Reconstructing Atrocity Prevention

In the two and a half decades since the end of the Cold War, policymakers have become acutely aware of the extent to which the world today faces mass atrocities. In an effort to prevent the death, destruction, and global chaos wrought by these crimes, the agendas for both national and international policy have grown beyond conflict prevention to encompass atrocity prevention, protection of civilians, transitional justice, and the Responsibility to Protect. Yet, to date, there has been no attempt to address the topic of the prevention of mass atrocities from the theoretical, policy, and practicing standpoints simultaneously. This volume is designed to fill that gap, clarifying and solidifying the present understanding of atrocity prevention. It will serve as an authoritative work on the state of the field.

SHERI P. ROSENBERG (1967–2015) was a scholar, professor, and human rights advocate focusing on issues of law and mass atrocity. She was Associate Clinical Professor of Law and Director of the Cardozo Law Institute on Holocaust and Human Rights (CLIHHR) and the Human Rights and Atrocity Prevention Clinic. Her publications include “Genocide by Attrition: Efficient and Silent,” in Genocide Matters (2013) and “Responsibility to Protect: A Framework for Prevention” in the journal Global Responsibility to Protect (2009).

TIBI GALIS is a political scientist. He is the Executive Director of the Auschwitz Institute for Peace and Reconciliation, a New York-based NGO that helps governments prevent genocide worldwide.

ALEX ZUCKER is an editor and a translator of Czech literature. He has received an English PEN Award for Writing in Translation, a National Endowment for the Arts Literature Fellowship, and the ALTA National Translation Award. He currently serves as co-chair of the PEN America Translation Committee.
Reconstructing Atrocity Prevention

Edited by
Sheri P. Rosenberg
Cardozo Law School
Tibi Galis
Auschwitz Institute, New York
Alex Zucker
Independent Scholar
CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University’s mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107094963

© Cambridge University Press 2016
This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.
First published 2016
A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.
Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
Reconstructing atrocity prevention / [edited by] Sheri P. Rosenberg, Cardozo
Law School, Tiberiu Galis, Auschwitz Institute, New York, Alex Zucker,
Independent Scholar.
pages cm
Includes bibliographical references and index.
3. Genocide – Prevention. I. Rosenberg, Sheri P., editor. II. Galis,
Tiberiu, editor. III. Zucker, Alex, editor.
HV6322.R43 2016
363.32–dc23 2015012308
Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of
URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication
and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain,
accurate or appropriate.
In memory of Sheri Rosenberg, scholar, colleague, mentor, friend. Sheri dedicated her life to the prevention of mass atrocities and to helping the people affected by them. Her knowledge, passion, and humor were an inspiration to us all, and her vision lives on in this volume.
## Contents

*Foreword*  
ROMÉO DALLAIRE  
*List of contributors*  
SHERI ROSENBERG, TIBI GALIS, AND ALEX ZUCKER

### Part I: Fluidities

   SCOTT STRAUS  
   17

2. The Pistol on the Wall: How Coercive Military Intervention Limits Atrocity Prevention Policies  
   BRIDGET CONLEY-ZILKIC  
   31

3. Operationalizing the “Atrocity Prevention Lens”: Making Prevention a Living Reality  
   ALEX J. BELLAMY  
   61

4. The “Narrow but Deep Approach” to Implementing the Responsibility to Protect: Reassessing the Focus on International Crimes  
   JENNIFER M. WELSH  
   81

5. The Role of Social Psychology in Preventing Group-Selective Mass Atrocities  
   JOHANNA RAY VOLLHARDT  
   95

6. Gender, Sexualized Violence, and the Prevention of Genocide  
   ELISA VON JOEDEN-FORGEY  
   125
Part II: Above Chronology

7 Audacity of Hope: International Criminal Law, Mass Atrocity Crimes, and Prevention  
SHERI P. ROSENBERG  
151

8 Historical Dialogue and the Prevention of Atrocity Crimes  
ELAZAR BARKAN  
175

9 Through the Barrel of a Gun: Can Information from the Global Arms Trade Contribute to Genocide Prevention?  
ANDREW FEINSTEIN  
196

10 The Individual Responsibility to Protect  
EDWARD C. LUCK AND DANA ZARET LUCK  
207

11 Resource Predation, Contemporary Conflict, and the Prevention of Genocide and Mass Atrocities  
MICHAEL T. KLARE  
249

12 Deconstructing Risk and Developing Resilience: The Role of Inhibitory Factors in Genocide Prevention  
DEBORAH MAYERSEN  
277

13 Military Means of Preventing Mass Atrocities  
DWIGHT RAYMOND  
295

Part III: Acting Out Prevention

14 Performing Prevention: Civil Society, Performance Studies, and the Role of Public Activism in Genocide Prevention  
KERRY WHIGHAM  
321

15 Early Warning for Mass Atrocities: Tracking Escalation Parameters at the Population Level  
JENNIFER LEANING  
352

16 Mobilizing Economic Sanctions for Preventing Mass Atrocities: From Targeting Dictators to Enablers  
GEORGE A. LOPEZ  
379

17 Corporate Behavior and Atrocity Prevention: Is Aiding and Abetting Liability the Best Way to Influence Corporate Behavior?  
OWEN C. PELL AND KELLY BONNER  
393
Contents

  EKKEHARD STRAUSS

19 The Practical Use of Early Warning and Response in Preventing Mass Atrocities and Genocide: Experiences from the Great Lakes Region 450
  ASHAD SENTONGO

20 The Argentinean National Mechanism for the Prevention of Genocide: A Case Study in Contemporary Preventive Institution-Building 477
  RAMIRO RIERA

Index 495
Foreword

Roméo Dallaire

Retired generals rarely write prefaces to nonmilitary books, but this is a rare book on a topic of crucial importance. The United Nations provided me with no serious briefing, scholarly or journalistic, before posting me to Rwanda in 1993. Major Brent Beardsley, my excellent assistant, scoured libraries and bookstores before our departure and put together a few basic facts. Only when we reached Kigali was he even able to purchase at a local shop a map of the city of Kigali and our areas of immediate responsibility. Such cavalier attitudes toward the needs of peacebuilding staff members permeated the UN system in the early 1990s, but, as later developments in Rwanda made clear, the success of UN peace operations requires rigorous and early input from experienced scholars and practitioners.

When “spoilers” undermined implementation of the Arusha Accords and the Rwanda genocide against Tutsi unfolded in spring 1994, most member states, especially those with seats on the UN Security Council, retreated to the narrowest notions of their core self-interests and mustered no comprehensive vision of genocide prevention or any recognition that protecting civilian lives was a vital responsibility of national leaders and the UN system itself. Neither the provisions of the UN Genocide Convention nor the concept of “human security” sufficed to mobilize states against mass atrocities aimed at destroying an entire human group. Only the desperate postgenocide discovery of sovereignty as responsibility, a concept pioneered by Francis Deng with Roberta Cohen at the Brookings Institution, lit the way toward concrete implementation of the concept of “Never Again,” a legacy of the Holocaust and World War II that, until the late 1990s, was honored rhetorically, but never in practice.

As a Canadian, I am proud that farsighted leaders and public servants such as Lloyd Axworthy and Don Hubert spearheaded the campaign to create the

International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty (ICISS), whose December 2001 report, *The Responsibility to Protect*, embodies the enduring ideas discussed in this volume. But I am also forced to admit that theirs was a minority effort within the government of Canada and that we would not be discussing the responsibility to protect (R2P) today were it not for the commitment and intellectual energy of Gareth Evans, the formidable foreign minister of Australia from 1988 to 1996 and president of the International Crisis Group from 2000 to 2009.

Why had no concrete mechanism and guidelines for preventing genocide emerged before Kosovo in 1999 and R2P in 2001? As Frank Chalk and my colleagues at Concordia University’s Montreal Institute for Genocide and Human Rights Studies found in their interview-based comparative research, in the wake of the Rwanda genocide, “the United States’ experience with Milosevic’s brutal record in the Balkans, and its perceived national interest in securing Europe” played major roles. Unlike the Rwandan crisis, “the geopolitical importance of the Balkans to the U.S. and its NATO allies constituted a powerful impetus for action against Milosevic.”

The Racak massacre of forty Kosovar Albanians in January 1999 and the failure of the Rambouillet Peace Talks in February of that year compelled President Clinton to explore the military option. Chalk and our team concluded in their 2009 study that “Ultimately, the NATO intervention was motivated by a confluence of narrowly perceived U.S. national interests, moral imperative, and the desire to demonstrate NATO’s continued military prowess and prestige.”

In the aftermath of Kosovo, a strong consensus on what governments should do to organize themselves to prevent future mass atrocities emerged. It is crystallized in *Mobilizing the Will to Intervene: Leadership to Prevent Mass Atrocities*, the book I co-authored with Chalk, Kyle Matthews, and others in 2010, and in *Preventing Genocide: A Blueprint for U.S. Policymakers* (2008), an important study piloted by Madeleine K. Albright and William S. Cohen. Enabling leadership, enhancing coordination, building capacity, and ensuring knowledge are the central tasks. That means presidents and prime ministers who make preventing mass atrocities a national priority for their governments

---


3 Ibid., 106.

4 Ibid., 106 and 108.

5 Ibid., 109.

and appoint a focal point person to lead the genocide prevention agenda across the government. It means permanent legislative committees to serve as watchdogs ensuring that the executive branch of government is given the necessary resources and follows through on its commitment. It also means overcoming the tendency to seal off vital intelligence on looming mass atrocities by creating an atrocities prevention board to share information across the government, galvanize diplomacy, craft carefully targeted foreign aid, and, if necessary, deploy military resources in mass atrocity response operations. And, finally, it means civil society groups and media focused on mass atrocity prevention and implementing “the responsibility to report.”

Most political leaders still don’t understand that their nation’s self-interest is tied to preventing mass atrocities against other human beings, especially while they are haunted and intimidated by the specters of Iraq and Afghanistan at election time. President Obama’s Atrocity Prevention Board is a very important step in the right direction, but even it, in practice, is not yet the dynamo needed to energize the U.S. government’s prevention efforts. Interests and perceptions matter, and it may take disasters like the Ebola epidemic and its worldwide ramifications for public health to highlight for political leaders the indirect connections between atrocity prevention in faraway lands and the national security of their citizens. Dr. Jay Keystone, head of the Tropical Disease Unit at the Toronto General Hospital, tied these threads together in our 2009 study, when he wrote: “Preventing genocide and crimes against humanity are front line tasks in our fight to maintain public health security right here in North America. Our politicians and public health officials need to lead in this area.”

I like this book. I like the editors’ recognition that we still have a lot to learn and that it will take a truly interdisciplinary approach to learn it. I like their focus on viewing prevention through the lenses of theory, policy, and practice. And I like the fact that it is a book written with students, our future preventers, in mind. The greatest challenge we will face is to convince political leaders to wisely use the insights and recommendations developed by these authors. And that will not be easy when we consider the hurdles they face, even those with the best will in the world. As political scientist René Lemarchand recently wrote: “we need to remind ourselves that it is in states where poverty is rife, political institutions are failing and human rights are abused that we should expect the greatest amount of turmoil.” But no one ever said the job would be easy!

7 Mobilizing the Will to Intervene, 17–63.
8 Ibid., 12.
I believe that priority should be given to a carrot-and-stick approach, encouraging and harnessing a broader idea of national self-interest to counter political leaders’ fears about backlashes after intervention and the costs to their states of foregoing the lures of profits earned from arms sales and resource control. One useful approach is for international institutions like the World Bank, the European Union, the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe, and the UN to provide compensation to the smaller nations for the direct and indirect costs of prevention and to recognize more vigorously the sacrifices that taxpayers in wealthier countries make when their leaders undertake peace diplomacy. Once national leaders grasp the practical importance of R2P, renewing their commitment to financing growing expertise that improves operational understanding of other cultures, languages, and histories is the next crucial step. The convergence of national interests and mass atrocity prevention will one day be obvious to all, but we have a long way to go – the transition from noble words to practical action is essential.
Contributors

ELAZAR BARKAN is Professor of International and Public Affairs and the Director of the Human Rights Concentration at Columbia’s School of International and Public Affairs. His research interests focus on human rights and on the role of history in contemporary society and politics and the response to gross historical crimes and injustices. His books include Choreography of Sacred Spaces: State, Religion and Conflict Resolution (2014); No Return, No Refuge: Rites and Rights in Minority Repatriation (2011); The Guilt of Nations: Restitution and Negotiating Historical Injustices (2000); Taking Wrongs Seriously: Apologies and Reconciliation (2006); and Claiming the Stones/Naming the Bones: Cultural Property and the Negotiation of National and Ethnic Identity (2003).

ALEX J. BELLAMY is Professor of Peace & Conflict Studies and Executive Director of the Asia Pacific Centre for the Responsibility to Protect at the University of Queensland, Australia. He is also Non-Resident Senior Adviser at the International Peace Institute, New York; Fellow of the Academy of Social Science in Australia; and Secretary of the High Level Advisory Panel on the Responsibility to Protect in Southeast Asia. His most recent book is The Responsibility to Protect: A Defense (2015), and he is currently editing The Oxford Handbook on the Responsibility to Protect with Tim Dunne.

KELLY BONNER is an attorney with White & Case LLP. Prior to joining White & Case, she worked with the Committee on the Administration of Justice in Northern Ireland, advising the Consultative Group on the Past as to legal strategies for addressing the legacy of the Troubles. She is a graduate of New York University and Fordham Law School.

BRIDGET CONLEY-ZILKIC is an assistant research professor at Tufts University’s The Fletcher School and Research Director of the World Peace Foundation, where she leads a project, “How Mass Atrocities End.” Previously, she worked at the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum Holocaust Memorial Museum on issues related to contemporary genocide.
with responsibility for developing the institution’s research and educational projects on ongoing threats of genocide. She helped frame the museum’s position regarding ongoing violence, produced films, conducted training workshops, and curated an exhibition, *From Memory to Action: Meeting the Challenge of Genocide Today*. She has a PhD in Comparative Literature from Binghamton University.

**Röméo Dallaire** is a retired lieutenant-general, retired senator, and celebrated humanitarian. In 1993, L.Gen Dallaire was appointed Force Commander for the UN Assistance Mission for Rwanda (UNAMIR), where he witnessed the country descend into chaos and genocide leading to the deaths of more than 800,000 Rwandans. Since his retirement, he has become an outspoken advocate for human rights, genocide prevention, mental health, and war-affected children. He founded the Röméo Dallaire Child Soldiers Initiative, an organization committed to ending the use of child soldiers worldwide, and is the author of two best-selling books.

**Andrew Feinstein** is a former ANC Member of Parliament in South Africa where he introduced the first-ever motion on Holocaust remembrance. He is the author of the best-selling political memoir *After the Party: A Personal and Political Journey Inside the ANC* and the critically acclaimed *The Shadow World: Inside the Global Arms Trade*, which the *Washington Post* describes as “the most complete account [of the trade] ever written.” He is Executive Director of Corruption Watch UK based in London. He appears regularly in a wide range of international print and broadcast media.

**Tibi Galis** is a political scientist. He is the Executive Director of the Auschwitz Institute for Peace and Reconciliation, a New York-based nongovernmental organization (NGO) that helps governments prevent genocide worldwide.

**Elisa von Joeden-Forgey** is Assistant Professor of Holocaust and Genocide Studies at the Richard Stockton College of New Jersey. Prior to this, she was a visiting scholar and lecturer in the Department of History at the University of Pennsylvania, where she earned her PhD degree in modern German and African history. She has taught courses on the Holocaust, genocide, human rights, war, and imperialism. Her current research on gender and genocide has appeared in several journals and collected volumes. She is currently completing a book on gender and the prevention of genocide, which will be published by the University of Pennsylvania Press.

**Michael T. Klare** is the Five College Professor of Peace and World Security Studies, a joint appointment at Amherst, Hampshire, Mount Holyoke, Smith College, and the University of Massachusetts at Amherst. He has written
List of contributors

Jennifer Leaning is the Director of the François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights at Harvard University, the FXB Professor of the Practice of Health and Human Rights at Harvard School of Public Health, Associate Professor of Medicine at Harvard Medical School, and a member of the faculty in the Department of Emergency Medicine at Brigham and Women’s Hospital. Her research, field investigations, and publications focus on public health, medical ethics, and early warning in response to war, disaster, and mass atrocities. She has written widely on these issues in the peer-reviewed literature.

George A. Lopez serves as vice president at the United States Institute of Peace and Hesburgh Professor of Peace, Emeritus, at the University of Notre Dame. He has been involved in sanctions research and policy since 1992, having co-written or edited six books and more than forty articles and book chapters on economic sanctions. He has advised international agencies and governments regarding sanctions issues, especially on limiting humanitarian impact and the design of targeted financial sanctions. From October 2010 to July 2011, he served on the UN Panel of Experts for monitoring and implementing UN Sanctions on North Korea.

Dr. Dana Zaret Luck is a licensed psychologist who specializes in clinical neuropsychology and serves as the managing partner of the Mattis and Luck Center for Neuropsychological Services, LLP. By viewing R2P through a psychological lens, she seeks to draw attention to the devastating impact of atrocity crimes on individuals and groups and to raise the level of awareness in the R2P and policy-making communities of how the trauma and recovery process for victims, perpetrators, humanitarian workers, and others who have been exposed to atrocity crimes should factor into policy and practice.

Edward C. Luck A scholar, practitioner, and author, Dr. Edward C. Luck served as the UN’s first Special Adviser on the Responsibility to Protect, at the Assistant Secretary-General level, from 2008 to 2012. He was responsible for its conceptual, political, and operational/institutional development and was the architect of the Secretary-General’s three-pillar strategy for implementing R2P. He has held a wide range of leadership positions in academia, nonprofit organizations, think tanks, and the UN.
DR. DEBORAH MAYersen is a historian and Vice-Chancellor’s Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the Institute for Social Transformation Research, the University of Wollongong, Australia. Her most recent publications include On the Path to Genocide: Armenia and Rwanda Reexamined (2014) and the edited volume (with Annie Pohlman) Genocide and Mass Atrocities in Asia: Legacies and Prevention (2013).

OWEN C. PELL is a litigation partner at White & Case in New York. He handles complex commercial matters, including cases involving the extraterritorial reach of U.S. law, securities and RICO claims, claims against foreign sovereigns, and reparation claims under the U.S. Alien Tort Statute. He also represented Peru in gaining the return of artifacts taken from Machu Picchu. He gave a TED talk (“Diplomacy 2.0”) on how companies and NGOs are changing how international legal norms are formed, and he formulated a proposal, endorsed by the European Parliament, for a title-clearing system to address Holocaust-looted art claims.

DWIGHT RAYMOND Colonel (Retired) Dwight Raymond is a peace operations specialist at the Peacekeeping and Stability Operations Institute at the U.S. Army War College, where he also teaches a course on Humanitarian Intervention. A West Point graduate, his military awards include the Bronze Star Medal; Combat Infantryman’s Badge; and Airborne, Ranger, and Pathfinder qualification badges. He is one of the primary authors of the Mass Atrocity Response Operations (MARO) Military Planning Handbook, the Mass Atrocity Prevention and Response Options (MAPRO) Policy Planning Handbook, the Protection of Civilians Military Reference Guide, and military doctrinal publications regarding stability and peace operations.

RAMIRO RIERA is a lawyer and a professor of legal sciences. He has a BA in philosophy from the University of Buenos Aires and an MA in human rights from the National University of La Plata. He is a PhD candidate in International Law at the University of Buenos Aires. He teaches graduate and postgraduate courses on matters of criminal law, human rights, and international law at the University of Buenos Aires, Salvador University, and the University of National Defense. Outside academia, he has served at the Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law Direction of the Ministry of Defense of Argentina.

SHERI P. ROSENBERG (1967–2015) was a scholar, professor, and human rights advocate focusing on issues of law and mass atrocity. She was Associate Clinical Professor of Law and Director of the Cardozo Law Institute on Holocaust and Human Rights (CLIHHHR) and the Human Rights and Atrocity Prevention Clinic. Her publications include “Genocide by Attrition: Efficient and Silent,” in Genocide Matters (2013) and “Responsibility to

Ashad Sentongo is Director of African Programs at the Auschwitz Institute for Peace and Reconciliation. His research work focuses on power-sharing and ethnic conflict in Africa. He previously worked with the Genocide Prevention Program as Program Officer on Genocide Prevention at the International Conference on the Great Lakes Region, and he helped to establish the Regional and National Committees in Member States. He worked as consultant on dialogue in oil-producing communities in the Delta State of Nigeria, Research Associate at the National Defense University, Program Assistant on transitional justice at Coexistence International, and Program Assistant at Mercy Corps on Conflict Management in Kosovo, Guatemala, Indonesia, and Ethiopia.

Scott Straus is Professor of Political Science and International Studies at the University of Wisconsin, Madison. He is the author most recently of Making and Unmaking Nations: War, Leadership, and Genocide in Modern Africa (2015) and Fundamentals of Atrocity Prevention (2015). He has also written widely on Rwanda, including The Order of Genocide: Race, Power, and War in Rwanda (2006), and published in various academic journals, including the American Journal of Political Science, Perspectives on Politics, World Politics, Foreign Affairs, and African Affairs.

Dr. Ekkehard Strauss qualified as judge in Germany and holds a doctoral degree in international law and human rights from the University of Potsdam in Germany. Following experience in academia, government, and the private sector, he served with the OSCE and the UN OHCHR since 1998. Throughout his career, he published extensively on protection of minorities, prevention of human rights violations, postconflict peacebuilding, and the prevention of mass atrocities. At the time of writing, he worked as an independent researcher and consultant. He is an associate professor with the Asia Institute at Griffith University.

Johanna Ray Vollhardt is Assistant Professor of Psychology at Clark University, where she also directs the doctoral program in social psychology and is affiliated with the Strassler Center for Holocaust and Genocide Studies. She is a co-founding co-editor of the Journal of Social and Political Psychology and serves on the editorial boards of the Journal of Social Issues and Politische Psychologie. From 2012 to 2015, she served on the governing council of the International Society of Political Psychology. She has been working with the NGO Radio LaBenevolencia, which produces edutainment radio reconciliation programs in Rwanda, Burundi, and Eastern DRC, since 2005.
List of contributors

Jennifer M. Welsh is Professor and Chair in International Relations at the European University Institute and a Fellow of Somerville College, University of Oxford. She is a co-director of the Oxford Institute for Ethics, Law and Armed Conflict, and, since July 2013, has served as Secretary-General Ban Ki-moon’s Special Adviser on the Responsibility to Protect. She is the author and editor of several books and articles on the responsibility to protect, humanitarian intervention, the UN Security Council, and the principle of sovereignty. From 2014, she is directing a five-year research project, funded by the European Research Council, on the “individualization of war.”

Kerry Whigham is a doctoral candidate in New York University’s department of Performance Studies. His research examines memory practices and activism in postgenocidal societies, with a focus on Argentina, Germany, and the United States. His work has been published in a number of journals, including the Journal of Latin American Cultural Studies, Tourist Studies, Memory and Society, and Material Culture. He is also the managing editor of e-misférica, a biannual, trilingual journal on performance and politics in the Americas published by the Hemispheric Institute.

Alex Zucker is an editor and a translator of Czech literature. He has received an English PEN Award for Writing in Translation, a National Endowment for the Arts Literature Fellowship, and the ALTA National Translation Award. He currently serves as co-chair of the PEN America Translation Committee.