# CONTENTS

- List of Figures x
- Acknowledgements xi
- List of Abbreviations xiv
- Table of Cases xvi
- Table of Conventions, Declarations and Decisions of Conferences of the Parties xviii
- Table of Legislation xxiv

## 1 Introduction  

### PART I Climate Change Mitigation and Forest Carbon Sequestration  

#### 2 REDD+ as International Legal Regime  

**A. Laws and Decision-Making Procedures**  
1. UNFCCC and the Paris Agreement 17  
2. Kyoto Protocol 21  
3. Cancun Agreements and Warsaw Framework 23  

**B. International Organizations and Other Key Participants**  
1. UN-REDD Programme 33  
2. Forest Carbon Partnership Facility 35  
3. Other Funding Bodies 35  
4. Nonstate Actors 37  

**C. Key Behaviours, Assumptions and Biases**  
1. RED to REDD to REDD+ 40  
2. Evaluative Criteria such as ‘Readiness’ Proposals or ‘R-PPs’ 43  
3. Compliance with Safeguards 45  

**D. Conclusions** 46  

#### 3 REDD+’s Broader International Legal Context  

**A. Fragmentation and REDD+ Obligations** 49  

**B. Overview of Relevant International Regimes** 54  
1. The International Forest Regime 55  
2. Other Regimes Recognising Indigenous Peoples’ ‘Rights’, Including Human Rights Regimes 65
CONTENTS

3. Environmental Protection Regimes 67
4. Food Security 71
C. Relevant Norms of Customary International Law 73
D. Fragmentation and Regime Interaction: A Preliminary Overview 76
   1. Fragmentation and Conflicting Norms 76
   2. Fragmentation and Relationships of Interpretation 78
E. Conclusions 82

PART II State and Indigenous Peoples’ Relations in the Context of REDD+

4 REDD+, Identity Law and ‘Free, Prior and Informed Consent’ 87
   A. REDD+, the Human Rights–Based Approach and Indigenous Peoples 89
      1. The World Bank’s Forest Carbon Partnership Facility (FCPF) 91
      2. The Cancun Safeguards and UN-REDD Programme Advice 94
      3. Human Rights and Multiple Benefits for Indigenous Peoples 101
   B. Indigenous Identity Law: Competing Approaches within REDD+ 104
      1. International Law on ‘Indigeneity’ 105
      2. Indigeneity and International Law: UN-REDD Programme and FCPF Approaches 109
   C. FPIC in the UN-REDD Programme and FCPF REDD Readiness Standards 112
      1. Principles and Criteria on Indigenous Peoples Used by the UN-REDD Programme and FCPF 112
      2. The Content of FPIC in REDD+: The UN-REDD Programme’s Advice 117
      3. FPIC and the World Bank 125
   D. Conclusion 128

5 REDD+, Tenure and Indigenous Property Claims 130
   A. What Are the Entry Points for Tenure Issues in REDD+ Discourse? 132
   B. Tenure in REDD+: Debates and Controversies 142
      1. The FAO Guidelines 145
   C. International Human Rights and Property Law: Conceptual Problems 154
      1. Indigenous Property in the UNDRIP 155
      2. Indigenous Property and the UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies 157
CONTENTS

3. Indigenous Property and Anti-Discrimination Law in Australia: The Equal Protection of Property Rights (Once Recognised) 159
4. The Inter-American Court Methodology: Equal Recognition of Property Rights 163

D. Conclusion 169

6 Benefit-Sharing in the REDD+ Regime: Linking Rights and Equitable Outcomes 172
A. REDD+: Defining Benefits 176
B. Benefit-Sharing: ‘Fairness’ and ‘Equity’ 177
   1. Ecosystem Services and Co-Benefits 180
   2. The Evolution of Benefit-Sharing 183
   3. Benefit-Sharing in REDD+ and Parallel Models 185
   4. Non-Carbon Benefits in REDD+ 188
C. REDD+ ‘Readiness’ and Benefit-Sharing 189
D. Defining Benefits Independently of Context 190
E. Benefit-Sharing Arrangements 191
   1. National and Regional Governance of Forest Land and Resources 194
   2. Tenure Security and Benefit-Sharing 195
F. Conclusion: Implementing Fairness and Equity in Benefit-Sharing 199

PART III Country Examples 201

7 Malaysia and the UN-REDD Programme: Exploring Possibilities for Tenure Pluralism in Forest Governance 203
A. REDD+ in Malaysia 205
   1. Malaysia as a Governance-Interaction Case Study 208
   2. REDD+: Competing Opportunities 211
B. The Malaysian Forests and Peoples 212
   1. A Federal Nation 212
   2. Malaysia’s Forests 214
C. Indigenous Peoples and Forest-Dependent Communities 219
   1. Indigenous Peoples’ Land Rights in Malaysia 222
D. REDD+ in Malaysia 231
   1. Overview 232
   2. Pilot Programmes 235
E. Conclusion 236

8 REDD+ in Melanesia: Papua New Guinea and Vanuatu 239
A. Melanesia Overview 239
B. Indigenous People and Customary Tenure in PNG and Vanuatu 241
   1. The Likely Success of REDD+ in PNG and Vanuatu 244
   2. Customary Land Tenure in Melanesia and Challenges for REDD+ 250
   3. Customary Land and Challenges for REDD+ 253

C. REDD Readiness in Melanesia 256
   1. Bilateral and Multilateral Funding 257
   2. UN-REDD Programme and FCPF REDD Readiness Activities in PNG 258

D. Third-Party Rights and Customary Tenure in Melanesia 264
   1. PNG: Incorporated Land Groups 266
   2. Vanuatu: Leasing Practices 268

E. FPIC in Melanesia 271
   1. National Guidelines 271
   2. FPIC and National Tenure Reforms 275

F. Pilot Programmes 277

G. Conclusion: Future Prospects for REDD+ Implementation 281

9 Indigenous Land Tenures and Carbon Mitigation Schemes: Lessons from Northern Australia 283
A. Australia Overview 283
   1. Lessons for REDD+ from Australia 285
   2. Challenges to Indigenous Peoples’ Participation in Carbon-Management Activities 287

B. Mitigation and Sequestration of Carbon in Australia 289
   1. State Schemes for Carbon Management: Western Australia 290
   2. The Direct Action Plan – Emissions Reduction Fund 292

C. Indigenous Tenure and Recognition: Common Law and Statute 295
   1. The Historical Context 296
   2. Native Title: What Type of Tenure and Rights? 299
   3. Agreement-Making for Indigenous Tenure as an Alternative to Native Title 305
   4. Statutory Land Rights 307
   5. Inalienable Title, Powers and Consents 309

D. Interaction of Tenure, Carbon Regulation and Mitigation Schemes 311
   1. Carbon Rights and Tenure 312
   2. The Emissions Reduction Fund and Indigenous Land 314
   3. Emissions Reduction and Carbon Mitigation Projects in Northern Australia 316

E. Lessons from Australia 324
## CONTENTS

### PART IV Implications and Conclusions

10 Interacting Regimes and Experimentalism 329

A. REDD+ and Regime Interaction: Implications for Indigenous Peoples and Forest Communities 330
   1. Protections: Recipients and Donors 331
   2. Implied Powers of International Organizations 333
   3. Deliberative Credentials and Emerging Duties 337

B. Experimentalist Governance 339
   1. Participatory Processes 340
   2. The Prospect of Penalty Default: The Safeguards Information System 342
   3. Established Practices for Revision, Involving Peer Review 343
   4. A Broadly Agreed Common Problem? 344

C. Conclusion 345

11 Conclusion 346

Bibliography 353

Index 398