THE IRONIES OF COLONIAL GOVERNANCE

The Indian village council, or *panchayat*, has long held an iconic place in India. *Ironies of Colonial Governance* traces the history of that ideal and the attempts to adapt it to colonial governance. Beginning with an in-depth analysis of British attempts to introduce a system of panchayat governance during the early nineteenth century, it analyses the legacies of these actions within the structures of later colonial administrations as well as that of the early nationalist movement. Particular attention is paid to the ways in which the ideologies of panchayat governance evolved during this period and to the transnational exchange and circulation of panchayat ideologies.

JAMES JAFFE is Professor of History at the University of Wisconsin-Whitewater and a Fellow at the Institute for Legal Studies, University of Wisconsin-Madison. His current work on transnational legal history has received support from the National Science Foundation, the US–UK Fulbright Commission and the Ford Foundation.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LAW AND SOCIETY

Cambridge Studies in Law and Society aims to publish the best scholarly work on legal discourse and practice in its social and institutional contexts, combining theoretical insights and empirical research.

The fields that it covers are: studies of law in action; the sociology of law; the anthropology of law; cultural studies of law, including the role of legal discourses in social formations; law and economics; law and politics; and studies of governance. The books consider all forms of legal discourse across societies, rather than being limited to lawyers' discourses alone.

The series editors come from a range of disciplines: academic law; socio-legal studies; sociology; and anthropology. All have been actively involved in teaching and writing about law in context.

Series editors

Chris Arup Monash University, Victoria

Sally Engle Merry New York University

Susan Silbey Massachusetts Institute of Technology

A list of books in the series can be found at the back of this book.

THE IRONIES OF COLONIAL GOVERNANCE

Law, Custom, and Justice in Colonial India

James Jaffe University of Wisconsin



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107087927

© James Jaffe 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
Jaffe, James Alan, 1954– author.
Ironies of colonial governance : law, custom and justice in colonial India / James Jaffe. pages cm. – (Cambridge studies in law and society)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-1-107-08792-7 (hardback)
Justice, Administration of – India – History – 19th century.
Panchayat – India – History – 19th century. I. Title.
KNS132.J344 2015
347.54'0209034–dc23

ISBN 978-1-107-08792-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

In memory of my parents Laura Bernice Jaffe (1927–2011) and Stanley R. Jaffe (1923–2011)

CONTENTS

List of tables and figures		page viii ix
Acknowledgments List of abbreviations		
Map		
IVIQ		xiii
	Introduction	1
PAI	RT I DISCOVERIES AND ADAPTATIONS	19
1	The rise and fall of the panchayat in the Bombay Presidence	y 21
2	Bringing justice to every man's door	48
3	Appeals and the language of petitioning	77
4	The construction of panchayat legality	102
5	The panchayat and trial by jury, I: the civil trial	128
6	The panchayat and trial by jury, II: military and criminal justice	155
7	The panchayat debate in the Bengal Presidency, 1814–1830	183
PART II LINEAGES AND LEGACIES		207
8	The panchayat from village republic to municipality	209
9	The panchayat and the building of civil society	234
10	The panchayat legacy and the independence movement	258
	Conclusion	287
Glossary Manuscript Sources Bibliography Index		292 295 297 308

vii

TABLES AND FIGURES

FIGURES

1	Map of Bombay Presidency, c. 1840	þage xiii
2.1	Total adjusted bimonthly cases, 1823–1827	61
6.1	The native court martial (Anne S. K. Brown Military	
	Collection, Brown University Library)	160

TABLES

2.1	Total cases, c. 1819–1827	56
2.2	Distribution of cases decided, 1819–1827	57
2.3	Litigation rates: selected years, 1823–1827	59
2.4	2.4 "Statement shewing the description of suits on which decisions	
	have been passed within the Adawlut of Ahmednuggur during	
	the six months from 1st January to 30 June 1826"	62
2.5	"Statement shewing the description of suits on which decisions	
	have been passed within the Court of Adawlut in Candeish	
	during the six months from 1st January to 30 June 1826"	63
2.6	Panchayat cases, 1819–1827	65
2.7	Annual panchayat cases, 1819–1827	66
2.8	"General Abstracts of all the complaints made within the	
	Districts of Koreygaon, Waee, Kattoo, Punderpoor & Beejapore"	
	[1821]	70
3.1	Total cases decided and panchayat appeals in the Deccan, 1824	80
3.2	Panchayat appeals in the Deccan, 1825	80
3.3	Panchayat cases before the Sadr Diwani Adalat, 1800–1824	87
6.1	Employment of panchayats, assessors, and juries in criminal	
	cases, lower Bengal provinces, 1849 and 1850	180
6.2	Employment of panchayats, assessors, and juries in criminal	
	cases, North-Western Provinces, 1848 and 1849	180

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

It is a commonplace in Acknowledgments to assert the collective nature of the undertaking and in my case this is especially appropriate. Before work began on this project, my career had been spent entirely in the field of British history and particularly in the field of the histories of British industrial relations and trade unionism. In fact, this book began as a legal and social history of English arbitration practices during the nineteenth century. However, as that research proceeded, I continually found references, and very numerous ones at that, to the Indian panchayat, which I found both odd and intriguing. As the work evolved, it became apparent not only that the archival and secondary sources on the panchayat were plentiful, historically significant, and underutilized, but also that I would have to learn the vagaries, disputes, and critical issues confronting historians of British imperialism as well as historians of South Asia.

I was incredibly fortunate to find that the community of South Asianists was invariably generous with their time, advice, expertise, and friendship. I will thank them more fully in a moment, but I would first like to express my profound gratitude to those institutions and agencies that provided the funding necessary to undertake and complete this project. Particularly at this time, when support for the humanities is disappearing and the requirements for gaining such support are most often premised upon "measurable outcomes," I was indeed fortunate to receive support from the US National Science Foundation, the US-UK Fulbright Commission and the University of Leeds, and the Ford Foundation at Jawaharlal Nehru University. The grant from the US National Science Foundation, SES-0849571, provided support for my first lengthy research trip to Mumbai and thus laid the foundation for this work. The US-UK Fulbright Commission and the University of Leeds, and the Ford Foundation at Jawaharlal Nehru University provided the time, space, and financial support necessary to complete the manuscript. Without the support of all of these agencies and institutions, this work could never have been begun, much less completed.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The Fulbright–Leeds University Distinguished Chair Award brought me back into contact with several old "fellow-travelers" in British working-class and trade union history, all of whom brought their critical perspectives to my new endeavor. Foremost among these, I wish to thank Malcolm Chase, whose help in securing the Chair at Leeds was invaluable. Martin Hewitt, now Dean at the University of Huddersfield, helped to ease me into life in West Yorkshire, and, most of all, Quentin Outram, with whom I spent many an evening at the local. At JNU, the faculty at the Centre for the Study of Law and Governance were wonderful hosts who graciously made time for me despite their hectic schedules. I sincerely appreciate the help of Pratiksha Baxi and Niraja Gopal Jayal, who welcomed me to the Centre, and I could not have done without the friendship of Amit Prakash, who helped me in so many ways both large and small.

The staffs at the British Library's Asian and African Reading Room and the Maharashtra State Archive provided expert assistance while carrying the burden of the enormous tomes compiled by the East India Company. At my home institution, the University of Wisconsin-Whitewater, the interlibrary loan staff secured dozens of articles and books from around the country that were absolutely crucial for the completion of this project. I would also like to thank the editors of the *Historical Journal* for permission to reprint Chapter 5, which first appeared there.

However, it is the new friends and new colleagues that I have made during the course of this research that made this project exciting, enjoyable, gratifying, and fun. Even though I was one of their worst students, my Hindi teachers, Virendra Singh and Brajesh Samarth, deserve much credit for their persistence and patience. In Mumbai, Jehangir and Veera Patel were the kindest and most generous hosts imaginable. The Parsi club life and the marriage ceremonies that they introduced me to were experiences I shall never forget. Similarly, Erin Broach welcomed me into her busy life, providing wonderful meals, trips to the theatre, and several adventures in her "classic" automobile. In Delhi, Anita Khemka and Imran Kokiloo were wonderful hosts: Imran's meals were to die for and Anita's willingness to help me settle into life in Delhi was unstinting.

At SOAS, University of London, the group of outstanding South Asianists was especially helpful and welcoming. Among them, Peter Robb was most generous with his time and advice, Roy Fischel helped to arrange and organize my visits there, and my close friends there,

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Martin Lau, Eleanor Newbigin, and Amrita Shodhan, helped me in more ways than I can count. Amrita has shared both her expertise and friendship as we both worked on the history of panchayats, an endeavor that we once thought would be a lonely one but have since been pleasantly surprised to find that this is not the case. I owe my sincere thanks as well to the international group of scholars who work on law and/or colonialism, especially Adam Hofri-Winogradow, Binyamin Blum, Pooja Parmar, Peter Andersen, Gopika Solanki, Jothie Rajah, Shalini Randeria, and Nurfadzilah Yahaya.

This book would never have been completed without the friendship, advice, and support of Mitra Sharafi and Marc Galanter. If I were to list all of the ways in which they have helped me, then that would merit a book in and of itself. Instead, let me simply emphasize the fact that I will always be indebted to them for their wise counsel, constant support, and, most of all, their camaraderie and friendship.

I know that others may think that they have the greatest children in the world, but I really do. So thank you, Olwen and Max, for being my greatest joy. Finally, this book is dedicated to the memory of my parents.

ABBREVIATIONS

CWMG	Collected Works of Mahatma Gandhi
Hansard	Hansard's Parliamentary Debates
IOR	British Library, India Office Records
LHR	Law & History Review
MAS	Modern Asian Studies
MSA, EIC	Maharashtra State Archives, East India Company Papers
NA, CAB	National Archives, Cabinet Papers
ODNB	Oxford Dictionary of National Biography
PP	Parliamentary Papers

xii



Map 1 Map of Bombay Presidency, c. 1840¹

¹ "The Bombay Presidency (excluding Sind), c. 1843." Reproduced from Anil Seal, *The Emergence of Indian Nationalism: Competition and Collaboration in the Later Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge University Press, 1965).