Debating Early Child Care

Throughout distressing cultural battles and disputes over child care, each side claims to have the best interests of children at heart. While developmental scientists have concrete evidence for this debate, their message is often lost or muddied by the media. To demonstrate why this problem matters, this book examines the extensive media coverage of the NICHD Study of Early Child Care and Youth Development – a long-running government-funded study that provides the most comprehensive look at the effects of early child care on American children. Analyses of newspaper articles and interviews with scientists and journalists reveal what happens to science in the public sphere and how children's issues can be used to question parents' choices. By shining light on these issues, the authors bring clarity to the enduring child care wars while providing recommendations for how scientists and the media can talk to – rather than past – each other.

ROBERT CROSNOE is the C.B. Smith, Sr., Centennial Chair at the University of Texas at Austin, where he is chair of the Department of Sociology and holds faculty appointments in the Population Research Center and the Department of Psychology. Prior to coming to Texas, he received his PhD in Sociology from Stanford University and completed postdoctoral fellowships at the Center for Developmental Science and Carolina Population Center, both at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. Crosnoe's research focuses on the education and general development of young people, especially those growing up in poverty or who come from immigrant backgrounds. His books include Healthy Learning: A Whole Child Approach to Disparities in Early Education (with Claude Bonazzo and Nina Wu, Teachers College Press, 2015), Fitting In, Standing Out: Navigating the Social Challenges of High School to Get an Education (Cambridge

**Tama Leventhal** is Associate Professor in the Eliot-Pearson Department of Child Study and Human Development at Tufts University. She received her degree (with distinction) from Teachers College, Columbia University. Prior to her position at Tufts, she served as an associate research scientist at the Institute for Policy Studies and an assistant professor at the Bloomberg School of Public Health, both at Johns Hopkins University. She also worked as a research scientist at the National Center for Children and Families at Columbia University. Her research is at the intersection of child development and social policy, with a general focus on the role of neighborhood and housing contexts in the lives of children, youth, and families. Her research appears in numerous peer-reviewed publications in many top-tier disciplinary journals ranging from developmental psychology, human development and family studies, sociology, and psychiatry to public health. She is co-editor of the *Handbook of Child Psychology and Developmental Science: Ecological Settings and Processes in Developmental Systems, Volume 4* (2015).

Both Crosnoe and Leventhal joined the NICHD Early Child Care Research Network when the SECCYD children entered high school, and they helped to organize data collection as the sample moved from adolescence to young adulthood.
Debating Early Child Care
The Relationship between Developmental Science and the Media

ROBERT CROSNOE
University of Texas at Austin

TAMA LEVENTHAL
Tufts University
This book is dedicated to all of the investigators on the NICHD Study of Early Child Care Network, including and especially the Phase IV investigators who had such influence on us: Jay, Cathryn, Bob B., Celia, Peg, Sue C., Beth, Martha, Sarah, Jim, Bonnie H-F, Bill, Kathy, Dan, Bonnie K., Kathleen, Vonnie, Fred, Phil, Marion, Margaret, Ross, Bob P., Kim, Vijaya, Glenn, Sue S., Larry, Liz, Deborah, and Marsha. And, in this group, we want to make special note of Alison, whom we all miss a great deal.
# Contents

List of figures and tables  
Acknowledgments  

1 The child care wars 1  
2 Translating science for public consumption 27  
3 Media coverage of early child care research 56  
4 Mothers, children, and messages 80  
5 Gaining perspective on early child care research in the media 108  
6 Lessons learned for scientists, journalists, and parents 131  
7 Moving forward with developmental science in the media 145  

References 160  
Index 166
Figures and tables

FIGURES
1.1 Gender breakdown of the US labor force
1.2 Care arrangements for today's children from birth through age four
2.1 The process of creating framing effects
2.2 Timeline of the NICHD SECCYD, focal research reports, and focal media coverage windows
3.1 Placement of newspaper articles about the NICHD SECCYD by year
3.2 Type of newspaper articles about the NICHD SECCYD by year
4.1 Breakdown of newspaper articles by focal benefits/risks discussion
4.2 Findings reported in newspaper articles about the NICHD SECCYD by year
4.3 Breakdown of newspaper articles by other benefits/risks discussion
4.4 Breakdown of newspaper articles by maternal or child focus
7.1 Framing of the NICHD SECCYD
7.2 Full text of the NICHD press release for the final SECCYD omnibus report

TABLES
3.1 NICHD Early Child Care Network papers used to organize media coverage
3.2 Newspapers selected for search and content coding
### List of Figures and Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure/Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Topics covered in interviews with NICHD SECCYD study investigators and NIH officials</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Newspapers selected for international search and number of articles coded by year</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Number of articles on spanking identified and coded by year</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Number of articles on spanking identified and coded by newspaper</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgments

The William T. Grant Foundation has proven to be one of the greatest resources in support of developmental research, and it has been something like a home base for both of us for most of our professional careers, first through the Faculty Scholars Program, which shaped us as researchers, and then through a grant that helped us launch the young adult wave of the NICHD Study of Early Child Care and Youth Development. That project led to this book, and so the Foundation gets much of the credit for our work here. In particular, we want to thank Bob Granger and Ed Seidman for always encouraging us to go our own way, especially if doing so meant charting new territory.

For many years beginning in 2004, we were part of the NICHD Early Child Care Research Network, and the funding that we received from the National Institute of Child Health and Human Development (under the management of Sarah Friedman and then Jim Griffith) was instrumental in our careers. Without that experience, we would never have written this book, of course, but we would also not have achieved many other things. Our dedication of the book to the members of the NICHD Network, so many of whom helped us with this project and in innumerable other ways (you know who you are), speaks for itself.

More recently, the Council on Contemporary Families has helped us to be more thoughtful about our role as public scholars. That organization, which is dedicated to using science to inform the media, has taught us many lessons and has been an invaluable source of support. We are especially grateful to Stephanie Coontz for her guidance.

For help with the newspaper sampling and coding, we need to thank a wonderful group of students at the University of Texas at
As we have written in both the introductory and concluding chapters of this book, this project was as much about our lives as parents as it was about our work as developmental scientists, and so it seems only fitting that we pay special thanks – above all others – to our own families. Shannon, Joseph, and Caroline, Matt, Naomi, and Nina. In the end, nothing else matters.