Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07847-5 — Empirical Bioethics Edited by Jonathan Ives , Michael Dunn , Alan Cribb Index More Information

INDEX

abstract generalism, 105 academic disciplines bioethics and, 239-240 boundaries, 236-237 disciplinary conventions and, 235-236 elements of, 236-237 history of development of, 237-238 RAEs and, 236, 251 as socially contingent bodies, 238-239 what are, 235-239 Alzheimer's disease (AD), 182-183 The Forgetting: A Portrait of Alzheimer's, 185 Annas, 90-91 antenatal screening, 222-223 Archard, 55-56, 240 Aristotelian phronesis, 7-8 Arledge, The Forgetting: A Portrait of Alzheimer's, 185 Ashcroft, 242 assumptions knowledge and, 4-5 social world and, 5 authority in or an, 64 feminist approach and, 201-202 political, 56-61 of theory, 42–43 Ayer, 'Language, Truth and Logic,' 21 bioethicist, role of, 245-246

bioethics. *See also* critical bioethics; descriptive bioethics; empirical bioethics; philosophical bioethics; social bioethics

critical, 196-197, 202-203 DD, 179-180 as natural ally of, 178-182 defined, 239 as discipline of disciplines, 85-89 discipline or not, 239-240 expertise and, 240-243 feminist approach to, 197–198 interdisciplinary conflict in, 103-107 naturalised, 202 Presidential Commission for the Study of Bioethical Issues, 181-182 sociology for, 244 sociology in, 244-245 sociology of, 243-244 turn to empirical, 196-197 Boorse's Biostatistical Theory of Health, 169-170 British Empiricism, 7–8 as radical epistemology, 21 Brody, 244 Brownsword, 86-87 Callahan, 86 Cambridge, 237-238 Caplan, 241 care ethics, 205-207 children, disabled, 211-213 coherence, 162-163, 170-172 coherentism, with different levels of justificatory power, 162-163 common law, 90-91 consultative methodologies, 126

analytic process and, 127

256

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07847-5 — Empirical Bioethics Edited by Jonathan Ives , Michael Dunn , Alan Cribb Index More Information

> justification and, 126-127 normative conclusions and, 127-128 critical bioethics, 196-197, 202-203 cultural relativism, 40-41 cultural values, as changeable, 41 culture, in publishing research, 252 Daniels, 242 data empirical, 12-13 in empirical ethics, 69-71 data collection in empirical ethics, 71-72 theory and, 12-13 Dawson, 67-68 DD. See deliberative democracy De Vries, 68-69 Sociology of Health & Illness, 243-244 deaf or disabled children, 211-213 deliberative democracy (DD) bioethics and, 179-180 bioethics as natural ally of, 178-182 case study, 177, 182-188 commonality of theories of, 179 conclusions, 189-190 health policy studies, 181-182 other approaches contrasted with, 132 overview, 130-131, 177 pitfalls, limiting, 188-189 polarisation and, 188-189 practice of, 181 questions to ask when considering, 132 - 133rationale behind, 178-179 dementia research, 182-183 deontic argument, 18-22 descriptive bioethics, 115, 120 descriptive ethical relativism defined, 34 variation in ethical systems and, 41 descriptive method, diversity and, 111-112 dialogical empirical ethics challenges, 151-153 conclusions, 156 dialogue role in, 141

INDEX

257

discussion, 151-153 horizon and, 141-142 normativity within, 143-144 other approaches contrasted with, 132 overview, 129, 139 perspective and, 141 practical rationality and, 142 questions to ask when considering, 132 - 133researcher's role in, 144-145 theoretical and normative underpinnings of, 140-143 theoretical framework, 140-145 dialogical methodologies, 126 analytic process and, 127 justification and, 126-127 normative conclusions and, 127-128 disciplines. See also academic disciplines; interdisciplinary research bioethics as discipline of disciplines, 85-89 empirical ethics interdisciplinarity, 78-79 ethics sub-disciplines, 85, 97 harmonising, 10 interdisciplinary conflict in bioethics, 103-107 interdisciplinary highway, 133-134 or not, 239-240 novel methods and, 78-79 philosophy, history of, 237-238 power and, 10 transdisciplinarity, 3-4 dissensus, 23 diversity of aims and methods within ethics, 107 - 112aims of, 103 aims of different approaches and, 107 conclusions, 119 descriptive method and, 111-112 division of labour related to, 108-109 embracing, 14-15 empirical bioethics, what qualifies as, 115-119

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07847-5 — Empirical Bioethics Edited by Jonathan Ives , Michael Dunn , Alan Cribb Index More Information

258

diversity (cont.) empirical ethics management of, 112-115 engineering model and, 109-110 enlightenment model and, 109 interdisciplinary conflict and, 103 - 107overview, 14, 103 prescriptive method and, 110-111 Driver, 240 Duchesneau, 211-213 Eastlund, 56, 57-58 EBM. See evidence-based medicine Eckenwiler, 206-207 EDGs. See Ethics Discussion Groups embodiment feminist approach and, 207-208 relating to others and, 208 social positioning affected by, 208 embryo donation, 222-223 empirical bioethics. See also empirical ethics empirical in, 68-72 overview, 67-68 turn to, 196-197 what qualifies as, 115-119 empirical data, 12-13 empirical ethics. See also empirical bioethics application of, 251 conclusions about, 46-48 data collection in, 71-72 data in, 69-71 defining, 53 expertise and, 243-245 fact/value distinction and, 35 Hedgecoe and, 28-31 legitimacy and, 35-36 managing pluralism in, 112-115 normatively invested concepts and, 35-36 novel methods and interdisciplinarity in, 78-79 policy-making role of, 62-63 question posing in, 71-72 reporting, 247-249 way forward, 81

INDEX

empirical questions framing, 12-13 metaethical relativism and, 36-37 empirical research as handmaiden to normative research, 5-6 harmonising normative research with, 8-9 qualitative research: methods and results, 163-165 quality of, 8-9 value neutral, 8-9 empirical rigour, 116-117 empiricism British Empiricism, 21 observation and, 3-4 engineering model, 109-110 enlightenment model, 109 epistemology assumptions and, 4-5 British Empiricism as radical, 21 feminist, 198-203 harmonising, 3-4 methodology sprouting from, 3-4 problem of harmonising different, 8-9 ethical particularism, 7-8 ethical relativism. See also descriptive ethical relativism attractiveness of, 33 judgement context and, 41 overview, 11-12 ethics abstract generalism and, 105 care, 205-207 diversity of aims and methods within, 107-112 feminist approach to, 197-198 methodological purity in, 113 as normative enterprise, 5-6 relativistic and non-relativistic positions in, 40-45 sociology in, 232-233 sub-disciplines of, 85, 97 Ethics Discussion Groups (EDGs) centres buy in and, 226-227 centres contacts and relationships supporting, 228-229

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07847-5 — Empirical Bioethics Edited by Jonathan Ives , Michael Dunn , Alan Cribb Index More Information

> concept and purposes, 223-224 conclusions, 232-233 external stakeholders and, 229 facilitating, 224-225 facilitator role in, 225 lessons learned, 226-231 organising, 230 participant commitment in, 227-228 philosophy seminar approach of, 224-225 product of, 226 reluctant participants in, 229-230 research question clarification in, 227 staff perspectives and, 231-232 story telling and, 230-231 topics tailor made for, 230 evidence-based medicine (EBM), 22-23 expertise bioethics and, 240-243 claims example, 37 empirical ethics and, 243-245 of professional ethicist, 54-56 as skill, 241-242 facts, values and, 6, 8-9 fact/value distinction, 21-22 conclusions about, 31 deontic argument and, 18-22 empirical ethics and, 35 Hume and, 18-22 overview, 11, 17-18 passions and, 20-22 Putnam and, 25-27 sense impressions and, 19-20 values-based medicine and, 27 feminist approach authority and, 201-202 bioethical turn to empirical and, 196-197 care and, 205-207 choosing deaf or disabled children and, 211-213 context and, 199-200

critical bioethics and, 202–203 critique and self-critique and, 211 distinctive features related to, 203–211

INDEX

259

Eckenwiler and, 206-207 embodiment and, 207-208 to ethics and bioethics, 197-198 future of, 215-216 gender equality and justice and, 197-198 gender roles and, 205-207 Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act and, 213-214 Kittay and, 214 lived experience and, 209 mainstream methodologies and, 215 marginal voices and, 208-211 moral self and, 198-199, 217 naturalised bioethics and, 202 ontology and epistemology, 198-203 overview, 131-132, 195-196 power structures and, 203-205 questions to ask when considering, 132-133 relationality and, 205-207 relativism and, 216 responsibility and reflexivity, 211-215 social identity and, 200 stem cell research example, 204 Foot, 26-27 Foucault, 86 Fulford, 22-25 dissensus and, 23 values and, 23-24 Gadamerian hermeneutic philosophy explained, 129 horizon and, 141-142 Gaita, 44-45 gender equality and justice, 197-198 roles, 205-207 Glaser, 29-30 Green, 239

Habermas, 60–61 Hamersley, 8–9 Hedgecoe, 28–31 hermeneutic philosophy, 7–8, 140–143

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07847-5 — Empirical Bioethics Edited by Jonathan Ives , Michael Dunn , Alan Cribb Index More Information

260

hESC. See human embryonic stem cell research Hobbes, 237-238 Holistic Theory of Health, 169-170 Hope, 19 horizon, 141-142 human embryonic stem cell (hESC) research, 222-223 Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act, 213-214 Hume, 237-238 facts/value distinction and, 18-22 Moore and, 21-22 passions and, 20-22 sense impressions and, 19-20 Hurst, 246-247 incommensurability, 43-44 inference relations, 162-163 interdisciplinarity, in empirical ethics, 78-79 interdisciplinary conflict, 103-107 interdisciplinary highway, 133-134 interdisciplinary research aims of, 236 centres buy in and, 226-227 centres contacts and relationships facilitating, 228-229 conclusions, 232-233 external stakeholders and, 229 lessons learned, 226-231 overview, 135, 222-223 participant commitment in, 227-228 question clarification, 227 reluctant participants and, 229-230 staff perspectives and, 231-232 story telling and, 230-231 intuition autonomy, 166 beneficence, 167 human dignity respect, 168-169 moral principles confronting, 164-169 non-maleficence, 167-168 treatment and, 164-165 is claim, ought claim and, 6, 8-9 Ives, 25, 49

INDEX

James, 237-238 judgement context, 41 Kittav, 214 knowledge assumptions and, 4-5 ways of acquiring, 3-4 Krishan, 236-237 law as action oriented, 95 as adversarial, 94-95, 99 bioethics as discipline of disciplines and, 85-89 common, 90-91 conclusions about, 96-97 contribution and convergence and, 89-93 decision and, 93 divergence and distraction and, 93-96 medical, 98 overview, 13, 84-85 phrasing and, 93 practice and, 92-93 process and, 89-92 products of, 92 purpose and, 89 tale of two flatmates and, 84-85 legitimacv as normatively invested concepts, 35-36 of values, 24-25 Lillehammer, 242 Locke, 237-238 marginal voices feminist approach to, 208-211 religious groups, 209-211 McCullough, 211–213 McDowell, 26-27 McMillan, 'The possibility of empirical psychiatric ethics,' 19 medical sociology empirical ethics and, 28-31 Strauss and Glaser and, 29 - 30Mertz, 133-134, 249-250

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07847-5 — Empirical Bioethics Edited by Jonathan Ives , Michael Dunn , Alan Cribb Index More Information

> metaethical relativism, 41-42. See also ethical relativism authority of theory and, 42-43 conclusions about, 46-48 culture and, 40-41 defined, 34 empirical questions and, 36-37 expertise claims example and, 37 Ives and, 49 judgement context and, 41 legitimacy example and, 35-36 normative questions and, 36, 38 - 40normatively invested concepts and, 35-36 objectivism compared with, 34, 40 - 45ought questions and, 38-39 overview, 34-35 as pragmatic, 42 preferences and, 39 primary and secondary questions and, 38 relevance of, 35-40 truth claim of, 40 value and, 39 Wong and, 42 metaethics, defined, 33 methodology conclusions, 136-137 epistemology and, 3-4 four approaches, 129–133 hierarchies of approaches to, 12-13 overview, 128-129 Mill, 237-238 Miola, 87, 98 moderate objectivism conclusions about, 46-48 incommensurability and, 43-44 objectivism and, 42-45 overview, 11-12 perseverance and, 44 underdetermination and, 43-44 Moore Hume and, 21-22 naturalistic fallacy and, 21-22 moral craftsmanship, 134-135 moral self, 198-199, 217

INDEX

261

naturalised bioethics, 202 naturalistic fallacy, 21-22 NE-RE. See normative-empirical reflective equilibrium new reproductive and genetic technologies (NRGTs), 209-211 noble failure, 49 nondescriptivism, 23-24 normative conclusions, 127-128 normative questions, 36, 38 - 40normative research empirical research as handmaiden to, 5-6 harmonising empirical research with, 8-9 normative rigour, social bioethics and, 116-117 normative underpinnings, of dialogical empirical ethics research, 140-143 normative-empirical reflective equilibrium (NE-RE) coherence measurement and, 162 - 163features of, 160-161 intuitions in, 161-162 moral wisdom and, 161-162 other approaches contrasted with, 132 overview, 129-130 questions to ask when considering, 132-133 normatively invested concepts, legitimacy and, 35-36 normativity within dialogical empirical ethics research, 143-144 overview, 11 nothing else to think, 44-45 NRGTs. See new reproductive and genetic technologies objectivism. See also moderate objectivism authority of theory and, 42-43 conclusions about, 46-48

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07847-5 — Empirical Bioethics Edited by Jonathan Ives , Michael Dunn , Alan Cribb Index More Information

262

objectivism (cont.) metaethical relativism compared with, 34, 40-45 overview, 34-35 observation, limitations of, 3-4 ontology, feminist, 198-203 Parker, 134–135 parliamentary decision-making, 58-59 passions facts/value distinction and, 20-22 Moore and, 21-22 Patient and Public Involvement (PPI), 51 - 52perseverance explained, 44 slave example and, 44-45 PGD. See pre-implantation genetic diagnosis philosophical bioethics as abstract, 5-6 abstract generalism and, 105 audiences alienated by, 106 criticism of, 103-104 cross-purposes and, 105 defence forms and, 120 empirical methods, avoidance of, in, 104 empirical rigour and, 116-117 methods, 107-112 principalism and, 118-119 sociologists missing point and, 105 philosophy history of discipline of, 237-238 seminar approach, 224-225 Pickerskill, 232–233 polarisation, 188-189 post-reflective interpretation, 161-162 power coherentism with different levels of justificatory, 162-163 disciplines and, 10 structures, 203-205 PPI. See Patient and Public Involvement practical rationality, 142 pre-implantation genetic diagnosis (PGD), 222-223

INDEX

pre-reflective interpretation, 161-162 prescriptive method, 110-111 Presidential Commission for the Study of Bioethical Issues, 181-182 principalism, 118-119 professional ethicist conclusions, 64 defining, 53 deliberative bodies and, 57 deriving role of, 56-61 expertise of, 54-56 overview, 12, 51-54 parliamentary decision-making and, 58-59 political authority and, 56-61 psychiatrist example, 27 publishing research academic discipline and, 235-239 changing culture in, 252 conclusions, 250-251 dividing results in, 248 overview, 136 quality and reporting in, 246-247, 252 quality assessment, 249-250 RAEs and, 236, 251 reporting empirical ethics, 247-249 reviewers and, 249 scope of findings curtailed in, 248 - 249Putnam 'The Collapse of the Fact/Value Dichotomy,' 25-27 on entanglement of fact and value, 25 - 27teacher example of, 26-27 qualitative research, 163-165 quasi-moral foundationalism, 7-8 Racine, 25 RAEs. See research assessment exercises Rasmussen, 54-56 rationalism, 3-4

Rawls, 60–61, 109

RE and, 160 RCUK. See Research Councils UK

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07847-5 — Empirical Bioethics Edited by Jonathan Ives , Michael Dunn , Alan Cribb Index More Information

INDEX

263

RE. See reflective equilibrium reflective equilibrium (RE), 160. See also normative-empirical reflective equilibrium reflexivity in research, 134-135 responsibility and, 211-215 relationality, 205-207 relativism. See also descriptive ethical relativism: ethical relativism: metaethical relativism cultural, 40-41 feminist approach and, 216 incommensurability and, 43-44 nothing else to think and, 44-45 ought questions and, 38-39 perseverance and, 44 slave example, 44-45 underdetermination and, 43-44 Wong and, 42 religion, 209-211 reporting. See publishing research research. See also dialogical empirical ethics; empirical research; interdisciplinary research; normative research; publishing research complexity of, 3-4 conclusions, 136-137 interdisciplinary highway and, 133-134 novel practices of, 133-136 problem of harmonising epistemologies in, 8-9 reflexivity in, 134-135 stem cell example, 204 study choices in, 133-134 surrogate-based attitudes in, 185 research assessment exercises (RAEs), 236, 251 Research Councils UK (RCUK), 236 Research Excellence Framework, 98 responsibility, 211-215 responsive evaluation, 129 Schneider, 94

Sen, 109–110 *The Idea of Justice*, 109–110 sense impressions, 19-20 sexual offending, 24-25 Shildrick, 197-198 Singer, 54, 55-56 on expertise as skill, 241-242 slave example, 44-45 Smith, 237-238 social bioethics audiences alienated by, 106 criticism of, 104 cross-purposes and, 105 defence forms and, 120 methods, 107-112 normative rigour and, 116-117 philosophers missing point and, 105 principalism and, 118-119 social identity, 200 socially contingent bodies, academic disciplines as, 238-239 sociological epistemic values, 31 sociology for bioethics, 244 in bioethics, 244-245 of bioethics, 243-244 in ethics, 232-233 stem cell research example, 204 Stigglebout, 244-245 story telling, 230-231 Strathern, 236 Strauss, 29-30 subjectivism, 40-41 substituted judgement, 166 surrogate-based research attitudes, 185 tale of two flatmates, 84-85

teacher example, 26–27 Teleological Expressivism, 7–8 territorial dispute, 10 theory authority of, 42–43 data collection and, 12–13 problem of harmonising different, 8–9 thick ethical concepts psychiatrist example of, 27 teacher example of, 26–27 transdisciplinarity, 3–4

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-07847-5 — Empirical Bioethics Edited by Jonathan Ives , Michael Dunn , Alan Cribb Index More Information

264

underdetermination, 43-44

values. See also fact/value distinction cultural, 41 facts and, 6, 8-9 Fulford and, 22-25 legitimacy of, 24-25 metaethical relativism and, 39 motivating nature of, 27 neutral, 8-9 non-cognitivism about, 20-22 preferences and, 39 sexual offending and, 24-25 sociological epistemic, 31 values-based medicine (VBM), 17-18 dissensus and, 23 EBM and, 22-23 fact/value distinction and, 27 principles of, 22-25

INDEX

van der Burg, 89 Van der Scheer, 115 VBM. See values-based medicine Walker, 195-196, 200-201 Weberian tradition, 8-9 Wellcome Trust, 227 Widdershoven, 115 on dialogue, 141 Wiggins, 26-27 incommensurability and, 43-44 nothing else to think and, 44-45 perseverance and, 44 position of, 43 underdetermination and, 43-44 Wong, 42

Yoder, 55