CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

INDEX

Abrams, Kathryn, 140
Abrams v. United States, 196
absolute truth, anti-foundationalism and, 28–30
abstract theory, 56–60
  partisanship and, 59–60, 77
activism, of judges, 307
act-utilitarian judges, 275, 277–8
affirmative action, 140
  color-blind society and, 141–4
  neutral principle and, 168, 170
  opposition to, 141–2
  racism and, 141
  reverse discrimination and, 142
Alexander, Larry, 123, 221
"Almost Pragmatism:: The Jurisprudence of Richard Posner, Richard Rorty, and Ronald Dworkin" (Fish), 252, 258
amazing trick of law, for Fish, 301, 313
ambiguity
  in anti-foundationalism, 284
  enterprise-specific, 284
American Booksellers Association v. Hudnut, 198–9
angle of lean, 2–3
anti-foundationalism, 21–40. *See also* progressive anti-foundationalism
  absolute truth and, 28–30
  accumulation of facts and, 22–3
  ambiguity in, 284
  autonomy of practices and, 61–2, 110
  beliefs and, 118, 147
  claims and, 27
  CLS and, 327–8, 332
  conservative direction of, 109
  critical theory and, 112–21
  in educational institutions, 33–5
  in everyday life, 31–3
  in Fish/Dworkin debate, 256–7
  forms of force and, 173–4
  interpretation and, 269
  lack of political consequences for, 108–9
  in law, 35–6
  legal actors and, 256–7
  legal formalism and, 213–21
  local theory and, 53
  logic and, 38–40
  misinterpretations of, 145
  partisanship and, 147–8
  philosophy and, 67, 115
  political consequences of, 140, 146
  positive arguments for, 31–40
  post-modernism and, 21–2
  pragmatism and, 21–2, 63, 135
  recontextualization and, 309
  relativism and, 26–8, 44–5, 68–9, 145–6
  in science, 36–8
  skepticism and, 26–7
  social constructivism and, 282–3
  textualism and, 213–21
  theories, hope and fear in, 108–12
  theory development, 67–8
  theory talk and, 159–60
anti-Semitism, 160
Arnold, Thurman, 294
author claim
  in intentionalism, 228
  unconscious/conscious intentions, 238
authority, freedom of religion and, 101

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

author-less intentionalism, 222–5
  context for, 224
autonomy
  free speech and, 194–5
  for Kant, 8
  of self, 7
autonomy of practices, 60–4, 66, 71
  anti-foundationalism and, 61–2, 110
  critical theory and, 117
  in "Dennis Martinez and the Uses of Theory," 267
  in Fish/Dworkin debate, 266–9
  incorporation of new material, 72–3
  institutional tasks and, 60
  interdisciplinarity and, 63–4, 73–5
  for judges, 277
  performance of, 76–7
  political paralysis from, 171
  political practices and, 158
  politics and, 156
  pragmatism and, 135–6
  professional correctness and, 60
  separation of practices in, 71
  at work, 62
autonomy of theory, 64–70

background beliefs, 46
  feminism and, 47
  freedom of religion and, 100
  reason and, 97–8
Barak, Aharon, 231, 242–3
  intentionalism for, 271–2
Beauharnais v. Illinois, 198
Beiner, Ronald, 91
beliefs
  anti-foundationalism and, 118, 147
  capacity for change, 45–7
  critical theory and, 118
  deep, 46–7
  epistemology and, 40–7
  historical emergence of, 45
  knowledge and, 23
  perceptions of facts and, 42–4
  reason and, 43
  the self and, 10, 12
  social change influenced by, 162
  surface, 46
  theories compared to, 162
bias, 20
  freedom of religion and, 104
black-letter law, 186–90
boutique multiculturalism, 2
  postmodernism and, 127–8
  the self and, 8–9
Butler, Judith, 124–5
  politics of thinking for, 124–5

camouflage strategy, for substantive justice job, 296–7, 300
Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, 198
censorship, 202, 204–5
change. *See also* social change
  of beliefs, 45–7
  communities as engines of, 152
  as community-specific, 150–1
  critical theory and, 119–20
  embeddedness and, 120
  free speech and, 30–1
  through internal processes, 150
  law as engine of, 185
  for neoconservative right, 152
  political, as internal development, 152–3
  production of, through vocabulary, 47
change, in law. *See also* legal indeterminacy
  claim of consideration doctrine and, 314
  community as engine of, 315
  constraints and, 306–7
  craft-training and, 316
  critique of Fish's stance, 305
  institutional bias against, 312–13
  through judicial activism, 307
  legal precedent and, 317–18
  limitations of, 312–13
  opposition to tradition and, 315–16
  parol evidence rule and, 313–14
  political context of, 315
  rhetorical achievements and, reworking of, 313–14
  rule of law job and, 311–12
  substantive justice job and, 312–13
  for U.S. Constitution, 307
  visibility of, 311–12

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

Christie, Agatha, 264
civility, freedom of religion and, 102–4
classical legal formalism, 206–8
  conceptual formalism, 207
  critiques of, 207
  demise of, 208
  principles of, 206
  rule formalism, 207
CLS. *See* critical legal studies
Cobb, Ty, 285–6
Cohen, Felix, 321
Collin v. Smith, 198–200
color-blind society, affirmative action and, 141–2
  abstract principles of, 143–4
common law, 271–2, 294
communities
  agreement within, 283
  change influenced by, 150–1
  domestication of foreign material, 151–2
  embeddedness in, 149–50
  as engine of change in law, 315
  as engines of change, 152
  intentionalism in, 271–2
  interpretation claims influenced by, 233–4
  substantive justice job and, 291–2
  of worship, 101–2
comprehensive doctrines, 50–1
  force and, 176
The concept of law (Hart), 209, 219–20, 294. *See also* legal formalism
conceptual legal formalism, 207
conflict
  force and, 175–6
  manageability of, 176
  political practice and, 173–6
consciousness
  reflective activity and, 54–5
  the self and, 10, 14
Conservative Christianity, 101–4. *See also* freedom of religion
conservative religions. *See* freedom of religion
consideration doctrine, 187, 297, 314
Constitution, U.S.
  authors' intentions, 224
  change in law for, 307
  historical changes to, 217
  interpretation of, 36
constraints
  change in law and, 306–7
  on interpretation, 259–64, 269
  for judges, 275–6, 278
  by law, 210
  on legal actors, 317–18
  in legal indeterminacy, 306–8
  liberalism under, 85–6
  Milton on, 307
  non-legal, 278–9
  in parol evidence rule, 314
  of practices, 281
  recategorization of, with freedom of speech, 205
  on recontextualization, 310–14
  under rule of law, 318
constructive interpretation, 262
Contingency, irony, and solidarity (Rorty), 134
contingent consequences of theory, 70–8
contract law
  contract implied in law, 297
  contradictions within, 296–8
  formal consideration doctrine and, 297
  interpretation of, 190
  morality and, 187
  orthodox, 186–8, 297
  parol evidence rule in, 313–14
  protections under, 189–90
  taxonomy for, 298
critical legal studies (CLS), 288–90, 327–34
  anti-foundationalism and, 327–8, 332
  disorder of law and, 289–90
  Fish critique of, 329–32
  Frankfurt School and, 333
  goals of, 327
  Gramsci and, 327
  ideology as concept in, 327–8
  legal indeterminacy and, 329–31
  liberalism and, 328, 330–2

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

critical legal studies (CLS) (cont.)
literary support of, 332–3
rejection of orthodox Marxist account of law, 327
The critical legal studies movement (Unger), 288
Critical social science (Fay), 114–15
critical theory
anti-foundationalism and, 112–21
autonomy of practices and, 117
beliefs and, 118
change and, 119–20
components of, 112–13
critical attitudes, 116–17
enabling background of, 113
Fish rejection of, 148–9
Frankfurt School and, 119
freedom and, 120–1
legal studies movement, 119
political project of, 119
projects, 113, 115–17
roots of, 114–15
the self and, 117–18
social construction in, 118–19
structural background of, 113
culture wars, 141
Cusset, Francois, 123

Dalton, Clare, 298
Dasenbrock, Reed Way, 144
deconstruction
of liberalism, 84–5, 122
postmodernism and, 122
deep beliefs, 46
feminism and, 47
Delgado, Richard, 171–2
democracy, pragmatism and, 133–5
"Dennis Martinez and the Uses of Theory" (Fish), 251–2, 257, 266
autonomy of practices in, 267
legal analogy in, 281–2
philosophy's role in law in, 268
Dennis v. United States, 196–7
Derrida, Jacques, 16
Descartes, René, 57
detached theory, 56. *See also* abstract theory
Fish critique on, 57–9
philosophy as, 56
Dewey, John, 129
discrimination, 140
reverse, 142
distortion problem, 18–19
Doing what comes naturally (Fish), 3, 64, 186–90, 214
"Don't Know Much About the Middle Ages: Posner on Law and Literature" (Fish), 325
doubt, 57
Duke, David, 168
Dworkin, Ronald, 55, 180. *See also* Fish/Dworkin debate
on articulate consistency, 300
commonalities with Fish, 252
constraints against legal actors for, 263
critique of interpretation claim, 242–5
critique of judges as analogous to athletes, 281–6
foundationalism for, 260–1
independent constraints upon interpretation for, 259–64
intentionalism for, 240–1, 271–2
on judges, 253–4
law as integrity for, 253
legal formalism for, 260–1
philosophy as guide for law, 264–9
on philosophy's role in law, 268
positivism for, 260–2
on pragmatism of unconstrained legal actors, 255
on pragmatist judges, 274–5
on principles of liberalism, 90
on rule of law job, 294–5
the self for, 254–5, 277–8
on substantive justice job, 294–5
textualism for, 219, 260–1
on unconstrained legal actors, 252–9, 273–81
Dworkin, Ronald, works of. *See also* Fish/Dworkin debate; *Law's empire*
"Law as Interpretation," 243

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

"My Reply to Stanley Fish (and Walter Benn Michaels): Please Don't Talk About Obectivity Anymore," 251
"Pragmatism, Right Answers, and True Banality," 252, 282

Eagleton, Terry, 119, 191
Economic analysis of law (Posner), 325–6
educational institutions, anti-foundationalism in, 33–5
egalitarianism, 168–9
embeddedness
in communities, 149–50
free speech and, 191
of judges, 276
of legal positivism, 179
liberalism and, 89–92
local theory and, 53–4
pragmatism and, 135
recontextualization and, 309
of self, 15
theory and, 49
epistemology
beliefs and, 40–7
facts and, 40–7
foundationalism as, 16–18
of pragmatism, 130
reasons and, 40–7
secular liberalism and, 43–4
equality, 168–9
exclusion, freedom of religion and, 106–8

facts
beliefs and, 42–4
epistemology and, 40–7
fairness, liberalism and, 91–2
faith. *See* beliefs
fallibilism, 101, 106
Fay, Brian, 114–15, 119
Feinman, Jay, 332–3
feminism, 47, 140
reasons for success of, 289
theory for, 160
theory talk and, 160–1
fictional intentionalism, 229–30
First Amendment
free speech under, 196
pragmatic balancing with, 200–1
speech/action distinction and, 202
first law of toleration-dynamics, 196
Fish, Stanley. *See also* anti-foundationalism; autonomy of practices; Fish/Dworkin debate; intentionalism
advocacy of political practice, 164–5
on affirmative actions, 140
amazing trick of law for, 301, 313
angle of lean for, 2–3
area of expertise, 1
author claim for, 228
on bias, 20
CLS and, 288–90
commonalities with Dworkin, 252
conception of the self, 11–15
on constraint of legal actors, 252
on constraints of practices, 281
critique of, on change in law, 305
critique of Butler, 124–5
critique of CLS, 329–32
critique of detached theory, 57–9
critique of Dworkin, 55
critique of foundationalism, 18–21, 23–5
critique of Habermas, 51
critique of independent constraints upon interpretation, 259–64
critique of Kant, 9–11
critique of legal realism, 322–3
critique of Posner, 293–4, 322–3
critique of speech/action distinction, 202–5
critiques of, 1–2, 4
critiques of textualism, 213–28
on discrimination, 140
on gay and lesbian rights, 140
interpretation claim for, 228–9, 231–4, 269
judges as analogous to athletes for, 281–6
on legal canon, 288
legal indeterminacy and, 305–8, 316–18
legal positivist responses, 186–205

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

Fish, Stanley (cont.)
on liberalism, 141, 165–6
Milton's influence on, 21–2, 43, 100
philosophical influences on, 4
political positions of, 139–44
as politically conservative, 140
pragmatism for, 131–2, 134–6
on pragmatist judges, 274–5
progressive politics of, 140
reading style of, 276
rejection of critical theory, 148–9
rejection of unconstrained legal actors, 273–81
on rule of law job, 294–5
on skepticism, 26–7
social construction of reality, 24
social constructivism for, 282–3
structural style, 2–3
on substantive justice job, 294–5
on success of feminism, 289
writing style, 2
Fish/Dworkin debate
"Almost Pragmatism:: The Jurisprudence of Richard Posner, Richard Rorty, and Ronald Dworkin," 252, 258
anti-foundationalism and, 256–7
autonomy of practice in, 266–9
common law in, 271–2
communication of meaning in, 272–3
"Dennis Martinez and the Uses of Theory," 251–2, 257, 266–8, 281–2
development of, 251–3
independent constraints upon interpretation in, 259–64
intentionalism in, 268
interdisciplinarity in, 268–9
interpretation differences in, 269–71
judges as analogous to athletes in, 281–6
"Law as Interpretation," 251, 260
Law's empire in, 239, 241, 251, 255
literary responses, 251–2
"My Reply to Stanley Fish (and Walter Benn Michaels): Please Don't Talk About Obectivity Anymore," 251
on personal preferences of legal actors, 257–9
"Pragmatism, Right Answers, and True Banality," 252, 282
the self and, differences in accounts of, 254, 277–8
"Still Wrong After All These Years," 251–2, 256
unconstrained legal actors in, 252–9
"Working on the Chain Gang: Interpretation in Law and Literature," 251, 260–1
"Wrong Again," 251, 256, 259–61
Fiss, Owen, 180–2, 281
force
anti-foundationalism and, 173–4
comprehensive doctrines and, 176
definition of, 175
freedom of speech and, 174–5
partisanship and, 175
politics and, 175
formalism. *See also* legal formalism
recontextualization and, 308
rule of law and, 291
foundationalism. *See also* anti-foundationalism
definition of, 16
distortion problem and, 18–19
for Dworkin, 260–1
as epistemology, 16–18
Fish critique of, 18–21, 23–5
legal formalism and, 213
legal realism as, 321–2
of liberalism, 83–4
limitation problem and, 18–19
objective knowledge and, 17–18, 23
positivism and, 17, 183
for Posner, 323
rejection of, 20
scientific method and, 18
theory essentials, 22
theory talk for, 164
truth and, 23
Frank, Jerome, 321
Frankfurt School, 114–15
CLS and, 333
critical theory and, 119

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

freedom. *See also* freedom of speech
  critical theory and, 120–1
  liberalism under, 85–6
freedom of religion, 100–8
  atheism and, 151
  authority and, 101
  background beliefs and, 100
  civility and, 102–4
  community of worship and, 101–2
  conservative Christianity under, 101–4
  exclusion and, 106–8
  freedom of association and, 101–2
  hidden bias and, 104
  under liberalism, 176
  marginalization and, 104–6
  multiculturalism and, 127
  obedience to God's commands, 102–4
  philosophical critique of, 108
  postmodernism and, 127
  rational deliberation and, 101
  rejection of, 105
  tradition and, 101
freedom of speech, 30–1
  in *Abrams v. United States*, 196
  in *American Booksellers Association v. Hudnut*, 198–9
  autonomy and, 194–5
  in *Beauharnais v. Illinois*, 198
  censorship and, 202, 204–5
  in *Collin v. Smith*, 198–200
  consequences of, 192, 203–4
  in *Dennis v. United States*, 196–7
  embeddedness and, 191
  under First Amendment, 196, 200–1
  forms of force, 174–5
  in *Gitlow v. New York*, 196
  as incoherent concept, 191
  liberalism and, 192–3, 201–2
  partisanship and, 191–3
  political paralysis and, 172–3
  pragmatic balancing for, 200–1
  protected speech and, 204
  recategorization of constraint with, 205
  regulated speech and, 204
  speech/action distinction and, 202–5
  tolerance and, 192, 195, 199–202

Gabel, Peter, 332–3
gay and lesbian rights, 140
Geertz, Clifford, 21
general theory, 48
Gitlow v. New York, 196
God, 20
  obedience to, under freedom of religion, 102–4
  the Self and, 10–11
Goldsmith, Andrew, 281
Goodrich, Peter, 206, 332–3
Gordon, Robert, 332–3
Gramsci, Antonio, 327
grand theory, 48
Gray, John, 83
Grice, H. P., 228

Habermas, Jürgen, strong theory for, 51
Hale, Robert Lee, 95
Hart, H. L. A., 209, 219–20, 294. *See also* legal formalism
  on hard cases, 300–1
  scorer's discretion and, 232, 248
Hay, Douglas, 327
Heidegger, Martin, 109, 133–4
Hobbes, Thomas, 82–3
Holmes, Oliver Wendell, 207–8
Holocaust denial, 160
How Milton Works (Fish), 3

ideology, as concept
  in CLS, 327
  critique of, 328
indeterminacy. *See* legal indeterminacy
institutional history, law and, 255–7
integrity
  for judges, 253–4
  law as, 253
"Intention is All There Is" (Fish), 245
intentionalism, 221–50. *See also* interpretation claim, in intentionalism
  advocates of, 221
  author claim in, 228

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

intentionalism (cont.)
author meaning and, textual meaning compared to, 225–8
without authors, 222–5, 270–1
for Barak, 271–2
boundaries of, 244
common law and, 271–2
within communities, 271–2
conceptual assumptions of, 221–2
conscious intentions, 238
Dworkin on, 240–1, 271–2
fictions in, 229–30
in Fish/Dworkin debate, 268
interpretation and, 269–70
lack of limitations under, 224–5
law and, with non-human authors, 270–1
legislative, 227, 237, 241–2
methodological individualism and, 241
multiple states of mind, 241
natural meanings in, 228
public language and, 238–9
public meaning and, 222
rewriting and, 244–7, 301
for Rorty, 244
rule of law job and, 303
textual meaning and, author meaning compared to, 225–8
textualism compared to, 221, 233
unconscious intentions, 238
U.S. Constitution and, 224
interdisciplinarity, 63–4, 73–5
in Fish/Dworkin debate, 268–9
in legal realism, 322
for Posner, 323
risks of, 324–5
interpretation
anti-foundationalism and, 269
broad sense of, 269
communication of meaning through, 272–3
constructive, 262
of contract law, 190
in Fish/Dworkin debate, 269–71
independent constraints upon, 259–64, 269
intentionalism and, 269–70
by judges, 279
of law, 303
in legal formalism, 218
legal indeterminacy and, 306
narrow sense of, 269–70
rewriting compared to, 246–7, 270
textual features of, 262–3
in textualism, 218, 233
of U.S. Constitution, 36
interpretation claim, in intentionalism
community influences on, 233–6
critiques of, 231–4, 236–7
Dworkin's critique of, 242–5
epistemological objection in, 237
for Fish, 228–9, 231–4, 269
independent constraints upon, 259–64
independent object of, 232–3
non-existence objection to, 240
objections to, 242–3
public language and, 238–9
as rational, 249
rewriting and, 244–7
scorer's discretion and, 248
textualism and, 218, 233
unconstrained legal actors and, 248–9
interpretive communities, 216
Ireland, Paddy, 109
Is There a Text in This Class (Fish), 33–5, 214, 219

James, William, 21, 38–9, 129
Jameson, Frederic, 176
Johnson, Philip E., 159
judges
act of persuasion for, 319
act-utilitarian, 275, 277–8
athletes as analogous to, 281–6
autonomy of practices for, 277
constraints for, 275–6, 278
embeddedness of, 276
formal consideration doctrine and, 297
integrity for, 253–4
interpretation by, 279
moral principles of, 259
personal preferences as influence on, 257–9, 276

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

philosophy as influence on, 265
political principles of, 259
pragmatism in, 274–5, 279
as unconstrained legal actors, 253–4
judicial activism, 307
Justifying belief (Olson), 60, 149, 155, 173, 178

Kant, Immanuel, 83
autonomy for, 8
conception of the self, 7–11, 194
Fish critique of, 9–11
Kelman, Mark, 332–3
Kennedy, Duncan, 95, 332–3
Kloppenberg, James, 133
Knapp, Steven, 221, 223
Knight, G. Wilson, 250
knowledge
beliefs and, 23
foundations of, 17
objective, 17–18, 23
positivism and, 17
relativism and, 27
skepticism and, 27
Kronman, Anthony, 182
Kuhn, Thomas, 37, 62, 155

language. *See also* intentionalism
of neutral principles, 170
public, for interpretation claims, 238–9
textualism and, 209–11
law. *See also* change, in law; contract law; legal indeterminacy; legal positivism; rule of law; substantive justice job, of law
absolutist monarchic power and, 177
amazing trick of, for Fish, 301, 313
anti-foundationalism in, 35–6
anti-legal positivism in, 298
autonomy of, 184–5
black-letter, 186–90
CLS and, 288–90
common, 271–2, 294
conflicts with consistency in, 292
conservatism of, 302
constitutional interpretation and, 36
constraints by, 210
continuity in, 291
culture of, 326
definition of, 36
disorderly nature of, 287–90
distinctions within, 256
doctrine of consideration and, 187
empirical approaches to, 320
as empirical fact, 183–4
enabling background as influence on, 333–4
enforcement of, 184
as engine of change, 185
equity, 294
as expression of moral principles, 253
as expression of political principles, 253
flexibility of, 301
formalism in, 178
forum of principle perspective, 190
goals of, 177–8
hard cases in, 300–1
institutional functions of, 293
institutional history and, 255–7, 300
integrity in, 253–4
intentionalism with non-human authors, 270–1
interdisciplinarity in, 268–9
interpretation of, 303
jobs of, in liberal societies, 290–5
legal canon, 288
legal doctrine of, 288–9, 298–9
legal texts, 36
liberal requirements of, 177
liberalism and, 177–8
malleability of, 330
morality and, 183–6, 253, 280
neutral principles in, 190–205
objectivity of, 216
orthodox contract, 186–8
orthodox Marxism, 327
philosophy as influence on, 264–9, 292–3
as political, 178
politics and, separation from, 183–6
positivism and, 177–8
Posner on, 287–8
pragmatism of, 293

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

law (cont.)
precedent in, 317–18
principles of, 287
ratiocination as task for, 206–7
reasoning mechanisms of, 288
recontextualization in, 310–14
rewriting in, 246–7, 301–4
rhetoric in, 330
separate institutions within, 294
as social practice, 188–9
stopping rule in, 246–7
tasks of, 290, 302
technical content of, 288
Law and Literature (Posner), 325
law as integrity, 253
"Law as Interpretation" (Dworkin), 243, 251, 260
Law's empire (Dworkin), 239, 241, 251, 255, 260–2
constructive interpretation in, 262
philosophy in, 265
pragmatism in, 257
lawyers. *See* legal actors
legal actors. *See also* judges
anti-foundationalism and, 256–7
constraints on, 317–18
craft-training for, 316
Dworkin on, 252–9
Fish on, 252
institutional history and, 255–7
morality as influence on, 254
nature of constraints on, 263
philosophy as influence on, 265
politics as influence on, 254
pragmatism of, 255
under rule of law, compulsion of, 318–19
textualism and, 208–9
uncertainty of, 285
unconstrained, 179–82, 253–9
legal doctrine, 288–9, 298–9
legal formalism, 178. *See also* classical legal formalism; textualism
anti-foundationalist argument and, 213–21
conceptual, 207
in *Doing what comes naturally*, 214
for Dworkin, 260–1
foundationalism and, 213
goals of, 206
interpretation in, 218
interpretive communities and, 216
in *Is There a Text in This Class*, 214
legal indeterminacy and, 305–6
legal realism as rejection of, 320
rejection of history in, 206
rule of law job and, 293–4
rules and, 210–11
substantive justice job and, 294
in *There's No Such Thing as Free Speech*, 214–15
unconstrained legal actors, 179–82
legal indeterminacy
CLS and, 329–31
constraints in, 306–8
experience of, 310
Fish and, 305–8, 316–18
interpretive community and, 306
legal formalism and, 305–6
legal realism and, 320
prejudices and, 315–16
recontextualization and, 308–14
theoretical development of, 305
versions of, 308–9
legal positivism, 177–8, 183
autonomy in, 184–5
development of, 183
legal realism and, 320, 326
neutral principles in, 190–205
responses to Fish, 186–205
rule of law job and, 293
the self and, 180
unconstrained legal actors and, 179–82
legal realism, 320–6
empirical approaches to law, 320
Fish critique of, 322–3
as foundationalism, 321–2
interdisciplinarity in, 322
legal indeterminacy and, 320
legal positivism and, 320, 326
as movement, 321
myth of objectivity and, 321
Posner and, 322–3
rejection of legal formalism, 320

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

legislative intention, 241–2
  stopping rule and, 246–7
Levinson, Sanford, 144
liberalism, 50–1, 81–108.
    See also freedom of religion
  abstract principles of, 143–4
  censorship and, 202
  CLS and, 328, 330–2
  color-blind society and, 141–2
  conflict resolution under, 81–2
  deconstruction of, 84–5, 122
  dichotomies of, 84–8
  doctrine of consideration and, 187
  Dworkin on, 90
  fairness and, 91–2
  Fish on, 141, 165–6
  foundationalism of, 83–4
  free market under, 94–5
  free speech and, 192–3, 201–2
  freedom of religion under, 176
  freedom *vs.* constraint under, 85–8, 120–1
  historical development of, 81
  inconsistencies of, 82–3
  law and, 177–8
  marginalization under, 104–6
  moral agenda of, 91–2
  neutral principles of, 90–3, 165–6
  neutral procedures of, 93–6
  neutral reason in, 96–9
  neutrality of, 89–99
  organizing categories of, 84
  partisanship of, 89
  philosophy and, 163
  political paralysis as result of, 172–3
  pragmatism and, 134
  progressivism and, 199–200
  protection of religion and, 105
  rejection of, as philosophical position, 148
  rule of law job and, 290–1
  theory talk for, 164
  tolerance and, 99
  unconstrained legal actors and, 179–82
limitation problem, 18–19
Llewellyn, Karl, 182, 299, 316, 329–31
local practices. *See also* autonomy of practices
  theory and, 53–5
local theory, 52, 69–70
  anti-foundationalism and, 53
  efficacious, 59
  embeddedness and, 53–5
  philosophy and, 65
  practice of, 65
  strong theory compared to, 52–3
Locke, John, 82–3
logic
  anti-foundationalism and, 38–40
  contingent background beliefs and, 39–40

MacKinnon, Catharine, 160
Mannheim, Karl, 113
marginalization, freedom of religion and, 104–6
Margolis, Joseph, 131
Martinez, Dennis, 54, 76
Masterson v. Sine, 314
meaning
  author's, compared to textual, 225–8
  depth of, with textualism, 212
  through interpretation, 272–3
  natural, in intentionalism, 228
  public, intentionalism and, 222
  through recontextualization, 310
  textual, compared to author's, 225–8
  textualism for, 233
methodological individualism, 241
Michaels, Walter Benn, 221, 223
Mill, John Stuart, 83, 103
Milton, John, 9, 235–6, 250, 263–4
  on legal constraints, 307
Moore, Michael, 268, 281
moral agency, of self, 8
morality
  contract law and, 187
  of judges, 259
  law and, 183–6, 253, 280
  legal actors influenced by, 254
  of unconstrained legal actors, 259
multiculturalism
  boutique, 2, 8–9, 127–8
  postmodernism and, 126–9

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

multiculturalism (cont.)
religious freedom and, 127
strong, 128–9
tolerance and openness and, 126–7
"My Reply to Stanley Fish (and Walter Benn Michaels): Please Don't Talk About Obectivity Anymore" (Dworkin), 251
myth of objectivity, 321

neutral principle, 2
affirmative action and, 168, 170
freedom of religion and, 167
labeling of, 163
language of, 170
in law, 190–205
legal positivism and, 190–205
of liberalism, 90–3, 165–6
political paralysis from, 171–3
of politics, 165–7
racism and, 168
in rule of law, 291
Norris, Christopher, 52

objective knowledge, 17–18, 23
Olson, Gary, 60, 149, 155, 173, 178
"On Legal Autonomy" (Fish), 325
On Liberty (Mill), 103
openness, multiculturalism and, 126–7
orthodox contract law, 186–8
consideration doctrine in, 297
orthodox Marxist account of law, 327
overarching theory, 48
Owen, J. Judd, 144, 146

Paradise Lost (Milton), 235–6, 263–4
parol evidence rule, 313–14
constraints in, 314
in *Masterson v. Sine*, 314
textualism and, 313
partisanship
anti-foundationalism and, 147–8
force and, 175
free speech and, 191–3
of liberalism, 89
politics and, 165–70
theory and, 59–60, 77
"The Path of the Law" (Holmes), 207–8
Patterson, Dennis, 27–8
Peirce, Charles, 129
personal preferences
of judges, 257–9, 276
legal actors influenced by, 257–9
legal indeterminacy and, 315–16
principles compared to, 277
philosophy
anti-foundationalism and, 67, 115
deflationary approach to, 266–9
as detached theory, 56
doubt in, 57
for Dworkin, 264–9
as influence on judges, 265
as influence on legal actors, 265
interdisciplinarity in, 268–9
law influenced by, 264–9, 292–3
in *Law's empire*, 265
liberalism and, 163
local theory and, 65
politics and, connections between, 139, 144–53, 163
theory talk and, 162–3, 268
"Play of Surfaces: Theory and the Law" (Fish), 184–5
pluralism, 106
political change, 152–3
political practice, 156–76
autonomy of practices and, 158
conflict and, 173–6
features of, 156–7
forms of force and, 175
lack of cynicism in, 164–5
neutral principles of, 165–7
paralysis in, from neutral principles, 171–3
partisanship and, 165–70
philosophically-defective arguments, 162–5
theory and, 157–62
political theory. *See* liberalism
politics
autonomy of practices and, 156, 158
broad sense of, 154–5
as concept, 154–6
conflict and, 173–6
forms of force and, 175
of judges, 259

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

law as expression of, 253
legal actors influenced by, 254
local commitments and, 154–5
narrow sense of, 155
neutral principle in, 165–7
paralysis in, from neutral principles, 171–3
partisanship and, 165–70
philosophy and, connections between, 139, 144–53, 163
public, 155
science and, 155
separation of law from, 183–6
theory and, 157–62
of unconstrained legal actors, 259
positivism. *See also* legal positivism
characteristic theses of, 17
development of, 183
for Dworkin, 260–2
foundationalism and, 183
knowledge and, 17
Posner, Richard, 274–5, 279, 287–8, 325–6
Fish critique of, 293–4, 322–3
foundationalism for, 323
interdisciplinarity for, 323
on law, 287–8
legal realism and, 322–3
on precedent, 317–18
on substantive justice job, 293–4
Postmodern Sophistry (Olson), 60–1, 234–6, 283
postmodernism, 121–9
anti-foundationalism and, 21–2
deconstructionism and, 122
definition of, 121
French theorists and, 122
multiculturalism and, 126–9
political consequences of, 123–4
religious freedom and, 127
strong multiculturalism and, 128
uniculturalism and, 128–9
vulgar, 123
pragmatism, 129–38
account compared to program, 134–5
anti-foundationalism and, 21–2, 63, 135
autonomy of practices and, 135–6
community and, 132–3
definition of, 131–2
democracy and, 133–5
development of, 129–30
embeddedness and, 135
epistemology of, 130
for Fish, 131–2, 134–6
in judges, 274–5, 279
of law, 293
in *Law's empire*, 257
liberalism and, 134
political consequences of, 132
relativism and, 131
roots of, 129
for Rorty, 131, 133, 136–8
trans-contextual principles, 132, 136
for unconstrained legal actors, 255
Pragmatism (James), 38–9
"Pragmatism, Right Answers, and True Banality" (Dworkin), 252, 282
Pragmatism in Law and Society, 131, 252
Pragmatism's Advantage (Margolis), 131
Prakash, Saikrishna, 221
principles, personal preferences compared to, 277
The problems of jurisprudence (Posner), 287–8
Professional Correctness (Fish), 60
progressive anti-foundationalism, 112–38. *See also* critical theory; postmodernism; pragmatism
disadvantaged groups and, 112
Frankfurt School and, 114–15, 119
social constructed reality and, 112
progressivism, 199–200
protected speech, 204
protection of religion, 105
Putnam, Hilary, 133

racism
affirmative action and, 141
neutral principles and, 168
Radin, Margaret Jane, 136
rational self, 7
Rawls, John, 83

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

Rawls, John (cont.)
comprehensive doctrines, 50–1
hypothetical agreement and, 8
information for self and, 8
on the self, 7–8
reality
progressive anti-foundationalism and, 112
social construction of, 24
reason
background beliefs and, 97–8
belief and, 43
epistemology and, 40–7
in law, 288
in liberalism, 96–9
reasonable testator, 249
recontextualization
anti-foundationalism and, 309
constraints on, 310–14
embeddedness and, 309
fixed meanings through, 310
formalism and, 308
future possibilities, 309–10
in law, 310–14
legal indeterminacy and, 308–14
textualism and, 308
reflection, consciousness and, 54–5
regulated speech, 204
relativism
anti-foundationalism and, 26–8, 44–5, 68–9, 145–6
knowledge and, 27
pragmatism and, 131
religion. *See also* freedom of religion
in substantive justice job, 291–2
religious fundamentalism, 160. *See also* freedom of religion
reverse discrimination, 142
The Revival of Pragmatism, 131
rewriting
inconsistency of, 301–2
intentionalism and, 244–7, 301
interpretation compared to, 246–7, 270
in law, 246–7, 301–4
of literature, 250
negative attitudes towards, 249–50
reasonable testator and, 249
in rule of law job, 303
in substantive justice job, 303
unconstrained legal actors and, 248–9
rhetoric, in law, 330
Riggs v. Palmer, 219, 295
Rorty, Richard, 63, 88, 109, 134
on intentionalism, 244
as neo-pragmatist, 131, 133, 136–8
rule formalism, 207
rule of law, 290–1
application of, 295–9
changes in law and, 311–12
compulsion of legal actors under, 318–19
constraints under, 318
Dworkin on, 294–5
Fish on, 294–5
formalism and, 291
intentionalism and, 303
legal formalism and, 293–4
legal positivism and, 293
liberalism and, 290–1
neutral principles in, 291
as noble lie, 299
rewriting in, 303
rhetoric and, 318
substantive justice job compared to, 290
textualism and, 208–9, 211
validity of, 318–19

Scalia, Antonin, 211–12
Schanck, Peter, 4, 22–3, 70, 140, 148, 159–60
Schauer, Frederick, 210–12
Schlag, Pierre, 332–3
Schreiber, Harry, 299
science
anti-foundationalism and, 36–8
as political, 155
scientific method, 18
foundationalism and, 18
scorer's discretion, 232
interpretation claim and, 248
Second Restatement on Contracts, 298
secular liberalism, 43–4

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

the self
  autonomy of, 7
  beliefs and, 10, 12
  boutique multiculturalism and, 8–9
  consciousness and, 10, 14
  critical theory and, 117–18
  deprivation of, 9
  for Dworkin, 254–5, 277–8
  emancipation of, 19
  embeddedness of, 15
  Fish critique of Kant's conception, 8
  in Fish/Dworkin debate, 254, 277–8
  Fish's conception of, 11–15, 254, 277–8
  God and, 10–11
  information for, 8
  institutional influences on, 13–14
  Kantian conception of, 7–11, 194
  legal positivism and, 180
  local contexts for, 13
  moral agency of, 8
  rational, 7
  Rawls on, 7–8
  self-consciousness and, 10
  social, 14
  as social construct, 13
  solipsism and, 13–14
  in *A Theory of Justice*, 7–8
  values of, 10
self-consciousness, 10
semantics, textualism and, 227
sham theory, 59
Sinnott-Armstrong, Walter, 230
skepticism
  anti-foundationalism and, 26–7
  knowledge and, 27
Smith, Steven, 231, 238, 292
social change
  beliefs as influence on, 162
  theory as influence on, 157
social construction
  in critical theory, 118–19
  of reality, 24
social constructivism, 282–3
social self, 14
solipsism, 13–14
speech. *See* freedom of speech
speech/action distinction, 202–5
  consequences of, 204–5
  First Amendment and, 202
  Fish critique of, 202–5
  malleability of, 204
St. Augustine, 4, 228
stereo strategy, with substantive justice job, 296–7
Stewart, Hamish, 281
"Still Wrong After All These Years" (Fish), 251–2, 256
Stoljar, Natalie, 236–7
stopping rule, in law, 246–7
strong multiculturalism, 128–9
strong theory, 50
  local theory compared to, 52–3
The Structure of Scientific Revolutions (Kuhn), 37, 155
substantive justice job, of law, 291–2
  application of, 295–9
  camouflage strategy for, 296–7, 300
  change in law and, 312–13
  communitarian elements of, 291–2
  contract implied in law and, 297
  dispute resolution under, 291
  Dworkin on, 294–5
  Fish on, 294–5
  flexibility of, 298
  legal formalism and, 294
  orthodox contract law and, 297
  Posner on, 293–4
  religious elements of, 291–2
  rewriting in, 303
  Riggs v. Palmer under, 295
  rule of law compared to, 290
  stereo strategy with, 296–7
  in *The Trouble with Principle*, 295
surface beliefs, 46
syntax, textualism and, 227

textualism, 206–12
  See also intentionalism
  ambiguity of, 216–17
  anti-foundationalist arguments against, 213–21
  authoritative resolution of disputes through, 212
  without authors, 222–5
  contemporary application of, 210–12

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

textualism (cont.)
depth of meanings with, 212
difficulties of, 209–10
in *Doing what comes naturally*, 214
for Dworkin, 219, 260–1
established meanings of words and, 233
exceptions to, 210
Fish critiques of, 213–28
hard cases and, 220–1
intentionalism compared to, 221, 233
interpretation in, 218, 233
interpretive communities and, 216
in *Is There a Text in This Class*, 214, 219
language and, 209–11
legal actors and, 208–9
in literary studies, 219
parol evidence rule and, 313
plain cases and, 220–1
purpose of, 208
recontextualization and, 308
rule of law and, 208–9, 211
rules and, 210–11
for Schauer, 210–12
semantics and, 227
sensitivity of decision-maker and, 211
syntax and, 227
in *There's No Such Thing as Free Speech*, 214–15
theory. *See also* critical theory; local theory
abstract, 56–60
anti-foundationalism, hope and fear in, 108–12
of anti-foundationalism, 67–8
autonomy of, 64–70
beliefs compared to, 162
as consequential, 59
as deflationary, 48, 64–5, 161
embeddedness and, 49
in everyday practices, 49
feminist, 160
guidance of other practices and, 55–70
interdisciplinary borrowing, 77
local context limitations and, 50–3
local practices and, 53–5
orthodox claims about, 48–9
partisanship and, 59–60, 77
politics influenced by, 157–62
sham, 59
social change influenced by, 157
status of, 78
strong, 50, 52–3
theory-talk compared to, 158
types of, 48
"Theory Minimalism" (Fish), 67
A Theory of Justice (Rawls), 7–8
theory talk
anti-foundationalism and, 159–60
anti-Semitism and, 160
feminism and, 160–1
for foundationalism, 164
for liberalism, 164
philosophy and, 162–3, 268
political consequences of, 158, 161–2
in political practice, 157–62
religious fundamentalism and, 160
theory compared to, 158
There's No Such Thing as Free Speech (Fish), 193, 214–15, 287, 315
Thomas, Brook, 52
Thompson, E. P., 327
tolerance
first law of toleration-dynamics, 196
free speech and, 192, 195, 199–202
multiculturalism and, 126–7
Toulmin, Stephen, 18
tradition, freedom of religion and, 101
"Transcendental Nonsense and the Functional Approach" (Cohen), 321
Tribe, Laurence, 196
Trident Centre v. Connecticut General Life Insurance Company, 188
The Trouble with Principle (Fish), 3, 169
substantive justice job in, 295
truth. *See also* absolute truth
foundationalism and, 23

unconstrained legal actors, 179–82. *See also* judges

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-07474-3 - Stanley Fish on Philosophy, Politics, and Law: How Fish Works
Michael Robertson
Index
More information

Dworkin on, 252–9, 273–81
institutional history and, 255–7
interpretation claims and, 248–9
judges as, 253–4
morality of, 259
politics of, 259
pragmatism for, 255
rejection of, by Fish, 273–81
rewriting and, 248–9
Unger, Roberto, 152–3, 268, 288, 332–3
uniculturalism, 128–9

vulgar postmodernism, 123

Webb v. McGowin, 297
Weber, Mark, 43
Webster, John, 101
Weinrib, Ernest, 62
West, Cornel, 136–8
White, James Boyd, 333
Williams, Ted, 285–6
Winter, Steven, 39, 281
"Working on the Chain Gang: Interpretation in Law and Literature" (Fish), 251, 260–1
"Wrong Again" (Fish), 251, 256, 259–61, 276

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org