This book addresses maritime piracy by focusing on the unique and fascinating issues arising in the course of domestic piracy prosecutions, from the pursuit and apprehension of pirates to their trials and imprisonment. It examines novel matters not addressed in other published works, such as the challenges of preserving and presenting evidence in piracy trials, establishing the rights of pirate defendants, and contending with alleged pirates who are juveniles. A more thorough understanding of modern piracy trials and the precedent they have established is critical to scholars, practitioners, and the broader community interested in counter-piracy efforts, because these prosecutions are likely to be the primary judicial mechanism for contending with pirate activity in the future.

Michael P. Scharf is interim dean and the John Deaver Drinko–Baker & Hostetler Professor of Law at the Case Western Reserve University School of Law. He is also managing director of the Nobel Peace Prize–nominated Public International Law and Policy Group. He is the author of 17 books, including, most recently, Shaping Foreign Policy in Times of Crisis (2010) and Customary International Law in Times of Fundamental Change: Recognizing Grotian Moments (2013). During the George H. W. Bush and Clinton administrations, Scharf served in the Office of the Legal Adviser of the U.S. Department of State.

Michael A. Newton is an expert on accountability and conduct-of-hostilities issues and Professor of the Practice of Law at the Vanderbilt University Law School. He has published more than 80 articles and book chapters, as well as opinion pieces in the New York Times, the International Herald Tribune, and other newspapers. In addition to having written numerous articles on issues of international law, he is the author of Enemy of the State: The Trial and Execution of Saddam Hussein (2014, co-authored with Michael Scharf) and Proportionality in International Law (2014, co-authored with Larry May), as well as the senior editor of Terrorism: International Case Law Reporter (2007–2012, updated annually).

Contents

Contributors  page vii

Introduction  1
(Michael P. Scharf)

PART I DEFINING THE CRIME OF PIRACY AND ESTABLISHING JURISDICTION OVER THE CRIME OF PIRACY

1 The Governing International Law on Maritime Piracy  13
(Sandra L. Hodgkinson)

2 The Incorporation of International Law to Define Piracy Crimes, National Laws, and the Definition of Piracy  32
(Sandra L. Hodgkinson)

3 Exercising Universal Jurisdiction over Piracy  54
(Ved P. Nanda)

4 Incorporating International Law to Establish Jurisdiction over Piracy Offenses: A Comparative Examination of the Laws of the Netherlands, South Korea, Tanzania, India, and Kenya  75
(Milena Sterio)

PART II THE PURSUIT, ARREST, AND PRE-TRIAL TREATMENT OF PIRATES

5 The Use of Force against Pirates  103
(Laurie R. Blank)
Contents

6 The Use of Force by Private Parties against Suspected Pirates 119
   (Mark V. Vlasic and Jeffrey Paul DeSousa)

7 Transfer of Suspected and Convicted Pirates 150
   (Frederick Lorenz and Laura Eshbach)

8 Pirates’ Right to a Speedy Trial 172
   (Milena Sterio)

PART III LEGAL ISSUES IN DOMESTIC PIRATE TRIALS

9 Evidentiary Issues in Piracy Prosecutions 207
   (Frederick Lorenz and Kelly Paradis)

10 Piracy and the Problem of “Command Responsibility” 242
    (Michael A. Newton)

11 The Issue of Juvenile Piracy 275
    (Jon Bellish)

PART IV SENTENCING AND POST-SENTENCE TREATMENT OF CONVICTED PIRATES

12 The Problems of Pirate Punishment 299
    (Eugene Kontorovich)

13 The Potential for Asylum-Seeking by Convicted Pirates 320
    (Yvonne M. Dutton)

Conclusion: Is There a Case for an International Piracy Court? 350
   (Michael P. Scharf)

Index 357
Contributors

Editors

Michael A. Newton is an expert on accountability and conduct of hostilities issues. Over the course of his career, he has published more than 70 articles and book chapters, as well as opinion pieces for the New York Times, the International Herald Tribune, and other papers. Professor Newton is a member of the International Institute of Humanitarian Law and the International Bar Association. At Vanderbilt, he developed and teaches the innovative International Law Practice Lab and develops externships and other educational opportunities for students interested in international legal issues. Professor Newton currently serves on the executive council of the American Society of International Law (ASIL) and has previously served on its Task Force on U.S. Policy toward the International Criminal Court and on an experts group in support of the Task Force on Genocide Prevention established by the U.S. Holocaust Memorial Museum and the U.S. Institute of Peace. He has supervised Vanderbilt law students working in support of the Public International Law Policy Group to advise the governments of Afghanistan, Kosovo, Sri Lanka, Kenya, Uganda, and other nations. Professor Newton negotiated the Elements of Crimes document for the International Criminal Court and coordinated the interface between the FBI and the ICTY while deploying into Kosovo to do the forensics fieldwork in support of the Milosevic indictment. As the senior advisor to the Ambassador-at-Large for War Crimes Issues in the U.S. State Department, Professor Newton implemented a wide range of policy positions related to the law of armed conflict, including U.S. support to accountability mechanisms worldwide. He was the senior member of the team that taught international law to the first group of Iraqis who began to think about accountability mechanisms and a constitutional structure in November 2000. He subsequently
assisted in drafting the Statute of the Iraqi High Tribunal, and he served as International Law Advisor to the Iraqi Judicial Chambers in 2006 and 2007. Professor Newton has taught Iraqi jurists on seven other occasions, both inside and outside Iraq, and as part of the academic consortium he assists Vanderbilt students in providing substantive advice to the lawyers in Iraq. He served as the U.S. representative on the U.N. Planning Mission for the Sierra Leone Special Court and was also a member of the Special Court academic consortium. From January 1999 to August 2000, he served in the State Department's Office of War Crimes Issues. Professor Newton began his distinguished military career as an armor officer in the 4th Battalion, 68th Armor, Fort Carson, Colorado, until his selection for the Judge Advocate General’s Funded Legal Education Program. As an operational military attorney, he served with the U.S. Army Special Forces Command (Airborne), Fort Bragg, North Carolina, in support of units participating in Desert Storm. Following duty as the chief of operational law, he served as the group judge advocate for the 7th Special Forces Group (Airborne). He deployed on Operation Provide Comfort to assist Kurdish civilians in Northern Iraq, as well as on a number of other exercises and operations. From 1993 to 1995 he was reassigned as the brigade judge advocate for the 194th Armored Brigade (Separate), during which time he organized and led the human rights and rules of engagement education for all multinational forces and international police deploying into Haiti. He subsequently was appointed as a professor of international and operational law at the Judge Advocate General’s School in Charlottesville, Virginia, from 1996 to 1999. He currently serves as senior editor of the Terrorism International Case Law Reporter series published annually by Oxford University Press. Professor Newton has made numerous appearances on CNN, BBC, Court TV, and NPR, among other media outlets. He has written opinion pieces for the New York Times and the International Herald Tribune and has been widely quoted in print and broadcast media. Along with numerous published law review articles on issues of international law, he is the author of Enemy of the State: The Trial and Execution of Saddam Hussein, published by St. Martin’s Press in 2009.

Michael P. Scharf is the Interim Dean, John Deaver Drinoko-Baker & Hostetler Professor of Law, Associate Dean for Global Legal Studies, and Director of the Frederick K. Cox International Law Center at Case Western Reserve University School of Law. Scharf is the author of 74 scholarly articles and 14 books, including Balkan Justice, which was nominated for a Pulitzer Prize in Letters in 1997; The International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda, which was awarded the ASIL’s Certificate of Merit for outstanding book in 1999; Peace with Justice and Enemy of the State, which won the International Association of Penal Law’s book of the year award for 2003 and 2009; Shaping Foreign Policy in Times of Crisis, published by Cambridge University Press in 2010; and Customary International Law in Times of Fundamental Change: Recognizing Grotian Moments, published by Cambridge
University Press in 2013. During the George H. W. Bush and the Clinton administrations, Scharf served in the Office of the Legal Adviser of the U.S. Department of State, where he held the positions of Attorney-Adviser for Law Enforcement and Intelligence, Attorney-Adviser for United Nations Affairs, and delegate to the United Nations Human Rights Commission. In February 2005, Scharf and the Public International Law and Policy Group, a nongovernmental organization he co-founded and directs, were nominated for the Nobel Peace Prize by six governments and the prosecutor of an international criminal tribunal for the work they have done to help in the prosecution of major war criminals, such as Slobodan Milosevic, Charles Taylor, and Saddam Hussein. During a sabbatical in 2008, Scharf served as Special Assistant to the Chief Prosecutor of the Cambodia Genocide Tribunal. A graduate of Duke University School of Law (Order of the Coif and High Honors) and judicial clerk to Judge Gerald Bard Tjoflat on the Eleventh Circuit Federal Court of Appeals, Scharf is an internationally recognized expert who has testified before the Senate Foreign Relations Committee and the House Armed Services Committee and has appeared frequently in the national news media.

Milena Sterio is Associate Dean for Faculty Enrichment and the Charles R.Emrick Jr.–Calfee Halter & Griswold Professor at Cleveland State University’s Marshall College of Law. Professor Sterio earned her law degree, magna cum laude, from Cornell Law School in 2002. At Cornell, she was Order of the Coif, general editor of the Cornell International Law Journal, and a member of Phi Beta Kappa. In 2003, she earned a master’s degree, cum laude, in Private International Law from the University Paris I-Pantheon-Sorbonne; in 2002, she earned a Maîtrise en droit franco-américain cum laude, also from the Sorbonne. Her undergraduate degree, summa cum laude, in Political Science and French Literature is from Rutgers College, New Brunswick, New Jersey. Before joining the Cleveland-Marshall faculty, she was an associate in the New York City firm of Cleary, Gottlieb, Steen & Hamilton and an Adjunct Law Professor at Cornell, where she taught in the International War Crimes Clinic. Her research interests are in the fields of international law, international criminal law, international human rights, law of the seas, and private international law. She has published in the American University Law Review, the Connecticut International Law Journal, the Fordham International Law Journal, the Cardozo Journal of International and Comparative Law, the Denver Journal of International Law and Policy, the Florida Journal of International Law, and the UC Davis Journal of International Law and Policy. Her book, The Right to Self-Determination Under International Law: “Selfistsans,” Secession and the Great Powers’ Rule, was published by Routledge in 2012. Professor Sterio was the recipient of the Fulbright academic award for the spring 2013; pursuant to this award, she spent the last semester researching at Baku State University in Baku, Azerbaijan. Professor Sterio is Co-Chair of the
Contributors

Jon Bellish is the Project Develop Manager at the One Earth Future Foundation, a Colorado-based think/do tank working to eliminate the root causes of war, where he oversees the strategic development process. Prior to his role at the foundation, Bellish was a legal Project Officer at Oceans Beyond Piracy, an NGO aiming to facilitate multisector cooperation around maritime piracy off the Horn of Africa and in the Gulf of Guinea. He led the legal aspects of Oceans Beyond Piracy’s efforts related to the international response to Somalia-based piracy and the provision of private maritime security. Bellish is also a Fellow at the Nanda Center for International and Comparative Law at the University of Denver Sturm College of Law. He received his B.A. and M.B.A. at Millsaps College and his J.D. at the University of Denver.

Laurie R. Blank is the director of Emory Law’s International Humanitarian Law Clinic and was one of the principal founders of the clinic in early 2007. She supervises law students in their work assisting organizations, law firms, and tribunals on cases, projects, and issues related to humanitarian law and human rights. Before coming to Emory, she was a program officer in the Rule of Law Program at the United States Institute of Peace in Washington, D.C., where she ran an experts’ working group on New Actors in the Implementation and Enforcement of International Humanitarian Law. Blank also worked as a litigation associate in the New York and Paris offices of Shearman & Sterling. In addition to her recent book, Law of War Training: A Resource for Military and Civilian Leaders (2008), she has published several articles on topics in international humanitarian law.

Jeffrey Paul DeSousa attended law school at the Georgetown University Law Center, where he was an articles development editor for the American Criminal Law Review. He graduated cum laude in 2013. DeSousa was raised near Boston, Massachusetts, and now works as an appellate lawyer in Miami. His research interests include constitutional law, international law, and cultural property issues, and his scholarship has been published in the Georgetown Law Journal, the Georgetown Journal of Legal Ethics, and the Durham Law Review. During law school, he interned with the U.S. Department of Justice in the Criminal Division Appellate Section and for the U.S. District Court for the District of Columbia. He is an avid squash player.
List of contributors

Yvonne M. Dutton is an Associate Professor of Law at the Robert H. McKinney School of Law. Professor Dutton graduated from Columbia Law School, where she served on the Columbia Law Review and was a Harlan Fiske Stone Scholar (all years). After graduation, Professor Dutton clerked for the Honorable William C. Conner, United States District Judge for the Southern District of New York. She has practiced law as a federal prosecutor in the U.S. Attorney’s Office for the Southern District of New York, where she tried narcotics trafficking and organized crime cases. She also practiced as a civil litigator in law firms in New York and California (including Wachtell, Lipton, Rosen & Katz and Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher). Professor Dutton’s research interests include international criminal law, international human rights law, and maritime piracy. Broadly speaking, her scholarship examines questions about international cooperation and the role and effectiveness of international institutions in deterring and holding accountable those who commit crimes of international concern. Professor Dutton has published her research in a variety of law reviews. In May 2013, her book Rules, Politics, and the International Criminal Court: Committing to the Court was published by Routledge. In 2011, Professor Dutton was a Fellow in Columbia Law School’s Careers in Law Teaching Program. In 2013, she was awarded a John S. Grimes Fellowship in recognition of scholarly excellence.

Laura Eshbach is an attorney and international development professional based in Seattle, Washington. She holds a J.D. from DePaul University College of Law and an LL.M. in the Law of Sustainable International Development from the University of Washington School of Law.

Sandra L. Hodgkinson served as Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense for Detainee Affairs from 2009 to 2011. Prior to this position, she served as Deputy to the Ambassador-at-Large for War Crimes at the U.S. State Department, where she provided support to international justice mechanisms around the globe and coordinated engagement with foreign governments on repatriation of their nationals captured in the war on terror from Guantanamo Bay. She also served as Director for International Justice at the National Security Council, White House, from May 2004 to December 2005. Prior to this assignment, she was a Foreign Affairs Officer at the U.S. State Department’s Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights and Labor, first specializing in democracy and human rights promotion for the Middle East and later in global rule-of-law issues. From February 2003 to February 2004, Hodgkinson was detailed to the Department of Defense’s Office of Reconstruction and Humanitarian Assistance, and later the Coalition Provisional Authority (CPA), where she worked in Kuwait and Iraq as the senior human rights official. She served as Senior Advisor to the newly established Ministry of Human Rights and as Director for the CPA’s Office of Human Rights and Transitional Justice, which addressed mass graves and supported the Iraqi efforts to create the Iraqi High Tribunal, which tried Saddam Hussein. Prior to the State Department,
Hodgkinson spent six years on active duty in the U.S. Navy’s Judge Advocate General’s (JAG) Corps, including assignments as an Appellate Clerk to the Navy and Marine Corps’ Court of Criminal Appeals, as a Prosecutor and Foreign Criminal Jurisdiction Officer in Europe and Southwest Asia, and as an instructor at the Defense Institute of International Legal Studies where she led training teams to 25 countries on Rule of Law, Human Rights, Military Justice, and Law of War. She was recently selected for Commander in the Navy Reserve JAG Corps and is entitled to wear the Defense Meritorious Service Medal.

Eugene Kontorovich’s research spans the fields of constitutional law, international law, and law and economics. He has authored a series of papers that extend the economic analysis of law to public law. Professor Kontorovich is also one of the leading experts on maritime piracy, universal jurisdiction, and international criminal law. He has advised lawyers in historic piracy trials around the world. He is working on a book, Justice at Sea: Piracy and the Limits of International Criminal Law, under contract with Harvard University Press. His scholarship has been relied on in numerous federal judicial opinions. Professor Kontorovich has also written and lectured extensively about the legal aspects of the Israel-Arab conflict. He went to college and law school at the University of Chicago, where he also taught for two years as a visiting professor. After law school, he clerked for Judge Richard Posner on the United States Court of Appeals for the Seventh Circuit. During the 2011–12 academic year, Professor Kontorovich was a resident member of the Institute for Advanced Study’s School of Social Science at Princeton.

Frederick (Rick) Lorenz grew up in New York City and obtained his undergraduate and law degrees from Marquette University. He served in the U.S. Marine Corps for 27 years as a judge advocate, including a tour as an infantry company commander. He obtained an LLM (With Highest Honors) from George Washington University in Land Use Management and Control and practiced environmental/land use law between 1982 and 1991. In 1992 he joined the First Marine Expeditionary Force and was the senior legal advisor for the United Nations–authorized military intervention in Somalia, and he returned there as senior legal advisor for the UN evacuation in 1995. In 1996 he served in Bosnia as a legal advisor for the NATO implementation force and later was a Professor of Political Science at the National Defense University in Washington, D.C. In 2000 he served as a United Nations legal affairs officer in Kosovo, working in the UN Civil Administration. He has been a Visiting Professor of Law at the University of Bergen, Norway, and a Visiting Scholar at the Irish Centre for Human Rights in Galway, Ireland. He is currently a Senior Lecturer at the Jackson School of International Studies, University of Washington, teaching courses in international humanitarian law and water and security in the Middle East. He is also a Senior Fellow for the Public International Law and Policy Group, working in the Republic of Georgia, assisting the Georgian government in peace negotiations with the Republic of Georgia.
Abkhazia. In the summer of 2007 he was an election monitor in another self-proclaimed and disputed territory, the Republic of Nagorny Karabakh. In 2008 and 2009 he participated in a State Department program to provide legislative support in the unrecognized Republic of Somaliland.

**Ved P. Nanda** is the Evans University Professor and the Thompson G. Marsh Professor of Law at the University of Denver Sturm College of Law. In addition to his scholarly achievements, he is significantly involved in the global international law community. He is Past President of the World Jurist Association and now its Honorary President, former honorary Vice President of the ASIL and now its counselor, and a member of the advisory council of the United States Institute of Human Rights. He was formerly the United States Delegate to the World Federation of the United Nations Associations, Geneva, and Vice-Chair of its Executive Council, and he also served on the Board of Directors of the United Nations Association–USA. He also serves as an elected member of the American Law Institute and as a council member for the American Bar Association Section of International Law. In 2006 Professor Nanda was honored with a $1 million founding gift from DU alumni Doug and Mary Scrivner to launch the Ved Nanda Center for International and Comparative Law. The Center began its programming in 2007, hosting programs for lawyers, students, and community participants as well as promoting scholarship in the field of international law. In February 2004, Professor Nanda was awarded the Gandhi, King, Ikeda Award for Community Peace Building from Soka Gakkai International and Morehouse College. In 1990 in Beijing, China, Professor Nanda was presented with the World Legal Scholar Award by the World Jurist Association. He was also the recipient of the United Nations Association Human Rights Award in 1997. He has received honorary doctorates from Soka University in Tokyo, Japan, and from Bundelkhand University in Jhansi, India. He is widely published in law journals and national magazines, has authored or co-authored 22 books in the various fields of international law and more than 180 chapters and major law review articles, and has been a Distinguished Visiting Professor and Scholar at a number of universities in the United States and abroad.

**Kelly Paradis** attended the George Washington University in Washington, D.C., where she studied criminal justice and international affairs. She earned her B.A. magna cum laude and is a member of Phi Beta Kappa. After graduation, she worked for the Honorable Ronald M. Gould at the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit. She received her J.D. from the University of Washington School of Law and currently works as a law clerk for the Washington State Court of Appeals in Seattle.

**Mark V. Vlasic** is an Adjunct Professor of Law at Georgetown University Law Center; a Senior Fellow at Georgetown’s Institute for Law, Science & Global
Security; and a Principal at Madison Law & Strategy Group PLLC, where he heads the firm’s international practice. He serves as Counselor to the Antiquities Coalition and as an Expert Advisor to the European Centre for Dispute Resolution. As public-sector specialist at the World Bank Group, Vlasic served as the first head of operations of the StAR Secretariat, a presidential initiative to help developing countries recover stolen assets from past dictators. Before joining the Bank, he served as a White House Fellow/special assistant to the Secretary of Defense, advisor to the President’s Special Envoy to Sudan, and was awarded the Office of the Secretary of Defense Medal for Exceptional Public Service by Secretary Robert Gates. Prior to his government service, Vlasic practiced law at Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP and served on the Slobodan Milosevic and Srebrenica genocide prosecution trial teams at the United Nations war crimes tribunal in The Hague. He has taught the Iraqi judges that tried Saddam Hussein; served on the U.S. delegation to the Pan Am 103 Lockerbie terrorist bombing trial in the Netherlands; provided commentary to the BBC, CNN, Fox News, CBS, and NPR; and has contributed to four books, The Responsibility to Protect, Responsibility to Protect in Theory and Practice, The Business Case for Sustainable Finance, and The Encyclopedia of Transnational Crime and Justice. Vlasic studied business, theology, and government at Georgetown University while on an Army ROTC scholarship and received his Juris Doctorate, cum laude, from Georgetown University Law Center. He holds a Certificate in International Law from The Hague Academy of International Law and conducted postdoctorate research at Universiteit Leiden as a NAF-Fulbright Scholar to the Netherlands. As a U.S. Army officer, he has been attached to Capitol Hill and the Defense Attaché Office at the U.S. Embassy in The Hague, and he was awarded the Army Commendation Medal. He is a Fellow with the U.N. Alliance of Civilizations; a member of the bars of California, the District of Columbia, and the Supreme Court of the United States; and a life member of the Council on Foreign Relations. Named a Young Global Leader by the World Economic Forum in Davos, Vlasic advises numerous boards, including those related to the U.S. Trade Representative and Secretary of Commerce’s Industry Trade Advisory Committee on Services and Finance Industries; Humanity in Action, Inc.; the NCAC Fulbright Association; and the Fulbright Academy of Science and Technology.