

Labour in Global Value Chains in Asia

This book brings together a set of studies on labour conditions in GVCs in a variety of sectors—ranging from labour-intensive sectors like garments, fresh fruits, and tourism, to medium- and high-technology sectors like automobiles, electronics and telecom, and knowledge-intensive sectors (IT software services). The studies span a number of countries across Asia—Bangladesh, Cambodia, China, India, Indonesia, Sri Lanka and Vietnam.

While pointing out that participation in GVCs has provided many benefits to Asia—which include employment, poverty reduction and women's employment, the book notes that there is a high incidence of precarious employment in low-knowledge sectors, along with new forms of Taylorism. The book also documents the uneven distribution of benefits along the value chain, the uneven patterns of the knowledge flows associated with out-sourcing and the contested nature of the impact of lead-firm business practices on wages and employment and work conditions in supplier countries, alongside the benefits of upgrading and job enlargement that have accompanied these same processes.

In trying to identify spaces for progressive action and policies in the current GVC-linked global work environment, the book goes against the grain in searching for an alternative to laissez faire forms of globalization.

Dev Nathan is Visiting Professor at the Institute for Human Development, New Delhi, and Visiting Research Fellow at the Center on Globalization, Governance and Competitiveness at Duke University, USA. He is an economist, and his main research interests are global value chains, labour conditions, rural and indigenous peoples' development, and gender issues.

Meenu Tewari is Associate Professor of Economic and International Development at the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill. Her research focuses on the political economy of development, industrialization, and on institutional reform in the public and urban sectors. She is particularly interested in the changing nature of work in rapidly urbanizing low-income economies, and in the challenge of skill formation and upgrading within regional and global production networks.

Sandip Sarkar is Professor at the Institute for Human Development, New Delhi. He has previous working experience with research institutes like Institute of Economic Growth and Institute for Studies in Industrial Development. His areas of research interest are industry, poverty, labour and employment, on which he has experience of more than two decades.



Development Trajectories in Global Value Chains

A feature of the current phase of globalization is the outsourcing of production tasks and services across borders, and increasing organization of production and trade through global value chains (GVCs), global commodity chains (GCCs), and global production networks (GPNs). With a large and growing literature on GVCs, GCCs, and GPNs, this series is distinguished by its focus on the implications of these new production systems for economic, social and regional development.

This series publishes a wide range of theoretical, methodological and empirical works, both research monographs and edited volumes, dealing with crucial issues of transformation in the global economy. How do GVCs change the ways in which lead and supplier firms shape regional and international economies? How do they affect local and regional development trajectories, and what implications do they have for workers and their communities? How is the organization of value chains changing and how are these emerging forms contested as more traditional structures of North-South trade are complemented and transformed by emerging South-South lead firms, investments, and trading links? How does the large-scale entry of women into value chain production impact on gender relations? What opportunities and limits do GVCs create for economic and social upgrading and innovation? In what ways are GVCs changing the nature of work and the role of labour in the global economy? And how might the increasing focus on logistics management, financialization, or social standards and compliance portend important developments in the structure of regional economies?

The series includes contributions from many disciplines and interdisciplinary fields and approaches related to GVC analysis, including GCCs and GPNs, and is particularly focused on theoretically innovative and informed works that are grounded in the empirics of development related to these approaches. Through their focus on the changing organizational forms, governance systems, and production relations, volumes in this series contribute to on-going conversations about theories of development and development policy in the contemporary era of globalization.

Series editors

Stephanie Barrientos is Professor of Global Development at the Global Development Institute, University of Manchester.

Gary Gereffi is Professor of Sociology and Director of the Center on Globalization, Governance and Competitiveness, Duke University.

Dev Nathan is Visiting Professor at the Institute for Human Development, New Delhi, and Visiting Research Fellow at the Center on Globalization, Governance and Competitiveness, Duke University.

John Pickles is Earl N. Phillips Distinguished Professor of International Studies at the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill.



Endorsements

"... an impressive number of case studies from several Asian countries to show how their specialized location in GVCs as 'supplier countries', different distribution of surplus along those chains and varying governance types structure... wages, employment relations and working conditions... This link between an increasingly important type of participation in international trade and conditions in the labor market and thus the process of development in general throws much-needed light on a topical subject of great concern in Asia and elsewhere."

Pranab Bardhan, Professor of Economics, University of California, Berkeley

"...a conceptually coherent and empirically rich assessment of the complex and shifting position of labour in GVCs in Asia ... very effectively uses different GVC governance types as an organising frame, but also gives full weight to the place-specific or 'horizontal' factors that powerfully shape the outcomes and opportunities for labour in GVCs ... an exciting contribution which deserves a wide readership across the field of GVC/global production network research and beyond."

Neil Coe, Professor of Geography, National University of Singapore

"This important book demonstrates... that GVCs are not delivering a fair share of the economic benefits to workers and that private compliance approaches have failed. It contributes to a better understanding of the underlying causes, which should help governments, companies and others interested in positively influencing working conditions in GVCs to distinguish worker-centered strategies that can lead to genuine change from mere window-dressing."

Jenny Holdcroft, Policy Director, IndustriALL Global Union

"...a major contribution to knowledge of how GVCs work, the wage and skill patterns that they create, the conditions under which gains for labour can be maximized and the ways in which the actors concerned are responding. It is required reading for anyone who wants to get behind the rhetoric of the global economy to understand the realities on the ground."

Gerry Rodgers, Former Director, International Institute of Labour Studies, Geneva



Labour in Global Value Chains in Asia

Edited by
Dev Nathan
Meenu Tewari
Sandip Sarkar







CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, vic 3207, Australia 4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India 79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107103740

© Institute for Human Development 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

Printed in India

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data

Names: Nathan, Dev, editor. | Tewari, Meenu, editor. | Sarkar, Sandip, 1961-editor.

Title: Labour in global value chains in Asia / edited by Dev Nathan, Meenu Tewari, Sandip Sarkar.

Description: Cambridge, UK; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016002557 | ISBN 9781107103740 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Labor market--Asia. | Labor--Asia. | Industries--Asia. |

Economic development--Asia. | Asia--Commerce.

Classification: LCC HD5811.85.A6.L324 2016 | DDC 331.1095--dc23 LC record available at http://lccn.loc.gov/2016002557

ISBN 978-1-107-10374-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Figu	res	ix
Tabl	les	x
Fore	word – Alakh N. Sharma	xiii
Prefe	ace	xiv
Ackı	nowledgements	xvi
Intr	oduction	
1.	Introduction – Dev Nathan, Meenu Tewari and Sandip Sarkar	3
Cap	tive Governance	
2.	Achieving Better Work for Apparel Workers in Asia – Arianna Rossi	31
3.	Improving Wages and Working Conditions in the Bangladesh Garment Sector: The Role of Horizontal and Vertical Relations – Nazneen Ahmed and Dev Nathan	51
4.	Bargaining in Garment GVCs: The Asia Floor Wage – Anannya Bhattacharjee and Ashim Roy	78
5.	Fresh Produce Markets, Standards, and Dynamics of Labour: Grapes in India – <i>Sukhpal Singh</i>	94
6.	The 'Zero-Fee' Tour: Price Competition and Chain Downgrading in Chinese Tourism – <i>Yang Fuquan, Yu Yin and Dev Nathan</i>	119
7.	Restricting Competition to Reduce Poverty: Impact of the Tourism Value Chain in an Upland Economy in China – Yang Fuquan, Yu Xiaogang, Yu Yin, Govind Kelkar and Dev Nathan	139
8.	Restructuring of Post-crisis GVCs: Tourism in Bali, Indonesia – Girish Nanda and Keith Hargreaves	154
9.	Dynamics of Labour-intensive Clusters in China: Wage Costs and Moving Inland – <i>Lixia Mei and Jici Wang</i>	183
10	Migrant Labour in Global Value Chains in Asia – Yuko Hamada	212



Contents

Modular	Governance

11.	From Disposable to Empowered: Rearticulating Labour in Sri Lankan Apparel Factories – <i>Annelies M. Goger</i>	239
12.	Scripted Performances? Local Readings of 'Global' Health and Safety Standards in the Apparel Sector in Sri Lanka – <i>Kanchana N. Ruwanpura</i>	265
13.	Diffusing Labour Standards Down and Beyond the Value Chain: Lessons from the Mewat Experiment – <i>Meenu Tewari</i>	287
14.	Social Upgrading in Mobile Phone GVCs: Firm-level Comparisons of Working Conditions and Labour Rights – Joonkoo Lee, Gary Gereffi and Sang-Hoon Lee	315
15.	The Politics of Global Production: Apple, Foxconn and China's New Working Class – <i>Jenny Chan, Ngai Pun and Mark Selden</i>	353
16.	New Strategies of Industrial Organization and Labour in the Mobile Telecom Sector in India – <i>Sumangala Damodaran</i>	377
17.	Global Production Networks and Labour Process – Praveen Jha and Amit Chakraborty	398
Rela	tional Governance	
18.	Still a Distance to Go: Social Upgrading in the Indian ITO-BPO-KPO Sector – Ernesto Noronha and Premilla D'Cruz	423
19.	What Do Workers Gain from Being in a GVC? ICT in India – Sandip Sarkar and Balwant S. Mehta	450
Con	clusions	
20.	Governance Types and Employment Systems – Dev Nathan	479
21.	The Double Movement of Labour in the Re-formation of GVCs – Meenu Tewari, Dev Nathan and Sandip Sarkar	503
Note	s on Contributors	535
Index	κ	538

viii



Figures

6.1	Tourism production network	121
6.2	Cash flow—normal mode	125
6.3	Cash flow—zero-fee tour	125
8.1	Foreign arrivals in Bali, 1997–2010	157
8.2	Bali tourism GVC	161
8.3	Visitor arrivals to Bali, 2002–2003, domestic/foreign break-up	167
9.1	Employment structure evolution by industrial sectors (1986–2005)	193
9.2	Employment structure evolution in Guangdong Province	
	(1990–2005) and Zhejiang Province (1985–2004)	194
9.3	The top 10 occupations short of applicants in GD province	
	(July to September, 2007)	196
10.1	Supply chain of fishing industry	215
14.1	Mobile phone global value chains and three modes of comparison	321
15.1	Operating margins: Apple and Foxconn compared, 2007–2012	361
15.2	Distribution of value for the iPhone, 2010	362
15.3	Foxconn locations in greater China (1974–2016)	365
16.1	Mobile telecom GPN	380
19.1	Share of global market for IT services off-shoring by	
	destination, 2011	450
19.2	Educational composition of ICT and non-ICT services	
	workers (in %), 2011/2012	457
19.3	Technical educational composition of ICT services	
	workers, 2011/2012	457
19.4	Employment status of ICT and non-ICT services	
	workers, 2011/2012	459
19.5	Formal and informal worker composition in ICT and non-ICT	
	regular services workers, 2011/2012	459



Tables

1.1	GVCs and the distribution of profits and wages	11
2.1	Overview of Better Work programmes (as of June 2014)	36
3.1	Inflation-adjusted minimum wage	55
3.2	Breakdown of the monthly salary received by workers	56
3.3	Monthly overtime and total income of workers of different grades	57
3.4	Unit prices of selected products produced in the surveyed factories	61
3.5	Garment export earnings per worker	62
3.6	Summary of vertical and horizontal relations in the garment GPN,	
	Bangladesh	70
3.7	Distribution of costs and profit margin (% per factory)	70
4.1	Asian Floor Wage in local currency on the basis of PPP 2012–2013	86
4.2	Living wage unit costs in US cents at 50 per cent efficiency using	
	AFW wages	86
5.1	Number of farmers, farm workers, harvesting workers and	
	pack house workers interviewed in the grape GPN	102
6.1	Share of domestic visitor spending in tourism and travel, 2011	123
6.2	China tourism growth (%)	130
7.1	Changes in well-being in two villages of Lijiang	147
8.1	Tourism industry-related survey	163
8.2	Impact on micro and small businesses	164
8.3	Short-term impacts on beach vendors and traders	165
8.4	Foreign and domestic expenditure, 2003	167
8.5	Coping mechanisms in the crisis in order of importance	173
8.6	People in Bali under the poverty line, 2000–2010	175
9.1	Minimum wages in selected provinces and cities of China,	
	2007–08 and 2015	184
10.1	Migrant workers' countries of origin under employment permit	
	system in manufacturing in Korea	214
	Migrant workers in fishing industry in Thailand	215
	Palm oil industry in Malaysia, 2010	216
	Profile of case firms and factories	323
14.2	Working conditions in China: Nokia, Salcomp, Perlos, Foxconn,	
	China, c2004 (re: VC#1 & HC#1)	326



		Tables
14.3	Working conditions comparison in Nokia, Salcomp, Perlos,	
	Foxconn, India, c2008 (re: VC#2 & HC#2 & TC#1)	329
14.4	Working conditions in Nokia, Salcomp, Foxconn, Flextronics,	
	India, c2011 (re: VC#3 & HC#3 & TC#1)	333
14.5	Working conditions in Samsung Shenzhen, Samsung Tianjin and	
	Tianjin Samsung Mobile Display, China, c2004 (VC#4, TC#2)	337
14.6	Working conditions comparison in China: Samsung Group,	
	c2012 (VC#4, TC#2)	344
19.1	Distribution of ICT workers (in 000') by industry in 2011–2012	452
19.2	Distribution of ICT workers (in 000') by gender in	
	2011–2012	454
19.3	Employment in ICT and non-ICT services by industry and	
	gender (in %), 2011/2012	455
19.4	Employment in ICT services by sector, 2011/2012	456
19.5	Employment by enterprise type of ICT and non-ICT regular	
	services workers, 2011/2012	460
19.6	Employment by enterprise type of ICT regular services workers,	
	2011/2012	460
19.7	Distribution of period of contract of ICT and non-ICT regular	
	services workers (in %), 2011/2012	461
19.8	Distribution of period of contract of ICT regular services workers	
	(in %), 2011/2012	462
19.9	Proportion of ICT and non-ICT regular services workers eligible	
	for paid leave (in %), 2011/2012	462
19.10	Eligibility for social security benefits of ICT and non-ICT regular	
	services workers (in %), 2011/2012	463
19.11	Eligibility for social security benefits among regular ICT services	
	workers (in %), 2011/2012	464
19.12	Presence of a union, as reported by regular workers, ICT and	
	non-ICT services (in %), 2011/2012	464
19.13	Proportion of ICT and non-ICT services regular workers as	
	members of union/association (in %), 2011/2012	465
19.14	Employment in top 10 occupations of regular workers in	
	IT-ITES services, 2011/2012	466
19.15	Employment in top 10 occupations of regular workers in	
	communications services, 2011/2012	466
19.16	Average daily earning (in Rs.) in ICT and non-ICT service workers,	
	2011/2012	467

xi



Tables

Average daily earning (in Rs.) of regular IT-ITES workers	
across occupation	468
Average daily earning (in Rs.) of regular communications workers	
across occupation	468
Regular employment by metro/non-metro in urban area	469
Regular IT-ITES jobs in metros	470
Regular communications jobs in metros	470
Case studies in this book and their governance type	483
Governance types, knowledge and employment quality	495
	across occupation Average daily earning (in Rs.) of regular communications workers across occupation Regular employment by metro/non-metro in urban area Regular IT-ITES jobs in metros Regular communications jobs in metros Case studies in this book and their governance type



Foreword

Global Value Chains (GVCs) have emerged as an extremely important form of organization of production and value creation, thanks to technological change and the process of globalization. India is rather a late comer in this system, and even now it comparatively accounts for a smaller proportion of value creation under GVCs as compared to most of middle and high income countries.

The Institute for Human Development (IHD) has been one of the few institutions in India which pioneered in creating interest in this increasingly important issue. IHD with support from ILO and Indian Council of Social Science Research (ICSSR) had organized an international conference way back in 1998 on this subject in Bangalore, selected papers of which were brought out as an edited volume. The present volume, largely an outcome of the Capturing the Gains (CtG) research programme, supported by DFID and implemented by the University of Manchester, has been coordinated by the IHD where many of the Asian case studies included in this book were conducted.

The papers in this volume bring together studies of labour and working conditions in many GVCs across Asia. Participation in GVCs has provided many benefits to Asia—increased employment in increasing return activities, such as manufacturing and services; reduction in poverty; and the enhanced participation of women in these modern sectors. This book, however, also points to the continued weaknesses and negativities in these developments such as the continuation of sweatshop conditions, even child labour, in many parts of GVC manufacture; the appearance of new forms of Taylorism in Call Centres; and so on.

There are other books and papers too dealing with issues of workers in global production networks. This book is different in its approach, it has tried to identify the positive factors that can work to improve the conditions of labour. It emphasizes the role of workers' organizations in the new areas of worker concentration. It stresses women's entry into the modern sectors of the economy as a factor that enables them to challenge and change existing restrictive gender norms. With an increasing sphere of GVCs creating new forms of institutions, including labour market institutions is very important. This book fills an important gap on the subject, although more such analyses will be needed in future, which it will facilitate.

Alakh N. Sharma Professor and Director Institute for Human Development New Delhi



Preface

The editors and many of the authors have spent much of the last decade researching various dimensions of Global Value Chains (GVCs). This is also the decade in which GVCs have grown in importance as the manner in which global production and trade is organized today. There are many aspects of the rise of GVCs and its implications for labour that demand closer analysis and examination as we move from trade in goods to trade in tasks. This book concentrates on the two-way interaction of GVCs with labour in supplier firms in late industrializing economies. This dialectic between employers, suppliers and labour within GVCs plays out in terms of both the volume and quality of employment that GVCs generate in supplier economies; and the recursive impacts of labour on the re-formation of GVCs. Both of these relations of labour within GVCs are relatively under-researched and under-theorized. An attempt to fill these gaps at the empirical and theoretical levels provides the *raison d'etre* of this book.

The splintering of production implies a deeper and finer division of labour in the organization of work. As the foundations of production and technology shift in the new 'knowledge economy', researchers have begun to read this new division of labour as a division of tasks and indeed, a division of knowledge. Splintered tasks, and the differentiated knowledge and skills associated with them, have also to be coordinated or governed. This book is organized on the basis of the manner in which tasks are divided and governed. The case studies in the book shed light on the knowledge intensity and complexity of these tasks and of the often contested organizational arrangements that govern them. The organizational arrangements that the book focuses on lie at the intersection of global value chains and the vast array of institutions that lead firms and their suppliers interact with in places where they originate, and where they touch down. These institutions range from market mediated ties, to links with state and civic actors as well as workers' own agency. At their most basic these varied relationships and governance systems result in what the literature calls captive, modular or relational governance structures. Each assigns differing distributions of knowledge and degrees of power to the actors involved lead firms, suppliers, states, and workers, and lead to varied distributions of the capture of value in the GVCs.

These vertical relations of power, governance, and distribution of value, however, intersect with deeply varied contexts – or place-based conditions in which particular supplier firms and workers enter into particular GVCs. These lateral or horizontal relations influence the nature of productive relations in particular



Preface

places, and mediate variable conditions of labour supply and demand, gender relations, technology absorption and working conditions in particular places. These place-based or horizontal forces and processes, over which local actors have some control, intersect with vertical relations to provide different outcomes for work and labour even in the same industry.

These variations in labour market outcomes transcend wages and employment within GVCs. With technical change, and labour supply shifts, such as the addition of tens of millions of women involved in GVC production in late developing economies, new practices of earning independent incomes and traversing public spaces including those outside the workplace, have challenged standard narratives of how GVCs impact work and workers in supplier countries. In dealing with the development impacts of GVCs and the employment and conditions of work they help create, the case studies in this book therefore go beyond the narrow confines of employment relations to examine the spatial and social conditions associated with the political economy of work.

The chapters in this book consistently elaborate both the opportunities and the challenges provided by GVC-based production in Asian economies. The outcomes are conflictual, contradictory and Janus-faced: There are sweatshops as well as successful struggles to end sweatshops. There are better quality employment systems alongside dead-end, deskilled work even in high tech sectors. There is value capture by some lead firms, as well as instances of those at the bottom of the chain carving out niches from where they fight back.

Rather than seeing the spread of globalized production as the elimination of worker agency, this book shows the possibilities for, and importance of, workers themselves in the transformation of GVCs as we know them. There are also growing possibilities for a Polanyian double transformation of the conditions of globalized production, one that would improve the manner in which labour is incorporated in globalized production.

Volume Editors



Acknowledgements

This book draws together many of the studies conducted under the Capturing the Gains (CtG) research initiative supported by DFID and coordinated by the Brooks World Poverty Institute of the University of Manchester and the Center for Globalization, Governance and Competitiveness (CGGC) of Duke University. Our thanks to Stephanie Barrientos and Gary Gereffi for their leadership in shaping this research programme.

We thank the other members of the CtG Research Coordination Committee, Shane Godfrey, Frederick Mayer, William Milberg, John Pickles, Ann Posthuma, Joonkoo Lee and Michelle Christian, who also contributed to shaping the wider research of which the case studies reported in this book are a part. We are grateful to numerous colleagues who contributed valuable comments, provided important feedback and offered discussion at various stages of the research and writing that strengthened our work. We particularly thank Jennifer Bair, Stephanie Barrientos, Gary Gereffi, Raphael Kaplinsky, Douglas Miller, Nicola Phillips, John Pickles, and Cornelia Staritz for their excellent comments on written drafts of these chapters and at conferences where versions of them were presented. We thank the three anonymous reviewers of Cambridge University Press who offered very helpful advice and critical comments that have strengthened the book and many of the individual chapters in it.

Many of the papers were presented at workshops on GVCs organized by the University of Manchester, the Institute for Human Development (IHD), New Delhi, the Indira Gandhi Institute for Development Research (IGIDR), Mumbai, the Centre for Policy Dialogue (CPD), Dhaka, and CARE, Dhaka. We thank the organizing institutions for their support and workshop participants for their feedback. We also thank several students of the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill's Department of City and Regional Planning for excellent research assistance to the editors, and the Indian Council for Research on International Economic Relations (ICRIER) for hosting Meenu Tewari for part of the research process.

Our thanks also go out to the International Labour Organization (ILO) for funding support for some of the research on which a subset of the chapters are based.

IHD was the host organization for conducting and coordinating many of the case studies reported here and for the production of the book. We thank Alakh Sharma for his support for the project. We also thank Lindsey Block, then of DFID



Acknowledgements

in India, who was instrumental in getting additional support from DFID India for the workshops at IHD and the production of the book.

We are especially grateful to Priyanka Tyagi, Communications Officer of IHD, for overseeing the production process and ensuring that the work was in order and kept moving along. Ashwitha Jaykumar did a great job in editing many of the chapters through several drafts.

At Cambridge University Press, we thank former and present staff at Delhi, Dhiraj Pandey, Qudsiya Ahmed, Debjani Mazumder, along with Sohini Ghosh and Suvadip Bhattacharjee, and Chris Harrison in Cambridge for their wonderful support, encouragement and partnership throughout the editorial process and for putting up with all the delays that inevitably came up along the way. We are especially grateful to Chris Harrison who saw the wider potential in this work and turned what was initially a single book into a series.

Our special thanks to all our colleagues and co-workers who at our various stages of the process helped with their support, encouragement, comments, feedback, and advice that collectively improved our work and kept our spirits up.

Dev would like to thank Govind and Pallavi for not only putting up with all the pressures and tensions of coming out with this book but also often being the first on whom he tried out various ideas. Meenu Tewari is grateful to Roberto Quercia, then Chair of the Department of City and Regional Planning at UNC Chapel Hill, for his support throughout the project.

Volume Editors

xvii