ANTI-IMPUNITY AND THE HUMAN RIGHTS AGENDA

In the twenty-first century, fighting impunity has become both the rallying cry and a metric of progress for human rights. The new emphasis on criminal prosecution represents a fundamental change in the positions and priorities of students and practitioners of human rights and transitional justice: it has become almost unquestionable common sense that criminal punishment is a legal, political, and pragmatic imperative for addressing human rights violations. This book challenges that common sense. It does so by documenting and critically analyzing the trend toward an anti-impunity norm in a variety of institutional and geographical contexts, with an eye toward the interaction between practices at the global and local levels. Together, the chapters demonstrate how this laser focus on anti-impunity has created blind spots in practice and in scholarship that result in a constricted response to human rights violations, a narrowed conception of justice, and an impoverished approach to peace.

Karen Engle is Minerva House Drysdale Regents Chair in Law, and Founder & Co-Director of the Bernard and Audre Rapoport Center for Human Rights and Justice at the University of Texas at Austin. She is the 2016–17 Deborah Lunder and Alan Ezekowitz Founders’ Circle Member at the Institute for Advanced Study.

Zinaida Miller is Assistant Professor at the School of Diplomacy and International Relations at Seton Hall University.

D.M. Davis is Judge President of the Competition Appeal Court of South Africa, and a Judge of the High Court of Cape Town. He is Honorary Professor of Law at the University of Cape Town.
Anti-Impunity and the Human Rights Agenda

Edited by

KAREN ENGLE
University of Texas School of Law

ZINAIDA MILLER
Seton Hall University
School of Diplomacy and International Relations

D.M. DAVIS
University of Cape Town Faculty of Law
## Contents

**Contributors**

vi

**Acknowledgments**

ix

**Introduction**

Karen Engle, Zinaida Miller, and D.M. Davis

1

**Part I**

**What does Anti-Impunity Mean?**

13

1 A Genealogy of the Criminal Turn in Human Rights

Karen Engle

15

2 Anti-Impunity as Deflection of Argument

Samuel Moyn

68

3 Doing History with Impunity

Vasuki Nesiah

95

**Part II**

**How and Where does Anti-Impunity Operate?**

123

4 The South African Truth Commission and the AZAPO Case: A Reflection Almost Two Decades Later

D.M. Davis

125

5 Anti-Impunity Politics in Post-Genocide Rwanda

Zinaida Miller

149

6 Whose Exceptionalism? Debating the Inter-American View on Amnesty and the Brazilian Case

Fabia Fernandes Carvalho Veçoso

185
Contents vi
vi
7 The Distributive Politics of Impunity and Anti-Impunity: Lessons from Four Decades of Colombian Peace Negotiations 216
Helena Alviar García and Karen Engle

8 From Political Repression to Torturer Impunity: The Narrowing of Filártiga v. Peña-Irala 255
Natalie R. Davidson

PART III ARE THERE ALTERNATIVES TO ANTI-IMPUNITY? 289

9 Impunity in a Different Register: People’s Tribunals and Questions of Judgment, Law, and Responsibility 291
Dianne Otto

10 Beyond Nuremberg: The Historical Significance of the Post-Apartheid Transition in South Africa 329
Mahmood Mamdani

Index 361
 Contributors

Helena Alviar García
Professor and former Dean, Faculty of Law, Universidad de los Andes

Natalie R. Davidson
Postdoctoral Fellow, Minerva Center for Human Rights, Hebrew University Jerusalem

D.M. Davis
Judge, High Court of Cape Town and Judge President, Competition Appeal Court of Cape Town; Honorary Professor, University of Cape Town Faculty of Law

Karen Engle
Minerva House Drysdale Regents Chair in Law and Founder & Co-Director, Bernard and Audre Rapoport Center for Human Rights and Justice, University of Texas at Austin

Mahmood Mamdani
Professor and Executive Director, Makerere Institute of Social Research, Makerere University, Kampala, Uganda, and Herbert Lehman Professor of Government and Professor of Anthropology, African Studies and Political Science, Columbia University

Zinaida Miller
Assistant Professor, School of Diplomacy and International Relations, Seton Hall University

Samuel Moyn
Jeremiah Smith, Jr. Professor of Law and Professor of History, Harvard University
viii

Contributors

Vasuki Nesiah
Associate Professor of Practice, Gallatin School of Individualized Study, New York University

Dianne Otto
Francine V. McNiff Professor in Human Rights Law and former Director, Institute for International Law and the Humanities (IILAH), Melbourne Law School

Fabia Fernandes Carvalho Veçoso
Assistant Professor of International Relations, Federal University of São Paulo and Postdoctoral Fellow with the Laureate Program in International Law, Melbourne Law School
Acknowledgments

We first thank all the authors who have contributed to this collection. We have learned a great deal from our interactions with them and their work. And we are grateful for the enormous patience they have shown in responding to our multiple requests for revisions and updates, and for their willingness to engage with each other’s work as we have sought to make an argument with the book.

We also thank the people behind two institutions who have supported this work: The Bernard and Audre Rapoport Center for Human Rights and Justice at the University of Texas School of Law and the Institute for Global Law and Policy (IGLP) at Harvard Law School. The collaboration began before we were aware of it, when IGLP’s director, David Kennedy, invited one of us (Karen Engle) to give a lecture in June 2012 and the other two of us (D.M. Davis and Zinaida Miller) to serve as respondents. Karen presented the first version of what later became her chapter for this book, and we believed we had the beginnings of a good discussion. The Rapoport Center decided to continue that discussion at its Spring 2013 conference, “Impunity, Justice and the Human Rights Agenda.” Most of the contributors to this collection attended that conference, as did several other discussants and presenters to whom we are grateful for their time and substantive contributions to this project. IGLP then invited us to “workshop” the papers at a proseminar in June of that year.

We are therefore extremely grateful to David Kennedy and his team for providing financial and logistical support for the proseminar and to the following people at the Rapoport Center: Co-Director Daniel Brinks, who has been involved in numerous discussions with us, including at the conference, encouraged us to publish this collection, and agreed to dedicate much of the Center’s time to the editing and production of the volume; Assistant Director William Chandler, who has deftly coordinated everything from the conference to the work of student copy-editors and the final preparation of the
manuscript; and Rapoport Center Scholars and Fellows – Kyle Shen, Kallie Dale Ramos, Rhiannon Hamam, Cianan Good, and Helen Kerwin – who have provided the bulk of the editing support for the project.

Hani Sayed has been an invaluable interlocutor and contributor to our discussions on anti-impunity from the beginning and we are grateful for his many insights, at the initial conference, the IGLP proseminar, and beyond. We are also indebted to Fionnuala Ní Aoláin for her very useful comments on the individual papers presented at the proseminar as well as on the project as a whole.

We are appreciative of John Berger and Sharon McCann at Cambridge University Press, as well as of three anonymous peer reviewers for their thoughtful feedback. We and our readers also benefited enormously from the excellent indexing skills of Deborah Patton.

Finally, we are each grateful to our two co-editors as well as to the friends, family, and colleagues who have stood by us throughout the production of this book. It has been a long haul that has spanned more continents and years than we originally anticipated. We hope the result vindicates the wait.