TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE AFTER GERMAN REUNIFICATION

How do societies transitioning from oppressive to democratic rule hold accountable those citizens who contributed to maintaining injustice in the ancient regime by secretly denouncing fellow citizens? Is their public identification a way of fulfilling respect for those who suffered harm as a result of their collaboration? And is public identification respectful of denunciators themselves?

This book pursues these questions through a multidisciplinary investigation focusing on the denunciators for the East German secret police and the Ministry of State Security and the way in which they have been publicly unveiled in contemporary German society. The book evaluates the justifications that social actors offer to support or oppose public identifications; how targeted collaborators react to this social practice; and whether it achieves its intended purpose. At every stage, the book asks whether the motivations and the consequences of public identifications honor or undermine the value of respect for people.

Juan Espindola is an assistant professor at the Center for Research and Teaching in Economics in Mexico City. He has held postdoctoral fellowships at the Centre for Advanced Studies Justitia Amplificata in the Goethe-University of Frankfurt and at the Institute for Social Research in the National University of Mexico. He has been a visiting scholar at the Max-Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law in Heidelberg and at the Institute of Political Studies in Paris. His work has appeared in journals such as Ethical Theory and Moral Practice, Res Publica, and German Studies Review. His primary research areas include transitional justice, historical rectification, and education. He received his PhD in Political Science from the University of Michigan.
Transitional Justice after German Reunification

EXPOSING UNOFFICIAL COLLABORATORS

Juan Espindola

Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas,
Mexico City
CONTENTS

Acknowledgments ........................................... page vii

1 Exposing Unofficial Collaborators ......................... 1
   1.1 The Disclosures of Respect ............................ 1
   1.2 Collaboration and Respect: A Framework ........... 12
   1.3 Respect and Its Relatives ............................ 23
   1.4 The Method and the Sources .......................... 27
   1.5 An Outline of the Chapters .......................... 31
   1.6 Ideological and Partisan Reductions ................ 35

2 The Regime, the Secret Police, and Coming to Terms with the Past ................... 39
   2.1 A Web of Surveillance ................................ 39
   2.2 The IM Network ....................................... 46
   2.3 The Trials and Errors of Vergangenheitsbewältigung . 54

3 The Case(s) of the Litigating Spies: Public Shame, Reputation, and Respect ............. 72
   3.1 Veils of Anonymity and Pillories of Shame .......... 72
   3.2 The Right of Personality: Schubert, Take One ....... 74
   3.3 The List of Informers and the Courts: Balancing Publicity and Respect .................. 80
   3.4 The Law of the Archives: Reputation’s Wedge ...... 87
   3.5 Resozialisierung and the Right to Forgetfulness: Schubert, Take Two .................. 91
   3.6 A Tale of Two (Harmful) Brothers .................... 97
   3.7 Conclusion: The Politics of Shame .................... 102

4 Civic Interpellations: Denunciation as Self-Disrespect ........... 104
   4.1 The Rhetoric of Zivilcourage ......................... 104
## Contents

4.2 The Filth of Denunciation: Shaming Interpellations ................. 106  
4.3 Citizens and Barbarians: Encouraging Civic Courage .......... 115  
4.4 Dirty Hands and Respect: When in Doubt, Out ...................... 123  
4.5 Failed Interpellation? ........................................ 131  
4.6 Conclusion ......................................................... 138  

5 Stasi Agents as Responsible Agents? Responsibility and Respect ........................................ 140  
5.1 The Complexity of Responsibility, and the Fine Line of Respect ........................................ 140  
5.2 The Most Important Weapon Against the Enemy ................. 143  
5.3 Forfeiting One's Soul: The Recalcitrance of Personal Intentions ........................................ 161  
5.4 Displacing Responsibility: Why Wut Is Not Mut ................. 170  
5.5 Conclusion ......................................................... 183  

6 An Apology for Public Apologies: A Matter of Respect? ........ 184  
6.1 A Less Respectful Kind of Apology? ............................. 184  
6.2 Deliverance from Resentment or Delivery of Repentance? .......... 187  
6.3 Interpersonal Repentance or Public Recognition? ............... 192  
6.4 From Emotional Report to Membership Reaccreditation .......... 198  
6.5 The Economy of Forgiveness: The Depreciation of Respect ........ 205  
6.6 Conclusion ......................................................... 208  

7 The Politics of Reconciliation: Offering Respect? ................. 210  
7.1 Introduction: The Kaiser’s Apology ................................ 210  
7.2 A Ritualized Vergangenheitsbewältigung? .......................... 212  
7.3 Supererogation or Obligation? ..................................... 218  
7.4 Of Suspension and Release: Without Reconciliation? ............ 223  
7.5 An Unrequited Apology: One Closure Takes Two Self-Disclosures ........................................ 228  
7.6 Conclusion ......................................................... 237  

8 Conclusion: Thou All-Spying Knave, of All Deeds of Shame ................. 239  

Bibliography .............................................................. 249  
Index ................................................................. 271
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book benefited from audiences at the Department of Political Science at the University of Michigan, the Max-Planck Institute for Public and International Law, Georgetown University, the Goethe-University of Frankfurt, and the Institute for Philosophical Research at the National University of Mexico. It also benefited from generous funding from the Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst and the Consejo Nacional de Ciencia y Tecnología.

At Ann Arbor, Michigan, where an earlier version of this book came to light, I received valuable feedback from members of the Political Theory workshop and from the political theory/philosophy community in general, including Arlene Saxonhouse, Lisa Disch, Elizabeth Wingrove, Elizabeth Anderson, and Lars Rensmann. I am particularly grateful to those who were closest to the project and provided constructive insight: Andrei Markovits (whose feedback came along with a great deal of encouragement), Don Herzog, Mika LaVaque-Manty, and Mariah Zeisberg.

Later, in Frankfurt, I continued working on the book manuscript as a Fellow at the Centre for Advanced Studies Justitia Amplificata. For that I owe a debt of gratitude to Stephan Gosepath and Rainer Forst. Forst’s generosity and encouragement also allowed me to extend my stay at the Forschungskolleg Humanwissenschaften in Bad Homburg. For making my stay at the Kolleg a wonderful experience, thanks to Ingrid Rudolph, Beate Sutterlüty, Andreas Reichhardt, and Maria Lorch. I received enormously helpful reactions when presenting some sections of this book at a conference on collective responsibility in Bad Homburg, with the participation of Kasper Lippert-Rasmussen, Avia Pasternak, Mark Osiel, Miriam
Ronzoni, Jesse Tomalty, Alex Leveringhaus, and Barbara Buckinx, among others.

For reading drafts of some of the chapters of the book and/or giving me valuable comments, thanks to Julian Culp, Jonathan Devore, Dorothea Gädeke, Eduardo García-Ramírez, Sabine Hake, Helen Ho, Bronwyn Leebaw, Claudio López-Guerra, Itzel Mayans, Mihaela Mihai, Darrel Moellendorf, Andrea Pozas-Loyo, Alberto Puppo, Christian Schemmel, Christine Straehle, Mauricio Tenorio, Mathias Thaler, and, last but not least, Moisés Vaca. The comments of two anonymous reviewers for the Press were extremely helpful in clarifying many arguments in the book. I much appreciate the assistance and suggestions of John Berger, who was extremely helpful and supportive throughout the editorial process.

Finally, I extend special gratitude to my parents Juan M. Espíndola and Rachel Mata, my sister Monica Espíndola, and my wife Miwa Pierre-Audain for their unconditional and unwavering love. To all of them I dedicate this book.