As calls for reparations to Indigenous peoples grow on every continent, issues around resource extraction, dispossession, and displacement raise complex legal questions. What do these disputes mean to those affected? How do the narratives of Indigenous people, legal professionals, and the media intersect?

In this richly layered and nuanced account, Pooja Parmar focuses on indigeneity in the widely publicized controversy over a Coca-Cola bottling facility in Kerala, India. Juxtaposing popular, legal, and Adivasi narratives, Parmar examines how meanings are gained and lost through translation of complex claims into the languages of social movements and formal legal systems. Included are perspectives of the diverse range of actors involved, based on interviews with members of Adivasi communities, social activists, bureaucrats, politicians, lawyers, and judges. Presented in clear, accessible prose, Parmar’s account of translation enriches debates in the fields of legal pluralism, indigeneity, and development.

Pooja Parmar is Assistant Professor in the Department of Law and Legal Studies at Carleton University. Her research on legal pluralism, indigeneity, human rights, and international law has been published in such journals as the *Australian Feminist Law Journal, International Community Law Review*, and *Osgoode Hall Law Journal*. Before entering academia, Parmar practiced law in New Delhi.
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LAW AND SOCIETY

Cambridge Studies in Law and Society aims to publish the best scholarly work on legal discourse and practice in its social and institutional contexts, combining theoretical insights and empirical research.

The fields that it covers are studies of law in action; the sociology of law; the anthropology of law; cultural studies of law, including the role of legal discourses in social formations; law and economics; law and politics; and studies of governance. The books consider all forms of legal discourse across societies, rather than being limited to lawyers’ discourses alone.

The series editors come from a range of disciplines: academic law, socio-legal studies, sociology, and anthropology. All have been actively involved in teaching and writing about law in context.

Series Editors
Chris Arup Monash University, Victoria
Sally Engle Merry New York University
Susan Silbey Massachusetts Institute of Technology

A list of books in the series can be found at the back of this book.
Indigeneity and Legal Pluralism in India

CLAIMS, HISTORIES, MEANINGS

POOJA PARMAR
Carleton University
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgments</th>
<th>xi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Glossary</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 1 Introduction

1.1 Introduction 1
1.2 The Dispute 1
1.3 Adivasi 4
1.4 Legal Pluralism 9
1.5 Translation 12
1.6 Telling Other Peoples’ Stories 15
1.7 Translation and Justice 18
1.8 Some Notes on Research Methodology and Methods 20
1.9 Organization of Chapters 25
1.10 “Just Write It As I’m Telling It. You Will Understand” 26

## 2 Locating a Dispute

2.1 Places 29
  2.1.1 Plachimada 29
  2.1.2 Chittur 31
  2.1.3 Cochin State 33
  2.1.4 Palakkad 35
  2.1.5 Kerala 36
2.2 People 37
  2.2.1 Adivasis 37
  2.2.2 Eravalans and Malasars 38
  2.2.3 Settlers and Others 43
2.3 Change 45
2.4 How It All Started 50
# Contents

2.5 Water .............................................. 52  
2.6 Protest ............................................. 56  
2.7 State Response to the Resistance Movement .......... 60  
2.8 The Litigation ...................................... 61  
2.9 The Samara Pandal ................................ 62  
2.10 A Separation ....................................... 64  
2.11 Water, Protests, Meanings ......................... 65  

3 A People’s Movement .................................. 67  
3.1 Plachimada: A People’s Resistance Movement ........ 67  
3.2 Activists and Organizations in Kerala ................. 69  
3.3 Support from a Wider Community .................... 77  
3.4 Media .............................................. 82  
3.5 Translating for the “Outside” ......................... 86  
3.6 Conclusion .......................................... 92  

4 Litigants, Lawyers, and the Questions of Law .......... 95  
4.1 Litigation ........................................... 97  
4.1.1 Perumatty Grama Panchayat ..................... 97  
4.1.2 Litigation Begins ................................ 104  
4.1.3 In the High Court of Kerala – Part 1 ............. 105  
4.1.4 In the High Court of Kerala – Part 2 .......... 115  
4.1.5 In the High Court of Kerala – Part 3 .......... 120  
4.1.6 In the Supreme Court of India .................. 124  
4.2 Framing Legal Claims: Legal Professionals As Translators 125  
4.2.1 The Legal and the Social ....................... 126  
4.2.2 The Tribal Question and Tribal Rights ........... 127  
4.2.3 Difference and the Inevitability of Sameness ... 130  
4.3 Conclusion ......................................... 132  

5 Claims and Meanings .................................. 134  
5.1 The Separation ..................................... 135  
5.2 The Ones Who Left ................................ 140  
5.3 Mylamma .......................................... 145  
5.4 Differences ........................................ 151  
5.5 Insiders and Outsiders .............................. 158  
5.6 Stories and Meanings ............................... 162  

6 Law, History, Justice .................................. 163  
6.1 Oral History ........................................ 164  
6.1.1 Maariamma’s Story ............................. 166  
6.1.2 Journeys, Places, Belonging .................... 178
Contents

6.2 Adivasi Dispossession in Kerala 186
6.3 Law’s Story of Adivasi Lands 190
   6.3.1 A Law to Restore Alienated Adivasi Lands 190
   6.3.2 Muthanga 198
   6.3.3 The Legalities of “Paper-Owners”: State of Kerala v. People’s Union for Civil Liberties 200
6.4 Adivasi Pasts and Presents 207
6.5 Conclusion 214

7 Conclusion 216

Bibliography 221

Index 235
Acknowledgments

I have accumulated many debts in the course of researching and writing this book. I offer my gratitude first and foremost to all those who agreed to share with me many of their experiences and views. While not identified by their real names here, their words, their stories, and their silences inspired and challenged me as I wrote this book.

I offer my enduring gratitude to W. Wesley Pue, Karin Mickelson, and Renisa Mawani for their guidance, encouragement, enthusiasm, questions, and provocations that have each enriched and shaped my work. I am also thankful to Bruce Miller, Lorraine Weir, Ruth Buchanan, Margot Young, Doug Harris, and Benjamin Berger for reading earlier versions or parts of this book. Those who responded with comments, suggestions, and questions at various conferences and lectures are too many to name here, but I am grateful for all that I learned from each of those encounters.

I am thankful to several people who facilitated my fieldwork in India. I am grateful to Shiny Gopakumar for the enthusiasm she brought to her role as an interpreter, for her curiosity, and for her patience. I am indebted to Baby Siraj and P. M. Sirajuddin for providing me a home in Ernakulam and for their help throughout my stay in Kerala. Laila and Saifuddin Kitchlu made my research in Palakkad possible by welcoming me into their home and lives, and I am indebted to them for their kindness, concern, and care. I am also thankful to Dr. Koya in Palakkad; Shoma and Animon Ilias, Gopakumar S. Nair, Jiss Verkey and Robin in Thrissur; Preeti and Ravindra Gosain in Bangalore; Professors Chandan Gowda and S. Japhet at CSEIP in NLSUI Bangalore; Zainu Kitchlu and M. Balachandran in Palakkad; Dr. Sivanandan in Trivandrum; and Sreejith Nair, Praveen Hariharan, and Professor N. S. Soman in Kochi.

The University of British Columbia, the UBC Graduate Program in Law, the Centre for India and South Asia Research at UBC, and the Law
Acknowledgments

Foundation provided funds that made this research possible. I would also like to acknowledge the financial support provided by Carleton University during the latter phases of the preparation of this book. I am grateful to Jon Corbett for the time he spent creating the map for this book, and to Zorana Dimitrijevic for her assistance in formatting and tracking those last missing references. I am also grateful to the anonymous reviewers and the editorial team at Cambridge University Press for all their help in preparation of this book.

Special thanks are owed to my family and friends across three continents for their invaluable support while I worked on this book. I would like to especially acknowledge Prabh Bedi, Erika Cedillo Corral, Mary-Ann Chacko, Joanne Chung, Patricia Cochran, Emma Cunliffe, John Ferguson, Ian Greig, Varsha Gurha, Sandy Kaur, Asad Kiyani, Nikhil Kripalani, Don McIntyre, N. S. Negi, Padma Negi, Tavnit Parmar, Naayeli Ramirez, Kanan Rana, Chanan Singh, Harmandip Singh, Sukhchain Singh, Maymon Siraj, and the Gill and Manhas families.

Last but not the least I would like to acknowledge the people whose love has sustained me the most through the years of research and writing. I am indebted to my parents, Raji and Sukhjiinder Singh, for too many reasons to list. Of the many things they have taught me, I hope the one lesson I have learned well is to never stop believing. I thank Navneet for being there through good times and bad, and for reading and responding to much of what I write. A special thank you to Arshia for the wonderful little notes and pictures she left on my desk on days I needed them most.
Glossary

Adivasi
Resident since earliest times, original inhabitant

Adivasi Maha Sabha
Adivasi Grand Assembly

Adivasi Samara Samithi
Adivasi Struggle Committee

Adivasi Samrakshana Samithi
Adivasi Protection Council

Anganwadi
Derived from the Hindi word angan, which means courtyard, Anganwadi translates as “courtyard shelter.” Set up under the Integrated Child Development Services Scheme in India, Anganwadi centers provide basic health care to young children, offer advice on nutrition to parents, and function as preschools. Anganwadi workers/teachers also provide meals to children during the day.

Coca-Cola Viruddha
Anti-Coca-Cola People’s Struggle Committee

Janakeeya Samara Samithi
Sit-in agitation

Dharna
Protest hut or shelter

Samara pandal
The word generally refers to the government or a person in a position of authority.

Sirkar