Modality and Propositional Attitudes

This book shows that the semantic analysis of modal notions of possibility and necessity can be used to enhance our understanding of the interpretation of reports of belief or emotional state. It introduces intuitive notation and terminology to express ideas in modern theories of modal interpretation that are normally represented in complex logical formulas, effectively updates the 1960s-era link between possible worlds and the semantics of propositional attitude ascriptions, and reconciles two disparate views of the role of events in semantic interpretation: that of Donald Davidson and that of David Lewis. It reduces a host of variable behaviors of propositional attitude ascription to an intuitive and precise distinction between ascriptions that merely express a commitment to propositional content versus ones that attribute a mental state to the holder of the propositional attitude. This leads to an explanation of the nature and effects of the language disorder of fluent aphasia.

MICHAEL HEGARTY was formerly an Associate Professor in the Linguistics Program at Louisiana State University, where he was the recipient of the LSU Alumni Faculty Excellence Award in 2013. He is currently a Test Specialist at the Law School Admission Council in Newtown, Pennsylvania. Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-08576-3 - Modality and Propositional Attitudes Michael Hegarty Frontmatter More information Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-08576-3 - Modality and Propositional Attitudes Michael Hegarty Frontmatter More information

Modality and Propositional Attitudes

Michael Hegarty Law School Admission Council





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107085763

© Michael Hegarty 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Hegarty, Michael, 1959– author.
Modality and propositional attitudes / Michael Hegarty.
pages cm
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-1-107-08576-3 (hardback)
1. Modality (Linguistics) 2. Semantics–Psychological aspects. 3. Grammar,
Comparative and general–Prepositional phrases. I. Title.
P325.5.P78H44 2016
415'.6–dc23 2015027884
EDN 0720-1-102 00576-2 1 June 1

ISBN 978-1-107-08576-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

Acknowledgments		vii
Introduction		
	Part I Modality and propositional attitudes	5
1	Epistemic modality 1.1 Possible worlds in the theory of epistemic modal interpretation 1.2 A scalar approach to modality: Lassiter (2011) 1.3 What is the epistemic modal base? 1.4 Conclusion	15 16 33 45 60
2	Root modality2.1 Introduction2.2 Challenges to possible worlds semantics of root modals	62 62 68
3	 Bare attitude ascriptions 3.1 Introduction 3.2 Interpreting attitude ascriptions 3.3 Iterated attitude ascriptions 3.4 Prospects for semantically reduced interpretations 	91 91 92 102 103
4	 Presupposition filtering and bouletic ascriptions 4.1 Introduction 4.2 Presupposition filtering 4.3 Bouletic ascriptions 4.4 Conclusion Conclusion to Part I 	113 113 113 113 118 131 131
	Part II Events and propositional attitudes	133
5	Events and states 5.1 Part-whole structure of events 5.2 Individuating events 5.3 Stative attitude ascriptions and neo-Davidsonian representations	137 138 152 155

v

vi Contents

6	 Full attitude ascriptions: individuating mental states through propositional content 6.1 Something is missing 6.2 Individuating and identifying by content 6.3 Two types of attitude ascription 6.4 Reports of attitude ascription 6.5 Reports of attitude assertion 6.6 Multidimensional attitude reports 6.7 Conclusion 	166 168 171 174 179 182 184
7	 Lower interpretation of negation 7.1 Delineation of the phenomenon 7.2 Neg-importation and duals 7.3 Applications and discussion 7.4 Other recent accounts of the lower interpretation of negation 	185 185 192 198 205
8	Events in epistemic and root modal interpretation 8.1 Hacquard's event-based theory of modal determination and interpretation 8.2 On the role of events in modal determination	220 220 225
9	 Attitude ascription in child development and Wernicke's aphasia 9.1 Establishing a baseline 9.2 Child language development of attitude ascriptions 9.3 Wernicke's aphasia: selective impairment of full ascriptions 	237 237 246 254
10	Conclusion	273
Au	ferences thor Index bject Index	276 288 291

Acknowledgments

For comments on previous versions of parts of this work, and discussion of topics addressed here, I am grateful to audiences at various conference and workshop talks I have given dating back to 2006, when I first began working on the topics of this book. I particularly want to thank Nicholas Asher, Lucia Tovena, Pierre Larrivée, and Kai von Fintel. I am grateful to students who participated in my Louisiana State University seminar on topics related to this work, including Danielle Alfandre, Sara Monti, and Jerry Weltman. I particularly thank Kari Swingle and Jerry Weltman for giving detailed comments on the manuscript and for intensive discussion of some of its main points. I am grateful to Ann Mulkern also for detailed comments on the manuscript, and for preparing the index. Hugh Buckingham pointed me to his work and the work of others on jargonaphasia. I am grateful to him for this and for generously sharing his jargonaphasia data. I thank Cambridge University Press reviewers for helping to sharpen many points in the manuscript and for their efforts to help prevent such a large, long-unfolding project from falling too far behind the literature on topics addressed in the work. For financial support I am grateful to the State of Louisiana Board of Regents for a 2010-2011 Award to Louisiana Artists and Scholars, award number LEQSF(2010-11)-RD-ATL-03, and to the College of Humanities and Social Sciences at Louisiana State University (LSU - Baton Rouge) for a semester of paid leave in 2011. In Chapter 1, examples (44) and (45) as well as the figure in (46) are reproduced from Lassiter (2011), for which permission is gratefully acknowledged. The definitions associated with Lassiter's scalar theory are also drawn directly from his work. Some paragraphs of Chapter 5 and Chapter 6 (Section 6.2) are reproduced from my contribution, "Two Types of Belief Report," to the Baltic International Yearbook of Cognition, Logic and Communication, vol. 6. Permission to reproduce those paragraphs is also gratefully acknowledged.