

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09182-5 - Criminalising Contagion: Legal and Ethical Challenges of Disease Transmission and the Criminal Law

Edited by Catherine Stanton and Hannah Quirk

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

- Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome (AIDS). *See* HIV/AIDS
- activist networks
- biological citizenship and, 173–4
 - legacy of science-based reforms for, 170–4
 - science-based criminal law reform and, 160–7
- actor network theory, agency and, 27–9
- advocacy for decriminalisation of HIV/AIDS, science-based strategies for, 160–7
- Africa, criminalisation of HIV/AIDS in, 105
- agency
- feminist perspectives on, 185–90
 - in HIV transmission, 26–33
- alcoholism, free will linked to, 38–9
- Altman, Lawrence K., 48–9
- American Medical Association, opposition to lethal injection, 39–40
- anti-essentialism in feminist legal methodology, 178–80, 185–90
- disclosure vs. non-disclosure in, 197–200
- violence against women and, 190–5
- Armstrong, Sarah, 46, 54
- Armstrong, W. N., 62–3
- Arning, Eduard, 66
- Ashworth, A., 2–3
- Asia, criminalisation of HIV/AIDS in, 105
- Australia, history of leprosy in, 57
- autonomy principles, criminalisation of non-disclosure of HIV/AIDS and, 185–90
- avian influenza, military/criminal metaphors concerning, 51–2
- Bad Blood: A Cautionary Tale* (film), 42–3
- Baier, Annette, 220–5
- Ban Ki-moon, 41–2
- Bartlett, Katharine, 178–80
- Bashford, Alison, 57
- battery, *actus reus* of, UK
- criminalisation of transmission and, 211–14
- Bayonet Constitution of 1887 (Hawaii), 58–9, 66
- Beacon: Magazine of Hawaii*, 74
- behaviour
- inefficacy of U.S. HIV/AIDS statutes concerning, 139–43
 - low-risk behaviours, criminalisation in U.S. statutes of, 27, 128–30, 136–8
 - medicalisation/demedicalisation of deviance and, 41–2
 - scope of, in Norwegian Penal Code, 115–16
 - U.S. exposure statutes and liability based on, 125–31, 134–9
- Bell, Joseph, 46
- Bennett, Jane, 27–9, 30
- 'Best Practices Guide to Reform HIV-Specific Criminal Laws to Align with Scientifically-Supported Factors' (U.S.), 145–7
- Betteridge, Glenn, 165
- Bible, illness as punishment in, 36–8
- bioinformationist metaphor, 48–9

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09182-5 - Criminalising Contagion: Legal and Ethical Challenges of Disease Transmission and the Criminal Law

Edited by Catherine Stanton and Hannah Quirk

Index

[More information](#)

230

INDEX

- biological citizenship, recent scholarship on, 173–4
- biomilitary metaphor, 48–9
- biopolitics, criminalisation of HIV/AIDS and, 33–4, 155–6
- Blackstone, W., 22–5
- blood and blood products, HIV/AIDS transmission through, 120–2
- ‘bodily harm,’ changing conceptions of, 208–9
- body as society metaphor, 52–4
- body in criminal law
- bodily harm concept and, 22–5, 208–9, 211–14
 - criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 22–5
 - deconstruction of body and harm and, 26–33
 - society as body metaphor and, 52–4
- Bones* (television series), 46
- Boroditsky, Lera, 44–5
- bounty hunters, roundup of Hawaiian lepers by, 67
- Braidotti, Rosi, 30
- Bray, S., 133
- Brazier, Margaret, xiii, 4, 223–4
- breach of trust, transmission of disease and, 220–5
- Breitha, Olivia, 71–2, 75–7
- ‘bright lines test,’ Canadian criminalisation of non-disclosure and, 167–70
- British Association of Sexual Health and HIV (BASHH) Guidelines, 78–80, 85–7, 95–6
- British HIV Association (BHIVA), 78–80
- Bronitt, Simon, 15, 16–17, 214–16
- Burris, S., 133, 141–2
- Burstow* case, 206–8, 209–10
- Bush, George W., 51–2
- Canada
- criminalisation of HIV transmission in, 13–14, 151–5
 - feminist perspectives on criminalisation of HIV/AIDS non-disclosure in, 175–200
- Canadian National Judicial Institute Workshop on HIV and the Law, 166–7
- “Cancer: Crime and Punishment” (Sharpless and DePinho), 48–9
- causation, principle of, criminalisation of transmission and, 214–16
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) (U.S.), 120–2
- Chan-Fook* case, 208–9, 211–14
- Chief Constable of Avon and Somerset Constabulary v Shimmén*, 217–20
- chlamydia, harm caused by, 3–4
- Clarence* case, 206–8, 209–10
- Clarke, E., 94–6
- colonialism, history of leprosy and, 12, 75–7
- Communicable Disease Control Act (Norway), 116–17
- Conan Doyle, Arthur (Sir), 46, 48–9
- condom use in HIV/AIDS patients as criminal defence against recklessness, 85–7
- ‘significant risk’ in Canadian HIV/AIDS criminalisation and, 156–9
 - in U.S. HIV/AIDS statutes, 130–1
- conduct perspective
- Canadian criminalisation of HIV/AIDS and, 155–6
 - criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 19–21
 - in U.S. HIV/AIDS statutes, 128–30
- confidentiality, healthcare professionals guidelines concerning, 90–2
- consent, legal concept of
- Canadian criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 156–9
 - feminist legal scholarship on criminalisation of HIV/AIDS and, 180–5, 189–90
 - Norwegian criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 114
- contagion
- crime as metaphor for, 45–7
 - critique of criminalisation paradigms concerning, 201–28
 - leprosy in Hawai‘i and theories of, 62
 - Nordic perspectives on, 98–100

- Contagious Diseases Act (1864), 1–4
 Coons, Christopher, 145–7
 corporations, responsibility for
 transmission of disease by, 42–3
 Craig, Elaine, 198
 criminalisation of contagious illness
 transmission
 as breach of trust, 220–5
 causation principle and, 214–16
 crime as disease metaphor, 47–9
 critique of paradigms for, 201–28
 current law in UK for, 211–14
 disease of crime metaphor
 and, 52–4
 disgust and, 225–7
 expansion in U.K. of, 209–10
 Hansen's disease in Hawai'i and,
 58–9, 62–3
 healthcare professional-patient
 relationships and, 78–97
 herpes transmission, 92
 inconsistency in prosecutions for
 transmission of disease, 42–3
 military/criminal metaphors relating
 to disease and, 50–2
 Nordic perspectives on,
 10–12, 98–119
 Norwegian Penal Code and liability
 for, 111–16
 recklessness and transmission of
 non-STD, 217–20
 scope of liability in English criminal
 law, 203–6
 as social deviance, 35
 social roles and gatekeeping related
 to, 39–40
 criminalisation of HIV/AIDS
 transmission
 adverse impact on prevention and
 treatment, 19–21
 biological citizenship and, 173–4
 body in criminal law and, 22–5
 in Canada, 13–14, 151–5
 construction of social order
 and, 195–7
 critique of U.S. statutes, 132–43
 disease prevention and control and,
 xiii, xvi
 feminism and, 175–200
 global trends in, 10–12
 healthcare professional-patient
 relationship and, 78–97
 HIV/AIDs and, 6–7
 identity concepts and, 8–9
 impact on sexual healthcare
 of, 78–80
 international law and scientific
 evidence concerning, 103–5
 legal status in European countries
 concerning, 105
 liability principles and, 21–2
 limited impact of, in reducing
 disease, 116–17
 normative perspective in Norwegian
 law concerning, 108–11
 Norwegian Law Commission
 proposals concerning,
 111–16, 117–19
 overview of scholarship on,
 18, 151–5
 public health policy and, xiii
 science-based criminal law reform
 and, 159–60
 social and policy effects of, 9
 state-level U.S. exposure statutes
 and, 125–31
 in United States, 12, 120–49
 U.S. policy changes relating
 to, 143–8
 criminality, disease linked to,
 38–9
 Criminal Procedure Act
 (Norway), 116–17
 Cristof, 42–3
 critical race feminism, violence
 against women and, 190–5
 Crompton, Constance, 188–9
 Crown Prosecution Service,
 85–9, 201–3
 Cuerrier, Henry, 156–9
 culpability, in criminal law, 2–3
 cultural colonisation, isolation of
 Hawaiian leprosy patients
 and, 75–7
 Cure Violence, 46
 Curran, James (Dr.), 120–2

- decriminalisation of sexually transmitted disease
 information collection and management prior to, 100–3
 normative perspective in Norwegian law and, 108–11
de minimis principle, recklessness and transmission of non-STD and, 217–20
 Denmark, decriminalisation of HIV transmission in, 10–12, 98–100
 detective metaphor, in health and disease, 45–7
 determinism, disease and, 38–9
 deviance
 crime and illness as, 35
 medicalisation/demmedicalisation of, 41–2
Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (DSM), 41–2
Dica case, 201–3, 206–8, 209–10, 214–16, 223–4
 diet and lifestyle choices
 Canadian criminalisation of HIV/AIDS and, 155–6
 illness and, 36–8
 racial stereotypes concerning, 61
 Dimock, Susan, 221–2
 disclosure of HIV/AIDS
 Canadian criminalisation of non-disclosure and, 156–9
 feminist perspectives on, 175–200
 U.S. statutes' requirements concerning, 128–30, 138–9
 discrimination of gay community
 Canadian criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 151–5
 employment discrimination and, 134–9
 HIV/AIDS and increase of, 8–9
 disease prevention and control
 crime as disease metaphor and, 38–9, 45–7, 52–4
 criminal law and, xiii
 journey metaphor of disease and, 47–9
 military/criminal metaphors relating to, 50–2
 Norwegian exemptions from criminal liability in presence of, 114–15
 Norwegian proposals for, 116–17
 punishment as tool for, 60–72
 'self-other' metaphor and, 49–50
 state responsibility for, 1–4
 U.S. prevention measures for HIV transmission and, 120–2, 130–1
 disgust, feelings of, criminalisation of contagious illness transmission, 225–7
 'dominance feminism,'
 178–80, 185–90
DPP v K, 211–14
DPP v. Smith, 208–9
 drug addiction, disease vs crime view of, 41–2, 123–4
 Dworkin, Andrea, 178–80
 Ebola
 military/criminal metaphors concerning, 51–2
 risk of transmission of, 113
 Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC), 4
 Edmond, Rod, 57
 Elliott, Richard, 161
 Emerson, N. B. (Dr.), 62–3
 employment discrimination, U.S.
 criminal exposure statutes and, 134–9
 epidemiological research, criminal law reform and, 160–3
 European Convention on Human Rights, 103–5
 Article 5, 1–4
 European Court of Human Rights, 103–5
 European Economic Area Law, criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 103–5
 Evans, Ceri, 5, 9, 78–97
 evidence-based prosecutorial guidance, development of, in Canadian criminalisation procedures, 163–7
 Falwell, Jerry, 36–8
 Feinberg, L., 19–21

- feminist legal scholarship
 anti-essentialism and legal methodology and, 178–80
 Canadian criminalisation of HIV/AIDS effect on, 170–4
 criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and role of, 13–14, 175–200
 criminal law and construction of social order and, 195–7
 disclosure vs. non-disclosure of HIV in, 197–200
 marginalisation and unintended consequences of criminalisation, 190–5
 ‘significant risk’ principle and, 180–5
 victimhood and agency in, 185–90
 Fernandez, Pualeilani, 64–5
 Flew, Anthony, 38–9
 Franke, Katherine, 196
 fraud, Canadian criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 156–9
 free will, disease and, 38–9
- Gandhi, Mahatma, 46
 gatekeeping, sickness and crime in relation to, 39–40
 ‘gay plague’ terminology, 8–9
 “Gay-Related Immune Deficiency” (GRID) terminology, 8–9
 gender and misogyny issues, feminist legal scholarship on criminalisation of HIV/AIDS and, 180–5
 General Medical Council (GMC), code of professional conduct, 90–2
 genetics research, criminality and, 38–9
 Gibson, Walter M., 61
 ‘Global Criminalisation Scan,’ 105n.16
 global health
 current challenges in, xiii
 epidemics and illness recurrence and, 16–17
 Global Network of People living with HIV (GNP+), 105n.16
 Golding, David, 92–3
 Goston, Lawrence O., xiii
 Green, J., 95–6
 gross negligence, Norwegian Penal Code and liability of, 111–16
 guilt, mental standard of, Norwegian Penal Code and, 113
 Gunderman, Richard, 36–8
 Gurnham, David, 4
- Hanne, Michael, 7–8, 35–54
 Hansen’s disease
 criminalisation of Hawaiian patients with, 62–3
 end of isolation for Hawaiians with, 72–5
 Hawaiian patients’ accounts of, 61, 64–5, 67, 70–2
 Hawaiian terminology for, 68
 history of legislation concerning, 8–9, 55–6
 legacy in Hawai’i of, 75–7
 punishment as tool for control of, 60–72
 research in Hawai’i on, 66
 sulfone therapy for, 69–70
 U.S. occupation of Hawaii and control of, 68–9
 Hansen’s Disease (leprosy), 8–9
 criminalisation in Hawai’i of, 55–77
 pathology of, 55n.1
 ‘hard law’ issues, criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 103–5
 harm in criminal law
 bodily harm concept and, 22–5, 208–9, 211–14
 breach of trust as, 220–5
 conflicting perspectives on, 19–21
 deconstruction of, 26–33
 definition of, 2–3, 7–8
 HIV/AIDS transmission as, 19
 liability principles and, 21–2
 Norwegian Penal Code and, 108–11
 ‘significant risk’ principle and, 156–9
 social and economic effects of HIV/AIDS and, 33–4
 UK criminalisation of STDs and, 206–8
 Harris, Angela, 191–2

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09182-5 - Criminalising Contagion: Legal and Ethical Challenges of Disease Transmission and the Criminal Law

Edited by Catherine Stanton and Hannah Quirk

Index

[More information](#)

234

INDEX

- Haw, Kaye, 46
- Hawai'i, criminalisation of Hansen's disease in, 55–77
- Hawkins J, 206–8
- healthcare professionals
 codes of conduct in U.K. for, 90–2
 U.K. practice guidelines for herpes and, 94–5
 U.K. practice guidelines for HIV/AIDS patients, 82–92
 in U.S., discrimination against HIV/AIDS patients by, 134–9
- herpes simplex virus (HSV)
 criminalisation of transmission of, 3–4, 78–80, 92
 pathophysiology of, 94–5
- Herpes Virus Association, 92–3
- highly active antiretroviral treatment (HAART), U.S. HIV/AIDS exposure statutes and, 120–2, 130–1, 134–9
- HIV/AIDS. *See also* criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission
 agency in transmission of, 27–9
 body concept in criminal law and transmission of, 22–5
 criminal justice scholarship concerning, 6–7, 151–5
 epidemic in U.S., origins of, 120–2
 evolution of nomenclature for, 8–9
 followup care and monitoring of patients with, 87–9
 military/criminal metaphors concerning, 51–2
 misunderstanding of, in criminal law, xiv
 non-punitive control of, 78–80
 pathology and treatment, 81
 patients 'lost to follow up' and, 85–7
 personal metaphors concerning, 47–9
 population statistics in UK for, 81–2
 practice guidelines for treating patients with, 82–92
 prognosis or treatment regimens, communication of, 84
 as punishment for homosexuality, 36–8
 risk of transmission of, 85–7, 111–16
 transmission as criminal harm, 7–8
 treatment in United Kingdom of, 81–92
 United States response to epidemic, 122–5
- HIV/AIDS Legal Clinic Ontario (HALCO), 13–14, 153–5, 167–70
- HIV and AIDS Reporting System (HARS) (U.K.), 85–7
- HIV Stigma Index, 80
- Hobhouse LJ, 211–14
- Hoekema, David, 221–2
- homosexuality
 HIV/AIDS seen as punishment for, 36–8, 123–4
 medicalisation/demmedicalisation of, 41–2
- Horvath, K. J., 141–2
- House* (television series), 46
- human rights instruments,
 criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 103–5
- Huntington's disease, criminality and, 38–9
- Hutchison, F. W., 65–6
- illness
 blame placed on victims of, 36–8
 crime associated with, 35, 47–9
 medicalisation/demmedicalisation of deviant behaviour and, 41–2
 social roles and gatekeeping related to, 39–40
- immigrants, infection control measures for, Norwegian proposals concerning, 116–17
- immune system, 'self-other' metaphor and, 49–50
- imperialism, history of leprosy and, 57
- imprisonment of leprosy patients,
 criminalisation of disease and, 60–72
- individual choice
 illness and, 36–8
 inconsistency in prosecutions for transmission of disease and, 42–3
 racial stereotypes about, 61

- individuation, body in criminal law
 and, 22–5
 infectious disease
 control in Norway of, 98–100
 crime linked to, 38–9
 inconsistency in prosecutions for
 transmission of, 42–3
 Norwegian Penal Code criteria for
 transmission of, 113
 recklessness and transmission
 of, 217–20
 survey of international controls
 of, 100–3
 in U.S. criminal exposure
 statutes, 146–8
 Infectious Disease Control Act
 (Norway), 108–11
 information collection and management,
 decriminalisation of sexually
 transmitted disease and, 100–3
 Inglis, Kerri, 8–9, 55–77
 insanity, disease vs crime view
 of, 41–2
 institutional ethnography
 Canadian criminalisation of HIV/
 AIDS transmission and, 151–5
 science-based criminal law reform
 and, 159–60
 instrumentalist view of HIV
 criminalisation, 19–21
 international law, criminalisation/
 decriminalisation of HIV/AIDS
 transmission and, 103–5
 international organisations
 decriminalisation of HIV/AIDS
 transmission and, 100–3
 responsibility for transmission of
 disease by, 42–3

 Jaffe, Harold (Dr.), 120–2
 Jewish philosophy, illness as
 punishment in, 36–8
 Johnson, Mark, 44–5
 journey, disease as, metaphor
 of, 47–9
 Judge, Anthony, 44–5, 209–10
 judicial executions, physicians' role
 in, 39–40

 judicial reasoning, science-based
 evidence and, 163–70

 Kahalelaau, W., 64–5
Ka Makaainana (Hawaiian language
 newspaper), 67
 Kant, Immanuel, 22–5
Ka Nūhou (bilingual Hawaiian
 newspaper), 61
Keeping Confidence study, 83–4, 96–7
 Keller, Evelyn Fox, 22–5
 Klein, Alana, 5, 13–14, 175–200
 Kleinman, Arthur, 57–8
Konzani case, 219n.71

 Laird, Karl, 5, 14–15, 201
 Lakoff, George, 44–5
 Latham, S. R., 141–2
 Latour, Bruno, 27–9
 Law Commission (Norway)
 Communicable Disease Control Act
 and, 116–17
 effect of proposals from, 117–19
 establishment of, 98–100
 information collection and analysis
 by, 100–3
 international law and scientific
 evidence, influence on work
 of, 103–5
 legal situation in European countries
 and, 105
 normative perspective in Norwegian
 law and, 108–11
 proposals of, 111–16
 Lazzarini, S., 133
 Lee, Barbara, 145–7
 legal implications of sexual disease
 transmission
 anti-essentialism in feminist legal
 methodology, 178–80
 Canadian criminalisation of
 HIV/AIDS transmission and,
 151–5, 163–7
 disgust in context of, 225–7
 future challenges in, 96–7
 normative perspectives in Norwegian
 law, 108–11
 survey in European countries of, 105

- legal implications of sexual disease transmission (*cont.*)
 U.K. practice guidelines for HIV/AIDS and, 83–4, 90–2
 U.K. practice guidelines in for herpes and, 95–6
 United States criminal HIV exposure statutes and, 120–49
- Legal Network (Canada), 13–14, 153–5, 159–60
 activism, texts, and text-mediated relations and, 160–3
 legacy of work by, 170–4
 science writing for juridical readers by, 163–7
 Supreme Court arguments by, 167–70
- leprosy. *See* Hansen's disease
- liability principles
 criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 21–2
 scope of liability in UK criminalisation of transmission, 203–6
- Lili'uokalani (Princess), 62–3
 Link, B. G., 36–8
 Lombroso, Cesare, 38–9
 Lota Kapuāiwa (Kamehaameha V), 55–6
 Lupton, Deborah, 22–5
- MacKinnon, Catharine, 178–80
 MacKinnon, Emily, 188–9
 marital rape, feminist legal scholarship on criminalisation of HIV/AIDS and, 180–5
 Marks, Richard, 70–2, 74
 Mathen, Carissima, 182–3
 Mawhinney, G., 15
 McLay, David, 165
mea kōkua (Hawaiian leprosy caregivers), 60, 65–6, 67, 68–9
 medical experimentation, leprosy research on Native Hawaiians, 66
 medical isolation, history of, 56
 medical professionals
 gatekeeping role of, in illness and crime, 39–40
 in U.S., discrimination against HIV/AIDS patients by, 134–9
mens rea, deconstruction of body and harm and, 26–33
 metaphors of illness
 contagion by, 35–54
 criminalisation of HIV/AIDS and, 7–8
 flow of meaning in, 47–9
 military/criminal metaphors, 50–2
 public policy and, 44–5
 of 'self' and 'other', 49–50
 Meyer, Rudolph, 65–6
 miasma theory, leprosy and, 62
- Middle Ages
 concept of body and criminal law in, 22–5
 illness as punishment in, 36–8
 isolation of lepers during, 56
 society as body metaphor during, 52–4
- military metaphors, disease management and, 50–2
- Mill, John Stuart, 2–3
 molar analysis, deconstruction of body and harm and, 26–33
 molecular analysis, deconstruction of body and harm and, 26–33
 Montgomery, Scott, 48–9
 Morgan, Henley, 46
 Mykhalovskiy, Eric, 13–14, 150–74
- Nalaielua, Henry, 71–2
 National AIDS Trust Report, 84–5
National Health Service (Venereal Diseases) Regulations, 90–2
 National HIV/AIDS Strategy for the United States, 143–8
Nature magazine, 48–9
 needle-sharing partners, in U.S.
 HIV/AIDS statutes, disclosure requirements, 128–30
 Netherlands, criminal law concerning HIV transmission in, 105
No Footprints in the Sand (Nalaielua), 71–2
 non-governmental organisations (NGOs), transmission of STDs and, 100–3

- Norway
 criminalisation sexually-transmitted
 disease in, 10–12, 98–119
 normative perspective in laws
 of, 108–11
 Penal Code of, 98–100, 111–16
 Norwegian Institute of Public
 Health, 117–19
 NOU (Official Norwegian
 Reports), 98–100
 Novas, C., 173–4
 Nursing and Midwifery
 Council, 90–2
 Nussbaum, Martha, 225–7
- O’ahu Prison, leprosy patients held
 in, 62–3
- Obama, Barack, 51–2, 143–8
- Offences Against the Person Act 1861,
 14–15, 201–3, 206–8
 bodily harm concept and, 211–14
 recklessness and transmission of
 non-STD and, 217–20
- Ontario Working Group on Criminal
 Law and HIV Exposure (CLHE),
 13–14, 153–5, 159–60
 activism, texts, and text-mediated
 relations and, 160–3
 legacy of work by, 170–4
 science writing for juridical readers
 by, 163–7
 Supreme Court arguments
 by, 167–70
- oral sex, low risk of HIV/AIDS
 transmission from, 128–30
- ‘otherness’ of diseases, military/
 criminal metaphors
 concerning, 51–2
- Parsons, Talcott, 35–6, 39–40
- patient advocacy, Hansen’s disease in
 Hawaii and, 74
- Peckham, Robert, 38–9
- Penal Codes of Nordic countries, 98
 criminalisation of sexually
 transmitted disease and, 98–100
 harm principle in, 108–11
 Norwegian Law Commission
 proposals and, 111–16
- penalties in criminal HIV exposure
 laws, harshness of U.S. statutes
 relating to, 131, 134–9
- person living with HIV (PLHIV)
 body in criminal law and liability
 of, 22–5
 liability for harm of, 21–2
- Petryna, Adriana, 173–4
- Phelan, J. C., 36–8
- Phillips, M. D., 84
- physical anomalies, disease linked
 to, 38–9
- Plaxton, Michael, 182–3
- politics
 criminalisation of HIV/AIDS
 transmission and role of, 13–14
 decriminalisation of HIV/AIDS
 transmission and, 100–3
 leprosy control in Hawai’i
 and, 66, 74
 oppression through criminalisation
 of behaviour and, 41–2
 science-based criminal law reform
 and, 159–60
- post-exposure prophylaxis (PEP)
 guidelines, 85–7, 130–1
- posthuman/posthumanity, 29–33
- Presidential Advisory Council on HIV/
 AIDS (PACHA), 143–8
- President’s Emergency Plan for AIDS
 Relief (PEPFAR), ineffectiveness
 of abstinence and faithfulness
 programs in, 135–7
- preventive measures for HIV/AIDS
 transmission, 120–2, 130–1
- proof of fault, criminalisation of HIV/
 AIDS and, 21–2
- Provider Referral services for HIV/
 AIDS patients, 84–5, 89–92
- psychosis, medicalisation/
 demedicalisation of deviance
 and, 41–2
- public health policies
 Canadian criminalisation of HIV/
 AIDS transmission and, 155–6
 crime as disease metaphor and, 45–7
 criminal law and, xiii
 disease prevention and control
 and, 1–4

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09182-5 - Criminalising Contagion: Legal and Ethical Challenges of Disease Transmission and the Criminal Law

Edited by Catherine Stanton and Hannah Quirk

Index

[More information](#)

238

INDEX

- public health policies (*cont.*)
 Hansen's disease in Hawai'i and, 57–8, 60, 72–5
 military/criminal metaphors concerning disease control and, 51–2
 Norwegian law on disease transmission and, 110–11
 state-level U.S. exposure statutes and, 125–31
 stigmatization in U.S. criminal exposure statutes as damaging to, 136–8
 United States criminal HIV exposure statutes and, 120–49
 U.S. occupation of Hawaii and leprosy management by, 68–9
 U.S. response to HIV/AIDS epidemic and, 122–5
- public policy, conceptual metaphors and, 44–5
- Punikaia, Bernard, 75–7
- punishment
 disease control using, 60–72
 illness as, 36–8
- quarantine, for leprosy, 55–6
- Quirk, Hannah, 1–17
- race and racism
 Canadian criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 151–5, 163–7
 isolation of Hawaiian leprosy patients and, 60–72, 75–7
 theories concerning leprosy and, 62
- racial segregation, medical isolation and, 56
- Radcliffe, Keith (Dr.), 92–3
- Reagan, Ronald, 123–4
- Real Existing Policies that Encourage and Allow Legal (REPEAL) HIV Discrimination Act (U. S.), 145–7
- recklessness
 condom use by HIV/AIDS patients as defence against, 85–7
 convictions in United Kingdom based on, 14–15, 80, 83–4, 85–9, 96–7
- criminalisation of disease transmission and, 3–4, 6–7, 12, 21–2
 expanding criminalisation in UK of, 209–10
 harmful conduct principle and, 30
 herpes transmission and, 92
 inefficacy of U.S. HIV/AIDS statutes in deterrence of, 139–43
 Norwegian Law Commission sanctions concerning, 100–3, 111–16, 117–19
 transmission of non-STD and, 217–20
- 'relations of ruling,' opposition to criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 153–5
- research texts, science-based criminal law reform and, 160–3
- Resolution on Ending Federal and State HIV-Specific Criminal Laws, Prosecutions and Civil Commitments (United States), 143–8
- responsibility, doctrine of
 agency and, 26–33
 body in criminal law and, 22–5
 normative perspective in Norwegian law and, 108–11
- Rhoades, Nick, 27, 136–8, 146–8
- risk of transmission
 assessment criteria for, 85–7
 Canadian criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 155–6, 163–7
 inefficacy of U.S. HIV/AIDS statutes in reduction of, 128–30, 136, 139–43
 Norwegian Penal Code criteria for, 111–16
- Rose, N., 173–4
- Roskill (Lord), 206–8
- R v Clarence* case, 203–6
- R v Cuerrier* case, 13–14, 156–9, 161, 166–74
 feminist legal scholarship concerning, 180–5
- R v DC* case, 167–70, 193–4
- R v Mabior* case, 13–14, 153–5, 166–7

- feminist legal scholarship and, 180–5, 193–4, 197–200
- Ryan White Comprehensive AIDS Resources Emergency Act, 124–5
- safe sex practices
- Canadian criminalisation of HIV/AIDS and, 155–6
 - healthcare professionals
 - communication with patients concerning, 85–7
 - ‘significant risk’ concept and, 156–9
 - in U.S. HIV/AIDS statutes, 128–30, 134–9, 141–2
- Schembri, G., 84
- Schön, Donald, 44–5
- Schultz, Viki, 196
- ‘science-based activism,’ Canadian criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 153–5
- scientific evidence
- activism, texts, and text-mediated relations based on, 160–3
 - Canadian Supreme Court on criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 167–70
 - criminalisation/decriminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 103–5, 150–74
 - criminal law reform based on, 159–60
 - presentation for juridical readers of, 163–7
 - unintended consequences in presentation of, 170–4
- ‘self-other’ distinction, metaphors of disease and, 49–50
- sentencing guidelines, in Norwegian Penal Code, 115–16
- serious disease criteria, Norwegian law on disease transmission and, 110–11
- Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS), military/criminal metaphors concerning, 51–2
- sexually transmitted diseases (STDs)
 - causation in criminalisation of, 214–16
 - characterization of leprosy as, 62, 71–2
 - criminalisation of, 3–4, 78–80, 201–3
 - recklessness and transmission of, 217–20
 - scope of liability in UK
 - criminalisation of, 203–6, 211–14
 - survey of international controls involving, 100–3
 - U.S. exposure statutes concerning, 125–31
- sexual offence cases
- criminalisation of HIV/AIDS
 - non-disclosure and, 177–8
 - feminist legal scholarship on criminalisation of HIV/AIDS and, 180–5
 - infection status assessment in,
 - Norwegian proposals for, 116–17
 - state-level U.S. exposure statutes and, 125–31
- sexual partners of HIV/AIDS patients
- Canadian criminalisation of non-disclosure and, 163–70
 - consent of, as liability exemption in Norwegian Penal Code, 114
 - feminist perspectives on nondisclosure and, 185–90
 - notification protocols for, 84–5, 89–90, 95–6
 - ‘significant risk’ principle and notification of, 156–9
 - in U.S. HIV/AIDS statutes, 124–5, 128–30
- Shrira, I., 38–9
- Sierra Leone, Ebola epidemic in, 1–4
- ‘significant risk’ concept
- ambiguities in, 155–6
 - basic parameters of, 156–9
 - criminalisation of HIV/AIDS transmission and, 153–5
 - feminist legal scholarship and, 180–5
 - problems and limitations of, 163–7
 - science-based criminal law reform and, 159–60
- Silva, Noenon K., 64–5
- sin, disease linked to, 38–9
- Slater, James, 222–3
- Slutkin, Gary, 45–7

- Smith, George, 159–60
 social order
 criminal law and construction
 of, 195–7
 illness and crime in, 39–40
 society as body metaphor, disease as
 crime and, 52–4
 Society of Sexual Health Advisers, 90–2
 sodomy laws in U.S., Supreme Court
 ruling against, 136n.98
 ‘soft law,’ criminalisation of HIV/AIDS
 transmission and, 103–5
 Sontag, Susan, 50, 54
 Stainback, Ingram M., 73
 Stanton, Catherine, 1–17
 state institutions
 criminalisation of STDs and, 100–3
 health prevention and control
 and, 1–4
 isolation of leprosy patients
 and, 60–72
 oppression through criminalisation
 of behaviour by, 41–2
 responsibility for transmission of
 disease by, 42–3
 U.S. federal government and HIV/
 AIDS epidemic and, 123–4
 statutes for criminalisation of disease
 transmission
 future challenges in, 96–7
 normative perspectives in Norwegian
 law, 108–11
 survey in European countries of, 105
 U.K. practice guidelines for HIV/
 AIDS and, 83–4, 90–2
 U.K. practice guidelines in for herpes
 and, 95–6
 United States criminal HIV exposure
 statutes and, 120–49
 sterilisation policies for leprosy
 patients, Hawaiian public health
 program for, 70–2
 stigmatization of illness, 36–8
 Canadian criminalisation of HIV/
 AIDS transmission and, 151–5
 feminist perspectives on
 criminalization of HIV
 and, 193–4
 herpes infection, 92–3
 impact on patient behavior
 of, 85–7
 isolation of Hawaiian leprosy
 patients and, 60–77
 Norwegian Law Commission
 proposals and issue of, 111–16
 United States response to HIV/AIDS
 and, 122–5, 134–9
 Stone, Deborah A., 46
 sulfone therapy for Hansen’s disease,
 introduction of, 69–70, 72–5
 Sweden, criminalisation of HIV/AIDS
 in, 105
 Symington, Alison, 172
 syphilis
 leprosy linked to, 62, 71–2
 as punishment, religious belief
 in, 36–8
 Syse, Aslak, 5, 10–12, 98–119
 terrorism, as metaphor, 51–2
 testing for HIV/AIDS, U.S. criminal
 exposure statutes as deterrent
 to, 134–9
 text-mediated relations, science-based
 criminal law reform and, 160–3
 Thatcher, Margaret, 8–9
 Thibodeau, Paul H., 44–5
 trans/posthumanity theory, 29–33
 trust, ethics of, transmission of disease
 and, 220–5
 Uganda, criminal law concerning HIV
 transmission in, 10–12
 unhealthy food, transmission of disease
 through, 42–3
 UN High Commissioner for Human
 Rights (OHCHR), 103–5
 United Kingdom
 changing conceptions of ‘bodily
 harm’ in, 208–9
 criminalisation of STDs in, 201–3
 criminal law concerning HIV
 transmission and, 10–12, 14–15,
 78–80, 105
 criminal transmission of herpes
 in, 92–3

- current criminalisation law for STDs
 - in, 211–14
- expanding criminalisation of
 - contagion in, 209–10
- recklessness and transmission of
 - non-STD in, 217–20
- scope of liability in transmission of
 - disease, 203–6
- United Nations AIDS Program
 - (UNAIDS), 78–80, 100–5
- United Nations Development
 - Programme (UNDP), 100–3
- United States
 - criminalisation of HIV transmission
 - in, 12, 120–49
 - critique of criminal exposure
 - statutes, 132–43
 - future of policy changes and
 - statutory reform in, 143–8
 - occupation of Hawaii and
 - management of leprosy by, 68–9
 - origins of HIV/AIDS epidemic
 - in, 120–2
 - response to HIV/AIDS epidemic
 - in, 122–5
 - state-level HIV exposure statutes in,
 - 125–31, 146–8
- UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to
 - Health, 103–5
- US Conference of Mayors, 146–8
- Valverde, Mariana, 38–9, 46
- victimhood
 - blame for illness and, 36–8
 - feminist perspectives on, 185–90
- violence
 - as disease, 45–7
 - against women, unintended
 - consequences of criminalisation
 - linked to, 190–5
 - viral load assessment in HIV/AIDS
 - criminal law reform and, 162–3
 - risk of transmission and, 85–7
 - voluntary HIV disclosure
 - Canadian criminalisation of HIV/
 - AIDS transmission and, 151–5
 - U.S. statutes as barrier to, 138–9
- Weait, Matthew, 7–8, 18–34,
 - 108, 185–90
- Webster, G. D., 38–9
- will, acts and consequences and, 26–33
- Williams, Nushawn, 124–5, 127
- Wilson* case, 206–8, 209–10
- Wisman, A., 38–9
- Wolf, Leslie E., 12, 120–49
- women
 - Canadian criminalisation of HIV/
 - AIDS effect on, 170–4
 - feminist perspectives on
 - criminalisation of HIV/AIDS
 - impact on, 175–200
 - impact of U.S. HIV/AIDS exposure
 - statutes on, 141–2, 146–8
 - marginalisation and unintended
 - consequences of criminalisation
 - for, 190–5
 - violence against, unintended
 - consequences of criminalisation
 - linked to, 190–5
- World Health Organisation
 - (WHO), 100–3
 - disease nomenclature guidelines and,
 - 8–9