

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10152-4 - Dissent on Core Beliefs: Religious and Secular Perspectives

Edited by Simone Chambers and Peter Nosco

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Dissent on Core Beliefs *Religious and Secular Perspectives*

Difference, diversity, and disagreement are inevitable features of our ethical, social, and political landscape. This collection of new essays investigates the ways that various ethical and religious traditions have dealt with intramural dissent; the volume covers nine separate traditions: Confucianism, Buddhism, Christianity, Judaism, Islam, liberalism, Marxism, South Asian religions, and natural law. Each chapter lays out the distinctive features, history, and challenges of intramural dissent within each tradition, enabling readers to identify similarities and differences between traditions. The book concludes with an Afterword by Michael Walzer, offering a synoptic overview of the challenge of intramural dissent and the responses to that challenge. Committed to dialogue across cultures and traditions, the collection begins that dialogue with the common challenges facing all traditions: how to maintain cohesion and core values in the face of pluralism, and how to do this in a way that is consistent with the internal ethical principles of the traditions.

Simone Chambers is Professor of Political Science and Director of the Centre for Ethics at the University of Toronto. She has been teaching at the University of Toronto since 2002, and her primary areas of scholarship include democratic theory, ethics, secularism, rhetoric, civility, and the public sphere. She has published articles in journals including *Political Theory*, *Journal of Political Philosophy*, *Ethics and Global Politics*, and *Critical Review*.

Peter Nosco is Professor of Asian Studies at the University of British Columbia. He is the author of *Remembering Paradise: Nativism and Nostalgia in 18th-Century Japan* (1990), *Thinking for Oneself: Individuality and Ideology in Early Modern Japan* (forthcoming, 2016), and the editor of *Confucianism and Tokugawa Culture* (1997), and *Identity and Individuality in Nineteenth-Century Japan* (with James Ketelaar and Kojima, Yasunori, forthcoming, 2015). He has served as guest editor for special issues of *Philosophy East and West* and *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies*.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10152-4 - Dissent on Core Beliefs: Religious and Secular Perspectives

Edited by Simone Chambers and Peter Nosco

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Ethikon Series in Comparative Ethics

Editorial Board

Carole Pateman, *Series Editor*

Gavin T. Colvert Robert P. George Sohail H. Hashmi

Peter H. Hoffenberg Will Kymlicka David Miller

Philip Valera Michael Walzer

The Ethikon Series publishes comparative studies on moral issues of current importance. By bringing together scholars representing a diversity of ethical viewpoints to focus on the same aspects of its topics, the series aims to broaden the scope of ethical discourse, to sharpen its focus, and to identify commonalities and differences among influential moral traditions.

TITLES IN THE SERIES

Brian Barry and Robert E. Goodin, eds., *Free Movement: Ethical Issues in the Transnational Migration of People and Money*

Chris Brown, ed., *Political Restructuring in Europe: Ethical Perspectives*

Terry Nardin, ed., *The Ethics of War and Peace: Religious and Secular Perspectives*

David R. Mapel and Terry Nardin, eds., *International Society: Diverse Ethical Perspectives*

David Miller and Sohail H. Hashmi, eds., *Boundaries and Justice: Diverse Ethical Perspectives*

Simone Chambers and Will Kymlicka, eds., *Alternative Conceptions of Civil Society*

Nancy L. Rosenblum and Robert C. Post, eds., *Civil Society and Government*

Sohail H. Hashmi, ed. Foreword by Jack Miles, *Islamic Political Ethics: Civil Society, Pluralism, and Conflict*

Richard Madsen and Tracy B. Strong, eds., *The Many and the One: Ethical Pluralism in the Modern World*

Margaret Moore and Allen Buchanan, eds., *States, Nations, and Borders: The Ethics of Making Boundaries*

Sohail H. Hashmi and Steven P. Lee, eds., *Ethics and Weapons of Mass Destruction: Religious and Secular Perspectives*

Michael Walzer, ed., *Law, Politics, and Morality in Judaism*

William M. Sullivan and Will Kymlicka, *The Globalization of Ethics: Religious and Secular Perspectives*

Daniel A. Bell, ed., *Confucian Political Ethics*

John Coleman, S. J., ed., *Christian Political Ethics*

William A. Galston and Peter H. Hoffenberg, eds., *Poverty and Morality: Religious and Secular Perspectives*

Simone Chambers and Peter Nosco, eds., *Dissent on Core Beliefs: Religious and Secular Perspectives*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10152-4 - Dissent on Core Beliefs: Religious and Secular Perspectives

Edited by Simone Chambers and Peter Nosco

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Dissent on Core Beliefs
Religious and Secular Perspectives

Edited by

SIMONE CHAMBERS

University of Toronto

PETER NOSCO

University of British Columbia



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10152-4 - Dissent on Core Beliefs: Religious and Secular Perspectives

Edited by Simone Chambers and Peter Nosco

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107101524

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Dissent on core beliefs : religious and secular perspectives / edited by Simone Chambers.

pages cm. – (The Ethikon series in comparative ethics)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-10152-4

1. Religions. 2. Conflict management – Religious aspects.

I. Chambers, Simone, editor.

BL85.D57 2015

202–dc23

2014043076

ISBN 978-1-107-10152-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10152-4 - Dissent on Core Beliefs: Religious and Secular Perspectives

Edited by Simone Chambers and Peter Nosco

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Contributors</i>	page vi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	x
1 Introduction <i>Simone Chambers and Peter Nosco</i>	1
2 Liberalism and internal dissent <i>William A. Galston</i>	19
3 Intramural dissent: Marxism <i>Andrew Levine</i>	35
4 Dissent on core beliefs in natural law <i>Tom Angier</i>	53
5 The management of intramural dissent in Judaism <i>Alan Mittleman</i>	76
6 Christianity and the management of intramural dissent <i>Peter Steinfels</i>	98
7 Intramural dissent on core beliefs in Islam <i>Meena Sharify-Funk</i>	128
8 Dissent and diversity in South Asian religions <i>Anne Murphy</i>	158
9 Confucianism and dissent on core beliefs <i>Richard Madsen</i>	186
10 Intramural dissent in Buddhism <i>Peter Nosco</i>	201
11 Afterword <i>Michael Walzer</i>	220
<i>Selected bibliography</i>	229
<i>Index</i>	232

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10152-4 - Dissent on Core Beliefs: Religious and Secular Perspectives

Edited by Simone Chambers and Peter Nosco

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contributors

TOM ANGIER teaches in the area of ethics and political theory at the University of St. Andrews, with a specific focus on ancient Greek philosophers. He also has subsidiary interests in nineteenth-century post-Kantian philosophy. His publications include *Techne in Aristotle's Ethics: Crafting the Moral Life* and *Either Kierkegaard/Or Nietzsche: Moral Philosophy in a New Key*. He has also edited and contributed to a new volume on the great moral philosophers, entitled *Ethics: The Key Thinkers*. His essay on Alasdair MacIntyre's theory of tradition appeared in *The European Journal of Philosophy* (published online: December 2011).

SIMONE CHAMBERS is Professor of Political Science and Director of the Centre for Ethics at the University of Toronto. She is the author of *Reasonable Democracy: Jürgen Habermas and The Politics of Discourse* and many other book chapters and journal articles. She has also co-edited *Alternative Conceptions of Civil Society* (with Will Kymlicka), *Deliberation, Democracy, and the Media* (with Anne Costain), and Volumes 1–v of the *Encyclopedia of Political Science* (with Kurian, Alt, Garrett, Levi, and McClain). In 1997 she received the Best First Book in Political Theory Award from the American Political Science Association.

WILLIAM A. GALSTON is a senior fellow and Ezra K. Zilcha chair in Government Studies at the Brookings Institution, Washington, DC, and formerly professor in the School of Public Affairs and director of the Institute for Philosophy and Public Policy at the University of Maryland, College Park. Formerly deputy assistant to President Clinton for domestic policy, he has also served as executive director of the National Commission on Civic Renewal. His most recent books are *The Practice of Liberal Pluralism* and *Public Matters: Politics, Policy, and Religion in the 21st Century*. He is also the author of several other books and numerous articles on political philosophy, public policy, and American politics. He also co-edited *Poverty and Morality* (with Peter H. Hoffenberg).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10152-4 - Dissent on Core Beliefs: Religious and Secular Perspectives

Edited by Simone Chambers and Peter Nosco

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contributors*

vii

ANDREW LEVINE is presently a senior scholar at the Institute for Policy Studies, Washington, DC, and formerly a professor of philosophy at the University of Wisconsin–Madison and research professor in philosophy at the University of Maryland at College Park. He has written extensively on recent liberal theory and on historical figures including Marx, Rousseau, Locke, and Mill. His recent books include *In Bad Faith: What's Wrong with the Opium of the People; Political Keywords; The American Ideology; A Future for Marxism?: Althusser, the Analytical Turn, and the Revival of Socialist Theory;* and *Engaging Political Philosophy: Hobbes to Rawls*.

RICHARD MADSEN is Distinguished Professor of Sociology at the University of California, San Diego. He is a co-author (with Robert Bellah et al.) of *The Good Society* and *Habits of the Heart*, which received the Los Angeles Times Book Award and was jury nominated for the Pulitzer Prize. He has authored or co-authored eight books on China, including *Morality and Power in a Chinese Village* for which he received the C. Wright Mills Award; *China's Catholics: Tragedy and Hope in an Emerging Civil Society;* and *China and the American Dream*. He also co-edited (with Tracy B. Strong) *The Many and the One: Religious and Secular Perspectives on Ethical Pluralism in the Modern World*.

ALAN MITTMELMAN is Professor of Jewish Philosophy at The Jewish Theological Seminary in New York. He teaches and writes in the areas of Jewish ethics and Jewish political thought. His most recent books are *Hope in a Democratic Age* and *A Short History of Jewish Ethics*. His book *Human Nature and Jewish Thought* will be published in 2015. Mittleman has been a guest professor at the University of Cologne, Princeton University, and the CUNY Graduate Center. He is the recipient of fellowships from the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation and the Center for Jewish Studies of Harvard University.

ANNE MURPHY, Associate Professor is the Department of Asian Studies at the University of British Columbia, is a cultural historian of early modern and modern South Asia, with particular interests in the historical formation of religious communities in Punjab and northern South Asia, and the Sikh tradition. Her recent monograph, *The Materiality of the Past: History and Representation in Sikh Tradition*, explores the construction of Sikh memory and historical consciousness around material representations and religious sites from the eighteenth century to the present. She edited a thematically related book entitled *Time, History, and the Religious Imaginary in South Asia*. Her current research concerns the articulation of secular ideas and practices in modern Punjabi literature in both Pakistan and India, and the historical formations of social service or *sevā* as an expression of ethical life within Sikh tradition. This latter project engages a broader interest in the

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10152-4 - Dissent on Core Beliefs: Religious and Secular Perspectives

Edited by Simone Chambers and Peter Nosco

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

Contributors

intersection of philanthropic behavior and modernity in South Asia and beyond.

PETER NOSCO is Professor of Asian Studies at the University of British Columbia and a specialist in the intellectual and social history of early modern Japan. He is best known for his work on early modern Japanese Confucianism, nativism (*kokugaku*), underground religions, and popular culture. His current work is on the individuality and values of the last decades of the Tokugawa period, and their fate in the early Meiji. He is the author of *Remembering Paradise: Nativism and Nostalgia in 18th Century Japan* and the editor of *Confucianism and Tokugawa Culture* and *Japanese Identity: Cultural Analyses*. He has also contributed chapters on Buddhism and Confucianism to three other Ethikon volumes, and has been a guest editor of the *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* and *Philosophy: East and West*.

MEENA SHARIFY-FUNK, Ph.D., is an associate professor in the Religion and Culture Department of Wilfrid Laurier University, Waterloo, Ontario; she specializes in Islamic studies with a focus on contemporary Muslim thought and identity. Her current research focuses on the construction of contemporary North American Muslim identity in a post-9/11 context. It is a continuation of her first manuscript, *Encountering the Transnational: Women, Islam, and the Politics of Interpretation*, which examined the impact of transnational networking on Muslim women's identity, thought, and activism. She also has written and presented a number of articles and papers on the politics of Islamic hermeneutics, Islamic conceptions of peace and conflict resolution, and the role of cultural and religious factors in peacemaking. Additionally, Sharify-Funk has two co-edited books, *Cultural Diversity and Islam* (with Abdul Aziz Said) and *Contemporary Islam: Dynamic, not Static* (with Abdul Aziz Said and Mohammed Abu-Nimer).

PETER STEINFELS is a university professor emeritus at Fordham in New York City. From 1988 to 1997, he was senior religion correspondent of the *New York Times*, where he also wrote "Beliefs," a biweekly column on religion, until 2010. In 2004, with Margaret O'Brien Steinfelds, he founded the Fordham Center on Religion and Culture, which they co-directed until July 2012. Earlier an editor at *Commonweal* and in the field of bioethics, he has written over 2,000 articles and reviews on topics including church and state, international affairs, social policy, and biomedical ethics. He is the author of *The Neoconservatives*, and *A People Adrift: The Crisis of the Roman Catholic Church in America*, and has contributed chapters to twenty other books. He graduated from Loyola University in Chicago and holds a Ph.D. in modern European history from Columbia as well as seven honorary doctorates.

MICHAEL WALZER is Professor Emeritus of Social Science at the Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton. He is the author of *In God's Shadow: Politics in the Hebrew Bible*; *Thinking Politically*; *The Revolution of the Saints*; *Just*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10152-4 - Dissent on Core Beliefs: Religious and Secular Perspectives

Edited by Simone Chambers and Peter Nosco

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contributors

ix

and Unjust Wars; Spheres of Justice; and On Toleration. He is also a co-editor of *The Jewish Political Tradition*, a four-volume set of texts and commentaries dealing with all aspects of Jewish political experience from biblical times to the present; a former co-editor of *Dissent*; and a member of the editorial board of The Ethikon Series in Comparative Ethics.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-10152-4 - Dissent on Core Beliefs: Religious and Secular Perspectives

Edited by Simone Chambers and Peter Nosco

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

The trustees of the Ethikon Institute join with Philip Valera, president, and Carole Pateman, series editor, in thanking all who contributed to the development of this volume.

Special thanks are due to Simone Chambers and Peter Nosco for taking on the challenging task of editing this book.

We are especially indebted to the Sidney Stern Memorial Trust for their enabling financial support.

Finally, we wish to express our thanks to Hilary Gaskin, our editor at Cambridge University Press, for her encouragement, valuable guidance, and support; and to Rosemary Crawley, assistant editor at Cambridge, for skillfully guiding the manuscript through the production process.

The Ethikon Institute

The Ethikon Institute, a nonprofit organization, is concerned with the social implications of ethical pluralism. Its dialogue-publication projects are designed to explore a diversity of moral outlooks, secular and religious, and to clarify areas of consensus and divergence among them. By encouraging a systematic exchange of ideas, the Institute aims to advance the prospects for agreement and to facilitate the peaceful accommodation of irreducible differences. The Ethikon Institute takes no position on issues that may divide its participants, serving not as an arbiter but as a neutral forum for the cooperative exploration of diverse and sometimes opposing views.