

Training the Party

Charlotte Lee considers organizational changes taking place within the contemporary Chinese Communist Party (CCP), examining the party's renewed emphasis on an understudied but core set of organizations: party-managed training academies or "party schools." This national network of organizations enables party authorities to exert political control over the knowledge, skills, and careers of officials. Drawing on in-depth field research and novel datasets, Lee finds that the party school system has not been immune to broader market-based reforms but instead has incorporated many of the same strategies as actors in China's hybrid, state-led private sector. In the search for revenue and status, schools have updated training content and become more entrepreneurial as they compete and collaborate with domestic and international actors. This book draws attention to surprising dynamism located within the party in political organizations thought immune to change, and to the transformative effect of the market on China's political system.

CHARLOTTE LEE is Associate Director of the China Program at Stanford University's Shorenstein Asia-Pacific Research Center. Prior to joining the Stanford China Program, she taught courses in Chinese politics, comparative politics, and international relations at Hamilton College and the United States Air Force Academy. Her research focuses on the institutions of authoritarian regimes, public bureaucracies, organizations, and contemporary Chinese politics. She holds a doctorate in political science from Stanford University and a Bachelor of Arts in political economy and Asian studies from the University of California, Berkeley.





Training the Party

Party Adaptation and Elite Training in Reform-era China

Charlotte P. Lee

Stanford University





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107090637

© Charlotte P. Lee 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Lee, Charlotte P., 1969-

Training the party: party adaptation and elite training in reform-era China / Charlotte P. Lee.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-09063-7

1. Zhongguo gong chan dang. 2. China – Politics and government – 1949 I. Title.

JQ1519.A5C349 2015 324.251'075-dc23

2015004121

ISBN 978-1-107-09063-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	List of figures	vii
	List of tables	ix
	Acknowledgments	xi
1	Introduction	1
2	The organizational landscape: party schools' development and organization	28
3	Managing the managers: party schools as a pipeline to higher office	55
4	Fusing party and market: introducing market-based incentives to the party school system	89
5	The entrepreneurial party school: party school responses to reforms	123
6	Adaptation measured: content analysis of party school training	157
7	Conclusion: risks and limits to party school reforms	178
	Appendices	
	A Number of party schools, by locale and national share of	
	leading cadres	202
	B Note on sources and research methods	203
	C Central Party School organization	208
	D City Z training allocations, 2008	209
	E Descriptive statistics and robustness tests of PSM	
	presented in Chapter 3	212
	F Central Party School Mid-Career Cadre Training	
	Classes descriptive data	221

v



vi Contents

G	International partnerships, central and provincial-level	
	party schools	224
H	Categories for coding training syllabi	227
References		229
Inc	dex	247



Figures

2.1	Local party organs involved in cadre education	
	(district-level example)	36
2.2	Government organs involved in civil servant and cadre	
	education (district-level example)	37
3.1	Frequency of administrative rank, 2003 China GSS	67
3.2	Prematch propensity score distribution	74
3.3	Postmatch propensity score distribution	74
4.1	Central-level organizations of cadre training	101
4.2	Share of total training, by school type	117
4.3	Central Party School trainee volume, 1977–2000	119
4.4	Timeline of domestic training providers	121
6.1	Percent of CPS training class time dedicated to	
	partybuilding content, 1983–2007	160
6.2	Percent of CPS training time dedicated to orthodox	
	theory, 1983–2007	163
6.3	Percent of CPS training time dedicated to the theories of	
	reform-era leaders, 1983–2007	164
6.4	Percent of CPS training class time dedicated to	
	management content, 1983–2007	165
6.5	Percent of CPS training class time dedicated to briefings,	
	1983–2007	166
6.6	Percent of CPS training class time dedicated to policy	
	and law content, 1983–2007	167
6.7	Mid-career cadre training class training content,	
	2007-08	174
B.1	Cadre population and GDP per capita, coastal region	205
B.2	Cadre population and GDP per capita, central region	205
B.3	Leading cadre population and GDP per capita,	
	coastal region	206
B.4	Leading cadre population and GDP per capita,	
	central region	206

vii



viii	List	of:	figures

B.5	Leading cadre population and GDP per capita, all	
	regions	207
B.6	Cadre population and GDP per capita, all regions	207
E.1	Absolute distance between the propensity scores of each	
	treatment observation and nearest neighbor match	216



Tables

	The organization of public officials in China, 1998	9
2.1	Highest educational attainment of cadres, by percent	
	of 2003 survey respondents	32
2.2	Provincial-level party school leadership, 2009	40
2.3	City Z planned training classes, 2008, by type and	
	enrollment levels	44
2.4	Percent increases, CPS mid-career cadre trainees, leading	
	cadres, and CCP members, select years	51
2.5	CPS Mid-Career Cadre Training Class enrollment,	
	1980–2000	51
3.1	Descriptive summary of cadre and general population	66
3.2	First-stage probit regression results for propensity score	
	estimation	69
3.3	Marginal effect for significant control variables	71
	Total cadres in treated and control groups, by propensity	
	score block	73
3.5	Estimation of average treatment effect on the	
	treated (ATT) enrollment in a non-degree party school	
	training class	75
3.6	Estimation of average treatment effect on the	
	treated (ATT) party school degree	76
3.7	Estimation of average treatment effect on the treated (ATT)	
	university degree	76
3.8	Estimation of average treatment effect on the treated (ATT)	
	party school training and university degree	77
3.9	Promotion patterns of Central Party School trainees, 1995	
	and 2000 classes	80
3.10	Career tracks of CPS trainees in stalled careers, 1995 and	
0	2000 classes	81
3.11	Administrative rank, CPS Mid-Career Cadre Training	
	Class alumni, 2010	84
		01

ix



X	List	of	tab	les

3.12	Occupation category, CPS Mid-Career Cadre Training	
	Class alumni, 2010	85
	Comparing average ages, by rank	86
4.1	Summary of local party school expense categories and	
	income sources	98
	Provincial-level party schools and administration institutes	108
	A selection of training bids, by locale and awardee	115
5.1	2001 Income and Expense Report, county-level party	
	school in Province B	126
5.2	Local party school entrepreneurial activities	132
5.3	Provincial party school partnerships with Chinese	
	universities	139
5.4	Shanghai party school and administration institute	
	international partnerships	141
6.1	Central Party School training syllabi analyzed, by year	159
6.2	Shanghai party school pedagogies, by percentage of total	
	class time	172
	Description of mid-career cadre training classes, 2007–08	173
B.1	Administrative level of interviewees	204
B.2	Interviewee type	204
B.3	Interviewee gender	204
E.1	Pairwise correlations between independent and control	
	variables	213
E.2	Descriptive summary of variables	214
E.3	T-tests for equality of means across treatment and control	
	groups, before and after matching	214
E.4-6	Estimation of average treatment effect on the treated (ATT)	
	using different matching algorithms	217
E.7	Probit regression results, effect of party school training on	
	promotion	218
E.8	Marginal effect for significant control variables	219
F.1	Age at the time of training	221
F.2	Gender	221
F.3	Home province at the time of training	221
F.4	Educational attainment	222
F.5	Percent with party school degrees	223
F.6	University major	223



Acknowledgments

When I began this project ten years ago, I had little idea that the road would be so delightfully peopled with teachers and friends, both old and new, who would bring much insight to the undertaking. Along the way, I have become indebted to many individuals on both sides of the Pacific, and each has contributed to my research and thinking in ways that are difficult to measure. I am grateful for the generosity of ideas and spirit that many mentors, friends, and family have bestowed on me during these years.

This book first took shape as my dissertation at Stanford University, and it acquired its present form during my time in the Government Department at Hamilton College, in the Department of Political Science at the US Air Force Academy, and at the Shorenstein Asia-Pacific Research Center at Stanford. Heartfelt thanks go first to Jean Oi. Her formidable skills in the field and in the classroom will continue to shape my approach to the study of China. I also could not have completed this project without the encouragement of two other readers at Stanford, Beatriz Magaloni and Mike McFaul. Beatriz challenged me always with her questioning and thinking about how the China case fits into our understanding of authoritarian systems. I am grateful for Mike's big questions and his ability to support my work while handling calls from the "situation room." Special thanks go to Andy Walder, for pushing my research in new directions, and Alice Miller, who has taught me volumes about the intricacies of elite politics in China. Joe Fewsmith sharpened the project by facilitating discussions with thoughtful audiences. I thank David Shambaugh for his generosity with documentary sources.

The process of writing this book was also due in no small part to the support of my colleagues at Stanford, Hamilton, USAFA, and beyond. Thanks go to Yuen Yuen Ang, Xiaobin He, Xiaojun Li, and Kay Shimizu for reviewing drafts and advising on data analysis. Special thanks also to scholars from "across the Bay," Leslie Wang and Rachel Stern, for including me in their China circles and providing invaluable guidance.

хi



xii Acknowledgments

I am fortunate to be surrounded by so many talented China researchers, and I draw much inspiration from them.

My deep thanks and appreciation go to each of my many friends and acquaintances in China. They remain anonymous here, but without their time and insights this book would not have been possible. I am grateful to have met so many Chinese teachers, officials, and students who were willing to share their experiences and, in so doing, illuminate some of the challenges and solutions devised within their complex political system. I thank in particular Professors Chen, Fan, Hu, Mu, Xiang, Yu, and Yuan for their energetic guidance throughout my fieldwork. In a field where the data collection challenges are daunting, I am grateful for the research assistance of Kiki, Chelsea, Haihui, Shaorong, Xiaoya, Luke, and Zhaofen.

My research would not have been possible without financial and administrative support from many organizations. The National Science Foundation, US Department of Defense Minerva Initiative, and Hamilton College all supported my research at various stages. At Stanford University, I remain grateful to the faculty and staffs of the Freeman Spogli Institute for International Studies, Shorenstein Asia-Pacific Research Center, and Center for East Asian Studies. At Cambridge University Press, I am thankful for the care with which my editor, Lucy Rhymer, her assistant, Fleur Jones, and a terrific copyediting team shepherded my project through the review and publication process. I also thank two anonymous reviewers for their careful reading of the manuscript, which improved the book in many ways.

Finally, I am deeply grateful to many personal friends and family members for their boundless generosity and support. The entire "village" has kept me well nourished all these years. I remain especially grateful to my parents, Jean and Ken, and my brothers, Eric and Kennon, who have been a part of my explorations of China from the very beginning. I thank my husband, Nik, and daughter, Lesara, without whose humor, patience, and love this project would be much diminished.