment of human rights, especially the right to life, have been subjects of intensive scholarly attention. Many literatures have been espoused on the need for governments, business enterprises and other key stakeholders to adopt policy measures aimed at combating climate change. However, recent findings show that climate change response measures and projects, particularly clean development mechanism (CDM) and multilateral REDD+ (Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation together with forest conservation, sustainable forest management and enhancement of carbon stocks), are in turn producing, arguably, more serious human rights concerns. While the direct impacts of climate change on human rights have received enormous attention, issues relating to the secondary impacts of climate change responses and projects on human rights, have yet to receive a book-length, exhaustive and rigorous exposition and analysis. This book is an attempt to fill that gap.

This book examines the negative implications and impacts of projects designed to combat climate change ('carbon projects'), on the effective enjoyment of fundamental human rights. It reviews growing evidence that carbon projects currently produce serious human rights concerns, especially in developing countries. The main topics covered lay at the heart of contemporary debates on the impacts of climate change on human rights and larger debates on the need to recognize and reinforce the synergies between human rights and climate change in designing climate change responses.

The ten chapters of the book examine and discuss legal and institutional frameworks required to incorporate human rights norms and safeguards into the design, approval, finance and implementation of carbon projects, specifically the CDM, REDD+ and green climate funds, to address negative human rights impacts and consequences. Despite growing recognition that carbon projects may foster human rights violations, most especially the

xvii

xviii

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

direct recognition by the 2010 Cancun climate conference that countries 'should fully respect human rights in all climate change related actions', legal and institutional frameworks required to anticipate, mitigate and prevent these human rights impacts of carbon projects have not been coherently developed and communicated.

Overall, the ultimate aim of the book is to answer the question of 'how', that is, how can the international climate change regime be organized to fully integrate and mainstream human rights safeguards and considerations into the design, approval, finance and implementation of carbon projects to protect the rights of affected peoples and communities? The book discusses the guiding principles of a human rights-based approach to carbon finance as a legal and institutional framework for mainstreaming human rights principles into the design, approval, finance and implementation of carbon projects. The book also takes a comprehensive, highly analytical approach to discuss how lessons learned from the implementation of select climate finance mechanisms, specifically CDM and REDD+, may inform thoughts on practical and institutional requirements for mainstreaming human rights principles into the international climate change regime in general.

This book is prepared in a user-friendly style to enhance its utility among its primary audience, namely environmental and human rights administrators, students, lawyers, bankers, auditors, government representatives, judges, analysts, pundits, international negotiators and policy leaders. It provides environmental and human rights stakeholders from all backgrounds with a toolkit and operational framework to understand, digest and appreciate the legal and institutional framework for reflecting human rights norms in climate actions and projects.

In examining these issues, this book takes a comparative approach that benefits immensely from the author's research, professional and teaching experience acquired over the years while working on environmental issues in Nigeria, Kenya, Canada, Australia, India, China, United States, United Kingdom, Switzerland, Spain, Denmark, France and Italy. It offers discussions and analyses of concepts, instruments and principles on climate change and human rights, that are key to a rights-based approach to the design, approval, finance and implementation of carbon projects. A discussion of diverse institutions that could aid the systemic integration and stronger legal partnerships between human rights and climate change, under a rights-based approach, is also provided in the book.

It remains for me to register my profound gratitude to many helping hands, without whom the publication of this book would not have been

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

possible. First and foremost, my thanks and appreciation go to God the Almighty for the successful publication of this book. Second, my profound gratitude goes to Dr Andrew Shacknove and Professor Alastair R Lucas Q.C., who supervised my doctoral thesis at the University of Oxford – the research work that culminated in the publication of this book. I am highly indebted to them for their scholarly guidance, mentoring and intellectual generosity in the course of my research. Furthermore, I owe a debt of gratitude to Professor Dapo Akande and Professor Edwin Peel for their constructive comments and encouragements during my academic voyage at Oxford. I am also indebted to Professor Catherine Redgwell and Professor Phillipe Cullet for providing insightful and helpful comments during my doctoral thesis examination. Their constructive criticisms and suggestions greatly enhanced the framing of this book.

I also appreciate the kind motivation and support of the president and founder of Afe Babalola University, Aare Afe Babalola, OFR, CON, SAN, FNIALS, FCIArb., LLD, who has taken unparalleled personal interests in my professional development. Aare Afe Babalola's journey and global achievements provide reinforcing pillars and instructive pathways that one could only aspire to follow.

Furthermore, I am especially indebted to everyone at Norton Rose Fulbright Canada LLP, for their exceptional support and kind mentoring over the years. I would also like to extend a word of gratitude to Orieji Onuma and Omolola Olarinde for providing careful and thoughtful research assistance, and to my legal assistants, Calvin Jim, Curtis Snow, Moronkeji Kolawole and Tosin Adewunmi, who have all worked tirelessly for the success of this book.

Finally, I would like to thank my dear wife Oluwabunmi, and my twin girls, Titilayo and Oluwatoni for their love, dedication and inspiration. Thanks are also due to my exceptional students at the College of Law, Afe Babalola University, whose class contributions and brilliant ideas served as timely seeds that blossomed into this book. I thank you all for your support and kindness, and I commit this book to your scholastic minds.

I have endeavoured to state the position of the law as of 30 June 2015, although I have been able to take into account subsequent developments in one or two instances.

Damilola S. Olawuyi Ado Ekiti, June 2015

xix

ABBREVIATIONS

ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
AfCHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples Rights
ATCA	United States Aliens Torts Act
ATI	Access to Information
BAP	Bali Action Plan
CDM	Clean Development Mechanism
CDM EB	Executive Board of the Clean Development Mechanism
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against
	Women
CER	Certified Emissions Reductions
CERD	Convention on Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CFCs	Chlorofluorocarbons
CFU	Carbon Finance Unit
COP	Conference of the Parties
CSR	Corporate social responsibility
DfNS	Debt for Nature Swaps
DNA	Designated National Authority
DOE	Designated Operational Entity
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
EP	Equator Principles
ERPA	Emissions Reduction Purchase Agreement
ERU	Emission Reduction Unit
ET	Emissions Trading
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FCPF	Forest Carbon Partnership Facility
FPIC	Free Prior Informed Consent
GCF	Green Climate Fund
GEF	Global Environment Facility
GHGs	Green House Gases
GWP	Global Warming Potential
HFCs	Hydrofluorocarbons

CAMBRIDGE

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

xxi

HRBA HRCU HRE HRIA ICC ICCPR ICERD	Human Rights-Based Approach Human Rights And Climate Change Unit Human Rights Education Human Rights Impact Assessment Inuit Circumpolar Conference International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial
ICERD	Discrimination
ICESCR ICJ IFC	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights International Court of Justice International Finance Corporation
ILC ILO	International Law Commission International Labour Organization
ILO IMF	International Monetary Fund
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
IUCN	International Union for Conservation of Nature
II	Joint Implementation
KPCS	Kimberley Process Certification Scheme
LDC	Least Developed Countries
LDCF	Least Developed Country Fund
MOP	Meeting of the Parties
NGOs	Non Governmental Organizations
NIMBY	Not-in-My-Backyard
ODA	Official Development Assistance
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
PCB	Public Complaints Branch
PDD	Project Design Document
PDT	Participation Development Theory
PFCs	Perfluorocarbons
PRTR	Protocol UNECE Kiev Protocol on Pollutant Release and Transfer
	Registers
REDD	Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation
REDD+	REDD together with sustainable forest management and enhancement
	of carbon stocks
RTD	Right to Development
SCCF	Special Climate Change Fund
SF6	Sulphur Hexafluoride
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UNDG	United Nations Development Group
UNDRIP	United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples
UNECE	United Nations Economic Commission for Europe
UNEP	United Nations Environmental Programme

xxii	LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNHRC	United Nations Human Rights Council
WBIP	World Bank Inspection Panel
WWF	World Wildlife Fund