

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## BETWEEN INTERESTS AND LAW

We could not have a global economy without a system to resolve commercial disputes across borders, but the international regime that performs this key role bears little resemblance to other pillars of the global economy. A hybrid of private arbitral institutions, international treaties, and domestic laws and courts, the regime for commercial dispute resolution shows that effective transborder institutions can take a variety of forms.

This book offers the first comprehensive social-scientific account of this surprisingly effective regime. It maps and explains the web of institutions traders use to resolve disputes, tracing their evolution since the Industrial Revolution, both at the global level and in the United States, Argentina, and China.

The book shows how both political economic approaches and sociolegal theories have shaped institutional outcomes. Whereas economic interests have been the chief determinants, legal processes have played a key role in shaping the form institutions take. The regime for commercial dispute resolution therefore remains between interests and law.

THOMAS HALE is Associate Professor at the Blavatnik School of Government, Oxford University. His previous books include *Gridlock: Why Global Cooperation Is Failing When We Need It Most* (with David Held and Kevin Young, 2013) and *Transnational Climate Change Governance* (with Harriet Bulkeley, Liliana Andonova, Michele M. Betsill, Daniel Compagnon, Matthew J. Hoffmann, Peter Newell, Matthew Paterson, Charles Roger, and Stacy D. VanDeveer, 2014).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial  
Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# BETWEEN INTERESTS AND LAW

The Politics of Transnational Commercial Disputes

THOMAS HALE



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107083622](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107083622)

© Thomas Hale 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN 978-1-107-08362-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial  
Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

For those who taught me,  
and who teach me still

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial  
Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

	<i>List of figures</i>	page	x
	<i>List of tables</i>		xii
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>		xiii
1	Introduction		1
	1.1 Dispute resolution as a laboratory for shifts in global governance		3
	1.2 Law and politics		6
	1.3 The question: institutional variation in transborder commercial dispute resolution		7
	1.4 The argument: market power, legal networks, and their interaction		9
	1.5 Research design and overview		11
	1.6 Relation to existing work		16
2	The past and present regime for transborder commercial disputes		25
	2.1 Introduction		25
	2.2 A historical sketch of institutions for cross-border commercial dispute resolution		26
	2.3 The contemporary system of transnational commercial arbitration and other dispute settlement institutions		34
	2.4 The role of commercial arbitration in the global economy		40
3	Institutions between interests and law		47
	3.1 Introduction		47
	3.2 Conceptualizing the dependent variable(s): supply and demand		49
	3.3 Market power		51
	3.4 Legal networks		73
	3.5 The interplay of law and politics		84
	3.6 Summary of hypotheses and observable implications		89

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

## CONTENTS

- |     |  |     |  |
|-----|--|-----|--|
| 4   | The intergovernmental regime: from interests to law over a century         | 93  |  |
| 4.1 | Introduction   | 93  |  |
| 4.2 | The Geneva treaties of the 1920s   | 95  |  |
| 4.3 | The New York Convention of 1958  | 128 |  |
| 4.4 | Conclusion: the evolution from interests to law                            | 151 |  |
| 5   | The United States  | 155 |  |
| 5.1 | Introduction   | 155 |  |
| 5.2 | The colonial period: internalizing “foreign” trade through empire          | 157 |  |
| 5.3 | Economic takeoff and the creation of the hybrid system, 1860–1930          | 165 |  |
| 5.4 | Postwar shift: the dominance of law, within bounds                         | 200 |  |
| 5.5 | Conclusion: the convergence of interests and law                           | 227 |  |
| 6   | Argentina  | 231 |  |
| 6.1 | Introduction   | 231 |  |
| 6.2 | The colonial legacy: a hybrid medieval system                              | 233 |  |
| 6.3 | Independence and state building: the assertion of law and public authority | 242 |  |
| 6.4 | The Golden Age: economic miracle brings a return to private authority      | 251 |  |
| 6.5 | The Depression, state intervention, and Peronism                           | 264 |  |
| 6.6 | Postwar: state intervention under partisan conflict                        | 269 |  |
| 6.7 | Democracy, the neoliberal turn, and its limits                             | 276 |  |
| 6.8 | Conclusion: a private alternative to the public rule of law                | 299 |  |
| 7   | China  | 302 |  |
| 7.1 | Introduction   | 302 |  |
| 7.2 | The century of humiliation: dispute resolution in treaty ports             | 305 |  |
| 7.3 | The Mao era: private institutions in the party-state                       | 312 |  |
| 7.4 | The reform period: instrumental isomorphism                                | 320 |  |
| 7.5 | Conclusion: private institutions for public purposes                       | 349 |  |
| 8   | Conclusion: findings and implications                                      | 352 |  |
| 8.1 | Findings across cases  | 352 |  |
| 8.2 | A bounded evolution from interests to law                                  | 355 |  |
| 8.3 | Implications for transborder commercial dispute resolution                 | 359 |  |



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

CONTENTS

ix

8.4 Implications for the study of institutional diversity in global  
governance 363

8.5 Implications for managing interdependence 367

*Bibliography* 369

*Index* 398

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## FIGURES

2.1 Firm preferences over laws governing arbitration disputes.	<i>page</i> 36
2.2 Usage of international and transnational laws in arbitration.	36
2.3 Where do firms prefer to hold arbitrations?	37
2.4 Commercial dispute resolution versus arbitration.	39
2.5 Transborder cases at select arbitral institutions, 1992–2009.	42
3.1 Conceptualizing the dependent variable.	50
3.2 A rationalist model of variation in dispute resolution institutions.	70
4.1 British imports of finished goods, 1882–1934.	103
4.2 Total exports of British produce and manufactures, 1854–1935.	104
4.3 Participation in the 1958 New York Convention, 1958–2014.	150
5.1 US trade in goods, 1867–1930.	166
5.2 US openness.	166
5.3 US wheat and flour exports, 1850–1930.	168
5.4 US exports by type, 1821–1930.	178
5.5 US postwar trade.	201
5.6 US postwar openness.	201
5.7 Percentage of US trade with countries in which US arbitral awards are not enforceable.	215
6.1 Argentine trade, 1890–1930.	252
6.2 Principal Argentine commodity exports, 1864–1930.	254
6.3 Mid-century Argentine trade.	265
6.4 Principal Argentine exports at mid century.	265
6.5 Argentine trade, 1949–2004.	271
6.6 Caseload of Arbitration Chamber of the Buenos Aires Stock Exchange, 1963–2010.	281
6.7 BCBA arbitrations and federal court cases compared, 2002–9.	282
7.1 Trade in the early People's Republic.	316
7.2 China's openness, 1970–2010.	321
7.3 Civil cases, economic disputes, contract disputes, and arbitration cases in PRC courts, 1986–2008.	328
7.4 Economic disputes and contract disputes relative to GDP, 1986–2008.	329
7.5 Foreign economic disputes as a percentage of total disputes, 1987–96.	329

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## LIST OF FIGURES

xi

7.6 Litigation versus arbitration in China, 1986–96.	329
7.7 TCA cases at leading Chinese arbitral institutions.	331
7.8 Arbitral disputes involving Chinese parties outside of China.	331
7.9 China-related TCA cases at major Chinese and foreign arbitration centers.	332
7.10 CIETAC's and BAC's total caseload, 1990–2009.	333
7.11 Ratio of arbitration cases in CIETAC and BAC to GDP.	333
7.12 Foreign law firms in China, 2012.	342

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## TABLES

3.1 Factors that shape alternative dispute resolution institutions	<i>page</i> 63
3.2 The marker power explanation	90
3.3 The legal networks explanation	92
4.1 Years in which countries passed threshold of manufacturing output per capita obtained by Great Britain in 1870	103
4.2 Members of the 1924 Protocol and 1927 Convention, date of entry into force	120
4.3 Ratification of the Geneva arbitration treaties	121
5.1 Types of disputes put to arbitration	227
5.2 Reasons companies arbitrate disputes	228
5.3 Results of US subcases	229
6.1 Market share, by firm, of Anglo-Argentine wheat trade, 1914	255
6.2 Primary Argentine exports by value, 2010	284
6.3 Market share of top soy exporters, 2002	285
6.4 Argentina subcase findings	299
7.1 Institutional alternatives in the Mao era	315
7.2 Top arbitral institutions in China (foreign and domestic arbitration), 2010	325
7.3 Institutional alternatives in the reform period	339
7.4 China subcase findings	350
8.1 Cross-case findings	356
8.2 Public and private governance ideal types	365

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

There is so much that goes into making a book, and the doctoral dissertation from which it grew, that it is difficult to know where to begin acknowledging the various building blocks on which the present study sits. However, one may start, as the analysis that follows does, with the imperatives of material needs. I am deeply thankful for research support from Princeton's Department of Politics and from several of the university's centers: the Program in Latin American Studies, the Program in East Asian Studies, the Program in International and Regional Studies, and the Political Economy Research Program. The Department of Government at the London School of Economics was a generous host for much of the writing process, and Oxford's Centre for International Studies and Global Economic Governance Programme hosted a key workshop to interrogate and improve a late draft.

However, as the reader will discover in the following chapters, ideas and epistemic communities can be just as important as material needs. Indeed, this is much more true in scholarship than in commercial dispute resolution. I am therefore grateful to the individuals who discussed those ideas and formed that community at Princeton, the London School of Economics, and Oxford. These include, without prejudice as to order, Lauge Poulsen, Noel Johnson, Emily Jones, Taylor St. John, Mareike Kleine, John Wagner Givens, Walter Mattli, Duncan Snidal, Kalypso Nicolaidis, Ngaire Woods, and Mathias Koenig-Archibugi. In the research process, I was guided by an even wider group of individuals who were rich in knowledge and generous with time, including Cao Lijun, Anthony Dicks, Loukas Mistelis, Alejandro Garro, and Horacio Grigera Naón. Tim Büthe and several anonymous reviewers provided generous and constructive comments on the draft manuscript.

I am most grateful, however, to the individuals who have taught, advised, and mentored me at Princeton and elsewhere. These include Christina Davis as a graduate advisor, Andrew Moravcsik and Helen Milner on my dissertation committee, and, most significantly, Robert O.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-08362-2 - Between Interests and Law: The Politics of Transnational Commercial Disputes

Thomas Hale

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

xiv

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Keohane as my dissertation advisor. His unflinching rigor tore down weak versions of my ideas, and his extraordinary intellectual generosity helped me build stronger versions from the rubble. David Held and Anne-Marie Slaughter, though not deeply involved in this book, did much to lay the intellectual foundation on which it stands. It has been my great fortune and privilege to work with scholars who not only lead their fields but rank the success of their students high among their many accolades. I have often felt both humbled and inspired by this generosity. The book is dedicated to them.

Finally, but most fundamentally, material and ideational inputs require an author. But an author cannot subsist on research alone, though sometimes it may seem that he does. This book would not have been possible without my partner, my parents, my expanding family, and my friends. On the surface, one can identify some tensions between this element of life and the exigencies of research. On a more profound level, however, it is the bedrock on which this work sits. For all this and more, I am grateful.