The emergence of new empirical evidence and ethical debate about families created by assisted reproduction has called into question the current regulatory frameworks that govern reproductive donation in many countries. In this multidisciplinary book, social scientists, ethicists and lawyers offer fresh perspectives on the current challenges facing the regulation of reproductive donation, and suggest possible ways forward. They address questions such as: what might people want to know about the circumstances of their conception? Should we limit the number of children donors can produce? Is it wrong to pay donors or to reward them with cut-price fertility treatments? Is overseas surrogacy exploitative of women from poor communities? Combining the latest empirical research with analysis of ethics, policy and legislation, the book focuses on the regulation of gamete and embryo donation and surrogacy at a time when more people are considering assisted reproduction and when new techniques and policies are underway.

Susan Golombok is Professor of Family Research and Director of the Centre for Family Research at the University of Cambridge.

Rosamund Scott is Professor of Medical Law and Ethics and Co-Director of the Centre of Medical Law and Ethics in the Dickson Poon School of Law, King’s College London.

John B. Appleby is Research Associate at the Centre of Medical Law and Ethics in the Dickson Poon School of Law, King’s College London.

Martin Richards is Emeritus Professor of Family Research in the Centre for Family Research at the University of Cambridge.

Stephen Wilkinson is Professor of Bioethics in the Department of Politics, Philosophy and Religion at Lancaster University.
Regulating Reproductive Donation

Edited by
Susan Golombok
Rosamund Scott
John B. Appleby
Martin Richards
Stephen Wilkinson
## Contents

| List of editors, contributors and discussants | page viii |
| Acknowledgements | xi |
| Introduction | 1 |
| SUSAN GOLOMBOK, ROSAMUND SCOTT, JOHN B. APPLEBY, MARTIN RICHARDS AND STEPHEN WILKINSON |
| 1 The development of governance and regulation of donor conception in the UK | 14 |
| MARTIN RICHARDS |
| **Part I International, cross-border and global issues** |
| 2 International regulation and cross-country comparisons | 39 |
| GUIDO PENNINGS, ROBERT KLITZMAN AND FERNANDO ZEGERS-HOCHSCHILD |
| 3 Legal regulation of family creation through gamete donation: access, identity and parentage | 60 |
| THERESA GLENNON |
| 4 Reproductive donation in the context of environmental and global justice | 84 |
| ANJA J. KARNEIN AND MATTIAS ISER |
| 5 Normative and regulatory issues in cross-border reproductive health care | 105 |
| GUIDO PENNINGS |
| 6 Surrogacy: issues, concerns and complexities | 126 |
| VASANTI JADVA |
Contents

7 A better legal framework for United Kingdom surrogacy? 140
Natalie Gamble

Part II How many children per donor?

8 Sperm donors limited: psychosocial aspects of genetic connections and the regulation of offspring numbers 165
Tabitha Freeman, Vasanti Jadva and Jenna Slutsky

9 Limiting offspring numbers: can we justify regulation? 185
Katharine Wright

Part III Donors: experiences, motivations and consent

10 Regulating the ‘good’ donor: the expectations and experiences of sperm donors in Denmark and Victoria, Australia 207
Susanna Graham, Sebastian Mohr and Kate Bourne

11 Gamete donor motives, payment and child welfare 232
Stephen Wilkinson

12 Egg-sharing, motivation and consent: ethical, legal and policy issues 259
Rosamund Scott

Part IV Information about donors: the interests at stake

13 Thoughts and feelings about the donor: a family perspective 293
Lucy Blake, Elena Ilioi and Susan Golombok

14 ‘Choosing’ a donor: parents’ perspectives on current and future donor information provision in clinically assisted reproduction 311
Sophie Zadeh, Susan Imrie and Andrea M. Braverman
| Contents |
|------------------|--------|
| 15 Regulating the provision of donor information to donor-conceived children: is there room for improvement? | 334 |
| JOHN B. APPLEBY |
| 16 The informational needs of prospective parents: an ethical perspective | 352 |
| BOBBIE FARSIDES |
| Index | 373 |
Editors, contributors and discussants

Editors

Susan Golombok, Professor of Family Research and Director, Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge

Rosamund Scott, Professor of Medical Law and Ethics and Co-Director, Centre of Medical Law and Ethics, King’s College London

John B. Appleby, Research Associate, Centre of Medical Law and Ethics, King’s College London

Martin Richards, Emeritus Professor of Family Research, Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge

Stephen Wilkinson, Professor of Bioethics, Department of Politics, Philosophy and Religion, Lancaster University

Contributors

John B. Appleby, Centre of Medical Law and Ethics, King’s College London

Lucy Blake, Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge

Kate Bourne, Victorian Assisted Reproductive Treatment Authority, Australia

Andrea M. Braverman, Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Thomas Jefferson University, USA

Bobbie Farsides, Brighton and Sussex Medical School, University of Sussex

Tabitha Freeman, Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge

Natalie Gamble, Natalie Gamble Associates, Salisbury
List of editors, contributors and discussants  ix

Theresa Glennon, Beasley School of Law, Temple University, USA
Susan Golombok, Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
Susanna Graham, Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
Elena Ilioi, Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
Susan Imrie, Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
Mattias Iser, Binghamton University, State University of New York, USA
Vasanti Jadva, Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
Anja J. Karnein, Binghamton University, State University of New York, USA
Robert Klitzman, College of Physicians and Surgeons, Columbia University, USA
Sebastian Mohr, Aarhus University, Copenhagen, Denmark
Guido Pennings, Bioethics Institute, Ghent University, Belgium
Martin Richards, Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
Rosamund Scott, Centre of Medical Law and Ethics, King’s College London
Jenna Slutsky, Center for Attachment Research, The New School for Social Research, New York, USA
Stephen Wilkinson, Department of Politics, Philosophy and Religion, Lancaster University
Katharine Wright, Nuffield Council on Bioethics, London
Sophie Zadeh, Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
Fernando Zegers-Hochschild, University Diego Portales, Santiago, Chile

Discussants

Kamal Ahuja, The London Women’s Clinic
Joanne Anton, Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority, London
David Archard, School of Politics, International Studies and Philosophy, Queen’s University Belfast
List of editors, contributors and discussants

Irenee Daly, School of Applied Social Sciences, De Montfort University, Leicester
Yolanda Garcia-Ruiz, Faculty of Law, University of Valencia, Spain
Danielle Griffiths, Institute for Science, Ethics and Innovation, University of Manchester
Zeynep Gürtin, Department of Sociology, University of Cambridge
Florence Herrera, Sociology Department, University Diego Portales, Santiago, Chile
Martin Johnson, Department of Physiology, Development and Neuroscience, University of Cambridge
Hallvard Lillehammer, Department of Philosophy, Birkbeck, University of London
Carol Smart, The Morgan Centre, University of Manchester
Venessa Smith, The London Women’s Clinic
Helen Statham, Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
Effy Vayena, Institute of Biomedical Ethics, University of Zurich, Switzerland
Laura Witjens, National Gamete Donation Trust, London
Paul Woodgate, The Wellcome Trust, London
Acknowledgements

This book is the third and final volume in the series on ‘Bioethics, Assisted Reproduction and the Family’ produced through a Wellcome Trust Enhancement Award in Biomedical Ethics held by Professor Susan Golombok and colleagues at the University of Cambridge Centre for Family Research and, for this volume, in collaboration with Professor Rosamund Scott from the Centre of Medical Law and Ethics, Dickson Poon School of Law, King’s College London and Professor Stephen Wilkinson from the Department of Politics, Philosophy and Religion at Lancaster University through their Wellcome Trust Senior Investigator Award, ‘The Donation and Transfer of Human Reproductive Materials’. We are extremely grateful to the Wellcome Trust for supporting the workshop that led to the present volume.

The editors greatly appreciate the involvement of everyone who took part in this project throughout its many stages. Thanks are due to the authors for their lively contributions to the workshop, their insightful chapters and their tolerance during the editing process. We would also like to thank the discussants for their stimulating and invaluable input.

Workshop dinner at King’s College, Cambridge
The workshop would not have been possible without the administrative genius of Abby Scott and Kathy Oswald who made everything run like clockwork. We are also indebted to Kathy Oswald for nurturing the book to fruition.