Are there any universal entities? Or is the world populated only by particular things? The problem of universals is one of the most fascinating and enduring topics in the history of metaphysics, with roots in ancient and medieval philosophy. This collection of new essays provides an innovative overview of the contemporary debate on universals. Rather than focusing exclusively on the traditional opposition between realism and nominalism, the contributors explore the complexity of the debate and illustrate a broad range of positions within both the realist and the nominalist camps. Realism is viewed through the lens of the distinction between constituent and relational ontologies, while nominalism is reconstructed in light of the controversy over the notion of trope. The result is a fresh picture of contemporary metaphysics, in which traditional strategies of dealing with the problem of universals are both reaffirmed and called into question.

Gabriele Galluzzo is a lecturer in ancient philosophy in the Department of Classics and Ancient History at the University of Exeter.

Michael Loux is George N. Shuster Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame.
THE PROBLEM OF UNIVERSALS IN CONTEMPORARY PHILOSOPHY

EDITED BY
GABRIELE GALLUZZO
MICHAEL J. LOUX
For Jonathan and Francesco
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of contributors</th>
<th>page ix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Introduction**

1. An exercise in constituent ontology  
   *Gabriele Galluzzo* and *Michael J. Loux*

2. Against ontological structure  
   *Peter van Inwagen*

3. In defense of substantial universals  
   *E. J. Lowe*

4. A kind farewell to Platonism: for an Aristotelian understanding of kinds and properties  
   *Gabriele Galluzzo*

5. Universals in a world of particulars  
   *John Heil*

6. Is trope theory a divided house?  
   *Robert K. Garcia*

7. Tropes and the generality of laws  
   *Sophie Gibb*

8. On the origins of order: non-symmetric or only symmetric relations?  
   *Fraser MacBride*
Contents

9 States of affairs and the relation regress 195
Anna-Sofia Maurin

References 215
Index 225
Contributors

Gabriele Galluzzo is a lecturer in ancient philosophy in the Department of Classics and Ancient History at the University of Exeter

Robert K. Garcia is an assistant professor of philosophy at Texas A&M University

Sophie Gibb is a senior lecturer in philosophy at Durham University

John Heil is a professor of philosophy at Washington University in St Louis and an honorary research associate at Monash University

Michael J. Loux is George N. Shuster Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame

E. J. Lowe was a professor of philosophy at Durham University

Fraser MacBride is a professor of philosophy at the University of Glasgow

Anna-Sofia Maurin is a professor of theoretical philosophy at the University of Gothenburg

Peter van Inwagen is John Cardinal O'Hara Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame
Acknowledgments

The chapters collected in this volume had their origin in a conference on the problem of universals in contemporary analytic philosophy held at the Scuola Normale Superiore in Pisa, Italy in July 2010. We wish first of all to thank the Scuola Normale Superiore for the financial support and for providing an ideal setting for philosophical discussion. Massimo Mugnai generously offered to co-organize the event and apply for funds. This is the place to express our sincere gratitude to him. Alex Oliver, Gonzalo Rodriguez-Pereyra, and Dean Zimmerman also presented papers at the conference and greatly contributed to discussion. We are very grateful to them for their suggestions, criticisms, and comments, which helped all the contributors to shape their views and improve the final versions of their papers. Thanks go also to Giulia Felappi, Michele Ginammi, Giorgio Lando, Laura Mari, Valentina Morotti, and Giacomo Turbanti, who helped with the organization of the conference and took an active part in the philosophical discussion. Most of all, they created a lively and intellectually stimulating environment, which added value to our proceedings. The conference attracted a number of visitors from Italy and beyond. We wish to thank all the participants for enriching the event with their active presence.

We are very grateful to Hilary Gaskin for taking an interest in this book and considering it for publication. Thanks go also to two anonymous referees for Cambridge University Press, who made a number of insightful comments on the chapters and greatly improved the quality of the volume.

While this volume was close to completion, we lost two dear friends and colleagues who greatly contributed to our project: E. J. Lowe and Francesco Del Punta. Besides being one of the contributors, Jonathan Lowe was also supposed to be co-editor of the volume. He conceived with us the initial idea of the project and constantly advised us on a number of philosophical and editorial matters. Most of all, however, he was a splendid person, a dear friend and a good example of how to do good metaphysics.
Francesco Del Punta, too, played a crucial role in our project. He was the first to entertain the bold idea of bringing together philosophers and historians of philosophy to talk about the problem of universals. He co-organized with us the 2010 conference and ever since he provided unceasing encouragement in our attempts to bring the volume to completion. He always remained for us a source of inspiration and a severe judge of the quality of our scientific enterprise. During the 2010 conference he said he would watch the end of our works from ‘a rather comfortable cloud.’ We do hope that the cloud is indeed comfortable. This volume is for Jonathan and Francesco.